

Mark A. Keffer

Law & Government Affairs Vice President Atlantic Region Room 3-D 3033 Chain Bridge Road Oakton, VA 22185 703 691-6046 FAX 703 691-6093 Email Fax No. 202 263-2692 mkeffer@att.com

September 15, 2004

VIA E-Docket

Sanford M. Speight, Acting Secretary Public Service Commission of the District of Columbia 1333 H Street, N.W. 2nd Floor, West Tower Washington, DC 20005

Re: Formal Case No. 1024

Dear Mr. Speight:

Please find enclosed the Response of AT&T Communications of Washington, DC, L.L.C and Teleport Communications – Washington, DC Inc. to Commission Order No. 13371 in the above referenced proceeding filed via E-Docket.

Very truly yours,

Mark A. Keffer

Enclosures

BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

IN THE MATTER OF THE

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE

Formal Case No. 1024

TRIENNIAL REVIEW ORDER IN THE

DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

:

RESPONSE OF AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF WASHINGTON, DC LLC AND TELEPORT COMMUNICATIONS – WASHINGTON, DC INC. TO COMMISSION ORDER NO. 13371

The Public Service Commission directed parties to respond to a series of questions regarding its role in providing "granular evidence" to the FCC for that federal agency's consideration in developing revised UNE rules. For reasons set forth below, AT&T recommends that this Commission not attempt to create a "summary" of the evidence for the FCC. The Commission lacks a complete record to enable it to create such a summary. The Commission can, however, assist the parties by confirming that proprietary information that has been produced in the course of the Commission's proceeding can be disclosed to the FCC, provided it is protected from public disclosure under the terms of the FCC's protective order.

Without the benefit of a full evidentiary record in this proceeding – where prefiled testimony has been subjected to cross examination and where parties have had the opportunity to submit briefs and/or otherwise argue the relative merits of the various positions presented – this Commission cannot reasonably be expected to evaluate and

Order No. 13371 (Sept. 8, 2004) citing Unbundled Access to Network Elements, Review of the Section 251 Unbundling Obligations of Incumbent Local Exchange Carriers, WC Docket No. 04-313, CC Docket No. 01-338, Order and Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, FCC 04-179 (Aug. 20, 2004).

summarize the filings in this docket. It is simply not reasonable to expect this

Commission to "summarize" an incomplete record. Instead, the Commission should

simply permit the parties to summarize their own testimony and filings for submission to
the FCC.

This approach is logical given the procedural history of this case. The

Commission initiated this case as a comprehensive proceeding — with testimony, hearings
and briefings contemplated — in response to the FCC's 2003 *Triennial Review Order*.²

Issuance of the District of Columbia Circuit's *USTA II* decision³ earlier this year,
however, led to the sudden halt to this proceeding before the final deadlines for the
submission of pre-filed testimony.⁴ Although Verizon was able to file its complete direct
case before the procedural schedule was stayed, CLECs did not have the opportunity to
file testimony on high capacity loop impairment. Thus, the pre-filed information
submitted to the Commission is incomplete.

A further, and perhaps more significant, reason that this Commission's record must be deemed too incomplete for this Commission to "summarize" is because the proceeding was stayed before the Commission conducted evidentiary hearings. Not only was the pre-filed testimony never admitted into the record, it also was never subjected to cross-examination. Absent a record where opposing parties were able to test and probe the relative strengths and weaknesses of each other's pre-filed testimony, the

Order No. 12958 (Oct. 24, 2003). The case was intended to address, inter alia, whether Verizon Washington DC, Inc. met certain switching, high capacity loops and dedicated transport "triggers."

³ U.S. Telecomm. Ass'n v. FCC, 359 F.3d 554 (D.C. Cir. 2004)(USTA II).

⁴ Formal Case Nos. 962 and 1024, Order 13210 (Mar. 3, 2004).

Commission is in no position to weigh the evidence. Any "summary" based on such incomplete information would not be useful to the FCC.

In view of the abbreviated proceeding – a docket where the record on switching, high capacity loops and dedicated transport impairment was never completed or entered into evidence – it is unreasonable to expect the Commission to weigh and summarize the parties' filings. Indeed, absent the creation of a complete record, the Commission is in no position to do so. In any event, such a task would unnecessarily stretch the Commission's financial resources and burden legal and technical staff members. The Commission should not place itself in such an untenable position.

An appropriate alternative, under these unique circumstances, would be for the Commission to permit the parties to summarize their own testimony and other filings. The parties themselves would also determine which of their filings in the docket should be included with their submission to the FCC.

There is, however, an important role for the Commission in assisting the parties to get their information to the FCC. Much of the information submitted to the Commission in this case was marked as "proprietary" and is subject to the Commission's non-disclosure requirement. Absent an order from the Commission or agreement from the parties, parties cannot disclose to the FCC any of the information they received from other participants. As to the treatment of such confidential materials, the Commission should simply ask the parties to confirm in writing that they do not object to submission of confidential information to the FCC. In most or all cases, parties would not object to

The Commission specifically inquired: "How should confidential information filed in Formal Case No. 1024 be treated? Can this information be transmitted to the FCC by the Commission with or without the approval of the party submitting the confidential information?" Order No. 13371 at 2.

the use of the confidential material, particularly given that the FCC has adopted its own procedures for protecting sensitive information from unwarranted disclosure.⁶ If in the unlikely event a party objects, the Commission can assist in resolving the matter so that the FCC is not denied access to any potentially useful information.

In conclusion, AT&T recommends that the Commission: (1) find that parties should submit their own summaries of the testimony and other filings directly to the FCC; and (2) confirm that parties do not object to confidential materials being released to the FCC, provided those materials are protected from disclosure under the FCC's protective order.

Respectfully submitted,

AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF WASHINGTON, D.C., LLC

TELEPORT COMMUNICATIONS – WASHINGTON, DC, INC.

By Its Attorneys

Mark A. Keffer

Ivars V. Mellups

Michael A. McRae

3033 Chain Bridge Road, 3D

Oakton, Virginia 22185

(703) 691-6047

Dated: September 15, 2004

Unbundled Access to Network Elements, Review of the Section 251 Unbundling Obligations of Incumbent Local Exchange Carriers, WC Docket No. 04-313, CC Docket No. 01-338, Order, DA 04-2603 (rel. Aug. 20, 2004).

Certificate of Service Formal Case No. 1024

I hereby certify that a copy of the Response of AT&T Communications of Washington, DC, L.L.C and Teleport Communications – Washington, DC Inc. to Commission Order No. 13371 was sent via email or first-class U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, to the following parties this 15th day of September 2004:

Dana Hoyle, Regulatory Compliance Mgr. @Link Networks 2220 Campbell Creek Blvd., #110 Richardson, TX 75082

Andy Horton, Tax Supervisor 1-800-Reconex, Inc. d/b/a USTel 2500 Industrial Ave. Hubbard, OR 97032

Francine Mambuca, Treasurer A.R.C. Networks d/b/a InfoHighway 175 Pinelawn Rd., Suite 408 Melville, NY 11747

Kit Morris, Director, New Business Markets Accutel of Texas d/b/a 1-800-4-A-Phone 7900 John Carpenter Freeway Dallas, TX 75247

Meredith H. Gifford Regulatory Compliance Officer Advanced TelCom, Inc. 6540 Powers Ferry Rd. Atlanta, GA 30339

Don Sussman
Allegiance Telecom of the District of
Columbia
1919 M Street, NW, Suite 420
Washington, DC 20036

James A. Kirkland, Sr. *
VP Spectrum Develop & General Counsel
01Communications of DC, LLC
c/o Clearwire Holdings, Inc.
19111 N. Dallas Parkway, Suite 200
Dallas, TX 75287

Charles Forst, Paralegal 360Networks (USA), Inc. 867 Coal Creek Circle, Suite 160 Louisville, CO 80027

Kaye Davis, General Counsel Director of Regulatory Affairs Access Point, Inc. 16 Hyland Road, Suite D Greenville, SC 29615

Lisa Lezotte, Paralegal CAN Communiction Services, Inc. 32991 Hamilton Ct. Farmington Hills, MI 48333

John Zahurancki, Director*
AES Communications
1001 North 19th Street
Arlington, VA 22209

Jeff Binder Allegiance Telecom of the District of Columbia 1919 M Street, NW, Suite 420 Washington, DC 20036

^{*} indicates sent via U.S. mail

Kris Shulman Allegiance Telecom of the District of Columbia 1919 M Street, NW, Suite 420 Washington, DC 20036

Kelly Franks
AmeriVision Communications, Ind.
d/b/a Lifeline Communications
5900 Mosteller Drive, Suite 1800
Oklahoma City, OK 73112

Paul Tendler
AX Telecommunications
5201 Leesburg Pike, Suite 1003
Falls Church, VA 22041

Ernest (Don) Walker, Jr. Bethel Communications 2711 Woodlake Rd. Michellville, MD 20721

Arthur L. Magee Budget Phone, Inc. 6901 W. 70th St. Shreveport, LA 71129

Demara Richardson
Cable and Wireless USA, Inc.
1130 Connecticut Ave., NW, #1201
Washington, DC 20036
Debra Waller
Cat Communications International, Inc.
d/b/a CCI
3435 Chip Drive, NW
Roanoke, VA 24012

Steven T. Perkins Cavalier Telephone Mid-Atlantic, LLC 2134 West Laburnum Ave. Richmond, VA 23227

Jeremy Azif CCCDC, Inc. d/b/a Connect! 3535 W. Seventh St., #1 Fort Worth, TX 76107 James Cornblatt*
Alticomm, Inc.
115 Shawmut Road
Canton, MA 02021

Doreen Flash ATX Licensing, Inc. d/b/a ATX Telecom. 15166 Neo Parkway Garfield Heights, OH 44128

Artis L. Baldwin Balpri Communications, Inc. d/b/a Allconnect 1101 15th St., NW, Suite 125 Washington, DC 20005

A. Sheba Chacko BT Communications Sales, LLC 11911 Freedom Drive, 11th Floor Reston, VA 20190

Jean Houck Business Telecom, Inc. d/b/a BTI 4300 Six Forks Road Raleigh, NC 27609

Matt Sitko
Capsule Communications
721 Broad St., Suite 200
Chattanooga, TN 37402
Donald F. Lynch, III
Cavalier Telephone Mid-Atlantic, LLC
2134 West Laburnum Ave.
Richmond, VA 23227

Julia O. Strow Cbeyond Communications, LLC 320 Interstate North Pkwy., Suite 300 Atlanta, GA 30339

E. B. Thomas Choctaw Communications, Inc. d/b/a Smoke Signals 8700 South Gessner Houston, TX 77074 Emilio L. Pardo CityNet Telecom, Inc. 8405 Colesville Rd., 6th Floor Silver Spring, MD 20910

Ried Zulager Cogent Communications of DC, Inc. 1015 31st St., NW Washington, DC 20007

Sheri Pringle Comm South Companies, Inc. 6830 Walling Lane Dallas, TX 75231

Anthony Hansel COVAD Communications Company 600 14th Street, NW, Suite 750 Washington, DC 20005

Rachelle D. Whitacre Cox District of Columbia Telcom, LLC 225 Clearfield Ave. Virginia Beach, VA 23451

Nicole Hamilton
Cypress Communications Operating Co.
15 Piedmont Center
3575 Piedmont Rd., Suite 100
Atlanta, GA 30305

Schula Hobbs
DSLnet Communications, LLC
545 Long Wharf Dr., 5th Floor
New Haven, CT 06511

Charles Kallenbach eLink Telecommunications, Inc. 39 Broadway, 19th Floor New York, NY 10006

Susan Edison Enron Telecommunications 1400 Smith St. Houston, TX 77002 Judith A. Riley, Esq. Claricom Networks, LLC 2912 Lakeside Dr. Oklahoma City, OK 73120

Beth Choroser Comcast Business Communications, Inc. 1500 Market St., 28 West Philadelphia, PA 19102

Steve Andreassi Consolidated Edison Communications 55 Broad St., 22nd Floor New York, NY 10004

A. John Leach *
Covista, Inc.
721 Broad St., Suite 200
Chattanooga, TN 37402

Douglas A. VanWinkle Intellectual Property Manager CTC Communications Corp. 115 Second Avenue Waltham, MA 023451

Anthony Hansel, Esq. DIECA d/b/a COVAD Communications 600 14th Ave., NW Washington, DC 20005

Pantios El Paso Networks 1001 Louisiana St. Houston, TX 77002

Ali Aliabadi Enkido, Inc. 411 Hackensack Ave. Hackensack, NJ 07601

Charles Kallenbach Eureka Telecom, LLC 39 Broadway, 19th Floor New York, NY 10006 Paul Bannwart *
Exario Telecom, Inc.
100 Executive Drive
W. Orange, NJ 07052-3371

Beatriz McNelly Fibergate 6076 Franconia Rd., Suite C Alexandria, VA 22310

David K. Tatak Focal Communications Corp. Mid-Atlantic 200 N. LaSalle St., Suite 1100 Chicago, IL 60601

Barbara E. Clocker Global Metro Networks DC., LLC 201 N. Union St., Suite 360 Alexandria, VA 22314

Scott Beer ICG Telecom Group, Inc. 161 Inverness Drive, West Englewood, CO 80112

Thomas Egan Inciscent, Inc. 2735 Hartland Rd., #200 Falls Church, VA 22043

Manager, Regulatory Compliance Intrado Communications, Inc. 1601 Dry Creek Rd. Longmont, CO 80503

Mike Ardia Level 3 Communications, LLC 1025 El Dorado Blvd. Broomfield, CO 80021 Amy Campbell Excel Telecommunications, Inc. 1600 Viceroy Dr. Dallas, TX 75235

Reginald Bailey *
First Regional Telecom
c/o Worldwide Network Services
15709 Kanawha Ct.
Rockville, MD 20855-2652

Teresa S. Reff Global Crossing Telemanagement, Inc. 1080 Pittsford Victor Rd. Pittsford, NY 14534

David Ferrari *
HarvardNet
1 Grafton Common #23
Grafton, MA 01519

Carl Wolf Billek IDT America, Corp. 520 Broad St. Newark, NJ 07102

J. G. Harrington*

Jason E. Rademacher*
Dow, Lohnes & Albertson, PLLC
1200 New Hampshire Ave., NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20036

Mike Duke KMC Companies 1755 N. Brown Rd. Lawrenceville, GA 30043

Linda Hunt Lightyear Communications, Inc. 1901 Eastpoint Parkway Louisville, KY 40223 Jodi J. Caro Looking Glass Networks, Inc. 1111 W. 22nd St., Suite 600 Oak Brook, IL 60523

David R. Conn McLeod USA Telecommunications Svcs. 6400 C St., SW P. O. Box 3177 Cedar Rapids, IA 54206-3177

Avi Mosden *
Metromedia Fiber Network Services, Inc. 360 Hamilton Ave.
White Plains, NY 10601

Lynn Abraham Mpower Communications Corp. 175 Sullys Trail, Suite 300 Pittsford, NY 14534

Korhan Aydin Ntera 1020 N. W. 163 Drive Miami, FL 33169

Max Kipfer OpenBand of DC. LLC 14927 Bogle Drive Chantilly, VA 20151

Terry Wingfield, Jr. PF.Net Network Service Corp. 2941 Fairview Park Drive, #200 Falls Church, VA 22042

Raymond E. Winkler PPL Companies Two N. Ninth St. Allentown, PA 18101-6094

Jacquetta Peace Premiere Network Services 1510 North Hampton Rd., Suite 120 DeSoto, TX 75115 Dulaney L. O'Roark, III, Esq.
MCI, Inc.
Six Concourse Parkway
Suite 600
Atlanta, GA 30328
Chad Hazam *
Metro Teleconnect Companies, Inc.
2150 Herr St.
Harrisburg, PA 17103

Aaron Goldberg
Metropolitan Telecommunications of DC
d/b/a MetTEL.
44 Wall Street, 14th Floor
New York, NY 10005

Rowena Valle NOC Communications 4380 Boulder Highway Las Vegas, NV 89121

Patrick Crocker, Esq. NUI Telecom Group 151 S. Rose St., Suite 900 Kalamazoo, MI 49007

J. T. Ambrosi
Paetec Communications, Inc.
One PaeTec Plaza
600 Willowbrook Office Park
Fairport, NY 14450

Darrell D. Evans
Phone Reconnect of America
9464 S. Federal Highway
Port St. Lucie, FL 34952

Alex Valencia Preferred Carrier Services, Inc. 14681 Midway Rd., Suite 105 Addison, TX 75001

Kathleen Lawrence Primus Telecommunications, Inc. 1700 Old Meadow Rd. McLean, VA 22102 Jenna Brown Quantum Shift Communications, Inc. 88 Rowland Way Novato, CA 94945

Meraj Abdul-Qadir Qwest Communications Companies 1801 California St., 3rd Floor Denver, CO 80202

Fred Goodwin SBC Telecom, Inc. 1010 N. St. Mary's, Room 13-34 San Antonio, TX 78215

Craig D. Dingwall
Sprint Communications Company L.P.
401 9th St., NW, Suite 400
Washington, DC 20004

Joseph O. Kahl Starpower Communications, LLC 105 Carnegie Center Princeton, NJ 08540

Russell M. Blau Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman 3000 K St., NW, Suite 300 Washington, DC 20007

David M. Channing Sunesys, Inc. 202 Titus Ave. Warrington, PA 18976-1416

Judith Riley Sure-Tel, Inc. 2912 Lakeside Drive Oklahoma City, OK 73120

Steve J. Bogdan
Talking Nets Holdings, LLC
1111 Military Cutoff Rd., #221
Wilmington, NC 28405

Andrew Stollman Quintelco, Inc. One Blue Hill Plaza Pearl River, NY 10965

Deborah Noell Rhythms Links, Inc. 9100 E. Mineral Circle Englewood, CO 80112

Jim Cornblatt*
ServiSense.com c/o Eastern Telephone
115 Shawmut Rd.
Canton, MA 02021

Jennifer Duane Sprint Communications Company L.P. 401 9th St., NW, Suite 400 Washington, DC 20004

Patrick McGuire Starpower Communications, LLC 105 Carnegie Center Princeton, NJ 08540

Philip J. Macres Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman 3000 K St., NW, Suite 300 Washington, DC 20007

Esther Sunday
Supra Telecommunications and
Information Systems
2620 SW 27th Ave.
Miami, FL 33133

Sharon Thomas Talk America, Inc. 12001 Science Drive, Suite 130 Orlando, FL 32826

Kim Degran *
Telera Communications
2005 Lakebreeze Way
Reston, VA 20191

Erick Robinson Trans National Communications 2 CharlesGate West Boston, MA 02215

Wanda Montano
US LEC of Virginia, LLC
6801 Morrison Blvd.
Charlotte, NC 28211

Amy Campbell VarTec Telecom, Inc. 1600 Viceroy Dr. Dallas, TX 75235

J. Henry Ambrose Verizon Washington, D.C., Inc. 2055 L Street, NW 5th Floor Washington, DC 20036

Natalie O. Ludaway, Esq. Counsel for Verizon Washington, DC Leftwich & Douglas, P.L.L.C. 1401 New York Avenue, N.W. Suite 600 Washington, DC 20005

Edward J. Marsh VIC-RMTS-DC d/b/a Verizon Avenue Two Conway Park, Suite 300 150 Field Drive Lake Forest, IL 60045

Denise Solitario
WilTel Local Network, LLC
One Technology Center MD-15
Tulsa, OK 74103

Kevin Photiades
Regulatory & Compliance Manager
United Systems Access Telecom, Inc.
5 Bragdon Lane, Suite 200
Kennebunk, ME 04043

Michael Morris Vice President US Telco, Inc. 300 Lakeside 11th Floor Oakland, CA 94612

David A. Hill, Esq.
Vice President and General Counsel
Verizon Washington, DC Inc.
2055 L Street, NW
5th Floor
Washington, DC 20036

Jennifer L. McClellan Verizon Communications 600 E. Main Street, 11th Floor Richmond, VA 23219

William B. Petersen Verizon Communications 1717 Arch Street 32nd Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103

Riley C. Davis We Connect Communications, Inc. 929 Wood St. Pittsburgh, PA 15221

Mac McIntyre Winstar Communications, LLC 1850 M Street, NW, Suite 300 Washington, DC 20036 Christopher McKee XO DC, Inc. 11111 Sunset Hills Rd. Reston, VA 20190

M. Nicole Oden
Counsel for XO Communications
Kelley Drye & Warren
1200 19th Street, NW
Suite 500
Washington, DC 20036

Larry Bercovich Yipes Enterprise Services, Inc. 114 Sansome St., 14th Floor San Francisco, CA 94104

Mike Hazzard Kelley, Drye & Warren 1200 19th St., NW, Suite 500 Washington, DC 20036

Sandra Mattavous-Frye Office of the People's Counsel 1133 15th St., NW, Suite 500 Washington, DC 20005-2170

Brenda K. Pennington, Esq. Assistant People's Counsel Office of the People's Counsel 1133 15th Street, N.W., Suite 500 Washington, DC 20005

Karla Chryar Office of the People's Counsel 1133 15th St., NW, Suite 500 Washington, DC 20005-2170 Steven Augustino
Darius B. Withers, Esq.
Kelley, Drye & Warren
1200 19th St., NW, Suite 500
Washington, DC 20036

James C. Falvey
Vice President, Regulatory Affairs
XSPEDIUS Management Company
17125 Columbia Gateway Dr.
Suite 200
Columbia, MD 21046

Timothy M. Seat Z-Tel Communications, Inc. 601 South Harbour Island Blvd., Suite 220 Tampa, FL 33602

Elizabeth A. Noel Office of the People's Counsel 113315th St., NW, Suite 500 Washington, DC 20005-2710

Barbara Burton
Office of the People's Counsel
1133 15th St., NW, Suite 500
Washington, DC 20005-2170

Laurence C. Daniels
Office of the People's Counsel
1133 15th St., NW, Suite 500
Washington, DC 20005-2170

Allen Buckalew J. W. Wilson 1601 N. Kent St., Suite 1104 Arlington, VA 22209 Molly Smith J. W. Wilson 1601 N. Kent St., Suite 1104 Arlington, VA 22209

Stephen P. Bowen Anita Taff-Rice BOWEN LAW GROUP, L.L.P. 235 Montgomery St. Suite 920 San Francisco, CA 94104

Danny W. Long