

ENGINEERING DIRECTIVE

Frank Tramontozzi (signature on original)

CHIEF ENGINEER

Contractor Performance Reports

The purpose of this Engineering Directive is to implement new Contractor Performance Reports for both general contractors and subcontractors. Effective immediately, these reports shall be used for the evaluation of all general contractors and their subcontractors on all current and future MassDOT Highway Division construction contracts. These reports replace any similar reports previously used for this purpose.

Separate reports have been developed specifically for rating general contractors and subcontractors. The categories used to evaluate performance have been expanded from four to nine for general contractors, and there are eight categories in the subcontractor report. This will allow Resident Engineers to rate the overall performance levels of general contractors and subcontractors in a broader range of areas associated with performance and contract compliance. In an effort to standardize the ratings submitted by Resident Engineers, guidelines have been established for assigning ratings for each category and for each type of report.

The new forms also include signature blocks for the general contractor as well as for the subcontractors. This is provided to allow contractors the opportunity to acknowledge that they reviewed the report. If a contractor or subcontractor refuses to sign a form, the Resident Engineer should note that in the appropriate signature block.

Completion of these forms is very important because the rating scores will be used as part of a revised process by the Prequalification Committee to determine the bidding limits for each contractor.

At a minimum, the performance reports shall be submitted to the District Construction Engineer after 50% (interim) of the work is completed and at 100% (final) completion of all work. In addition, these forms shall also be used at any interim point in the project to identify problems with either the general contractor or any of the subcontractors.

After sign-off by the District Highway Director, all performance reports shall be submitted to the Deputy Chief Engineer for Construction in the Boston headquarters. This includes reports with either passing or failing ratings. A passing rating is considered to be any rating equal or greater than 80%.

Attachments: Contractor Project Evaluation Form
Subcontractor Project Evaluation Form
Contractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines
Subcontractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines



CONTRACTOR PROJECT EVALUATION FORM

Date: _____

City/Town: _____ Contractor: _____

Project: _____ Address: _____

F.A. No. _____ Contract Number: _____

Bid Price: _____ Notice to Proceed: _____

Funds: State: _____ Fed Aid: _____ Current Contract Completion Date: _____

Date Work Started: _____ Date Work Completed*: _____

Contractor's Superintendent: _____

Division: (indicates class of work) Highway: _____ Bridge: _____ Maintenance: _____

*If work was NOT completed within specified time (including extensions) give reasons on following page.

| | Excellent 10 | Very Good 9 | Average 8 | 7 | Fair 6 | 5 | Poor 4 | % Rating |
|---|-----------------|----------------|--------------|---|-----------|---|-----------|------------------------|
| 1. Workmanship | | | | | | | | x 2= |
| 2. Safety | | | | | | | | x 2= |
| 3. Schedule | | | | | | | | x 1.5= |
| 4. Home Office Support | | | | | | | | x 1= |
| 5. Subcontractors Performance | | | | | | | | x 1= |
| 6. Field Supervision/ Superintendent | | | | | | | | x 1= |
| 7. Contract Compliance | | | | | | | | x 0.5= |
| 8. Equipment | | | | | | | | x 0.5= |
| 9. Payment of Accounts | | | | | | | | x 0.5= |
| (use back for additional comments) | | | | | | | | Overall Rating: |

(Give explanation of items 1 through 9 on the following page in numerical order if overall rating is below 80%. Use additional sheets if necessary.)

District Construction Engineer's Signature/Date

Resident Engineer's Signature/Date

Contractor's Signature Acknowledging Report/Date

Contractor Requests Meeting with the District: No Yes Date Meeting Held: _____

Contractor's Comments/Meeting Notes (extra sheets may be added to this form and noted here if needed): _____



SUBCONTRACTOR PROJECT EVALUATION FORM

Date: _____

City/Town: _____ Subcontractor: _____

Project: _____ Address: _____

F.A. No.: _____ Contract Number: _____

Prime Contractor _____ Current Contract Completion Date: _____

Date Work Started: _____ Date Work Completed*: _____

Subcontractor's Superintendent: _____

Type of Work Performed by Subcontractor: _____

*If work was NOT completed within specified time (including extensions) give reasons on following page.

| | Excellent 10 | Very Good 9 | Average 8 | 7 | Fair 6 | 5 | Poor 4 | % Rating |
|---|-----------------|----------------|--------------|---|-----------|---|-----------|------------------------|
| 1. Workmanship | | | | | | | | x 2= |
| 2. Safety | | | | | | | | x 2= |
| 3. Schedule | | | | | | | | x 1.5= |
| 4. Home Office Support | | | | | | | | x 1.5= |
| 5. Field Supervision/ Superintendent | | | | | | | | x 1= |
| 6. Contract Compliance | | | | | | | | x 1= |
| 7. Equipment | | | | | | | | x 0.5= |
| 8. Payment of Accounts | | | | | | | | x 0.5= |
| (use back for additional comments) | | | | | | | | Overall Rating: |

(Give explanation of items 1 through 8 on the following page in numerical order if overall rating is below 80%. Use additional sheets if necessary.)

District Construction Engineer's Signature/Date

Resident Engineer's Signature/Date

Contractor Signature Acknowledging Report/Date

Subcontractor Signature Acknowledging Report/Date

Subcontractor Requests Meeting with the District: No Yes Date Meeting Held: _____

Subcontractor's Comments / Meeting Notes (extra sheets may be added to this form and noted here if needed): _____

Contractor's Comments: _____



Contractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines

When rating the overall performance of a contractor, whether it is an interim evaluation or the final evaluation, the Resident Engineer shall use the following guidelines in determining the rating in each category. Guidelines have been developed to give overall guidance for ratings of 10, 8 and 4. Other numerical ratings may also be used if the description of the performance falls between the upper and lower ratings (10 and 4). Detailed descriptions of the contractor’s performance shall accurately describe the factual basis of the reasons for the rating and shall not include personal or subjective comments.

- 1. WORKMANSHIP:** Refers to the quality of the work product produced as defined by Construction Specifications, Plans and Industry Standards where applicable.

| Workmanship | | |
|--|--|---|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| <p>Full compliance with the contract specifications and plans</p> <p>Requires minimal oversight by the Resident engineer</p> <p>Work performed does not require rework to correct deficiencies</p> | <p>General conformance with the contract specifications and plans</p> <p>Requires occasional oversight by the resident engineer</p> <p>Occasional cosmetic defects</p> | <p>Substantial deviations from the contract plans and specifications</p> <p>Requires constant oversight by the resident Engineer</p> <p>Repeated, substantive corrective actions required on work performed</p> |

- 2. SAFETY:** Refers to proper compliance with all federal, state and local regulations, including, but not limited to, MUTCD compliant traffic management plan, OSHA, Department of Occupational Safety regulations and overall project housekeeping guidelines.

| Safety | | |
|---|--|---|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| <p>Full OSHA compliance</p> <p>Full compliance with TMPs</p> <p>Active safety program such as: regular toolbox meetings, safety manager on site, excellent housekeeping, full fall protection</p> <p>Worker injuries rare</p> <p>Workers fully engaged in safety issues</p> | <p>General OSHA compliance</p> <p>General compliance with TMPs</p> <p>Adequate housekeeping</p> <p>Periodic safety meetings</p> <p>Periodic site inspections by corporate safety officer</p> <p>Occasional worker injuries</p> <p>Workers generally aware of safety issues</p> | <p>Disregard for OSHA requirements</p> <p>Frequent failure to follow TMPs</p> <p>Poor housekeeping</p> <p>Inadequate or no fall protection</p> <p>Frequent worker injuries</p> <p>Workers are unable to speak up about safety issues.</p> |

Contractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines

3. **SCHEDULE:** Maintains work progress in accordance with approved schedule of operations and all subsequent approved modifications.

| Schedule* | | |
|--|--|--|
| *Schedule impacts outside Contractor's control are not to be considered failure to control the schedule. | | |
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Full use of schedule to manage construction progress | General adherence to work plan | Routine failure to complete work as planned |
| Prompt re-submittal of schedules as required or requested. | General attention to schedule as an important part of the contract | General lack of urgency in completing work |
| Full adherence to stated plan for prosecuting work | Reasonable response to schedule submittal requirements/requests | Failure to submit required/requested schedules |

4. **HOME OFFICE SUPPORT:** Refers to all aspects of Project Management including, but not limited to support for field operation needed to prosecute work, scheduling, timely submission of shop drawings/plans, erection/demolition procedures, material acquisition schedules and extra work order proposals.

| Home Office Support | | |
|---|---|--|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Full support from home office | General support from home office | Lack of support from home office |
| Timely, accurate submissions | Generally on time and accurate submittals | Late, incomplete submittals |
| Materials always available when required by field | Materials available when needed | Materials unavailable when needed by field |

5. **SUBCONTRACTORS' PERFORMANCE:** Subcontractors used are competent and knowledgeable with sufficient resources to produce high quality work.

| Subcontractor's Performance | | |
|--|--|---|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Subs exhibit excellent performance as defined for other categories | Subs exhibit average performance as defined for other categories | Subs exhibit poor performance as defined for other categories |

Contractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines

- 6. FIELD SUPERVISION/SUPERINTENDENT:** Must demonstrate knowledge of construction and contract documents necessary to complete the work as specified. The superintendent must also cooperate fully with Department personnel and all other interested parties so that work progresses as scheduled. The superintendent must be authorized to make decisions in the field that are binding upon the Contractor. In addition, the superintendent must demonstrate effective supervision and staffing of labor force, effective scheduling of subcontractors and proper prosecution of work.

| Field Supervision/Superintendent | | |
|--|---|---|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Demonstrates full knowledge of contract requirements | Reasonable knowledge of contract requirements | Does not demonstrate working knowledge of contract requirements |
| Fully cooperates with all reasonable requests | Generally cooperates with reasonable requests | Refuses to cooperate with reasonable requests |
| Effectively manages workforce | Generally capable of managing workforce | Unable to properly manage workforce |
| Fully authorized and capable of making jobsite decisions | Able to make jobsite decisions | Unable to make jobsite decisions |

- 7. CONTRACT COMPLIANCE:** Submittal of all documents required by the contract, but not directly needed for doing construction, such as payroll affidavits, EEO reports, trainees, manpower projections and material certifications.

| Contract Compliance | | |
|---|--|---|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Fully compliant with Division I contract requirements, | General overall compliance with contract paperwork | Non-compliant with contract paperwork |
| Material certifications received with material deliveries | EEO, material certifications and certified payrolls generally received as required | Certified payrolls late |
| Certified payrolls received with estimates | | Incomplete, late submissions of material certifications |

Contractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines

- 8. EQUIPMENT:** Refers to all equipment, machinery and operators used on the project. Equipment must be suitable and readily available, when needed, for all phases of the project. Equipment operators must demonstrate proficiency and skill in the operation of said equipment.

| Equipment | | |
|---|--|--|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Equipment always available when needed | Equipment usually available when needed | Equipment frequently unavailable |
| Equipment well maintained | Equipment reasonably well maintained | Equipment poorly maintained |
| Operators highly skilled and show proficiency in operation of equipment | Operators show proficiency in operation of equipment | Operators lack proficiency in operation of equipment |

- 9. PAYMENT OF ACCOUNTS:** Refers to the timely payment of undisputed invoices submitted by the subcontractors, material suppliers and police.

| Payment of Accounts* | | |
|--|---|--|
| *Funding/payment issues outside the contractor's control are not to be considered evidence of non-payment or late payment. | | |
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| No evidence of non-payment of subcontractors and suppliers | Occasional evidence of non-payment or late payment; i.e. sub mobilization or material deliveries delayed pending payment. No impact to project schedule. Holding of payment for legitimate contractual reasons is not to be considered "non-payment". | Repeated delays to the work due to deliveries or sub mobilizations delayed for non-payment Subcontractors lost for non-payment POs cancelled for non-payment |



Subcontractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines

When rating the overall performance of a subcontractor, whether it is an interim evaluation or the final evaluation, the Resident Engineer shall use the following guidelines in determining the rating in each category. Guidelines have been developed to give overall guidance for ratings of 10, 8 and 4. Other numerical ratings may also be used if the description of the performance falls between the upper and lower ratings (10 and 4). Detailed descriptions of the subcontractor’s performance shall accurately describe the factual basis of the reasons for the rating and shall not include personal or subjective comments.

- 1. WORKMANSHIP:** Refers to the quality of the work product produced as defined by Construction Specifications, Plans and Industry Standards where applicable.

| Workmanship | | |
|--|--|---|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| <p>Full compliance with the contract specifications and plans</p> <p>Requires minimal oversight by the Resident engineer</p> <p>Work performed does not require rework to correct deficiencies</p> | <p>General conformance with the contract specifications and plans</p> <p>Requires occasional oversight by the resident engineer</p> <p>Occasional cosmetic defects</p> | <p>Substantial deviations from the contract plans and specifications</p> <p>Requires constant oversight by the resident Engineer</p> <p>Repeated, substantive corrective actions required on work performed</p> |

- 2. SAFETY:** Refers to proper compliance with all federal state and local regulations, including, but not limited to, MUTCD compliant traffic management plan, OSHA, Department of Occupational Safety regulations and overall project housekeeping guidelines.

| Safety | | |
|---|--|--|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| <p>Full OSHA compliance</p> <p>Full compliance with TMPs</p> <p>Active safety program such as: regular toolbox meetings, safety manager on site, excellent housekeeping, full fall protection</p> <p>Worker injuries rare</p> <p>Workers fully engaged in safety issues</p> | <p>General OSHA compliance</p> <p>General compliance with TMPs</p> <p>Adequate housekeeping</p> <p>Periodic safety meetings</p> <p>Periodic site inspections by corporate safety officer</p> <p>Occasional worker injuries</p> <p>Workers generally aware of safety issues</p> | <p>Disregard for OSHA requirements</p> <p>Frequent failure to follow TMPs</p> <p>Poor housekeeping</p> <p>Inadequate or no fall protection</p> <p>Frequent worker injuries</p> <p>Workers are unable to speak up about safety issues</p> |

Subcontractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines

3. **SCHEDULE:** Maintains work progress in accordance with approved schedule of operations and all subsequent approved modifications.

| Schedule* | | |
|--|--|--|
| *Schedule impacts outside Contractor's control are not to be considered failure to control the schedule. | | |
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Full use of schedule to manage construction progress | General adherence to work plan | Routine failure to complete work as planned |
| Prompt re-submittal of schedules as required or requested | General attention to schedule as an important part of the contract | General lack of urgency in completing work |
| Full adherence to stated plan for prosecuting work | Reasonable response to schedule submittal requirements/requests | Failure to submit required/requested schedules |

4. **HOME OFFICE SUPPORT:** Refers to all aspects of Project Management including, but not limited to support for field operation needed to prosecute work, scheduling, timely submission of shop drawings/plans, erection/demolition procedures, material acquisition schedules and extra work order proposals.

| Home Office Support | | |
|---|---|--|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Full support from home office | General support from home office | Lack of support from home office |
| Timely, accurate submissions | Generally on time and accurate submittals | Late, incomplete submittals |
| Materials always available when required by field | Materials available when needed | Materials unavailable when needed by field |

Subcontractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines

- 5. FIELD SUPERVISION/SUPERINTENDENT:** Must demonstrate knowledge of construction and contract documents necessary to complete the work as specified. The superintendent must also cooperate fully with Department personnel and all other interested parties so that work progresses as scheduled. The superintendent must be authorized to make decisions in the field that are binding upon the Contractor. In addition, the superintendent must demonstrate effective supervision and staffing of labor force, effective scheduling of subcontractors and proper prosecution of work.

| Field Supervision/Superintendent | | |
|--|---|---|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Demonstrates full knowledge of contract requirements | Reasonable knowledge of contract requirements | Does not demonstrate working knowledge of contract requirements |
| Fully cooperates with all reasonable requests | Generally cooperates with reasonable requests | Refuses to cooperate with reasonable requests |
| Effectively manages workforce | Generally capable of managing workforce | Unable to properly manage workforce |
| Fully authorized and capable of making jobsite decisions | Able to make jobsite decisions | Unable to make jobsite decisions |

- 6. CONTRACT COMPLIANCE:** Submittal of all documents required by the contract, but not directly needed for doing construction, such as payroll affidavits, EEO reports, trainees, manpower projections and material certifications.

| Contract Compliance | | |
|---|--|---|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Fully compliant with Division I contract requirements | General overall compliance with contract paperwork | Non-compliant with contract paperwork |
| Material certifications received with material deliveries | EEO, material certifications and certified payrolls generally received as required | Certified payrolls late |
| Certified payrolls received with estimates | | Incomplete, late submissions of material certifications |

Subcontractor Performance Report Rating Guidelines

7. **EQUIPMENT:** Refers to all equipment, machinery and operators used on the project. Equipment must be suitable and readily available, when needed, for all phases of the project. Equipment operators must demonstrate proficiency and skill in the operation of said equipment.

| Equipment | | |
|---|--|--|
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| Equipment always available when needed | Equipment usually available when needed | Equipment frequently unavailable |
| Equipment well maintained | Equipment reasonably well maintained | Equipment poorly maintained |
| Operators highly skilled and show proficiency in operation of equipment | Operators show proficiency in operation of equipment | Operators lack proficiency in operation of equipment |

8. **PAYMENT OF ACCOUNTS:** Refers to the timely payment of undisputed invoices submitted by the subcontractors, material suppliers and police.

| Payment of Accounts* | | |
|--|---|--|
| *Funding/payment issues outside the contractor's control are not to be considered evidence of non-payment or late payment. | | |
| <u>10</u> | <u>8</u> | <u>4</u> |
| No evidence of non-payment of subcontractors and suppliers | Occasional evidence of non-payment or late payment; i.e. sub mobilization or material deliveries delayed pending payment. No impact to project schedule. Holding of payment for legitimate contractual reasons is not to be considered "non-payment". | Repeated delays to the work due to deliveries or sub mobilizations delayed for non-payment Subcontractors lost for non-payment Pos cancelled for non-payment |