

## **ENGINEERING DIRECTIVE**

Frank Tramontozzi (signature on original)

---

CHIEF ENGINEER

### **Design Consultant Performance Evaluations**

The purpose of this Engineering Directive is to establish a formal procedure for evaluating the performance of consultant engineering firms during the design phase of projects advanced by the MassDOT Highway Division. This procedure is effective immediately and replaces all previous procedures used by the MassDOT Highway Division to evaluate the performance of design consultants.

This procedure applies to design services completed directly under MassDOT contracts and to design services completed under contracts administered by municipalities or other outside entities. This procedure does not apply to non-design architect and engineering services, such as bridge inspection, bridge rating, materials inspection, planning and survey.

All Project Managers shall complete a Consultant Evaluation Workbook (MS Excel format) for every prime consultant design assignment and for each subconsultant design assignment with a fee in excess of \$50,000. Project Managers are responsible for entering all information into the Workbook, including scores provided by Reviewing Sections throughout the design phase. Reviewing Sections are responsible for providing evaluation scores to the Project Manager as part of their design reviews at each design submission stage.

The Workbook contains a two-page Performance Evaluation Form which shall be completed/generated either immediately following project bid opening or at the conclusion of the contract, whichever comes first. The Performance Evaluation Forms shall be signed by the Project Manager and forwarded to the design consultant for review and signature. Typically, a Principal-in-Charge shall review, sign and return the Performance Evaluation Form for the design consultant. The Director/Section Head of the unit responsible for the design consultant assignment shall review and sign all completed Performance Evaluation Forms and shall then forward each completed form to the Architects and Engineers Review Board for review.

Project Managers shall retain copies of completed Performance Evaluations as part of the project file for each design assignment.

The Consultant Evaluation Workbook and Performance Evaluation Form shall not be altered by individuals, but may be updated periodically by MassDOT. These materials shall be made available to Project Managers through e-mail, shared electronic work spaces, or other similar method.

Attachment: Performance Evaluation Form

<b>PERFORMANCE EVALUATION</b> <b>ARCHITECT-ENGINEER PROFESSIONAL SERVICES CONSULTANT</b>					
Name & Address of Consultant		Project No			
		Project Description			
Type of Services				Complexity of Project	
<b>Contract Data</b>					
Contract No		NTP Date		Maximum Obligation	
Contract Assignment		Completion Date		Amount Paid	
Method of Payment		Percent of Work Complete			
Description and Costs of Sub-Contracts (if any)					
<b>Project Manager Evaluation</b>					
Responsiveness to comments			Efficient Use of Workhours		
Involvement of Key Personnel in Engineering Services			Ability to work within budget amount or fee		
Manner in which Work was Organized and Accomplished			Overall Design Schedule Adherence		
Clearness & Completeness of Presentation			Local Office Staffing and Equipment		
Evidence of Ingenuity and Experience in Design			Capability for doing more complex work		
Performance at Public Hearings and Other Meetings			Preparation of Invoices and Other Billing Material		
			Project Manager Evaluation		
Reasons for Delays (if any)					
<b>Project Manager Comments</b>					
<b>Overall Evaluation</b>		<div style="display: flex; align-items: center;"> <div style="flex: 1; text-align: center;"> 0      1      2      3      4      5      6      7      8      9      10 </div> <div style="flex: 1; border-top: 1px solid black; position: relative;"> <div style="position: absolute; top: -10px; left: 0; right: 0; border-bottom: 1px solid black;"></div> </div> </div>			
(See Page 2 for Reviewing Section Scores)		<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; padding: 0 10px;"> <span>Unacceptable</span> <span>Below Average</span> <span>Average</span> <span>Above Average</span> <span>Exceptional</span> </div>			
Submitted by: _____		Title: _____		_____	
		Section: _____		<b>Evaluation Date</b>	

<b>PERFORMANCE EVALUATION</b> <b>ARCHITECT-ENGINEER PROFESSIONAL SERVICES CONSULTANT</b>							<b>EVALUATION DATE:</b>																																									
<b>Consultant:</b>		<b>Contract No:</b>			<b>Project No:</b>																																											
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p><b>DISTRICT ROADWAY REVIEWS:</b></p> <div style="display: flex; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="margin-right: 10px;"> 25% 75% 100% </div> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 80px; height: 60px; position: relative;"> <div style="background-color: #cccccc; width: 100%; height: 100%;"></div> </div> </div> </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p><b>ABP CONTROLS:</b></p> <div style="display: flex; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="margin-right: 10px;"> Design Schedules Construction Time Determination Study Construction Estimating Planning Considerations </div> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 80px; height: 60px; position: relative;"> <div style="background-color: #cccccc; width: 100%; height: 100%;"></div> </div> </div> </div> </div>																																																
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p><b>BRIDGE REVIEWS:</b></p> <div style="display: flex; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="margin-right: 10px;"> Type Study/Sketch Plans      35% Final Design                      35% Specs &amp; Estimate                30% </div> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 80px; height: 60px; position: relative;"> <div style="background-color: #cccccc; width: 100%; height: 100%;"></div> </div> </div> </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p><b>OTHER REVIEWS:</b></p> <div style="display: flex; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="margin-right: 10px;"> AAB/ADA Bike/Ped Landscape </div> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 80px; height: 60px; position: relative;"> <div style="background-color: #cccccc; width: 100%; height: 100%;"></div> </div> </div> </div> </div>																																																
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p><b>BOSTON TRAFFIC REVIEWS:</b></p> <div style="display: flex; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="margin-right: 10px;"> 25% 75% 100% </div> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 80px; height: 60px; position: relative;"> <div style="background-color: #cccccc; width: 100%; height: 100%;"></div> </div> </div> </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p><b>ROW:</b></p> <div style="display: flex; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="margin-right: 10px;"> Preliminary ROW Plans Layout Plans and Instruments </div> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 80px; height: 60px; position: relative;"> <div style="background-color: #cccccc; width: 100%; height: 100%;"></div> </div> </div> </div> </div>																																																
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p><b>ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEWS:</b></p> <div style="display: flex; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="margin-right: 10px;"> 25%/Early Env Coordination MEPA/NEPA Wetlands/Water Quality Cultural Resources Hazardous Materials </div> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 80px; height: 60px; position: relative;"> <div style="background-color: #cccccc; width: 100%; height: 100%;"></div> </div> </div> </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p><b>PROJECT MANAGER:</b></p> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 80px; height: 60px; position: relative;"> <div style="background-color: #cccccc; width: 100%; height: 100%;"></div> </div> </div> </div>																																																
<p><b>OVERALL QUALITY OF DESIGN:</b></p> <table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th style="text-align: center;">Distr.</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Bridge</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Envir.</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Traffic</th> <th style="text-align: center;">ROW</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Other</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Proj. Mgr.</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Controls</th> <th></th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Evaluation:</td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Weight:</td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Weighted Score:</td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px;"></td> <td style="border: 1px solid black; width: 50px; height: 20px; text-align: center; vertical-align: middle;"> <i>Weighted Score</i> </td> </tr> </tbody> </table>										Distr.	Bridge	Envir.	Traffic	ROW	Other	Proj. Mgr.	Controls		Evaluation:										Weight:										Weighted Score:									<i>Weighted Score</i>
	Distr.	Bridge	Envir.	Traffic	ROW	Other	Proj. Mgr.	Controls																																								
Evaluation:																																																
Weight:																																																
Weighted Score:									<i>Weighted Score</i>																																							
<b>CONSULTANT COMMENTS - Additional comments may be submitted separately.</b>																																																
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> Reviewed by PIC*: _____ </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> Title: _____ Date: _____ </div> </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; margin-top: 10px;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> Approved by: _____ </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> Title: _____ Date: _____ </div> </div> <p style="text-align: center; margin-top: 5px;"><b>MassDOT - Highway Division</b></p>																																																
<p>This form is to be submitted by the Section Head to the Secretary of the Architects &amp; Engineers Review Board at completion of work (not including construction stage) or at any other time when such a report may be pertinent.</p>																																																
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div>* Principal In Charge</div> <div>Page 2 of 2</div> </div>																																																