Where the claimant presented new evidence regarding his earnings, the DUA must properly enter those earnings into the UI Online computer system and recalculate the claimant's entitlement to benefits. He is eligible for benefits in any week in which he was in total unemployment or in which he was in partial unemployment, so long as he is otherwise eligible under Chapter 151A.

Board of Review 19 Staniford St., 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Boston, MA 02114 Phone: 617-626-6400

Fax: 617-727-5874

Issue ID: 0021 7769 54

Paul T. Fitzgerald, Esq. Chairman Charlene A. Stawicki, Esq. Member Michael J. Albano Member

# **BOARD OF REVIEW DECISION**

### <u>Introduction and Procedural History of this Appeal</u>

The claimant appeals a decision by a review examiner of the Department of Unemployment Assistance (DUA), which found the claimant overpaid benefits due to the misreporting of his earnings from January 17, 2016, through January 14, 2017. He was found to be overpaid pursuant to the provisions of G.L. c. 151A, §§ 29 and 1.

The claimant had filed a claim for unemployment benefits in January of 2016, and the claim was determined to be effective January 17, 2016. Thereafter, the claimant certified for benefits while also reporting some partial earnings during the benefit year of the claim. On August 3, 2017, the DUA issued a Notice of Disqualification, which provided that the claimant had incorrectly reported his earnings to the DUA during the benefit year of his claim, and which notified him that he had been overpaid. The claimant appealed to the DUA Hearings Department. Following a hearing on the merits, the review examiner affirmed the agency's initial determination in a decision rendered on December 23, 2017. The claimant sought review by the Board, which denied the appeal, and the claimant appealed to the District Court, pursuant to G.L. c. 151A, § 42.

On May 31, 2018, the District Court ordered the Board to obtain further evidence. Consistent with this order, we remanded the case to the review examiner to take additional evidence concerning the claimant's earnings during the benefit year of the claim effective January 17, 2016. The claimant attended the remand hearing. Thereafter, the review examiner issued her consolidated findings of fact.

The issue before the Board is whether the review examiner's decision, which concluded that the claimant incorrectly reported his earnings to the DUA, thus causing him to be overpaid unemployment benefits, is supported by substantial and credible evidence and is free from error of law.

After reviewing the entire record, including the documentary evidence submitted at the remand hearing, the review examiner's consolidated findings of fact, and the District Court's Order, we affirm in part and reverse in part the review examiner's decision.

### Findings of Fact

The review examiner's consolidated findings of fact, which were issued following the District Court remand, are set forth below in their entirety:

- 1. The claimant started working for the employer, a construction company, in April 2011 initially as a fulltime laborer. The employer has periods of time when there is no work available for the claimant due to lack of work and periods of time the claimant's hours are reduced due to lack of work.
- 2. The claimant is always able and available to work fulltime with the employer.
- 3. On January 19, 2016, the claimant filed an initial claim for Unemployment Insurance Benefits (hereinafter benefits). The claim is effective the week beginning January 17, 2016 and expired on January 14, 2017 (Exhibit 5).
- 4. The claimant's weekly benefit rate, on the claim effective January 17, 2016, was \$632 (Exhibit 3). The claimant's weekly earning exclusion amount was \$210.67 (Exhibit 3).
- 5. The employer's pay week begins on Wednesday and ends on Tuesday.
- 6. The Department of Unemployment Assistance's (hereinafter the Department) week begins on a Sunday and ends on a Saturday.
- 7. The Department received a Payroll Inquiry Report from the employer listing the claimant's gross earnings for the period of time running from January 17, 2016 through January 14, 2017 (Exhibit 7). This Payroll Inquiry Report lists weekly wage information based upon the employer's pay period.
- 8. The Department updated the claimant's gross wages in the Department's database to reflect the claimant's correct gross wages as listed in the Payroll Inquiry Report provided by the employer.
- 9. On August 3, 2017, the Department issued a Notice of Disqualification, Issue Identification Number 0021 7769 54, under Sections 29(a) (b) & 1(r) of the Law covering the period of time running from January 17, 2016 through January 14, 2017 (Exhibits 12 & 1). On the Notice of Disqualification, the Department listed the following information: "You failed to accurately report your gross [earnings] for the week in which you worked. You are entitled to partial benefits for any week in which you are employed less than a full-time schedule of hours and earn less than your allowable amount (Exhibit 12)." As a result of the Notice of Disqualification, the claimant was overpaid

\$12,009.00 in previously received benefits for the weeks ending January 30, 2016 through April 30, 2016, May 21, 2016 through July 30, 2016, August 20, 2016, September 10, 2016 through September 17, 2016, October 8, 2016 through October 29, 2016, November 12, 2016 through December 17, 2016 and January 7, 2017 (Exhibit 12).

- 10. The Notice of Disqualification was affirmed at the Hearings Level.
- 11. The claimant appealed the Notice of Disqualification to the Board of Review and the District Court.
- 12. The issue was remanded for additional evidence.
- 13. The claimant subsequently obtained an Employee Hours with Wages report from the employer listing the claimant's daily gross wages for the period of time running from January 17, 2016 through January 14, 2017 (Remand Exhibit 10).
- 14. The following is a list of the claimant's daily gross wages, weekly gross wages, daily hourly rate for the weeks the claimant requested on his benefits claim running from January 17, 2016 through January 14, 2017 (Remand Exhibit 10):

Week 1	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	01/17/16	01/18/16	01/19/16	01/20/16	01/21/16	01/22/16	01/23/16
Hourly Rate				\$36.35	\$36.35		
Hours Worked	0	0	0	8	8	0	0
Gross Daily Wage				\$290.80	\$290.80		
Gross Weekly Wage	\$581.60						
Weekly Hours Worked	16						

Week 2	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	01/24/16	01/25/16	01/26/16	01/27/16	01/28/16	01/29/16	01/30/16
Hourly Rate			\$36.35				
Hours Worked	0	0	8	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage			\$290.80				
Gross Weekly Wage	\$290.80						
Weekly Hours Worked	8						

Week 3	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	01/31/16	02/01/16	02/02/16	02/03/16	02/03/16	02/04/16	02/05/16	02/06/16
Hourly Rate		\$53.030	\$53.030	\$36.350	\$36.500	\$36.350	\$36.350	
Hours Worked		8	8	8	8	8	8	
Gross Daily								
Wage		\$424.24	\$424.24	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	
_				Job#5914	Job#7051			
Gross Weekly Wage	\$2,011.68							
Weekly Hours	40							
<u>Worked</u>	48							

Week 4	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	02/07/16	02/08/16	02/09/16	02/10/16	02/11/16	02/12/16	02/13/16
Hourly Rate		\$35.35	\$36.35	\$36.35		\$36.35	
Hours Worked	0	8	8	8	0	8	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$282.80	\$290.80	\$290.80		\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,155.20						
Weekly Hours Worked	32						

Week 5	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	02/14/16	02/15/16	02/16/16	02/17/16	02/18/16	02/19/16	02/20/16
Hourly Rate							
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage							
Gross Weekly Wage	\$0.00						
Weekly Hours Worked							

Week 6	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	02/21/16	02/22/16	02/23/16	02/24/16	02/25/16	02/26/16	02/27/16
Hourly Rate							
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage							
Gross Weekly Wage	\$0.00						
Weekly Hours Worked							

Week 7	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	02/28/16	02/29/16	03/01/16	03/02/16	03/03/16	03/04/16	03/05/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	
Hours Worked	0	8	8	8	8	8	
Gross Daily Wage		\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,454.00	, = 2 3 3 3 3	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	4 = 2 0 1 0 0	+ 22 3133	, 2, 3, 3	
Weekly Hours Worked	40						

Week 8	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	03/06/16	03/07/16	03/08/16	03/09/16	03/10/16	03/11/16	03/12/16
<u>Hourly</u> <u>Rate</u>		\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	
Hours Worked		8	8	8	8	8	
Gross Daily Wage		\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,454.00						
Weekly Hours Worked	40						

Week 9	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	03/13/16	03/14/16	03/15/16	03/16/16	03/17/16	03/18/16	03/19/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.35					
Hours Worked	0	8	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$290.80					
Gross Weekly Wage	\$290.80						
Weekly Hours Worked	8						

Week	Complex	Manday	Tuesday	Wadnaaday	Thursday	Enidos.	Caturday
10	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	03/20/16	03/21/16	03/22/16	03/23/16	03/24/16	03/25/16	03/26/16
Hourly Rate				\$36.35	\$36.35		
Kate				ψ30.33	Ψ30.33		
Hours Worked	0	0	0	8	8		
Gross							
Daily							
Wage				\$290.80	\$290.80		
Gross							
Weekly							
Wage	\$581.60						
wage	\$361.00						
Weekly							
Hours							
Worked	16						

Week							
11	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	03/27/16	03/28/16	03/29/16	03/30/16	03/31/16	04/01/16	04/02/16
Hourly							
Rate		\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	
Hours							
Worked	0	2	8	8	8	8	0
Gross Daily		<b>472.7</b> 0	<b>#200.00</b>	<b>\$200.00</b>	<b>#200.00</b>	<b>#200.00</b>	
<u>Wage</u>		\$72.70	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,235.90						
Weekly Hours Worked	34						

Week							
12	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	04/03/16	04/04/16	04/05/16	04/06/16	04/07/16	04/08/16	04/09/16
Hourly Rate					\$36.35	\$36.35	
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	8	8	0
Gross Daily Wage					\$290.80	\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$581.60				Ψ270.00	Ψ230.00	
Weekly Hours Worked	16						

Week	a 1			***		<b>7</b>	G 1
13	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	Tuesday	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	04/10/16	04/11/16	04/12/16	04/13/16	04/14/16	04/15/16	04/16/16
Hourly		Φ2 <i>C</i> 25	Φ2 <i>C</i> 25		\$2.C.25	Φ2.C. 2.5	
Rate		\$36.35	\$36.35		\$36.35	\$36.35	
<u>Hours</u>							
<u>Worked</u>	0	8	8	0	8	8	0
Gross Daily							
Wage		\$290.80	\$290.80		\$290.80	\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,163.20				Sick Day		
wage	\$1,103.20				SICK Day		
Weekly							
Hours Worked	24						
Sick	2-1						
<u>Pay</u>	8						

Week 14	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Tuesday	Tuesday	Wednesday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
Date	04/17/16	04/18/16	04/19/16	04/20/16	04/20/16	04/21/16	04/22/16	04/23/16
Hourly Rate			\$36.350	\$36.350	\$35.350	\$36.350	\$36.350	
Hours Worked			8	8	8	8	8	
Gross Daily								
Wage			\$290.80	\$290.80	\$282.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	
_				Job#7180	Job#138			
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,446.00							
Weekly Hours								
<b>Worked</b>	40							

Week							
15	<u>Sunday</u>	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	04/24/16	04/25/16	04/26/16	04/27/16	04/28/16	04/29/16	04/30/16
Hourly Rate				53.03		\$36.35	
Hours Worked	0	0	0	8	0	8	0
Gross Daily Wage				\$424.24		\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$715.04						
Weekly Hours Worked	16						

Week							
16-							
Delined UI	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	05/01/16	05/02/16	05/03/16	05/04/16	05/05/16	05/06/16	05/07/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	
Hours Worked	0	8	8	8	8	8	
Gross Daily Wage		\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,454.00						
Weekly Hours Worked	40						

Week 17	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	05/15/16	05/16/16	05/17/16	05/18/16	05/18/16	05/19/16	05/20/16	05/21/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.350	\$36.350	\$36.350	\$53.030	\$36.350	\$36.350	
Hours Worked	0	8	8	8	2	8	8	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$106.06	\$290.80	\$290.80	
_				Job#7121	#7121-300			
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,560.06		Sick Day					
Weekly Hours Worked	34							
Sick Day	8							

Week 18	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	05/22/16	05/23/16	05/24/16	05/24/16	05/25/16	05/26/16	05/27/16	05/28/16
Hourly Rate			\$36.350	\$36.350		\$36.350	\$36.350	
Hours Worked	0	0	8	8	0	8	8	0
Gross Daily Wage			\$290.80	\$290.80		\$290.80	\$290.80	
<u>wage</u>			Job#7121	Job#6259		Ψ270.00	Ψ270.00	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,163.20							
Weekly Hours Worked	32							

Week							
19	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	05/29/16	05/30/16	05/31/16	06/01/16	06/02/16	06/03/16	06/04/16
Hourly Rate			\$36.35	\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	
Hours Worked	0	0	8	8	8	8	0
Gross Daily			420000	000100	420100	<b>\$20.1.00</b>	
Wage			\$290.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,175.20						
Weekly Hours	. ,						
Worked	32						

Week							
20	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	06/05/16	06/06/16	06/07/16	06/08/16	06/09/16	06/10/16	06/11/16
Hourly							
Rate				\$36.85			
Hours							
Worked	0	0	0	8	0	0	0
Gross							
<u>Daily</u>							
<u>Wage</u>				\$294.80			
Gross							
Weekly							
Wage	\$294.80						
Weekly							
Hours							
Worked	8						

Week							
21	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	06/12/16	06/13/16	06/14/16	06/15/16	06/16/16	06/17/16	06/18/16
Hourly Rate						\$36.85	
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	0	8	0
Gross Daily Wage						\$294.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$294.80						
Weekly Hours Worked	8						

Week							
22	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	06/19/16	06/20/16	06/21/16	06/22/16	06/23/16	06/24/16	06/25/16
Hourly							
Rate		\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	
Hours							
Worked	0	8	8	8	8	8	0
Gross							
<u>Daily</u>							
Wage		\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	
Gross Weekly	Φ1 4 <b>5</b> 4 00						
Wage	\$1,474.00						
Weekly Hours							
Worked	40						

Week							
23	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	06/26/16	06/27/16	06/28/16	06/29/16	06/30/16	07/01/16	07/02/16
Hourly Rate					\$36.85		
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	8	0	0
Gross Daily Wage					\$294.80		
Gross Weekly Wage	\$294.80						
Weekly Hours Worked	8						

Week							
24	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	Tuesday	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	07/03/16	07/04/16	07/05/16	07/06/16	07/07/16	07/08/16	07/09/16
<u>Hourly</u>							
<u>Rate</u>			\$36.85			\$36.85	
Hours							
Worked	0	0	8	0	0	8	0
<u>Gross</u>							
<u>Daily</u> <u>Wage</u>			\$294.80			\$294.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$589.60						
Weekly Hours Worked	16						

Week							
25	<u>Sunday</u>	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	07/10/16	07/11/16	07/12/16	07/13/16	07/14/16	07/15/16	07/16/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.85	\$36.85				
Hours Worked	0	8	8	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$294.80	\$294.80				
Gross Weekly Wage	\$589.60						
Weekly Hours Worked	16						

Week 26	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday
Date	07/17/16	07/18/16	07/19/16	07/20/16	07/21/16	07/22/16	07/23/16
Hourly Rate				\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	
Hours Worked	0	0	0	8	8	8	0
Gross Daily Wage				\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$884.40						
Weekly Hours Worked	24						

Week							
27	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	07/24/16	07/25/16	07/26/16	07/27/16	07/28/16	07/29/16	07/30/16
Hourly							
Rate		\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85		
Hours							
Worked	0	8	8	8	8	0	0
Gross							
Daily							
Wage		\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80		
Gross							
Weekly							
Wage	\$1,179.20						
Weekly							
Hours							
Worked	32						

Week	a 1			***			a 1
28	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	07/31/16	08/01/16	08/02/16	08/03/16	08/04/16	08/05/16	08/06/16
Hourly Rate							
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage							
Gross Weekly Wage	\$0.00						
Weekly Hours Worked	0						

Week							
29	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	08/07/16	08/08/16	08/09/16	08/10/16	08/11/16	08/12/16	08/13/16
Hourly Rate							
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage							
Gross Weekly Wage	\$0.00						
Weekly Hours Worked	0						

Week							
30	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	08/14/16	08/15/16	08/16/16	08/17/16	08/18/16	08/19/16	08/20/16
Hourly							
<u>Rate</u>				\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	
Hours							
Worked	0	0	0	8	8	8	
Gross							
<u>Daily</u>							
<u>Wage</u>				\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	
Gross Weekly							
Wage	\$884.40						
Weekly Hours	24						
Worked	24						

Week							
31	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	08/21/16	08/22/16	08/23/16	08/24/16	08/25/16	08/26/16	08/27/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.85	\$35.85				
		Ψ30.03	Ψ33.03				
<u>Hours</u> <u>Worked</u>	0	8	8	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily							
Wage		\$294.80	\$286.80				
Gross Weekly Wage	\$581.60						
Weekly Hours Worked	8		Sick Day				
Sick Hours	8		- Luj				

Week							
32	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	08/28/16	08/29/16	08/30/16	08/31/16	09/01/16	09/02/16	09/03/16
Hourly Rate							
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage							
Gross Weekly Wage	\$0.00						
Weekly Hours Worked	0						

Week 33	Sunday	Monday	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	Thursday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	09/04/16	09/05/16	09/06/16	09/07/16	09/08/16	09/08/16	09/09/16	9/9/2016	9/10/2016
Hourly Rate					\$36.100	\$54.150	\$36.100	\$54.150	54.15
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	8	1	8	3	8
Gross Daily Wage					\$288.80	\$54.15	\$288.80	162.45	433.2
-									
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,227.40								
Weekly Hours Worked	28								

Week							
34	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	09/11/16	09/12/16	09/13/16	09/14/16	09/15/16	09/16/16	09/17/16
Hourly							
Rate		\$36.10	\$36.10	\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	
Hours							
Worked	0	8	8	8	8	8	0
Gross							
<u>Daily</u>							
Wage		\$288.80	\$288.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	
Gross							
Weekly							
Wage	\$1,462.00						
Weekly							
Hours							
Worked	40						

Week							
35	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	09/18/16	09/19/16	09/20/16	09/21/16	09/22/16	09/23/16	09/24/16
Hourly Rate							
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage							
Gross Weekly Wage	\$0.00						
Weekly Hours Worked	0						

Week							
36	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	09/25/16	09/26/16	09/27/16	09/28/16	09/29/16	09/30/16	10/01/16
Hourly Rate							
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage							
Gross Weekly Wage	\$0.00						
Weekly Hours Worked	0						

Week							
37	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	10/02/16	10/03/16	10/04/16	10/05/16	10/06/16	10/07/16	10/08/16
Hourly Rate				\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	
Hours Worked	0	0	0	8	8	8	0
Gross Daily Wage				\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$884.40			Ψ274.00	Ψ274.00	Ψ254.00	
Weekly Hours Worked	24						

Week							
38	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	10/09/16	10/10/16	10/11/16	10/12/16	10/13/16	10/14/16	10/15/16
Hourly							
<u>Rate</u>			\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	
Hours							
Worked		0	8	8	8	8	0
Gross							
Daily							
Wage			\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	
Gross							
Weekly							
Wage	\$1,179.20						
Weekly							
Hours							
Worked	32						

Week							
39	<u>Sunday</u>	Monday	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	10/16/16	10/17/16	10/18/16	10/19/16	10/20/16	10/21/16	10/22/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	\$36.85	
Hours Worked		8	8	8	8	8	0
Gross Daily							
Wage		\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	\$294.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,474.00						
Weekly Hours							
Worked	40						

Week	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
40							
<u>Date</u>	10/23/16	10/24/16	10/25/16	10/26/16	10/27/16	10/28/16	10/29/16
Hourly Pote		\$36.85					
Rate							
<u>Hours</u> <u>Worked</u>	0	8	0	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$294.80					
Gross Weekly Wage	\$294.80						
Weekly Hours Worked	8						

Week							
41	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	10/30/16	10/31/16	11/01/16	11/02/16	11/03/16	11/04/16	11/05/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.85	\$55.28				
Hours Worked	0	8	8	0	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$294.80	\$442.24				
Gross Weekly Wage	\$737.04	, , , , , ,	*******				
Weekly Hours Worked	16						

Week							
42	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	11/06/16	11/07/16	11/08/16	11/09/16	11/10/16	11/11/16	11/12/16
Hourly		<b>42.5.07</b>		<b>****</b>			
Rate		\$36.85		\$55.28			
<u>Hours</u>							
<u>Worked</u>	0	8	0	8	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$294.80		\$442.24			
Gross Weekly Wage	\$737.04						
Weekly Hours Worked	16						

Week 43	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
Date	11/13/16	11/14/16	11/15/16	11/16/16	11/17/16	11/18/16	11/19/16
Hourly Rate			\$36.85	\$36.85		\$36.85	
Hours Worked	0	0	8	8	0	8	0
Gross Daily Wage			\$294.80	\$294.80		\$294.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$884.40						
Weekly Hours Worked	24						

Week								
44	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	11/20/16	11/21/16	11/22/16	11/23/16	11/23/16	11/24/16	11/25/16	11/26/2016
Hourly								
Rate				\$36.850	\$35.850			
Hours								
Worked	0	0	0	4	4	0	0	0
Gross								
<u>Daily</u>								
<u>Wage</u>				\$147.40	\$143.40			
_								
Gross								
Weekly								
Wage	<u>\$290.80</u>							
Weekly								
<b>Hours</b>								
<b>Worked</b>	8							

Week 45	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday
Date	11/27/16	11/28/16	11/29/16	11/30/16	12/01/16	12/02/16	12/03/16
Hourly Rate			\$36.85	\$37.35	\$37.35	\$37.35	
Hours Worked	0	0	8	8	8	8	0
Gross Daily			\$294.80	\$298.80	\$298.80	\$298.80	
Wage Gross Weekly			\$294.60	\$278.80	\$290.00	\$298.80	
Wage	\$1,191.20						
Weekly Hours Worked	32						

Week							
46	<u>Sunday</u>	<b>Monday</b>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	Thursday	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	12/04/16	12/05/16	12/06/16	12/07/16	12/08/16	12/09/16	12/10/16
Hourly Rate		\$37.35		\$37.35		\$37.35	
Hours Worked	0	8	0	8	0	8	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$298.80		\$298.80		\$298.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$896.40						
Weekly Hours Worked	24						

Week							
47	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	12/11/16	12/12/16	12/13/16	12/14/16	12/15/16	12/16/16	12/17/16
<u>Hourly</u> <u>Rate</u>			\$56.03	\$56.03			
Hours Worked	0	0	8	8	0	0	0
Gross Daily Wage			\$448.24	\$448.24			
Gross Weekly Wage	\$896.48						
Weekly Hours Worked	16						

Week 48-							
Decline UI	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday
<u>Date</u>	12/18/16	12/19/16	12/20/16	12/21/16	12/22/16	12/23/16	12/24/16
Hourly Rate		\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	\$36.35	
Hours Worked	0	8	8	8	8	8	0
Gross Daily Wage		\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	\$290.80	
Gross Weekly Wage	\$1,454.00			Sick Day			
Weekly Hours Worked	32						
Sick Day	8						

Week	G 1	M 1	T 1	XX 1 1	TC1 1	E ' 1	G . 1
49	<u>Sunday</u>	<u>Monday</u>	<u>Tuesday</u>	Wednesday	<u>Thursday</u>	<u>Friday</u>	<u>Saturday</u>
<u>Date</u>	01/01/17	01/02/17	01/03/17	01/04/17	01/05/17	01/06/17	01/07/17
Hourly Rate					\$56.03		
Hours Worked	0	0	0	0	8	0	0
Gross Daily Wage					\$448.24		
Gross Weekly Wage	\$448.24						
Weekly Hours Worked	8						

- 15. In May 2017, the Department mailed the claimant questionnaires inquiring about his employment with the employer. In May 2017, the Department first notified the claimant that he may have underreported his wages from the employer.
- 16. The claimant's schedule and pay rate fluctuated from week to week during this time period. The rate of pay fluctuated depending on the time of day the claimant worked, the day of the week the claimant worked, and if the claimant was working as a foreman or non-foreman.
- 17. The claimant would learn his pay rate for this period of time when the claimant looked at his paystubs from the employer.
- 18. The claimant could not have reported the exact wages from the employer during the weeks he requested benefits based upon the information the employer provided the claimant when he was paid.
- 19. The claimant's educational level is high school.
- 20. The claimant had zero record keeping habits during the weeks he requested benefits.
- 21. The claimant knew the Department's work week was different than employer's work week. The claimant knew the Department's work week ran from Sunday to Saturday.
- 22. The claimant was estimating his wages he reported to the Department for the weeks he requested benefits. The claimant spoke with his co-workers about reporting earnings to the Department. The claimant's co-workers informed the claimant to estimate the wages he reported to the Department.
- 23. The claimant did not intend to misreport his earnings to the Department.

#### Ruling of the Board

In accordance with our statutory obligation, we review the decision made by the review examiner to determine: (1) whether the consolidated findings are supported by substantial and credible evidence; and (2) whether the review examiner's original conclusion is free from error of law. Upon such review, the Board adopts the review examiner's consolidated findings of fact, except for portions of Weeks 3 and 14 within Consolidated Finding of Fact # 14. As to Week 3, the hourly rate of pay, as indicated in Remand Exhibit # 10, for February 3, 2016, was \$36.35, not \$36.50. As to Week 14, we note that April 20, 2016, was a Wednesday and April 21, 2016, was a Thursday. These typographical errors did not affect the amount of earnings noted in Consolidated Finding of Fact # 14. We deem the remaining consolidated findings to be supported by substantial and credible evidence. As discussed more fully below, we agree with the review examiner and the DUA that the claimant incorrectly reported his earnings to the DUA during the benefit year of the claim effective January 17, 2016; however, based on the new

earnings information provided during the remand hearing, the amount of any overpayment must be recalculated.

The DUA initially issued the Notice of Disqualification in this matter pursuant to G.L. c. 151A, § 29 and 1. G.L. c. 151A, § 29, authorizes benefits to be paid only to those in "total unemployment" or "partial unemployment." These terms are in turn defined by G.L. c. 151A, § 1(r), which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

- (1) "Partial unemployment", an individual shall be deemed to be in partial unemployment if in any week of less than full-time weekly schedule of work he has earned or has received aggregate remuneration in an amount which is less than the weekly benefit rate to which he would be entitled if totally unemployed during said week....
- (2) "Total unemployment", an individual shall be deemed to be in total unemployment in any week in which he performs no wage-earning services whatever, and for which he receives no remuneration, and in which, though capable and available for work, he is unable to obtain any suitable work.

Whether the claimant was in total or partial unemployment during his benefit year necessarily depends on whether he worked and what he earned in each week he worked.

This case, in practical terms, is essentially one which turns on the verification of the claimant's earnings in his benefit year. The employer had submitted information regarding this to the agency, and the agency based its initial determination on the employer's wage information. During the initial hearing, the claimant offered no new information regarding his earnings. Although he noted that the pay periods used by the employer, which run from Wednesdays to Tuesdays, did not match the DUA's reporting week, which runs from Sunday to Saturday, he offered no specific information about the hours and pay rate. Consequently, the review examiner relied on the information submitted to the agency to render her decision.

The claimant has now submitted new, more accurate information regarding the days he worked, the number of hours he worked, and his pay rate for each day. The total amount of earnings for each week must now be applied to the relevant weeks of the claimant's unemployment claim. Generally, we note that if the claimant did not work at all in a given week, he will be eligible for his full benefit rate, so long as he is otherwise eligible for benefits under Chapter 151A. *See* G.L. c. 151A, § 1(r)(2). If the claimant did work, he will be eligible for benefits pursuant to the terms of G.L. c. 151A, § 1(r)(1). Because the benefit rate on the claim is \$632.00 per week, with an earnings disregard of \$210.67, the claimant can earn up to \$842.67 each week and still receive some benefits. In any week in which he earned over that total amount, he will not be eligible for benefits, even if he worked less than full-time hours, because he will have earned over his benefit rate.

We think it unnecessary here to undertake a detailed discussion for each week, including what the claimant actually earned, what he reported, what the DUA initially paid him, and what he now may be overpaid. Indeed, the consolidated findings of fact do not contain all of that information. It is sufficient for us at this point to simply state what earnings should be attributed

to the weeks the claimant certified for benefits on this claim. Upon implementation of this decision in the DUA's computer system, an updated overpayment figure will be generated.

In summary, the following provides claimant's earnings for the weeks at issue for the claim effective January 17, 2016 are:

```
For the week ending January 23, 2016: $581.60.
For the week ending January 30, 2016: $290.80.
For the week ending February 6, 2016: $2,011.68.
For the week ending February 13, 2016: $1,155.20.
For the week ending February 20, 2016: $0.00.
For the week ending February 27, 2016: $0.00.
For the week ending March 5, 2016: $1,454.00.
For the week ending March 12, 2016: $1,454.00.
For the week ending March 19, 2016: $290.80.
For the week ending March 26, 2016: $581.60.
For the week ending April 2, 2016: $1,235.90.
For the week ending April 9, 2016: $581.60.
For the week ending April 16, 2016: $1,163.20.
For the week ending April 23, 2016: $1,446.00.
For the week ending April 30, 2016: $715.04.
For the week ending May 7, 2016: $1,454.00.
For the week ending May 21, 2016: $1,560.06.
For the week ending May 28, 2016: $1,163.20.
For the week ending June 4, 2016: $1,175.20.
For the week ending June 11, 2016: $294.80.
For the week ending June 18, 2016: $294.80.
For the week ending June 25, 2016: $1,474.00.
For the week ending July 2, 2016: $294.80.
For the week ending July 9, 2016: $589.60.
For the week ending July 16, 2016: $589.60.
For the week ending July 23, 2016: $884.40.
For the week ending July 30, 2016: $1,179.20.
For the week ending August 6, 2016: $0.00.
For the week ending August 13, 2016: $0.00.
For the week ending August 20, 2016: $884.40.
For the week ending August 27, 2016: $581.60.
For the week ending September 3, 2016: $0.00.
For the week ending September 10, 2016: $1,227.40.
For the week ending September 17, 2016: $1,462.00.
For the week ending September 24, 2016: $0.00.
For the week ending October 1, 2016: $0.00.
For the week ending October 8, 2016: $884.40.
For the week ending October 15, 2016: $1,179.20.
For the week ending October 22, 2016: $1,474.00.
For the week ending October 29, 2016: $294.80.
```

For the week ending November 5, 2016: \$737.04

For the week ending November 12, 2016: \$737.04. For the week ending November 19, 2016: \$884.40. For the week ending November 26, 2016: \$290.80. For the week ending December 3, 2016: \$1,191.20. For the week ending December 10, 2016: \$896.40. For the week ending December 17, 2016: \$896.48. For the week ending December 24, 2016: \$1,454.00. For the week ending January 7, 2017: \$448.24.

We, therefore, conclude as a matter of law that the review examiner's decision is affirmed in part and reversed in part. The claimant shall be in total unemployment in any week in which he did not work at all and is otherwise eligible for benefits. The claimant shall be in partial unemployment in any week in which he is otherwise eligible for benefits and he earned less than his benefit rate, after taking into account the earnings disregard provided for in G.L. c. 151A, § 29(b). The amount of any overpayment shall be updated to reflect the correct earnings noted in this decision.

**BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS** DATE OF DECISION - October 24, 2018 Paul T. Fitzgerald, Esq.
Chairman
Chalen A. Stawicki

Charlene A. Stawicki, Esq. Member

Member Michael J. Albano did not participate in this decision.

## ANY FURTHER APPEAL WOULD BE TO A MASSACHUSETTS STATE DISTRICT COURT OR TO THE BOSTON MUNICIPAL COURT (See Section 42, Chapter 151A, General Laws Enclosed)

The last day to appeal this decision to a Massachusetts District Court is thirty days from the mail date on the first page of this decision. If that thirtieth day falls on a Saturday, Sunday, or legal holiday, the last day to appeal this decision is the business day next following the thirtieth day.

To locate the nearest Massachusetts District Court, see: www.mass.gov/courts/court-info/courthouses

Please be advised that fees for services rendered by an attorney or agent to a claimant in connection with an appeal to the Board of Review are not payable unless submitted to the Board of Review for approval, under G.L. c. 151A, § 37.

SF/rh