



The Commonwealth of Massachusetts

AUDITOR OF THE COMMONWEALTH

ONE ASHBURTON PLACE, ROOM 1819
BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS 02108

A. JOSEPH DeNUCCI
AUDITOR

TEL. (617) 727-6200

NO. 2006-0616-3A

**INDEPENDENT STATE AUDITOR'S REPORT
ON THE PHYSICAL CONDITION
OF STATE-AIDED PUBLIC HOUSING UNITS
AND RESOURCES ALLOCATED FOR THE
OPERATION AND UPKEEP OF THE
BOSTON HOUSING AUTHORITY
JULY 1, 2003 TO JUNE 30, 2005**

**OFFICIAL AUDIT
REPORT
SEPTEMBER 22, 2008**

TABLE OF CONTENTS/EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION

1

In accordance with Chapter 11, Section 12, of the Massachusetts General Laws, we have conducted a statewide comprehensive audit of the physical conditions and the resources available to provide for the operation and upkeep of the state-aided public housing authorities of the Commonwealth. To accomplish our audit, we performed work at the Department of Housing and Community Development (DHCD) and obtained data from surveys and site visits to a selected, representative cross-section of 66 Local Housing Authorities (LHAs) throughout the state. The Boston Housing Authority was one of the LHAs selected to be reviewed for the period July 1, 2003 to June 30, 2005. A complete list of the LHAs visited and surveyed is provided in our statewide report No. 2005-5119-3A. Our on-site visits were conducted to follow up on survey data we obtained in order to: observe and evaluate the physical condition of the state-regulated LHAs, review policies and procedures over unit site inspections, determine whether LHA-managed properties were maintained in accordance with public health and safety standards, and review the state modernization funds awarded to determine whether such funds have been received and expended for their intended purpose. In addition, we reviewed the adequacy of the level of funding provided to each LHA for annual operating costs to maintain the exterior and interior of the buildings and housing units, as well as capital renovation infrastructure costs to maximize the public housing stock across the state, and determined whether land already owned by the LHAs could be utilized to build additional affordable housing units. We also determined the number of vacant units, vacancy turnaround time, and whether any units have been taken off line and are no longer available for occupancy by qualifying families or individuals in need of housing. In its response, the Authority indicated that it has a program of planned repairs, coupling day-to-day maintenance delivery with planned capital improvements. The Authority also noted that capital funding from DHCD is still inconsistent and slow.

AUDIT RESULTS

5

1. RESULTS OF INSPECTIONS - NONCOMPLIANCE WITH STATE SANITARY CODE

5

DHCD's Property Maintenance Guide, Chapter 3(F), requires that inspections of dwelling units be conducted annually and upon each vacancy to ensure that every dwelling unit conforms to minimum standards for safe, decent, and sanitary housing as set forth in Chapter II of the State Sanitary Code. On May 2, and 3, 2006, we inspected nine of the 2,804 state-aided housing units managed by the Authority and noted 255 instances of noncompliance with Chapter II of the State Sanitary Code, including peeling paint on ceilings, mold in bathrooms and bedrooms, chipped and broken tiles, holes in walls, broken countertops, antiquated wiring, bug infestation, out-of-date plumbing, damaged floors, and damaged doors.

2. VACANT UNITS NOT REOCCUPIED WITHIN DHCD GUIDELINES

6

DHCD's Property Maintenance Guide indicates that housing authorities should reoccupy units within 21 working days of their being vacated by a tenant. However, our review

found that during the audit period, the Authority's average turnaround time for reoccupying vacant units was 124 days. Moreover, as of June 30, 2005, there were over 180 vacant family and elderly housing units and 13,000 applicants on the Authority's waiting list.

3. MODERNIZATION INITIATIVES NOT FUNDED **6**

In response to our questionnaires, the Authority informed us that there is a need for modernizing its managed properties. Specifically, the Authority submitted requests for funding from DHCD for its capital modernization projects; however, these requests have not been funded by DHCD. Deferring or denying the Authority's modernization needs may result in further deteriorating conditions that could render the units and buildings uninhabitable. Moreover, if the Authority does not receive funding to correct these conditions (which have been reported to DHCD), additional emergency situations may occur, and the Authority's ability to provide safe, decent, and sanitary housing for its elderly and family tenants will be seriously compromised.

4. AVAILABILITY OF LAND TO BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS **8**

During our audit, we found that the Authority had a large parcel of land, approximately 100,000 square feet, on which it could potentially build additional affordable housing units at its Jamaica Plain site.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION **11**

APPENDIX I **12**

State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted **12**

APPENDIX II **23**

Photographs of Conditions Found **23**

INTRODUCTION

Background

In accordance with Chapter 11, Section 12, of the Massachusetts General Laws, we have conducted a statewide comprehensive audit of the physical conditions and the resources available to provide for the operation and upkeep of the state-aided public housing authorities of the Commonwealth. To accomplish our audit, we performed work at the Department of Housing and Community Development (DHCD) and also obtained data from surveys and site visits to a selected, representative cross-section of 66 Local Housing Authorities (LHAs) throughout the state. The Boston Housing Authority was one of the LHAs selected to be reviewed for the period July 1, 2003 to June 30, 2005. A complete list of LHAs visited and surveyed is provided in our statewide report No. 2005-5119-3A.

Our on-site visits were conducted to follow up on survey data we obtained in order to: observe and evaluate the physical condition of the state-regulated LHAs, review policies and procedures over unit site inspections, determine whether LHA-managed properties are maintained in accordance with public health and safety standards, and review the state modernization funds awarded to determine whether such funds have been received and expended for their intended purpose. In addition, we reviewed the adequacy of the level of funding provided to LHAs for annual operating costs to maintain the exterior and interior of the buildings and housing units, as well as the capital renovation infrastructure costs to maximize the public housing stock across the state, and determined whether land already owned by the LHAs could be utilized to build additional affordable housing units. We also determined the number of vacant units, vacancy turnaround time, and whether any units have been taken off line and are no longer available for occupancy by qualifying families or individuals in need of housing.

Audit Scope, Objectives, and Methodology

The scope of our audit included an evaluation of management controls over dwelling unit inspections, modernization funds, and maintenance plans. Our review of management controls included those of both the LHAs and DHCD. Our audit scope included an evaluation of the physical condition of the properties managed; the effect, if any, that a lack of reserves, operating and modernization funds, and maintenance and repair plans has on the physical condition of the LHAs'

state-aided housing units/projects; and the resulting effect on the LHAs' waiting lists, operating subsidies, and vacant units.

Our audit was conducted in accordance with applicable generally accepted government auditing standards for performance audits and, accordingly, included such audits tests and procedures as we considered necessary.

Our primary objective was to determine whether housing units were maintained in proper condition and in accordance with public health and safety standards (e.g., the State Sanitary Code, state and local building codes, fire codes, Board of Health regulations) and whether adequate controls were in place and in effect over site-inspection procedures and records. Our objective was to determine whether the inspections conducted were complete, accurate, up-to-date, and in compliance with applicable laws, rules, and regulations. Further, we sought to determine whether management and DHCD were conducting follow-up actions based on the results of site inspections.

Second, we sought to determine whether the LHAs were owed prior-year operating subsidies from DHCD, and whether the untimely receipt of operating subsidies from DHCD may have resulted in housing units not being maintained in proper condition.

Third, in instances where the physical interior/exterior of LHA-managed properties were found to be in a state of disrepair or deteriorating condition, we sought to determine whether an insufficient allocation of operating or modernization funds from DHCD contributed to the present conditions noted and the resulting effect, if any, on the LHAs' waiting lists and vacant unit reoccupancy.

To conduct our audit, we first reviewed DHCD's policies and procedures to modernize state-aided LHAs, DHCD subsidy formulas, DHCD inspection standards and guidelines, and LHA responsibilities regarding vacant units.

Second, we sent questionnaires to each LHA in the Commonwealth requesting information on the:

- *Physical condition of its managed units/projects*
- *State program units in management*
- *Off-line units*
- *Waiting lists of applicants*

-
- *Listing of modernization projects that have been formally requested from DHCD within the last five years, for which funding was denied*
 - *Amount of funds disbursed, if any, to house tenants in hotels/motels*
 - *Availability of land to build affordable units*
 - *Written plans in place to maintain, repair, and upgrade its existing units*
 - *Frequency of conducting inspections of its units/projects*
 - *Balances, if any, of subsidies owed to the LHA by DHCD*
 - *Condition Assessment Reports (CARS) submitted to DHCD*
 - *LHA concerns, if any, pertaining to DHCD's current modernization process*

The information provided by the LHAs was reviewed and evaluated to assist in the selection of housing authorities to be visited as part of our statewide review.

Third, we reviewed the report entitled “Protecting the Commonwealth’s Investment - Securing the Future of State-Aided Public Housing.” The report, funded through the Harvard Housing Innovations Program by the Office of Government, Community and Public Affairs, in partnership with the Citizens Housing and Planning Association, assessed the Commonwealth’s portfolio of public housing, documented the state inventory capital needs, proposed strategies to aid in its preservation, and made recommendations regarding the level of funding and the administrative and statutory changes necessary to preserve state public housing.

Fourth, we attended the Joint Legislative Committee on Housing’s public hearings on March 7, 2005 and February 27, 2006 on the “State of Public Housing;” interviewed officials from the LHAs, the Massachusetts Chapter of the National Association of Housing and Redevelopment Officials, and DHCD; and reviewed various local media coverage regarding the condition of certain local public housing stock.

To determine whether state-aided programs were maintained in proper condition and safety standards, we (a) observed the physical condition of housing units/projects by conducting inspections of selected units/projects to ensure that the units and buildings met the necessary minimum standards set forth in the State Sanitary Code, (b) obtained and reviewed the LHAs’ policies and procedures relative to unit site inspections, and (c) made inquiries with the local boards

of health to determine whether any citations had been issued, and if so, the LHA's plan to address the cited deficiencies.

To determine whether the modernization funds received by the LHAs were being expended for the intended purposes and in compliance with laws, rules, and regulations, we obtained and reviewed the Quarterly Consolidated Capital Improvement Cost Reports, Contracts for Financial Assistance, and budget and construction contracts. In addition, we conducted inspections of the modernization work performed at each LHA to determine compliance with its work plan.

To determine whether LHAs were receiving operating subsidies in a timely manner, we analyzed each LHA subsidy account for operating subsidies earned and received and the period of time that the payments covered. In addition, we made inquiries with the LHA's Executive Director/fee accountant, as necessary. We compared the subsidy balance due the LHA per DHCD records to the subsidy data recorded by the LHAs.

To assess controls over waiting lists, we determined the number of applicants on the waiting list for each state program and reviewed the waiting list for compliance with DHCD regulations.

To assess whether each LHA was adhering to DHCD procedures for preparing and filling vacant units in a timely manner, we performed selected tests to determine whether the LHAs had uninhabitable units, the length of time the units were in this state of disrepair, and the actions taken by the LHAs to renovate the units.

The Boston Housing Authority provided a written response to our audit report, which appears on pages 9 and 10.

AUDIT RESULTS

1. RESULTS OF INSPECTIONS - NONCOMPLIANCE WITH STATE SANITARY CODE

The Department of Housing and Community Development's (DHCD) Property Maintenance Guide, Chapter 3 (F), requires that inspections of dwelling units be conducted annually and upon each vacancy to ensure that every dwelling unit conforms to the minimum standards for safe, decent, and sanitary housing as set forth in Chapter II of the State Sanitary Code.

For the fiscal year ended June 30, 2005, we reviewed 15 of the 2,804 state-aided dwelling unit inspection reports prepared for the Authority by a vendor. In addition, on May 2 and 3, 2006, we conducted inspections of nine of the 2,804 state-aided dwelling units managed by the Boston Housing Authority, which were located at Bowdoin Street, Bay Street, Boardman Street, and Blue Hill Avenue (Family Housing 705-1); and Joyce Hayes Way, Woodglen Road, and Vallar Road (Family Housing 200-1, 200-5, and 200-8). Our inspection noted 255 instances of noncompliance with Chapter II of the State Sanitary Code, including peeling paint on ceilings, mold in bathrooms and bedrooms, chipped and broken tiles, holes in walls, broken countertops, antiquated wiring, bug infestation, out-of-date plumbing, damaged floors, and damaged doors. (Appendix I of our report summarizes the specific State Sanitary Code violations noted, and Appendix II includes photographs documenting the conditions found.)

The photographs presented in Appendix II illustrate the pressing need to address the conditions noted, since postponing the necessary improvements would require greater costs at a future date, and may result in the Authority's properties not conforming to minimum standards for safe, decent, and sanitary housing.

Recommendation

The Authority should apply for funding from DHCD to address the issues noted during our inspections of the interior (dwelling units) and external (buildings) of the Authority, as well as other issues that need to be addressed. Moreover, DHCD should obtain and provide sufficient funds to the Authority in a timely manner so that it may provide safe, decent, and sanitary housing for its tenants.

2. VACANT UNITS NOT REOCCUPIED WITHIN DHCD GUIDELINES

DHCD's Property Maintenance Guide indicates that housing authorities should reoccupy units within 21 working days of their being vacated by a tenant. However, our review found that during the period July 1, 2003 through June 30, 2005, the Authority's average turnaround time for reoccupying vacant units was 124 days. (This calculation did not include 41 off-line units.) Moreover, we found that there were over 180 vacant family and elderly housing units and over 13,000 applicants on the Authority's waiting list. By not ensuring that vacant units were reoccupied within DHCD's guidelines, the Authority may have lost the opportunity to earn potential rental income net of maintenance and repair costs, and may have lost the opportunity, at least temporarily, to provide needy citizens with subsidized housing. The Authority indicated that in order to reduce the amount of time taken to renovate vacant units, it needs five additional maintenance staff, consisting of two carpenters, one electrician, one plumber, and one laborer.

Recommendation

The Authority should ensure that its vacant units are refurbished and reoccupied within DHCD's timeframe. DHCD should obtain and provide the Authority with the funds and additional maintenance staff necessary to fulfill their respective statutory mandates.

3. MODERNIZATION INITIATIVES NOT FUNDED

In response to our questionnaires, the Authority informed us that there is a need for modernizing its managed properties. Specifically, the Authority provided the following information regarding requests for capital modernization projects that had been formally requested from DHCD in 2001, and remain unfunded:

- 200-1 Family Housing: Septic and sewer upgrade, entrance doors and intercoms replacement, site improvements, and kitchen and bathroom renovation -- Orton Marotta Way, South Boston.
- 200-2 Family Housing: Upgrade of domestic hot water system, intercoms and electrical/fire safety upgrade, entrance doors replacement, and roof replacement -- Lenox/Camden Street, Roxbury.

-
- 200-4 Family Housing: Kitchen and bathroom renovation, site improvements, heating systems upgrade, septic and sewer upgrade, electrical upgrade, and roof replacement -- Faneuil Street, Brighton.
 - 200-5 Family Housing: Roof replacement, kitchen renovation, and site lighting replacement-- Bow Street, Hyde Park.
 - 200-7 Family Housing: Boiler replacement, septic and sewer lines replacement, and electrical/fire safety upgrade -- Brookway Road, Roslindale.
 - 200-8 Family Housing: Site lighting replacement, entrance doors and intercoms replacement, and heating plant replacement at development located on Waldemar Avenue, East Boston.
 - 200-10 Family Housing: Electrical, septic, and sewer upgrade -- Standard Street, Mattapan.
 - 200-12 Family Housing: Electrical upgrade, boiler replacement, septic and sewer upgrade, kitchen renovation, and site lighting improvement -- South Street, Jamaica Plain.
 - 667-2 Elderly Housing: Kitchen and bathroom renovation -- Ames Street, Dorchester.
 - 667-3 Elderly Housing: Fire alarm upgrade, domestic hot water storage tank replacement, site lighting and fencing improvement -- L Street, South Boston.
 - 705-1 Family Housing (Scattered Sites): Kitchen and bathroom renovation-- Bowdoin Street.
 - 705-6 Family Housing (Scattered Site): Fire systems upgrade, kitchen and bathroom replacement, doors replacement, and unit renovations -- Blue Hill Avenue, George Street, Norwell Street, Monson Street, and Mayland Street.

The above conditions are mainly the result of aging, use, and wear and tear and, as illustrated by the photographs included in Appendix II, may pose a safety hazard to tenants.

Deferring or denying the Authority's modernization needs may result in further deteriorating conditions that could render the units and buildings uninhabitable. Moreover, if the Authority does not receive funding to correct these conditions, additional emergency situations may occur, and the Authority's ability to provide safe, decent, and sanitary housing for its elderly and family tenants will be seriously compromised. Lastly, deferring the modernization needs of the Authority into future years will cost the Commonwealth's taxpayers additional money due to inflation, higher wages, and other related costs.

In June 2000, Harvard University awarded a grant to a partnership of the Boston and Cambridge Housing Authorities to undertake a study of state-aided family and elderly/disabled housing. The purpose of this study was to document the state inventory of capital needs and to make recommendations regarding the level of funding and the administrative and statutory changes necessary to give local Massachusetts housing authorities the tools to preserve and improve this important resource. The report, "Protecting the Commonwealth's Investment - Securing the Future of State-Aided Public Housing," dated April 4, 2001, stated, "Preservation of existing housing is the fiscally prudent course of action at a time when Massachusetts faces an increased demand for affordable housing. While preservation will require additional funding, loss and replacement of the units would be much more expensive in both fiscal and human terms."

Recommendation

The Authority should continue to appeal to DHCD to provide the necessary modernization funds to remedy these issues in a timely manner.

4. AVAILABILITY OF LAND TO BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS

During our audit, we found that the Authority had a parcel of land, approximately 100,000 square feet, on which it could potentially build additional affordable housing units at its Jamaica Plain site. The Authority informed us that there are zoning and other issues to be addressed before it could build on the parcel of land in Jamaica Plain. The need for affordable housing is justified, considering that there were over 13,000 applicants on the Authority's waiting list.

Without affordable housing, substantial costs may be incurred by the Commonwealth's social service programs and assistance organizations where displaced individuals turn for help. A lack

of decent affordable housing may result in families living in substandard housing, living in temporary shelters or motels, or becoming homeless. The need for affordable housing is especially critical for the elderly, whose fixed incomes and special needs limit their housing options.

Recommendation

The Authority should apply to DHCD for development funds needed to construct sufficient affordable housing units to meet the current demand.

Auditee's Response

In response to our audit, the Authority's Administrator/CEO provided the following comments:

I am writing in response to the draft audit report referenced above issued to the Boston Housing Authority regarding the physical condition of state-aided public housing units and resources allocated for the operation and upkeep of such units. The Boston Housing Authority (BHA) considers this draft report to be the companion to the State Auditor's Comprehensive Report No. 2005-5119-3A issued October 5, 2006.

Both reports document the conditions found at the BHA's state-assisted public housing properties and the BHA does not dispute that these were the conditions found when this audit was performed. In fact, the BHA cooperated fully with the State Auditor providing access to locations, units and documents. Further, the BHA used the State Auditor's findings, along with two other independent studies, to substantiate the legal claims made when the Boston, Cambridge and Brookline Housing Authorities filed a lawsuit against the Commonwealth's Departments of Administration and Finance and Housing and Community Development. [Boston Housing Authority, et al. v. Commonwealth of Massachusetts et al., Suffolk Superior Court, Civil Action No. 06-4831.] The other two reports are Protecting the Commonwealth's Investment, June 2001, and Findings of the Subcommittee on Public Housing, July 26, 2006.

As you are aware, that lawsuit was filed following years of egregiously deficient funding of public housing in the Commonwealth. The suit was brought in an attempt to try to preserve the rapidly deteriorating state-assisted public housing apartments. While the suit was brought by the three-named Plaintiffs, a statewide remedy was sought.

The BHA does not contest the draft report. However, it is important to note that, moving forward, the BHA is using the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development's Public Housing Assessment System (PHAS) to inspect and assess its state portfolio. This will be followed by a program of planned repairs, coupling day-to-day maintenance delivery with planned capital improvements. The capital funding from DHCD is still inconsistent and slow. The opposite is true for the state's operating subsidy funding.

The BHA's believes that the best response to the draft report is contained in the lawsuit itself as well as in the documents used to detail the physical conditions. It is the State Auditor's own report, No. 2005-5119-3A, the compilation of the individual audit reports done between 2003 and 2005, that perhaps says it best, ".....state operating subsidies

have been untimely and erratic through the years and generally too low to enable LHAs to maintain units in good repair and to fund reserves. Years of underfunding have resulted in deterioration of the state-aided housing inventory as LHAs have been forced to defer maintenance and other costs."

With consistent and adequate funding in the capital and operating accounts, Boston has the ability, over time, to repair and maintain code-compliant public housing for the thousands of families and individuals on our waiting lists. Without adequacy and consistency of funding which is controlled by the Commonwealth's Administration and Legislature, the state-assisted public housing portfolio will continue to deteriorate

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION***Boston Housing Authority–Managed State Projects***

The Authority's state-aided housing developments, the number of units, and the year each development was built, is as follows:

<u>Development</u>	<u>Number of Units</u>	<u>Year Built</u>
200-1	924	1949
200-2	72	1949
200-4	258	1950
200-5	202	1951
200-7	287	1952
200-8	344	1952
200-10	251	1953
200-12	132	1953
667-1	40	1958
667-2	80	1963
667-3	68	1976
667-6	5	1982
705	<u>141</u>	1989
Total	<u>2804</u>	

APPENDIX I

State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

200-1 Family Housing Development

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
37 Joyce Hayes Way, Apt 6084 (Vacant)	Unit Entry:	Locks on doors are broken	105 CMR 410.480
		Doors are damaged, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
	Living Room:	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Holes and cracks on walls	105 CMR 410.500
		Weather stripping is missing from windows, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Cracks on ceiling	105 CMR 410.500
	Kitchen:	Tiles on floor are loose/missing	105 CMR 410.504
		Walls are cracked in different spots	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracks on window frame, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Cracks on ceiling	105 CMR 410.500
		Sink is stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
		Cabinet hinges are broken	105 CMR 410.100
	Bathroom:	Some tiles are missing on floor	105 CMR 410.504
		Many tiles are missing on walls	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracks on window, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Bedrooms:	Sink is worn and stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
		Floor is worn	105 CMR 410.504
		Cracks and holes on walls	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracks on window frames, caulking is dry, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
Window screens are missing		105 CMR 410.551	
Outside Bedrooms:	Ceilings are cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500	
	Nonfunctioning smoke detectors	105 CMR 410.484	

APPENDIX I

State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

200-5 Family Housing Development

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
27 Woodglen Road (Vacant)	Unit Entry: Doors are broken, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501	
	Locks on doors are broken	105 CMR 410.480	
	Living Room: Floor is worn		105 CMR 410.504
		Walls are cracked	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracks in windows, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Kitchen: Floor is stained with paint		105 CMR 410.504
		Holes and cracks on walls	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracks on window frames, caulking is dry, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Sink is stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
		Cabinet hinges are broken	105 CMR 410.100
		Shelves are warped	105 CMR 410.500
	Bathroom: Some tiles are missing on floor		105 CMR 410.500
		Many loose tiles on wall	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracks on window frame, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Bedrooms: Floor is worn and stained with paint		105 CMR 410.150
		Walls are dotted with holes and cracks	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracks on windows, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceilings are cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Nonfunctioning smoke detectors	105 CMR 410.482

APPENDIX I
State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>
27 Woodglen Road (Vacant)	Building exterior: Electric meters' location is dangerous	105 CMR 410.750

200-5 Family Housing Development

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
29 Woodglen Road (Vacant)	Unit Entry: Locks on doors are broken	105 CMR 410.480	
	Doors are cracked, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501	
	Electric Meters' location is dangerous and too close to a tenant's entrance	105 CMR 410.750	
	Living Room:	Floor is worn	105 CMR 410.500
		Walls are cracked	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracks on windows, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Kitchen:	Floor is worn	105 CMR 410.504
		Walls are cracked, need paint	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracked window frame, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Sink is stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
		Cabinets' hinges are broken	105 CMR 410.100
	Shelves are warped	105 CMR 410.100	
	Bathroom:	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.504
		Numerous cracks on walls	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracked window frame, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
Sink is worn and stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150		

APPENDIX I
State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
29 Woodglen Road (Vacant)	Bedrooms:	Floors are worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Walls are dotted with crack/holes	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracked window frames, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceilings are cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Nonfunctioning smoke detectors	105 CMR 410.482
	Basement:	A pool of water from cracked foundation wall	105 CMR 410.500
<u>200-8 Scattered Site Family Housing Development</u>			
<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
61 Vallar Road (Vacant)	Unit Entry:	Doors are damaged, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Locks on doors are broken	105 CMR 410.480
	Living Room:	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Walls are cracked	105 CMR 410.500
		No caulking on windows	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked, needs paint	105 CMR 410.500
	Kitchen:	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.504
		Cracks on walls, needs paint	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracked window frame, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Sink is stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
		Cabinet hinges are broken	105 CMR 410.100
		Shelves are warped	105 CMR 410.100

APPENDIX I

State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
61 Vallar Road (Vacant)	Bathroom:	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.504
		Walls are cracked	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracked window frame, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Sink is worn	105 CMR 410.150
	Bedrooms:	Floors are worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Walls are cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracked window frames, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceilings are cracked, need paint	105 CMR 410.500
	Outside Bedrooms:		105 CMR 410.482
		Nonfunctioning smoke detectors	
	Building Exterior:		105 CMR 410.750
Front retaining wall is deteriorating			

705 Scattered Site Family Housing Development

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
25 Bowdoin Street (Vacant)	Unit Entry:	Doors are broken, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Locks on doors are damaged	105 CMR 410.480
	Living Room:	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Walls are cracked	105 CMR 410.500
		Window frames are rotted	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked, needs paint	105 CMR 410.500
	Kitchen:	Floor is damaged, needs extensive repair	105 CMR 410.504
		Wall paneling is missing, pipes and wires are exposed	105 CMR 410.500

APPENDIX I
State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>
25 Bowdoin Street (Vacant)	Window frame is rotted	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Sink's porcelain is worn	105 CMR 410.150
	Cabinets are broken	105 CMR 410.100
	Bathroom: Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.504
	Walls/tiles are cracked	105 CMR 410.500
	Window frame is rotted	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Sink is stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
	Toilet is broken	105 CMR 410.150
	Bedrooms: Floors are worn	105 CMR 410.500
	Walls are cracked, need paint	105 CMR 410.500
	Windows are cracked and rotted	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceilings are cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
Outside Bedrooms:		
	Smoke detectors are missing	105 CMR 410.482
<u>705 Scattered Site Family Housing Development</u>		

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>
4 Bay Street, Apartment #1 (Vacant)	Unit Entry: Doors are broken, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
	Living Room: Floor is worn	105 CMR 410.500
	Walls are cracked	105 CMR 410.500
	Cracked window frames, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceiling is cracked and water stained	105 CMR 410.500

APPENDIX I
State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
4 Bay Street, Apartment #1 (Vacant)	Kitchen:	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.504
		Walls are cracked	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracked window frame, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and water stained	105 CMR 410.500
		Sink is stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
	Bathroom:	Cabinets are broken	105 CMR 410.100
		Floor is worn	105 CMR 410.504
		Cracks on walls, need repair	105 CMR 410.500
		Flaky caulking on window, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Bedroom:	Floors are worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Walls are cracked, need repair	105 CMR 410.500
		Weather stripping is missing on windows	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceilings are cracked, need repair	105 CMR 410.500
Outside Bedrooms:	Smoke detectors are missing	105 CMR 410.482	

705 Scattered Site Family Housing Development

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
115 Boardman Street, Apartment # 1 (Vacant)	Unit Entry:	Locks on doors are broken	105 CMR 410.480
		Doors are damaged, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
	Living Room:	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Walls are cracked and dotted with holes	105 CMR 410.500

APPENDIX I

State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>	
115 Boardman Street, Apartment # 1 (Vacant)	Cracked window frames, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501	
	Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551	
	Ceiling is cracked and water stained	105 CMR 410.500	
	Kitchen:	Floor is worn	105 CMR 410.504
		Walls are cracked, need repair and paint	105 CMR 410.500
		Cracked window frame, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and water stained	105 CMR 410.500
		Sink is worn and stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
		Cabinet doors are missing, hinges on cabinets are broken, countertops are worn	105 CMR 410.100
	Bathroom:	Floor is worn, needs repair	105 CMR 410.504
		Walls are dotted with holes, tiles are missing, need repair	105 CMR 410.500
		Flaky caulking on window, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling plaster is missing, insulation is exposed	105 CMR 410.500
		Health-endangering mold on ceiling	105 CMR 410.750
		Toilet is broken	105 CMR 410.150
	Bedrooms:	Floors are worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
		Holes on walls need repair	105 CMR 410.500
		Mold on walls	105 CMR 410.750
		Weather stripping is missing on windows	105 CMR 410.501
		Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
		Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
Outside Bedrooms:	Nonfunctioning smoke detectors	105 CMR 410.482	

APPENDIX I

State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>
115 Boardman Street, Apartment # 1 (Vacant)	Building Exterior:	
	Shingles on the roof are deteriorating	105 CMR 410.500
	Wooden porches are rotten	105 CMR 410.500
 <u>705 Scattered Site Family Housing Development</u>		

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>
115 Boardman Street, Apartment #2 (Vacant)	Unit Entry:	
	Locks on doors are broken	105 CMR 410.480
	Doors are damaged, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
	Living Room:	
	Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Walls are cracked and dotted with holes	105 CMR 410.500
	Windows and frames are broken	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.511
	Ceiling is cracked and water stained	105 CMR 410.500
	Kitchen:	
	Floor is worn	105 CMR 410.504
	Walls are cracked, need repair and paint	105 CMR 410.500
	Window and frame are broken	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceiling is cracked, needs repair and paint	105 CMR 410.500
	Sink is worn	105 CMR 410.500
Cabinet doors are missing, hinges on cabinets are broken, counter tops are worn	105 CMR 410.100	
Bathroom:		
Floor is worn, needs repair	105 CMR 410.504	
Holes and cracks on walls, need repair	105 CMR 410.500	

APPENDIX I

State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>
115 Boardman Street, Apartment #2 (Vacant)	Window and frame are broken	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceiling is cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Bedroom #1: Floor is worn, needs repair	105 CMR 410.500
	Walls are cracked, need repair	105 CMR 410.500
	Health-endangering black mold on walls	105 CMR 410.750
	Windows are rotted	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Cracks and health endangering black mold on ceiling	105 CMR 410.750
	Bedroom #2: Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Walls are damaged and covered with health endangering mold	105 CMR 410.750
	Windows are rotted, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Cracks and health-endangering black mold on ceiling	105 CMR 410.750
	Outside Bedrooms:	
Smoke detectors are missing	105 CMR 410.482	
Building Exterior: Shingles on the roof are deteriorating	105 CMR 410.500	
Paint peeling on rotted wood	105 CMR 410.500	

705 Scattered Site Family Housing Development

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>
136 Blue Hill Avenue, Apartment #1 (Vacant)	Unit Entry: Locks on doors are broken	105 CMR 410.480
	Doors are damaged, not weathertight	105 CMR 410.501

APPENDIX I

State Sanitary Code Noncompliance Noted

<u>Location</u>	<u>Noncompliance</u>	<u>Regulations</u>
136 Blue Hill Avenue, Apartment #1 (Vacant)	Living Room: Floor is worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Walls are dotted with holes and cracks, need repair and painting	105 CMR 410.500
	Health-endangering black mold on walls	105 CMR 410.750
	All panes of glass are broken on windows	105 CMR 410.501
	Window frames are damaged	105 CMR 410.500
	Window screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceiling is cracked and water stained	105 CMR 410.500
	Kitchen: Floor is worn – needs repair	105 CMR 410.504
	Walls are cracked – need repair and paint	105 CMR 410.500
	Window's frame is damaged	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceiling is cracked and water stained	105 CMR 410.500
	Sink is worn and stained with rust	105 CMR 410.150
	Cabinets are worn – need replacement	105 CMR 410.100
	Bathroom: Floor is worn	105 CMR 410.504
	Tiles on walls are loose	105 CMR 410.500
	Window frame is broken	105 CMR 410.501
	Window screen is missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Cracks on ceiling, need repair	105 CMR 410.500
	Bedrooms: Floors are worn and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Cracks and holes on walls, need repair	105 CMR 410.500
	Health-endangering black mold on walls	105 CMR 410.750
	Weather stripping is missing on windows	105 CMR 410.501
	Windows screens are missing	105 CMR 410.551
	Ceilings are cracked and in disrepair	105 CMR 410.500
	Outside Bedrooms:	
	Smoke detectors are missing	105 CMR 410.482
Building Exterior: Gutters on the roof are damaged	105 CMR 410.500	
Railroad ties are missing on walkway	105 CMR 410.500	

APPENDIX II

Photographs of Conditions Found

200-1 Family Housing Development

37 Joyce Hayes Way, Apt. 6084

Many Tiles are Missing on Bathroom Wall



200-5 Family Housing Development

27 Woodglen Road

Floor is Worn and Stained with Paint in Bedroom



200-5 Family Housing Development
29 Woodglen Road

Electric Meters' Location is Dangerous and too Close to a Tenant's Entrance



200-5 Family Housing Development
29 Woodglen Road

A Pool of Water From Cracked Foundation in Basement



200-8 Family Housing Development
61 Vallar Road
Front Retaining Wall is Deteriorating



705 Family Housing Development
25 Bowdoin Street
Floor is Damaged, Wall Paneling is Missing,
Pipes and Wires are Exposed in Kitchen



705 Family Housing Development
115 Boardman Street, Apt. #1
Bathroom Walls are Dotted with Holes, Tiles and Ceiling Plaster are Missing,
Insulation is Exposed



705 Family Housing Development
115 Boardman Street, Apt #2, Bedroom #1
Cracks and Health-Endangering Black Mold on Ceiling



705 Family Housing Development
115 Boardman Street, Apt. #2, Bedroom #2
Cracks and Health-Endangering Black Mold on Ceiling



705 Family Housing Development
115 Boardman Street, Apt. #2, Building Exterior
Paint Peeling on Rotted Wood



705 Family Housing Development
136 Blue Hill Avenue
Health-Endangering Black Mold on Bedroom Walls



705 Family Housing Development
136 Blue Hill Avenue
Railroad Ties are Missing on Walkway



705 Family Housing Development
136 Blue Hill Avenue
Health-Endangering Black Mold on Walls in Living Room



705 Family Housing Development
136 Blue Hill Avenue, Apt. 1
All Panes of Glass over Broken Window Frames are Damaged in Living Room



705 Family Housing Development
136 Blue Hill Avenue
Cracks, Holes, and Health-Endangering Black Mold on Bedroom Wall



705 Family Housing Development
136 Blue Hill Avenue, Apt. 1
Gutters on the Roof are Damaged



705 Family Housing Development
115 Boardman Street, Apt. #1, Bedroom #1
Holes on Wall, Need Repair



705 Family Housing Development
115 Boardman Street, Apt. #2, Bedroom #2
Walls are Damaged, Covered with Health-Endangering Mold, Floor is Worn and in Disrepair

