

**THE EDWARD J. COLLINS, JR.  
CENTER FOR PUBLIC MANAGEMENT**

**MCCORMACK GRADUATE SCHOOL  
OF POLICY AND GLOBAL STUDIES**

University of Massachusetts Boston  
100 Morrissey Boulevard  
Boston, MA 02125-3393  
P: 617.287.4824  
[www.collinscenter.umb.edu](http://www.collinscenter.umb.edu)

# **CLASSIFICATION AND COMPENSATION STUDY**

**BROOKFIELD, MA**

**FEBRUARY 2019**

## **INTRODUCTION**

As a result of a Commonwealth Community Compact grant, the Town of Brookfield engaged the services of the Collins Center for Public Management (Collins Center) to conduct a classification and compensation study. Working with representatives of the Personnel Board, the project objectives were defined as:

- Evaluating and assigning all study positions to appropriate classifications to assure internal equity
- Conducting a salary survey of comparable Massachusetts municipalities to develop appropriate compensation levels for the Town, and to assure the external equity
- Developing new position for the study positions with clear definitions of essential functions and requirements
- Recommending the implementation of the new system and processes for movement through the salary schedule in the future

## **METHODOLOGY**

The steps followed by the Collins Center were:

- Creation of Position Descriptions
- Discussion of Position Description Issues
- Rating of Positions for Classification and Internal Equity
- Creation of Classification Structure
- Survey of Comparable Communities
- Development of a Salary Schedule

## **DISCUSSION**

Brookfield does not have a classification and compensation system. Individual employees are hired at a rate of pay that has nothing to do with any classification of a position and has more to do with what the previous incumbent was paid. At the time of hire, starting pay rates are determined and then across the board or cost of living adjustments are granted. The Town does not have pay ranges. The Town does not conduct a comprehensive market survey to address the compensation of employees. In individual instances, narrow surveys have been

conducted to address individual positions. By undertaking this comprehensive review of the classification and compensation structure, Brookfield will be able to adopt a fair and equitable system of compensating employees fairly, based on an objective review of the positions and a market analysis.

## **POSITION DESCRIPTIONS**

To create a viable classification system for the Town, the Collins Center began by evaluating the state of the current systems. Information about existing position descriptions was obtained.

Comprehensive questionnaires were given to the incumbents of the study positions. The questionnaire requested information regarding the position's responsibilities related to supervision, decision-making authority, budgetary responsibilities, and other characteristics that allowed the Collins Center to evaluate its level of difficulty, complexity and importance to the departmental and town organization. Interviews were offered to each employee. The interviews were conducted to clarify information contained in the questionnaires. The Collins Center has found that the time spent prior to drafting the descriptions improves accuracy of drafts and helps minimize the need for edits. The draft descriptions were created and were distributed to incumbents and supervisors for comments and final descriptions were created. Very few edits were requested to the drafts and of those comments received most were minor changes. None of the comments and edits warranted significant changes to the draft description. The final recommended position descriptions are provided electronically separately.

## **RATING OF POSITIONS FOR CLASSIFICATION AND INTERNAL EQUITY**

Once descriptions were drafted, the Collins Center used a point factor rating method to objectively evaluate the positions. The application of an objective position evaluation system that is consistently applied to each position is critical in assuring the internal equity of the classification plan. The evaluation system utilized by the Collins Center is one that has been applied successfully in many public organizations in Massachusetts. Each position was assigned a point factor in the categories listed below, which determined the groupings of positions.

Supervision Received	Complexity	Contacts with Others
Supervisory Responsibility	Confidentiality	Work Environment
Accountability	Education	Physical Requirements
Judgement	Experience	Occupational Risks

## RECOMMENDED CLASSIFICATION STRUCTURE

Because of the varied nature of the positions between public safety and EMS, the Collins Center recommends the creation of two classification structures: one for general government positions and the other for public safety/EMS. The recommended classification system for general positions is comprised five grades which groups positions based on similar rating and is contained in the following Table.

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	TITLE
<b>7</b>	Highway Water	Highway Superintendent Water Superintendent
<b>6</b>	Building Accountant Library Tax Collector Treasurer Assessor Town Clerk	Building Inspector Town Accountant Library Director Tax Collector Treasurer Principal Assessor Town Clerk
<b>5</b>	BOS BOH	Executive Assistant Health Agent
<b>4</b>	Highway Water Accounting Treasurer Police Highway Water Town Clerk Library	Operator I Water Operator Assistant Town Accountant Assistant Treasurer Administrative Assistant Administrative Assistant - Administrative Assistant Assistant Town Clerk Librarian
<b>3</b>	Assessor BOH Highway Library BOS	Department Assistant Department Assistant Operator II Library Assistant Animal Control Officer - Police

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	TITLE
<b>2</b>	BOH	Transfer Station Monitor
	BOS	Custodian
	Library	Custodian
	BOS	Municipal Clerk
<b>1</b>	Various	Casual, Seasonal, Temporary

One issue that arose is that of the Operator I and II positions. Currently, the two positions perform much of the same work, however, the Operator I assumes responsibility for the Superintendent in the Superintendent's absence. When and if the positions are vacated, the Town should evaluate the way in which the person who acts in the place of the Highway Superintendent is compensated. It is recommended the Town adopt a structure that provides for a differential for those times a replacement is needed.

The recommended classification system for Police, Fire and EMS positions is contained in the following Table.

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	TITLE
	Police	Police Chief
	EMS	EMS Director
	Fire	Fire Chief
P3	Police	Sergeant
P2	Police	Patrol Officer
P1	Police	Part Time Officer
E2	EMS	Paramedic
E1	EMS	EMT
F3	Fire	Fire Captain
F2	Fire	Fire Lieutenant
F1	Fire	Fire Fighter

## **SURVEY OF COMPARABLE MUNICIPALITIES**

Once the positions were classified, a salary survey was conducted to determine the ranges within which other, similar towns compensate their employees. Because the Town had participated in a recent survey for the Towns of Spencer much of the data that was shared from that survey was used. The criteria considered for selecting comparable municipalities included geographical proximity, as well as equalized value and average tax bill. A summary of the results is attached to this report. Obtaining survey data is one of the most challenging aspects of a classification and compensation study. The towns utilized for the survey were Barre, Boylston, Leicester, Paxton, Petersham, Princeton, Rutland, Spencer, Sturbridge, West Boylston, West Brookfield.

In in most instances, the minimum and maximum salaries in Brookfield are below the average and median of the survey municipalities. It is important to note that almost all Brookfield fall within the market range.

Because Brookfield does not have ranges for compensation, the survey results are often skewed. If incumbents of positions are relatively new to the position, the individual salaries may represent a minimum rate, and, those who have been in a position for many years may represent a maximum. For the purpose of analysis, the current pay of incumbents was listed as maximum in the survey.

## **DEVELOPMENT OF THE SALARY SCHEDULE**

When evaluating classification, it is important to remember that each municipality is different and the internal comparability within the organization is just as important, if not more so, than external comparability. In developing the recommended salary schedule, the Collins Center coalesced the position classification with the results of the salary survey to establish salary ranges for each of the grades. The salary ranges were established by evaluating the median and average pay with respect to the existing pay of the positions in each grade.

For the general government positions, the Collins Center recommends a classification schedule with five grades with each grade having twelve steps with 2.5% increments. The following table represents the recommended compensation schedule.

RECOMMENDED GRADE	RECOMMENDED MINIMUM	RECOMMENDED MAXIMUM
7	\$30.18	\$39.58
6	\$26.24	\$34.43
5	\$22.82	\$29.94
4	\$19.84	\$26.04
3	\$17.25	\$22.63
2	\$15.00	\$19.67
1	\$12.00	\$16.00

For the police, fire and EMS positions, the Collins Center recommends the Town continue the individual contracts or stipends with the Chiefs of Police, Fire and EMS and the following classification schedule each position. It is recommended incumbents receive step increase if the incumbent works a minimum of hours set by the Chiefs. The following table represents the recommended compensation schedule.

GRADE	DEPARTMENT	TITLE	MINIMUM	MAXIMUM
	Police	Police Chief		Contract
	EMS	EMS Director		Stipend
	Fire	Fire Chief		Stipend
P3	Police	Sergeant	\$26.00	\$32.00
P2	Police	Patrol Officer	\$20.00	\$26.00
P1	Police	Part Time Officer	\$18.00	\$24.00
E2	EMS	Paramedic	\$22.00	\$28.00
E1	EMS	EMT	\$18.00	\$24.00
F3	Fire	Fire Captain	\$18.00	\$24.00
F2	Fire	Fire Lieutenant	\$17.00	\$23.00
F1	Fire	Fire Fighter	\$16.00	\$22.00

## **IMPLEMENTATION**

In establishing the initial placement on the scale, the Collins Center recommends employees be placed in the recommended grade at a rate granting them an increase. The Town may choose to make a policy decision and implement the schedule by guaranteeing a certain minimum increase prior to deciding where to place employees within the grade. The Town may choose to implement a system that places incumbents on the scale recognizing length of time in service to the Town. In some municipalities, rather than just placing an employee on the step that provides for an increase, additional step increases are granted based on years of service. For example, an employee with 20 years of service may be granted three steps; an employee with 10 years of service may be granted two steps; and an employee with 5 years of service may be granted one additional step. Additionally, the Town may wish to adopt a longevity payment program which would grant longevity bonuses based on years of service. Another possible implementation strategy could be to guarantee each employee a minimum percent increase, such as 3% and place them on the step that provides that increase.

## **FUTURE ADJUSTMENTS TO THE SALARY SCHEDULE**

It is recommended that a market survey be conducted by the Town every 3 to 5 years and an appropriate across the board increase be applied to the entire scale.

## **CONCLUSION**

Thank you for allowing the Collins Center to work with the Town on this project. We believe the recommended position descriptions and classification plan will serve the Town well for many years to come. The Collins Center would like to thank Ms. Lucinda Thompson for her assistance throughout the process.



## SUMMARY OF SURVEY RESULTS

Department	TITLE	Average Minimum	Median Minimum	Average Maximum	Median Maximum	Brookfield Rate	Brookfield - Ave Max	Brookfield-Med Max
Accountant	Town Accountant			\$32.06	\$32.85	\$29.00	(\$3.06)	(\$3.85)
Assessor	Assistant Assessor (Principal Assessor)	\$23.54	\$23.14	\$31.51	\$28.86	\$25.09	(\$6.42)	(\$3.77)
Assessor	Assessors Clerk (Dept Asst)	\$17.42	\$17.24	\$22.31	\$22.55	\$14.11	(\$8.20)	(\$8.44)
BOH	Health Agent	\$24.90	\$26.01	\$35.74	\$36.61	\$16.16	(\$19.58)	(\$20.45)
BOH	Clerk (Dept Asst)	\$17.42	\$17.24	\$22.31	\$22.55	\$17.25	(\$5.06)	(\$5.30)
BOH	Transfer Station Monitor	\$14.83	\$14.83	\$17.67	\$17.67	\$15.53	(\$2.14)	(\$2.14)
BOS	Administrative Assistant - BOS/TA (Executive Assistant)	\$17.29	\$17.20	\$18.42	\$21.14	\$21.08	\$2.66	(\$0.06)
Fire	Fire Chief	\$32.42	\$32.42	\$40.67	\$38.96	\$35.53	(\$5.14)	(\$3.43)
Highway	Highway Superintendent	\$22.70	\$21.36	\$28.71	\$28.21	\$26.69	(\$2.02)	(\$1.52)
Highway	Operator I	\$19.00	\$19.41	\$23.65	\$23.95	\$22.62	(\$1.03)	(\$1.33)
Highway	Operator II	\$18.60	\$20.15	\$23.70	\$23.95	\$17.77	(\$5.93)	(\$6.18)
Highway	Administrative Assistant	\$17.42	\$17.24	\$22.31	\$22.55	\$17.44	(\$4.87)	(\$5.11)
Library	Library Director	\$24.66	\$24.56	\$32.44	\$33.71	\$24.71	(\$7.73)	(\$9.00)
Library	Librarian	\$18.08	\$16.81	\$24.18	\$22.14	\$16.87	(\$7.31)	(\$5.27)
Library	Library Assistant	\$14.81	\$14.83	\$18.92	\$19.10	\$14.93	(\$3.99)	(\$4.17)
Library	Custodian	\$12.77	\$12.60	\$17.18	\$17.12	\$13.47	(\$3.71)	(\$3.65)
Police	Chief of Police	\$34.96	\$34.96	\$49.13	\$40.20	\$37.83	(\$11.30)	(\$2.37)
Police	Sergeant - Police	\$33.62	\$32.53	\$34.44	\$34.83	\$31.85	(\$2.59)	(\$2.98)

Department	TITLE	Average Minimum	Median Minimum	Average Maximum	Median Maximum	Brookfield Rate	Brookfield - Ave Max	Brookfield-Med Max
Police	Officer - Police	\$23.81	\$23.44	\$28.84	\$28.59	\$25.42	(\$3.42)	(\$3.17)
Police	Administrative Assistant	\$17.42	\$17.24	\$22.31	\$22.55	\$18.75	(\$3.56)	(\$3.80)
Town Clerk	Town Clerk	\$28.01	\$28.28	\$31.32	\$31.70	\$15.80	(\$15.52)	(\$15.90)
Town Clerk	Assistant Town Clerk	\$16.87	\$17.20	\$21.13	\$21.33	\$16.92	(\$4.21)	(\$4.41)
Treasurer	Treasurer - (Treasurer/Collector)	\$26.43	\$23.88	\$33.56	\$32.18	\$30.00	(\$3.56)	(\$2.18)
Treasurer	Assistant Treasurer/Collector	\$17.48	\$17.45	\$23.35	\$22.99	\$23.43	\$0.08	\$0.44
Water	Chief Operator - Water/ Superintendent	\$23.09	\$20.01	\$28.56	\$26.36	\$28.65	\$0.09	\$2.29

## RECOMMENDED COMPENSATION SCHEDULE GENERAL GOVERNMENT

Grade	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6	Step 7	Step 8	Step 9	Step 10	Step 11	Step 12
1	\$12.00	\$12.50	\$13.00	\$13.50	\$14.00	\$14.50	\$15.00	\$15.50	\$16.00			
2	\$15.00	\$15.38	\$15.76	\$16.15	\$16.55	\$16.96	\$17.38	\$17.81	\$18.26	\$18.72	\$19.19	\$19.67
3	\$17.25	\$17.68	\$18.12	\$18.57	\$19.03	\$19.51	\$20.00	\$20.50	\$21.01	\$21.54	\$22.08	\$22.63
4	\$19.84	\$20.34	\$20.85	\$21.37	\$21.90	\$22.45	\$23.01	\$23.59	\$24.18	\$24.78	\$25.40	\$26.04
5	\$22.82	\$23.39	\$23.97	\$24.57	\$25.18	\$25.81	\$26.46	\$27.12	\$27.80	\$28.50	\$29.21	\$29.94
6	\$26.24	\$26.90	\$27.57	\$28.26	\$28.97	\$29.69	\$30.43	\$31.19	\$31.97	\$32.77	\$33.59	\$34.43
7	\$30.18	\$30.93	\$31.70	\$32.49	\$33.30	\$34.13	\$34.98	\$35.85	\$36.75	\$37.67	\$38.61	\$39.58

## RECOMMENDED COMPENSATION SCHEDULE FOR POLICE, FIRE AND EMS

Grade	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6	Step 7	Step 8	Step 9	Step 10	Step 11	Step 12	Step 13
<b>P3</b>	\$26.00	\$26.50	\$27.00	\$27.50	\$28.00	\$28.50	\$29.00	\$29.50	\$30.00	\$30.50	\$31.00	\$31.50	\$32.00
<b>P2</b>	\$20.00	\$20.50	\$21.00	\$21.50	\$22.00	\$22.50	\$23.00	\$23.50	\$24.00	\$24.50	\$25.00	\$25.50	\$26.00
<b>P1</b>	\$18.00	\$18.50	\$19.00	\$19.50	\$20.00	\$20.50	\$21.00	\$21.50	\$22.00	\$22.50	\$23.00	\$23.50	\$24.00
<b>E2</b>	\$22.00	\$22.50	\$23.00	\$23.50	\$24.00	\$24.50	\$25.00	\$25.50	\$26.00	\$26.50	\$27.00	\$27.50	\$28.00
<b>E1</b>	\$18.00	\$18.50	\$19.00	\$19.50	\$20.00	\$20.50	\$21.00	\$21.50	\$22.00	\$22.50	\$23.00	\$23.50	\$24.00
<b>F3</b>	\$18.00	\$18.50	\$19.00	\$19.50	\$20.00	\$20.50	\$21.00	\$21.50	\$22.00	\$22.50	\$23.00	\$23.50	\$24.00
<b>F2</b>	\$17.00	\$17.50	\$18.00	\$18.50	\$19.00	\$19.50	\$20.00	\$20.50	\$21.00	\$21.50	\$22.00	\$22.50	\$23.00
<b>F1</b>	\$16.00	\$16.50	\$17.00	\$17.50	\$18.00	\$18.50	\$19.00	\$19.50	\$20.00	\$20.50	\$21.00	\$21.50	\$22.00