BROOKLINE

CONTRIBUTORY RETIREMENT SYSTEM AUDIT REPORT JAN. 1, 2016 - DEC. 31, 2019



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Letter from the Executive Director	1
Explanation of Findings and Recommendations	2
Board's Annual Statements (as submitted):	
Statement of Ledger Assets and Liabilities	5
Statement of Changes in Fund Balances	6
Statement of Receipts	7
Statement of Disbursements	8
Investment Income	9
Supplementary Information:	
Schedule of Allocation of Investments Owned	10
Summary of Plan Provisions	11
Significant Accounting Policies	18
Administration of the System	20
Board Regulations	20
Actuarial Valuation and Assumptions	21
Membership Exhibit	22



COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS | PUBLIC EMPLOYEE RETIREMENT ADMINISTRATION COMMISSION

PHILIP Y. BROWN, ESQ., Chair

JOHN W. PARSONS, ESQ., Executive Director

Auditor DIANA DIZOGLIO | KATHLEEN M. FALLON | KATE FITZPATRICK | JAMES J. GUIDO | RICHARD MACKINNON, JR. | JENNIFER F. SULLIVAN, ESQ.

December 6, 2023

The Public Employee Retirement Administration Commission has completed an examination of certain activities of the Brookline Retirement System pursuant to G.L. c. 32, § 21. The examination covered the period from January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019. Based on an assessment in accordance with the policy outlined in PERAC Memo #18/2019, the scope of this audit was modified as noted below and was conducted in accordance with the accounting and management standards established by the Public Employee Retirement Administration Commission in regulation 840 CMR 25.00.

The specific objectives of our audit were to determine: 1) that the Board is exercising appropriate fiduciary oversight, 2) that cash balances are accurately stated, 3) that investment balances are accurately stated, 4) that travel expenses were properly documented and accounted for, 5) that retirement contributions are accurately deducted, 6) that retirement allowances were correctly calculated, 7) that required member documentation is maintained, 8) that appropriations certified by PERAC for the fiscal years covered by the audit have been paid to the retirement system, and 9) that refunds issued by the system were correctly calculated.

To achieve these objectives, we inspected certain records of the Brookline Retirement Board in the above areas. Specifically, we reviewed the minutes of the Board meetings for compliance with fiduciary oversight and verified cash balances and investment balances. We tested a sample of travel expenses for Board approvals, supporting documentation, and proper accounting. We tested the payroll records of a sample of active members to confirm that the correct percentage of regular compensation is being deducted, including the additional two percent over \$30,000. We also tested a sample of members who retired during our audit period to verify that their retirement allowance was calculated in accordance with the statute. We reviewed a sample of member files for accuracy and completeness. We reviewed appropriations received and compared to PERAC appropriation letters for the fiscal years during the audit period. We also tested refunds issued during the audit period and recalculated the interest portion of the refunds tested.

In our opinion, for those areas tested, the financial records are being maintained and the management functions are being performed in conformity with the standards established by PERAC with the exceptions noted in the findings presented in this report.

In closing, I acknowledge the work of the auditors who conducted this examination, and express appreciation to the Board and staff for their courtesy and cooperation.

Sincerely/

John W. Parsons, Esq.

Executive Director







EXPLANATION OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Active Members' Folders:

We tested 50 active members and found the following issues:

- It was discovered that one individual was added to the retirement system in error. She was enrolled in 2015 but was a retired teacher.
- We noted that one member's deduction rate was incorrect at 9% when it should be 8%.
 Although this member started working in Brookline in 2007, he transferred in from another system as an 8% contributor. Also, this person did not have completed beneficiary forms in his folder.
- There were four instances where members' creditable service was incorrect in the system's database. (These were corrected during fieldwork.)

Recommendation: The Board must review and correct all items noted in testing. The Board must keep required documents in members' folders and verify creditable service information in the database. All deductions paid in error must be returned to the individuals.

Board Response:

All cited issues have been corrected. The retired teacher was enrolled based on the employee's failure to affirmatively respond on the Enrollment Form that the employee was receiving a retirement allowance. Members' deduction rates are set at 9% upon enrollment and adjusted if necessary after proper verification of any claimed prior service has been received from the previous Systems. Although the Board requests all members to complete and file beneficiary selection forms, a member's right to select a beneficiary is nevertheless permissive. Attempts are made by Staff to contact employees enrolled without a completed beneficiary designation, but members may simply choose not to complete one, and the failure to do so does not alter the statutorily mandated membership and withholding. In the absence of a properly completed and filed beneficiary form, any benefits payments due subsequent to the death of a member are dictated by statute.

2. Regular Compensation:

The Town was withholding contributions from a monthly stipend of \$850 for one member whose contract included a clause that allows for 'Additional Compensation' to be either paid to him directly or put into a deferred compensation plan. This additional compensation arrangement does not qualify as regular compensation because the member has a choice between direct and indirect payments. Subsequent to the audit period, the member retired, and this additional compensation was incorrectly included in the calculation of the member's retirement allowance.

Recommendation: Deductions taken on the Additional Compensation should be returned to the member and the member's retirement allowance should be recalculated without including the Additional Compensation.

Board Response:

The member's employment was subject to a series of duly executed employment agreements with the Town commencing in 2010. Included was a provision which provided the member the sole discretion for the Town to pay his Additional Compensation to a deferred compensation account, or,

EXPLANATION OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (CONTINUED)

alternatively, for the Town to pay him directly for the services he was providing, "subject to withholdings for taxation and for other requirements applicable to regular compensation." Although PERAC is correct that the member had a choice between direct and indirect payments, the payments themselves were not discretionary, and the member opted initially to receive payments of the Additional Compensation indirectly through contributions to a deferred compensation account.

However, in August of 2018, the member provided written notice to the Town that he was exercising his sole discretion to cease payment of the Additional Compensation to a deferred compensation plan, and directed the Town to include the payment of the Additional Compensation as regular compensation paid directly to the member as part of the member's salary. Although the member's subsequent and final employment contract with the Town continued to include the provision relating to payment of deferred compensation, the Board confirmed with the Town that this was a drafting oversight, and that the 2018 election by the member to cease the deferred compensation and include the additional compensation as salary was understood by all parties to be "a one-time event." In a letter to the Board, the Town further advised the Board that, "[t]he old section relating to the conversion of deferred compensation was inadvertently left in the new agreement," and that, "this section of the contract was no longer applicable to his employment compensation." Therefore, as of August of 2018, the member no longer had a choice of direct or indirect payment of the Additional Compensation.

The Board and the member appreciate that the Commissioners and PERAC staff have invested significant time and resources in reviewing this issue. In the event that PERAC does not reconsider its position, it is respectfully requested that PERAC issue a separate written determination providing its rationale for this audit finding, with notice of appeal rights provided to the Board and member.

3. Investment Management Fees:

We found that there were no management fees recorded to the general ledger (GL) for some investments, as follows:

- No fees in 2016-2019 GL reports for Lexington
- No fees in 2017 and 2018 GL reports for AEW
- No fees in 2016-2018 GL for Hancock Timber and Sustainable Woodlands

Recommendation: The Board must review the accounting of investments in detail to ensure that all management fees are properly recorded to the GL and reported on the Annual Statements. The Board should not "net" management fees for accounting purposes but should record gross management fees and income for each investment.

Board Response:

In 2018, the Board voted to transfer management of the system's assets to PRIM. The Board is reviewing its accounting procedures for these illiquid legacy funds, in which some management fees have been waived, to ensure proper recording. Estimated Management Fees will be recorded in the GL at year end for any such legacy funds which continue to assess fees.

Final Determination

PERAC auditors will follow-up in six (6) months to ensure that appropriate actions have been taken regarding all findings.

ANNUAL STATEMENTS (as submitted)

STATEMENT OF LEDGER ASSETS AND LIABILITIES

		ASOF DECEMBER 31,					
	2019	2018	2017	2016			
Net Assets Available For Benefits:							
Cash	\$4,177,266	\$4,375,148	\$5,073,431	\$6,409,340			
Pooled Global Equity Funds	0	0	239,638,006	174,355,061			
Pooled Domestic Fixed Income Funds	0	0	31,139,402	43,299,743			
Pooled Alternative Investment Funds	23,450,165	19,853,820	14,411,293	12,680,970			
Pooled Real Estate Funds	7,124,089	19,434,321	18,756,247	18,823,418			
Hedge Funds	0	0	0	18,221,390			
PRIT Core Fund	309,038,245	255,887,431	0	0			
Accounts Receivable	0	119,850	109,436	109,637			
Accounts Payable	(<u>79,423</u>)	(<u>18,777</u>)	(<u>11,876</u>)	(<u>10,508</u>)			
Total	\$ <u>343,710,343</u>	\$ <u>299,651,791</u>	\$ <u>309,115,939</u>	\$ <u>273,889,051</u>			
Fund Balances:							
Annuity Savings Fund	\$80,934,334	\$77,424,392	\$74,932,293	\$73,370,439			
Annuity Reserve Fund	21,948,748	23,264,423	23,535,251	21,874,523			
Pension Fund	0	0	0	0			
Military Service Fund	13,685	13,671	13,687	13,689			
Expense Fund	0	0	0	0			
Pension Reserve Fund	<u>240,813,577</u>	<u>198,949,305</u>	<u>210,634,709</u>	<u>178,630,400</u>			
Total	\$ <u>343,710,343</u>	\$ <u>299,651,791</u>	\$ <u>309,115,939</u>	\$ <u>273,889,051</u>			

STATEMENT OF CHANGES IN FUND BALANCES

	Annuity Savings Fund	Annuity Reserve Fund	Pension Fund	Military Service Fund	Expense Fund	Pension Reserve Fund	Total All Funds
Beginning Balance 2016	\$71,433,001	\$21,728,645	\$0	\$14,396	\$0	\$163,347,373	\$256,523,415
Receipts	7,342,014	638,312	21,090,095	14	1,915,747	19,198,867	50,185,050
Interfund Transfers	(3,964,060)	3,964,707	3,915,915	(721)	0	(3,915,840)	0
Disbursements	(<u>1,440,516</u>)	(<u>4,457,141</u>)	(25,006,009)	<u>0</u>	(<u>1,915,747</u>)	<u>0</u>	(32,819,414)
Ending Balance 2016	73,370,439	21,874,523	0	13,689	0	178,630,400	273,889,051
Receipts	8,311,621	657,569	22,509,226	14	2,205,609	36,125,961	69,810,000
Interfund Transfers	(5,697,649)	5,732,095	4,087,220	(15)	0	(4,121,652)	0
Disbursements	(<u>1,052,119</u>)	(<u>4,728,937</u>)	(26,596,446)	<u>0</u>	(<u>2,205,609</u>)	<u>0</u>	(34,583,111)
Ending Balance 2017	74,932,293	23,535,251	0	13,687	0	210,634,709	309,115,939
Receipts	8,113,347	690,952	25,289,221	14	3,248,665	(9,550,550)	27,791,648
Interfund Transfers	(4,050,573)	4,055,381	2,130,075	(30)	0	(2,134,853)	0
Disbursements	(<u>1,570,674</u>)	(<u>5,017,161</u>)	(<u>27,419,296</u>)	<u>0</u>	(<u>3,248,665</u>)	<u>0</u>	(37,255,796)
Ending Balance 2018	77,424,392	23,264,423	0	13,671	0	198,949,305	299,651,791
Receipts	8,541,876	659,072	26,300,725	14	2,839,380	43,494,273	81,835,340
Interfund Transfers	(3,266,443)	3,268,711	1,627,734	0	0	(1,630,002)	0
Disbursements	(1,765,492)	(5,243,458)	(27,928,459)	<u>0</u>	(2,839,380)	<u>0</u>	(37,776,789)
Ending Balance 2019	\$ <u>80,934,334</u>	\$ <u>21,948,748</u>	\$ <u>0</u>	\$ <u>13,685</u>	\$ <u>0</u>	\$ <u>240,813,577</u>	\$ <u>343,710,343</u>

STATEMENT OF RECEIPTS

				24
	2019	FOR THE PERIOD E	ENDING DECEMBER : 2017	31, 2016
Annuity Savings Fund:		20.0		20.0
Members Deductions	\$7,632,578	\$7,148,484	\$7,264,287	\$6,470,915
Transfers from Other Systems	770,563	707,788	801,230	693,303
Member Make Up Payments and Re-deposits	20,685	147,141	138,847	43,537
Investment Income Credited to Member Accounts	<u>118,051</u>	109,935	107,257	134,259
Sub Total	8,541,876	8,113,347	8,311,621	7,342,014
Annuity Reserve Fund:				
Investment Income Credited to the Annuity Reserve				
Fund	659,072	690,952	657,569	638,312
Pension Fund:				
3 (8) (c) Reimbursements from Other Systems	560,129	556,366	462,913	371,847
Received from Commonwealth for COLA and Survivor	,		,	
Benefits	321,833	522,308	193,159	455,704
Pension Fund Appropriation	25,418,763	24,173,416	21,853,154	20,262,544
Settlement of Workers' Compensation Claims	0	37,130	0	0
Recovery of 91A Overearnings	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>
Sub Total	26,300,725	25,289,221	22,509,226	21,090,095
Military Service Fund:				
Investment Income Credited to the Military Service				
Fund	<u>14</u>	<u>14</u>	<u>14</u>	<u>14</u>
Expense Fund:				
Investment Income Credited to the Expense Fund	<u>2,839,380</u>	<u>3,248,665</u>	<u>2,205,609</u>	<u>1,915,747</u>
Pension Reserve Fund:	34,785	35,013	32,675	28,319
Federal Grant Reimbursement	,	9.889	32,675 22.320	26,319 36.411
Interest Not Refunded	11,864 371	9,009	22,320 378	30,411 74
Miscellaneous Income Excess Investment Income	** *			
	43,447,254	(<u>9,595,476</u>)	<u>36,070,587</u>	<u>19,134,063</u>
Sub Total	43,494,273	(<u>9,550,550</u>)	<u>36,125,961</u>	<u>19,198,867</u>
Total Receipts, Net	\$ <u>81,835,340</u>	\$ <u>27,791,648</u>	\$ <u>69,810,000</u>	\$ <u>50,185,050</u>

STATEMENT OF DISBURSEMENTS

	FOR THE PERIOD ENDING DECEMBER 31.				
	2019	2018	2017	2016	
Annuity Savings Fund:			-		
Refunds to Members	\$460,493	\$489,389	\$292,290	\$504,584	
Transfers to Other Systems	<u>1,304,999</u>	<u>1,081,285</u>	759,829	<u>935,931</u>	
Sub Total	<u>1,765,492</u>	<u>1,570,674</u>	<u>1,052,119</u>	<u>1,440,516</u>	
Annuity Reserve Fund:					
Annuities Paid	<u>5,243,458</u>	<u>5,017,161</u>	4,728,937	<u>4,457,141</u>	
Pension Fund:					
Pensions Paid:					
Regular Pension Payments	13,405,901	13,345,288	14,124,818	13,512,752	
Survivorship Payments	2,292,807	1,999,898	1,914,206	1,490,356	
Ordinary Disability Payments	204,881	186,471	235,660	202,857	
Accidental Disability Payments	6,701,751	6,712,862	5,316,845	5,826,950	
Accidental Death Payments	1,275,121	1,266,775	1,175,321	1,123,243	
Section 101 Benefits	202,627	206,226	239,069	178,561	
3 (8) (c) Reimbursements to Other Systems	1,222,109	1,245,191	1,343,171	593,166	
State Reimbursable COLA's Paid	2,644,556	2,435,292	2,272,372	2,081,521	
Chapter 389 Beneficiary Increase Paid	(<u>21,293</u>)	<u>21,293</u>	(<u>25,016</u>)	(<u>3,397</u>)	
Sub Total	<u>27,928,459</u>	<u>27,419,296</u>	<u>26,596,446</u>	<u>25,006,009</u>	
Expense Fund:	i				
Salaries	320,140	322,242	323,650	311,312	
Legal Expenses	9,828	7,871	26,478	16,119	
Travel Expenses	4,414	7,098	9,648	8,097	
Administrative Expenses	99,844	110,109	113,352	95,136	
Actuarial Services	5,000	29,500	4,000	28,000	
Furniture and Equipment	0	1,063	0	0	
Management Fees	2,381,598	2,613,251	1,728,481	1,439,980	
Service Contracts	0	139,800	0	0	
Fiduciary Insurance	<u>18,556</u>	<u>17,732</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>17,103</u>	
Sub Total	<u>2,839,380</u>	<u>3,248,665</u>	<u>2,205,609</u>	<u>1,915,747</u>	
Total Disbursements	\$ <u>37,776,789</u>	\$ <u>37,255,796</u>	\$ <u>34,583,111</u>	\$ <u>32,819,414</u>	

INVESTMENT INCOME

	FOR THE PERIOD ENDING DECEMBER 31.				
	2019	2018	2017	2016	
Investment Income Received From:					
Cash	\$39,144	\$2	\$0	\$0	
Equities	2,538	0	14,158	2,147	
Pooled or Mutual Funds	8,018,465	1,008,954	143,928	182,250	
Commission Recapture	<u>0</u>	<u>745</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	
Total Investment Income	8,060,147	<u>1,009,701</u>	<u>158,086</u>	<u>184,398</u>	
Plus:					
Realized Gains	18,661,702	15,116,681	48,066,636	2,135,289	
Unrealized Gains	34,927,691	<u>26,877,120</u>	30,550,300	32,207,478	
Sub Total	53,589,393	41,993,801	78,616,937	34,342,767	
Less:					
Realized Loss	(95,825)	(3,756,623)	3,737,132	(1,738,009)	
Unrealized Loss	(14,489,945)	(44,792,788)	(43,471,117)	(10,966,759)	
Sub Total	(<u>14,585,770</u>)	(<u>48,549,412</u>)	(39,733,986)	(12,704,768)	
Net Investment Income	47,063,770	(<u>5,545,910</u>)	39,041,036	21,822,396	
Income Required:					
Annuity Savings Fund	118,051	109,935	107,257	134,259	
Annuity Reserve Fund	659,072	690,952	657,569	638,312	
Military Service Fund	14	14	14	14	
Expense Fund	<u>2,839,380</u>	<u>3,248,665</u>	<u>2,205,609</u>	<u>1,915,747</u>	
Total Income Required	<u>3,616,516</u>	<u>4,049,565</u>	<u>2,970,450</u>	<u>2,688,333</u>	
Net Investment Income	47,063,770	(5,545,910)	39.041.036	21,822,396	
		(/			
Less: Total Income Required	<u>3,616,516</u>	<u>4,049,565</u>	<u>2,970,450</u>	<u>2,688,333</u>	
Excess Income (Loss) To The Pension Reserve					
Fund	\$ <u>43,447,254</u>	(\$9,595,476)	\$ <u>36,070,587</u>	\$ <u>19,134,063</u>	

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

SCHEDULE OF ALLOCATION OF INVESTMENTS OWNED

(percentages by category)

	ASOF DECEMBER 31, 2019			
		PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL		
	MARKET VALUE	ASSETS		
Cash	\$4,177,266	1.2%		
Pooled Alternative Investment Funds	23,450,165	6.8%		
Pooled Real Estate Funds	7,124,089	2.1%		
PRIT Core Fund	309,038,245	<u>89.9</u> %		
Grand Total	<u>\$343,789,766</u>	<u>100.0</u> %		

For the year ending December 31, 2019, the rate of return for the investments of the Brookline Retirement System was 15.95%. For the five-year period ending December 31, 2019, the rate of return for the investments of the Brookline Retirement System averaged 7.57%. For the 35-year period ending December 31, 2019, since PERAC began evaluating the returns of the retirement systems, the rate of return on the investments of the Brookline Retirement System was 8.65%.

The composite rate of return for all retirement systems for the year ending December 31, 2019 was 16.90%. For the five-year period ending December 31, 2019, the composite rate of return for the investments of all retirement systems averaged 7.95%. For the 35-year period ending December 31, 2019, since PERAC began evaluating the returns of the retirement systems, the composite rate of return on the investments of all retirement systems averaged 9.22%.

SUMMARY OF PLAN PROVISIONS

The plan is a contributory defined benefit plan covering all Brookline Retirement System member unit employees deemed eligible by the retirement board, with the exception of school department employees who serve in a teaching capacity. The Teachers' Retirement Board administers the pensions of such school employees.

ADMINISTRATION

There are 104 contributory retirement systems for public employees in Massachusetts. Each system is governed by a retirement board and all boards, although operating independently, are governed by Chapter 32 of the Massachusetts General Laws. This law in general provides uniform benefits, uniform contribution requirements and a uniform accounting and funds structure for all systems.

PARTICIPATION

Participation is mandatory for all full-time employees. Eligibility with respect to part-time, provisional, temporary, seasonal or intermittent employment is governed by regulations promulgated by the retirement board and approved by PERAC. Membership is optional for certain elected officials.

There are 4 classes of membership in the retirement system, but one of these classes, Group 3, is made up exclusively of the State Police. The other 3 classes are as follows:

Group 1:

General employees, including clerical, administrative, technical and all other employees not otherwise classified.

Group 2:

Certain specified hazardous duty positions.

Group 4:

Police officers, firefighters, and other specified hazardous positions.

MEMBER CONTRIBUTIONS

Member contributions vary depending on the most recent date of membership:

Prior to 1975: 5% of regular compensation 1975 - 1983: 7% of regular compensation 1984 to 6/30/96: 8% of regular compensation 7/1/96 to present: 9% of regular compensation

1979 to present: an additional 2% of regular compensation in excess of \$30,000.

In addition, members of Group 1 who join the system on or after April 2, 2012 will have their withholding rate reduced to 6% after achieving 30 years of creditable service.

RATE OF INTEREST

Interest on regular deductions made after January 1, 1984 is a rate established by PERAC in consultation with the Commissioner of Banks. The rate is obtained from the average rates paid on individual savings accounts by a representative sample of at least 10 financial institutions.

RETIREMENT AGE

The mandatory retirement age for some Group 2 and Group 4 employees is age 65. Most Group 2 and Group 4 members may remain in service after reaching age 65. Group 4 members who are employed in certain public safety positions are required to retire at age 65. There is no mandatory retirement age for employees in Group 1.

SUPERANNUATION RETIREMENT

A person who became a member before April 2, 2012 is eligible for a superannuation retirement allowance (service retirement) upon meeting the following conditions:

- completion of 20 years of service, or
- attainment of age 55 if hired prior to 1978, or if classified in Group 4, or
- attainment of age 55 with 10 years of service, if hired after 1978, and if classified in Group 1 or 2.

A person who became a member on or after April 2, 2012 is eligible for a superannuation retirement allowance (service retirement) upon meeting the following conditions:

- attainment of age 60 with 10 years of service if classified in Group 1, or
- attainment of age 55 with 10 years of service if classified in Group 2, or
- attainment of age 55 if classified in Group 4.

AMOUNT OF BENEFIT

A member's annual allowance is determined by multiplying average salary by a benefit rate related to the member's age and job classification at retirement, and the resulting product by his creditable service. The amount determined by the benefit formula cannot exceed 80% of the member's highest three year (or five year as discussed below) average salary. For veterans as defined in G.L. c. 32, s. 1, there is an additional benefit of \$15 per year for each year of creditable service, up to a maximum of \$300.

For employees who become members after January 1, 2011, regular compensation is limited to 64% of the federal limit found in 26 U.S.C. 401(a)(17). In addition, regular compensation will be limited to prohibit "spiking" of a member's salary to increase the retirement benefit.

- For persons who became members prior to April 2, 2012, Average Salary is the average annual rate of regular compensation received during the 3 consecutive years that produce the highest average, or, if greater, during the last 3 years (whether or not consecutive) preceding retirement.
- For persons who became members on or after April 2, 2012, Average Salary is the average annual rate of regular compensation received during the 5 consecutive years that produce the highest average, or, if greater, during the last 5 years (whether or not consecutive) preceding retirement.
- The Benefit Rate varies with the member's retirement age. For persons who became members prior to April 2, 2012 the highest rate of 2.5% applies to Group 1 employees who retire at or after age 65, Group 2 employees who retire at or after age 60, and to Group 4 employees who retire at or after age 55. A .1% reduction is applied for each year of age under the maximum age for the member's group. For Group 2 employees who terminate from service under age 55, the benefit rate for a Group 1 employee shall be used.
- For persons who became members on or after April 2, 2012 and retire with less than 30 years of creditable service, the highest rate of 2.5% applies to Group 1 employees who retire at or after age 67, Group 2 employees who retire at or after age 62, and to Group 4 employees who retire at or after age 57. A .15% reduction is applied for each year of age under the maximum age for the member's group.
- For persons who became members on or after April 2, 2012 and retire with more than 30 years of creditable service, the highest rate of 2.5% applies to Group 1 employees who retire at or after age 67, Group 2 employees who retire at or after age 62, and to Group 4 employees who retire at or after age 57. A .125% reduction is applied for each year of age under the maximum age for the member's group.

DEFERRED VESTED BENEFIT

A participant who has attained the requisite years of creditable service can elect to defer his or her retirement until a later date. Certain public safety employees cannot defer beyond age 65. All participants must begin to receive a retirement allowance or withdraw their accumulated deductions no later than April 15 of the calendar year following the year they reach age 72.

WITHDRAWAL OF CONTRIBUTIONS

Member contributions may be withdrawn upon termination of employment. The interest rate for employees who first become members on or after January 1, 1984 who voluntarily withdraw their contributions with less than 10 years of service will be 3%. Interest payable on all other withdrawals will be set at regular interest.

DISABILITY RETIREMENT

The Massachusetts Retirement Plan provides 2 types of disability retirement benefits:

ORDINARY DISABILITY

Eligibility: Non-veterans who become totally and permanently disabled by reason of a non-job related condition with at least 10 years of creditable service (or 15 years creditable service in systems in which the local option contained in G.L. c. 32, s. 6(1) has not been adopted).

Veterans with ten years of creditable service who become totally and permanently disabled by reason of a non-job related condition prior to reaching "maximum age". "Maximum age" applies only to those employees classified in Group 4 who are subject to mandatory retirement.

Retirement Allowance: For persons who became members prior to April 2, 2012, the benefit is equal to the accrued superannuation retirement benefit as if the member was age 55. If the member is a veteran, the benefit is 50% of the member's final rate of salary during the preceding 12 months, plus an annuity based upon accumulated member contributions plus credited interest. If the member is over age 55, he or she will receive not less than the superannuation allowance to which he or she is entitled.

For persons in Group 1 who became members on or after April 2, 2012, the benefit is equal to the accrued superannuation retirement benefit as if the member was age 60. If the member is a veteran, the benefit is 50% of the member's final rate of salary during the preceding 12 months, plus an annuity based upon accumulated member contributions plus credited interest. If the member is over age 60, he or she will receive not less than the superannuation allowance to which he or she would have been entitled had they retired for superannuation.

For persons in Group 2 and Group 4 who became members on or after April 2, 2012, the benefit is equal to the accrued superannuation retirement benefit as if the member was age 55. If the member is a veteran, the benefit is 50% of the member's final rate of salary during the preceding 12 months, plus an annuity based upon accumulated member contributions plus credited interest. If the member is over age 55, he or she will receive not less than the superannuation allowance to which he or she would have been entitled had they retired for superannuation.

ACCIDENTAL DISABILITY

Eligibility: Applies to members who become permanently and totally unable to perform the essential duties of the position as a result of a personal injury sustained or hazard undergone while in the performance of duties. There are no minimum age or service requirements.

Retirement Allowance: 72% of salary plus an annuity based on accumulated member contributions, with interest. This amount is not to exceed 100% of pay. For those who became members in service after January 1, 1988 or who have not been members in service continually since that date, the amount is limited to 75% of pay. There is an additional pension of \$952.32 per year (or \$312 per year in systems in which the local option contained in G.L. c. 32, s. 7(2)(a)(iii) has not been adopted), per child who is under 18 at the time of the member's retirement, with no age limitation if the child is mentally or physically incapacitated from earning. The additional pension may continue up to age 22 for any child who is a full time student at an accredited educational institution. For systems that have adopted Chapter 157 of the Acts of 2005, veterans as defined in G.L. c. 32, s. 1 receive an additional benefit of \$15 per year for each year of creditable service, up to a maximum of \$300.

ACCIDENTAL DEATH

Eligibility: Applies to members who die as a result of a work-related injury or if the member was retired for accidental disability and the death was the natural and proximate result of the injury or hazard undergone on account of which such member was retired.

Allowance: An immediate payment to a named beneficiary equal to the accumulated deductions at the time of death, plus a pension equal to 72% of current salary and payable to the surviving spouse, dependent children or the dependent parent, plus a supplement of \$952.32 per year, per child (or \$312 per year in systems in which the local option contained in G.L. c. 32, s. 9(2)(d)(ii) has not been adopted), payable to the spouse or legal guardian until all dependent children reach age 18 or 22 if a full time student, unless mentally or physically incapacitated.

The surviving spouse of a member of a police or fire department or any corrections officer who, under specific and limited circumstances detailed in the statute, suffers an accident and is killed or sustains injuries while in the performance of his duties that results in his death, may receive a pension equal to the maximum salary for the position held by the member upon his death. In addition, an eligible family member may receive a one-time payment of \$300,000 from the State Retirement Board. This lump sum payment is also available to the family of a public prosecutor in certain, limited circumstances.

DEATH AFTER ACCIDENTAL DISABILITY RETIREMENT

Effective November 7, 1996, Accidental Disability retirees were allowed to select Option C at retirement and provide a benefit for an eligible survivor. For Accidental Disability retirees prior to November 7, 1996, who could not select Option C, if the member's death is from a cause unrelated to the condition for which the member received accidental disability benefits, a surviving spouse will receive an annual allowance of \$6,000. For Systems that accept the provisions of Section 28 of Chapter 131 of the Acts of 2010, the amount of this benefit is \$9,000. For Systems that accept the provisions of Section 63 of Chapter 139 of the Acts of 2012, the amount of this benefit is \$12,000.

DEATH IN ACTIVE SERVICE (OPTION D)

Allowance: An immediate allowance equal to that which would have been payable had the member retired and selected Option C on the day before his or her death. For a member who became a member prior to April 2, 2012 whose death occurred prior to the member's superannuation retirement age, the age 55 benefit rate is used. For a member classified in Group 1 who became a member on or after April 2, 2012 whose death occurred prior to the member's superannuation retirement age, the age 60 benefit rate is used. If the member died after age 60, the actual age is used. For a member classified in Group 2 or Group 4, whose death occurred prior to the member's minimum superannuation retirement age, the benefit shall be calculated using an age 55 age factor. The minimum annual allowance payable to the surviving spouse of a member in service who dies with at least two years of creditable service is \$3,000 unless the retirement system has accepted the local option increasing this minimum annual allowance to \$6,000, provided that the member and the spouse were married for at least one year and living together on the member's date of death.

The surviving spouse of such a member in service receives an additional allowance equal to the sum of \$1,440 per year for the first child and \$1,080 per year for each additional child until all dependent children reach age 18 or 22 if a full time student, unless mentally or physically incapacitated.

COST OF LIVING

If a system has accepted Chapter 17 of the Acts of 1997, and the Retirement Board votes to pay a cost-of-living increase (COLA) for that year, the percentage is determined based on the increase in the Consumer Price Index used for indexing Social Security benefits, but cannot exceed 3.0%. Section 51 of Chapter 127 of the Acts of 1999, if accepted, allows boards to grant COLA increases greater than that determined by CPI but not to exceed 3.0%. Only a certain portion of a retiree's total allowance is subject to a COLA. The total COLA for periods from 1981 through 1996 is paid for by the Commonwealth of Massachusetts.

Under the provisions of Chapter 32, Section 103(j) inserted by Section 19 of Chapter 188 of the Acts of 2010, systems may increase the maximum base on which the COLA is calculated in multiples of \$1,000. For many years the COLA base was calculated based upon the first \$12,000 of a retiree's allowance. Now the maximum base upon which the COLA is calculated varies from system to system. Each increase in the base must be accepted by a majority vote of the Retirement Board and approved by the legislative body.

METHODS OF PAYMENT

A member may elect to receive his or her retirement allowance in one of 3 forms of payment.

Option A: Total annual allowance, payable in monthly installments, commencing at retirement and terminating at the member's death.

Option B: A reduced annual allowance, payable in monthly installments, commencing at retirement and terminating at the death of the member, provided, however, that if the total amount of the annuity portion received by the member is less than the amount of his or her accumulated deductions, including interest, the difference or balance of his accumulated deductions will be paid in a lump sum to the retiree's beneficiary or beneficiaries of choice.

Option C: A reduced annual allowance, payable in monthly installments, commencing at retirement. At the death of the retired employee, 2/3 of the allowance is payable to the member's designated beneficiary (who may be the spouse, or former spouse who has not remarried, child, parent, sister, or brother of the employee) for the life of the beneficiary. For members who retired on or after January 12, 1988, if the beneficiary pre-deceases the retiree, the benefit payable increases (or "pops up" to Option A) based on the factor used to determine the Option C benefit at retirement. For members who retired prior to January 12, 1988, if the System has accepted Section 288 of Chapter 194 of the Acts of 1998 and the beneficiary pre-deceases the retiree, the benefit payable "pops up" to Option A in the same fashion. The Option C became available to accidental disability retirees on November 7, 1996.

ALLOCATION OF PENSION COSTS

If a member's total creditable service was partly earned by employment in more than one retirement system, the cost of the "pension portion" is allocated between the different systems pro rata based on the member's service within each retirement system. In certain circumstances, if a member received regular compensation concurrently from two or more systems on or after January 1, 2010 and was not vested in both systems as of January 1, 2010, such a pro-ration may not be undertaken. This is because such a person may receive a separate retirement allowance from each system.

SIGNIFICANT ACCOUNTING POLICIES

The accounting records of the System are maintained on a calendar year basis in accordance with the standards and procedures established by the Public Employee Retirement Administration Commission.

<u>Cash</u> accounts are funds on deposit with banks and are available upon demand.

<u>Short Term Investments</u> are highly liquid investments that will mature within twelve months from the date of acquisition.

Investments are reported at their fair value. Securities traded on recognized exchanges are valued at the most recent sales price at year end. If no sale was reported, the mean of the bid and asked price is used when available, or the most recent bid price. Mutual, commingled and pooled funds are valued based on the net asset or unit value at year end. Real estate and alternative investments are valued based on estimates provided by the managers of those respective investments. Purchases and sales of securities are reflected on the date the trade is initiated. Realized gain or loss is largely based on the difference between the cost or the value at the prior year end and the funds realized upon liquidation. Dividend income is generally recorded when received. Interest income is recorded as earned on an accrual basis. Income from alternative investments is recorded as reported by the managing partner. Appreciation or depreciation in the value of investments consists of the unrealized gains and losses reported as the difference between the previous period and the current value.

The system makes estimates and assumptions that affect the reported values of assets and liabilities and the reported amounts added and deducted during the reporting periods. The fair value of real estate and alternative investment holdings are generally estimated in the absence of reliable exchange values. The actual funds realized upon liquidation may differ from these estimates.

The provisions of Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 32, § 23(2) generally govern the investment practices of the system. The Board primarily relies upon the investment strategy of the PRIM Board to maintain their progress toward full funding of the system. That strategy seeks to balance the exposure to common deposit and investment risks related to custody, credit concentrations, interest rate and foreign currency fluctuations.

Operating expenses include the ordinary and necessary cost of investment and professional services and the other miscellaneous administrative expenses of the system.

The <u>Annuity Savings Fund</u> is the fund in which members' contributions are deposited. Voluntary contributions, re-deposits, and transfers to and from other systems, are also accounted for in this fund. Members' contributions to the fund earn interest at a rate determined by PERAC. Interest for some members who withdraw with less than ten years of service is transferred to the Pension Reserve Fund. Upon retirement, members' contributions and interest are transferred to the Annuity Reserve Fund. Dormant account balances must be transferred to the Pension Reserve Fund after a period of ten years of inactivity.

The <u>Annuity Reserve Fund</u> is the fund to which a member's account is transferred upon retirement from the Annuity Savings Fund and Special Military Service Credit Fund. The annuity portion of the retirement allowance is paid from this fund. Interest is credited monthly to this fund at the rate of 3% annually on the previous month's balance.

The <u>Special Military Service Credit Fund</u> contains contributions and interest for members while on a military leave for service in the Armed Forces who will receive creditable service for the period of that leave.

The <u>Expense Fund</u> contains amounts transferred from investment income for the purposes of administering the retirement system.

The <u>Pension Fund</u> contains the amounts appropriated by the governmental units as established by PERAC to pay the pension portion of each retirement allowance.

The <u>Pension Reserve Fund</u> contains amounts appropriated by the governmental units for the purposes of funding future retirement benefits. Any profit or loss realized on the sale or maturity of any investment or on the unrealized gain of a market valued investment as of the valuation date is credited to the Pension Reserve Fund. Additionally, any investment income in excess of the amount required to credit interest to the Annuity Savings Fund, Annuity Reserve Fund, and Special Military Service Credit Fund is credited to this Reserve account.

The <u>Investment Income Account</u> is credited with all income derived from interest and dividends of invested funds. At year-end the interest credited to the Annuity Savings Fund, Annuity Reserve Fund, Expense Fund, and Special Military Service Credit Fund is distributed from this account and the remaining balance is transferred to the Pension Reserve Fund.

ADMINISTRATION OF THE SYSTEM

The System is administered by a five-person Board of Retirement consisting of the Comptroller who shall be a member ex-officio, a second member appointed by the governing authority, a third and fourth member who shall be elected by the members in or retired from the service of such system, and a fifth member appointed by the other four board members.

Ex-officio Member: Michael F. DiPietro

Appointed Member: Lincoln Heineman Until a successor is appointed

Elected Member: Robert J. Ward Term Expires: 12/19/2023

Elected Member: John J. Canney Term Expires: 12/19/2023

Appointed Member: Gary Altman, Chairperson Term Expires: 01/24/2024

The Board members are required to meet at least once a month. The Board must keep a record of all of its proceedings. The Board must annually submit to the appropriate authority an estimate of the expenses of administration and cost of operation of the system. The board must annually file a financial statement of condition for the system with the Executive Director of PERAC.

The investment of the system's funds is the responsibility of the Board. All retirement allowances must be approved by the Retirement Board. The PERAC Actuary performs verification prior to payment, unless the system has obtained a waiver for superannuation calculations allowing them to bypass this requirement. All expenses incurred by the System must be approved by a majority vote of the Board. Payments shall be made only upon vouchers signed by two persons designated by the Board.

Retirement board members and employees are bonded by an authorized agent representing a company licensed to do business in Massachusetts. Fidelity insurance is the only required policy coverage under Ch. 32 §21 and §23 as well as 840 CMR 17.01. The policy is designed to cover specific intentional acts such as theft, fraud or embezzlement and also specify who commits such acts, most commonly employees of the system. This coverage reimburses the system for the losses it suffers as a result of its employees' actions. It does not insure the employees for their illegal acts. Statutorily required coverage is provided by the current fidelity insurance policy to a limit of \$1,000,000 with a \$10,000 deductible issued through Travelers Casualty and Surety Company. The system also has Fiduciary coverage to a limit of \$50,000,000 under a blanket policy issued through the Massachusetts Association of Contributory Retirement Systems.

BOARD REGULATIONS

The Brookline Retirement Board has adopted Supplemental Regulations which are available on the PERAC website at https://www.mass.gov/Brookline-retirement-board-regulations.

ACTUARIAL VALUATION AND ASSUMPTIONS

The most recent actuarial valuation of the System was prepared by Segal Consulting as of January 1, 2022.

The actuarial liability for active members was	\$239,466,893
The actuarial liability for vested terminated members was	11,057,936
The actuarial liability for non-vested terminated members was	6,397,724
The actuarial liability for retired members was	<u>346,479,802</u>
The total actuarial liability was	\$603,402,355
System assets as of that date were (actuarial value)	415,251,318
The unfunded actuarial liability was	\$ <u>188,151,037</u>
The ratio of system's assets to total actuarial liability was	68.8%
As of that date the total covered employee payroll was	\$81,226,582

The normal cost for employees on that date was 10.4% of payroll

The normal cost for the employer including administrative expenses was 7.3% of payroll

The principal actuarial assumptions used in the valuation are as follows:

Investment Return: 6.90% per annum

Rate of Salary Increase: 4.5% for Groups 1&2, 4.75% for Group 4

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS AS OF JANUARY 1, 2022

	Actuarial	Actuarial	Unfunded			UAAL as a
Actuarial	Value of	Accrued	AAL	Funded	Covered	%of
Valuation	Assets	Liability	(UAAL)	Ratio	Payroll	Cov. Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b-a)	(a/b)	(c)	((b-a)/c)
1/1/2022	\$415,251,318	\$603,402,355	\$188,151,037	68.8%	\$81,226,582	231.6%
1/1/2020	\$336,243,386	\$564,124,005	\$227,880,619	59.6%	\$78,839,469	289.0%
1/1/2018	\$302,192,721	\$529,689,269	\$227,496,548	57.1%	\$73,332,427	310.2%
1/1/2016	\$268,098,412	\$484,224,410	\$216,125,998	55.4%	\$70,417,269	306.9%
1/1/2014	\$241,745,944	\$434,346,018	\$192,600,074	55.7%	\$64,829,168	297.1%

Prior to 2018, the covered payroll was equal to the projected pay. Beginning in 2018, the covered payroll was set equal to the total payroll.

MEMBERSHIP EXHIBIT

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Retirement in Past Years										
Superannuation	22	30	23	35	28	28	28	38	30	27
Ordinary Disability	0	0	1	1	0	1	0	0	2	0
Accidental Disability	4	7	5	4	5	2	5	7	2	0
Total Retirements	26	37	29	40	33	31	33	45	34	27
Total Retirees, Beneficiaries and										
Survivors	849	865	856	862	873	881	882	884	889	897
Total Active Members	1,292	1,338	1,380	1,467	1,575	1,678	1,826	1,494	1,622	1,476
Pension Payments										
Superannuation	\$11,123,282	\$11,343,938	\$12,055,485	\$11,818,320	\$11,912,221	\$12,190,375	\$13,512,752	\$14,124,818	\$13,345,288	\$13,405,901
Survivor/Beneficiary Payments	1,306,729	1,301,425	1,327,465	1,419,936	1,554,830	1,663,747	1,490,356	1,914,206	1,999,898	2,292,807
Ordinary Disability	223,412	238,105	235,775	249,210	239,974	240,385	202,857	235,660	186,471	204,881
Accidental Disability	5,366,248	5,491,911	5,200,479	5,723,735	5,952,005	6,169,655	5,826,950	5,316,845	6,712,862	6,701,751
Other	2,485,748	<u>2,698,591</u>	<u>3,027,656</u>	<u>3,353,868</u>	3,635,758	4,063,617	<u>3,973,095</u>	<u>5,004,917</u>	<u>5,174,776</u>	5,323,120
Total Payments for Year	\$ <u>20,505,419</u>	\$ <u>21,073,970</u>	\$ <u>21,846,860</u>	\$ <u>22,565,069</u>	\$ <u>23,294,788</u>	\$ <u>24,327,779</u>	\$ <u>25,006,009</u>	\$ <u>26,596,446</u>	\$ <u>27,419,296</u>	\$ <u>27,928,459</u>





COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS | PUBLIC EMPLOYEE RETIREMENT ADMINISTRATION COMMISSION

PHILIP Y. BROWN, ESO., Chair

WILLIAM T. KEEFE, Executive Director

Auditor DIANA DIZOGLIO | KATHLEEN M. FALLON | KATE FITZPATRICK | JAMES J. GUIDO | RICHARD MACKINNON, JR. | JENNIFER F. SULLIVAN, ESQ.

December 10, 2024

Gary Altman, Chairperson Brookline Retirement Board 11 Pierce Street Brookline, MA 02445

REFERENCE: Report of the Examination of the Brookline Retirement Board for the four-year period from January 1, 2016 through December 31, 2019.

Dear Chairperson Altman:

The Public Employee Retirement Administration Commission has completed a follow-up review of the findings and recommendations contained in its audit report of the Brookline Retirement Board for the period referenced above. We conduct these visits as a regular part of the oversight process to ensure the timely implementation of the recommendations contained in that report. The examination also addressed the other matters discussed at the completion of the audit. The results are as follows:

1. The Audit Report cited a finding that one individual was added to the retirement system in error, one active member's base deduction rate was incorrect, and that four active members had incorrect creditable service balances in the system's database.

Follow-up Result: We reviewed supporting documentation that showed each of the above-mentioned issues have been corrected. This issue is resolved.

2. The Audit Report cited a finding that a stipend for 'Additional Compensation' was incorrectly included in regular compensation for one retired member.

Follow-up Result: This issue is currently in litigation. We were informed that there are no other members receiving this 'Additional Compensation' stipend. This issue is not resolved.





December 10, 2024 Brookline Retirement Board Follow up letter Page Two

3. The Audit Report cited a finding that there were no management fees recorded to the general ledger (GL) for four investments during the audit period. The Board should have recorded the management fees and the corresponding income to the GL for fees taken "net" of income.

Follow-up Result: We reviewed the 2023 GL, the 2023 Annual Statement's Schedule 5 and 7 and verified that management fees for these investments held as of December 31, 2023 were appropriately recorded and accounted for in the 2023 GL. This issue is resolved.

The additional matters discussed have been reviewed and most have been resolved.

The Commission wishes to acknowledge the effort demonstrated by the staff of Brookline to correct many of the issues from the most recent examination of the system. PERAC auditors will conduct further follow-up as warranted to ensure corrections have been made in those areas that have not been resolved at this time.

Thank you for your continued cooperation in this matter.

Sincerely,

William T. Keefe

Executive Director

WTK/cms

cc: Brookline Retirement Board Members