Commonwealth Cares for Children (C3) Survey Findings
Please note these slides are from the Board of Early Education & Care September Meeting that occurred on September 13, 2023 and are not inclusive of all survey data.
Spring 2023 C3 Survey Overview

In March, EEC launched the fourth in a series of surveys to gather additional information about programs’ use of C3 grant funds, ongoing financial needs, and issues facing the workforce and families.

The spring survey launched on March 31, 2023 and providers were required to complete the survey when they applied for their next monthly C3 grant.

This analysis includes responses from 6,806 providers (87%) that completed the survey prior to July 31, 2023. Respondents include:

- 2,577 center-based care programs (88% of all CBC providers statewide)
- 4,229 family child care programs (86% of all FCC statewide)
- 4,414 programs (96% response rate) that serve children receiving EEC Child Care Financial Assistance*

Response rates by region range from 85% in the Southeast and Cape to 89% in Western MA.

*Note: For purposes of this analysis, “serve children receiving EEC child care financial assistance” is defined as a program that served a child with child care financial assistance in Feb 2020, May 2021, Nov 2021, March 2022, June 2022, Sept 2022, Dec 2022, and/or March 2023, as these are the points used in the C3 formula.
Licensed capacity continues to rebound.

License Capacity Over Time

- Center-Based Care
- Family Child Care
- Statewide Total

Licensed Capacity as of 8/25/23

Pre-COVID: 42086
Spring 2021: 35772
Spring 2022: 38232
Spring 2023: 39424
Current: 40769
Program enrollment is continuing to stabilize.

Percentage of License Capacity Enrolled

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Jul 2021</th>
<th>Jan 2022</th>
<th>Jul 2022</th>
<th>Jan 2023</th>
<th>Jun 2023</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family Child Care</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center Based, &lt;40 Seats</td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center Based, 40-79 Seats</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center Based, 80-120 Seats</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center Based, &gt;120 Seats</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data through FY23 C3 Application Data
Programs continue to spend the majority of C3 funding on existing operational expenses.

**Operational Costs**
To date, programs have spent 58% of grant funds on operational expenses over time (compared to 65% at the same time last year).

**New Investments**
Programs report spending 25% of total grant funds on new investments (compared to 20% at the same time last year).
Over 50% of C3 funds to date have been spent on workforce compensation and supports.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Workforce Spending</th>
<th>% of Total C3 Grants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Existing payroll and/or benefits</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased compensation for educators through salary increases</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased compensation for existing educators through one-time payments</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentives to attract or hire new staff</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to additional training and mental health supports for staff</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Spending** 55%

Data from Spring 2023 C3 Survey
Over time, programs are spending a smaller proportion of funds on ongoing operational costs and a higher proportion on investments.
The flexibility of C3 funding allows different program types to spend funds based on their needs.

Grant Funds Expended by Program Type through Spring 2023

FCC "other operational costs" includes rent/mortgage/utilities, facilities maintenance, and PPE.

FCC "new investments" includes 5% to Capital Investments and 5% towards New Materials.
C3 funds have supported providers in raising salaries, making investments (including avoiding debt), and avoiding significant tuition increases.

Changes Programs Report if C3 Ends, by Provider Type

- Defer planned salary scale increases or benefits improvements
- Increase tuition rates
- Reduce discretionary program expenses
- Reduce educator compensation
- Defer facility maintenance/improvements
- Reduce staffing level
- Reduce support for educators
- Incur or increase debt
- Close program
- Other
- None of the above

Center-Based Care (n = 2,577)
- Defer planned salary scale increases or benefits improvements: 24%
- Increase tuition rates: 53%
- Reduce discretionary program expenses: 52%
- Reduce educator compensation: 52%
- Defer facility maintenance/improvements: 39%
- Reduce staffing level: 49%
- Reduce support for educators: 30%
- Incur or increase debt: 36%
- Close program: 9%
- Other: 18%
- None of the above: 0%

Family Child Care (n = 4,229)
- Defer planned salary scale increases or benefits improvements: 24%
- Increase tuition rates: 53%
- Reduce discretionary program expenses: 52%
- Reduce educator compensation: 52%
- Defer facility maintenance/improvements: 39%
- Reduce staffing level: 49%
- Reduce support for educators: 30%
- Incur or increase debt: 36%
- Close program: 9%
- Other: 18%
- None of the above: 0%
The changes programs would make if C3 were no longer available vary by the proportion of children that receive child care financial assistance.

Changes Programs Report if C3 Not Available, by Proportion of Children Receiving CCFA

- Increase tuition rates: 43% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 55% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Reduce discretionary program expenses: 38% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 38% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Reduce educator compensation: 51% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 61% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Defers planned salary scale increases or benefits improvements: 36% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 48% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Defers Facility Maintenance: 46% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 45% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Incur or increase debt: 29% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 30% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Reduce staffing level: 27% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 31% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Reduce support for educators: 27% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 28% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Close: 13% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 16% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- Other: 2% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 2% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
- None of the Above: 0% (Serves less than 33% CCFA), 0% (Serves more than 33% CCFA)
Programs increasingly report needing to close if C3 funds were no longer available.

982 programs report they would Close if C3 Funds No Longer Available

~6,500 Child Care Financial Assistance Seats would be lost if these programs closed

18% of family child care report they would close up from 14% in Fall 22

8% of center-based programs report they would close down from 9% in Fall 22

18,000 Licensed Seats would be lost if these programs closed

Data from Spring 2023 C3 Survey
If C3 became a permanent funding source, programs would prioritize increasing salaries and benefits, hiring additional staff, and investing in professional learning and additional supports for children.

Activities programs would prioritize if grant funding permanent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Center-Based Care (n = 2,577)</th>
<th>Family Child Care (n = 4,229)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase salaries</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase benefits</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hire additional staff to serve current license capacity</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invest in more professional learning opportunities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invest in additional mental health or behavioral supports for children and/or staff</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand license capacity by hiring staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce planned increases to tuition costs</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand license capacity by making capital/facilities improvements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce tuition costs</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand hours of operation</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Programs were allowed to choose up to three activities
C3 Spring 2023 Survey Findings: Capacity, Staffing, and Compensation
Overall, about 1/3 of center-based providers report being unable to serve their full license capacity.

The most commonly reported reasons that programs are unable to serve their full license capacity include...

- Unfilled staff openings: 27%
- Lack of enrollment/turnover: 8%
- Space constraints: 2%
- Transportation limitations: 2%
- Health and safety concerns: 1%
- Other: 2%
- Prefer to Not: 0%
Almost 1/5 of center-based programs statewide report at least one closed classroom.

Percentage of programs with closed classrooms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Licensing Region</th>
<th>Child Care Financial Assistance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All Center-Based Care</td>
<td>Does not Serve Children With CCFA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central (n=93)</td>
<td>More than 66% (n=79)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast and Cape (n=101)</td>
<td>33% - 66% (n=101)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast (n=109)</td>
<td>1% - 33% (n=167)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro Boston (n=105)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western (n=53)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

0% 5% 10% 15% 20% 25% 30%
Infant and toddler classrooms are the most affected by classroom closures.

![Percentage of Closed Classrooms by Age Group](image-url)
## Programs report 2,045 open teacher positions, which make up 50% of all open positions and about 11% of all teacher positions statewide.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Number of Open Positions Statewide</th>
<th>Percent of All Open Positions Statewide</th>
<th>Number of Positions Statewide</th>
<th>Percent of All Positions that are Currently Open</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>2,045</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>19,389</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Teacher</td>
<td>1,249</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>8,684</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Leader</td>
<td>406</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>3,436</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Leader</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>1,696</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Coordinator</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1,008</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center Director</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2,294</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program Administrator</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1,301</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All positions</td>
<td>4,072</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>37,808</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

About 11% of all educator positions statewide are open.

46% of all center-based programs report an open position, averaging 3.4 open positions per programs.
The educator turnover rate is decreasing, although it is still high.

Turnover Rate Over Time

- Fall 2022: 32%
- Spring 2023: 27%

Turnover Rates by Region

- All Center-Based Care: 27%
- Western (n=326): 19%
- Southeast and Cape (n=486): 31%
- Northeast (n=524): 27%
- Metro Boston (n=548): 30%
- Central (n=438): 27%

Educator turnover: The % of educators (all educator roles) employed 12 months ago who are no longer employed by the program.
Turnover rates vary based on the proportion of children receiving child care financial assistance that a program serves.

Turnover Rates By Proportion of Children Receiving CCFA

- **All Center-Based Care (n=2,322)**: 27%
- **> 66% CCFA (n = 354)**: 28%
- **33-66% CCFA (n=332)**: 40%
- **1-33% CCFA (n=735)**: 31%
- **Does not serve CCFA (n =901)**: 19%
Staffing challenges prevent programs from serving their full license capacity.

1/3 Of all group and school age programs Cannot serve their full license capacity.

79% of those GSA programs Cite unfilled staff openings as a cause.

10,000-16,000 additional children could be served if these positions were filled.

Data from Spring 2023 C3 Survey
Overall, 44% of center-based programs reported having at least one educator turn down a role in their program in the last 6 months.

The most frequently reported reasons include:

- Educator turned down a position in the last six months: 44%
- Salary is too low: 27%
- Taking a job in another industry: 16%
- Taking a job at a public school: 14%
- Taking a job at another early education or out of school time program: 14%
- Work schedule is not a good fit: 10%
- Unknown/candidate did not share: 9%
- Taking a job as a nanny/babysitter: 8%
- Deciding not to work: 7%
- Benefits are not sufficient: 6%
- Unable to provide a spot for their own child at our center: 5%
- Location is not convenient: 3%
- Looking for more professional support or growth opportunities than available at your...: 1%
- Other: 1%

Note: Providers were able to select more than one option.
Wages have increased since the beginning of C3 but remain low.

Average Educator Highest and Lowest Hourly Pay By Role Over Time

- **Average Highest Wage**
- **Average Lowest Wage**
- **Mid-Point**

Data through FY23
Educator hourly pay varies by region.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Jul-21 Average Highest Wage</th>
<th>Jul-21 Average Lowest Wage</th>
<th>Jul-21 Midpoint</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Western</td>
<td>$19.02</td>
<td>$15.41</td>
<td>$17.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast and Cape</td>
<td>$19.96</td>
<td>$15.59</td>
<td>$17.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>$22.92</td>
<td>$18.06</td>
<td>$20.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>$21.38</td>
<td>$18.69</td>
<td>$20.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro Boston</td>
<td>$24.85</td>
<td>$19.25</td>
<td>$22.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Jun-23 Average Highest Wage</th>
<th>Jun-23 Average Lowest Wage</th>
<th>Jun-23 Midpoint</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Western</td>
<td>$21.48</td>
<td>$17.77</td>
<td>$19.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast and Cape</td>
<td>$19.35</td>
<td>$17.77</td>
<td>$18.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>$21.84</td>
<td>$18.83</td>
<td>$20.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>$21.89</td>
<td>$19.25</td>
<td>$20.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro Boston</td>
<td>$24.79</td>
<td>$20.51</td>
<td>$22.65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Educator hourly pay also varies by the proportion of children that receive child care financial assistance.

**Teacher's Average Highest and Lowest Hourly Salary By CCFA Acceptance Over Time**

- **Average Highest Wage**
- **Average Lowest Wage**
- **Midpoint**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>More than 66%</td>
<td>33% - 66%</td>
<td>1% - 33%</td>
<td>Does not serve children with CCFA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
C3 Spring 2023 Survey Findings: Family Access and Enrollment
Nearly half of programs have their own waitlist for enrollment.

By Program Type

- Family Child Care (n = 4,229): 43%
- Center-Based Care (n = 2,577): 60%

By CCFA Served

- > 66% CCFA (n = 2,514): 35%
- 33-66% CCFA (n = 838): 53%
- 1-33% CCFA (n = 1,062): 62%
- No CCFA Served (n = 2,392): 57%

By Region

- All Providers (n = 6,806): 49%
- Central (n = 1,343): 51%
- Metro (n = 1,543): 45%
- Northeast (n = 1,640): 42%
- Southeast (n = 1,242): 58%
- Western (n = 1,038): 55%
Almost \( \frac{3}{4} \) of programs report that C3 has positively impacted affordability for families.

- C3 grants positively impacted program affordability: 74%
- Delayed tuition increases: 47%
- Reduced or eliminated other parent fees (e.g., activity or supplies): 33%
- Reduced fees: 21%
- Provided additional private scholarships for families: 12%
- Provided additional private scholarships for staff: 7%
- Other: 6%