December 19, 2012

The Honorable Steven T. James Clerk of the House of Representatives

The Honorable William F. Welch Clerk of the Senate

The Honorable Cynthia Stone Creem Senate Chair, Joint Committee on the Judiciary

The Honorable Eugene L. O'Flaherty House Chair, Joint Committee on the Judiciary

Dear Sirs and Madam:

In compliance with the provisions of Chapter 205 of the Acts of 2008, "An Act Further Protecting Children," please find enclosed the annual report for 2012.

This report provides the Joint Committee on the Judiciary with the information required relative to the prosecution and disposition of offenses established under the Act. We look forward to continuing to work with the legislature on monitoring the implementation of this legislation.

Very truly yours,

Robert A. Mulligan
Chief Justice of the Trial Court

Harry Spence Court Administrator

cc: The Honorable Therese Murray, President of the Senate The Honorable Robert A. DeLeo, Speaker of the House

# Annual Report

# Chapter 205 of the Acts of 2008 An Act Further Protecting Children



A Report to the

Clerk of the House Clerk of the Senate Joint Committee on the Judiciary

Submitted by:

Honorable Robert A. Mulligan Chief Justice of the Trial Court

> Harry Spence Court Administrator

December 19, 2012

### **Annual Report to Support Implementation of**

## Chapter 205 of the Acts of 2008 An Act Further Protecting Children

#### Introduction

This report was prepared to comply with Section 5 of Chapter 205 of the Acts of 2008, "An Act Further Protecting Children" which provides that:

Notwithstanding any general or special law to the contrary, ... the trial court shall establish and implement an annual reporting system that shall provide information to the joint committee on the judiciary relative to the prosecution and disposition of cases which involve offenses established under this act. The reporting system shall be established not later than December 31, 2008, and the first annual report shall be filed with the clerk of the house and the clerk of the senate and the joint committee on the judiciary not later than December 31, 2009.

In meeting this reporting requirement, this annual report summarizes the changes made by the legislation and presents relevant data on this population through state fiscal year 2012.

#### **Chapter 205 Legislative Summary**

Chapter 205 of the Acts of 2008, entitled "An Act Further Protecting Children" was approved on July 24, 2008. This legislation made the following changes to the offense structure in Massachusetts:

- Created three new crimes:
  - o Indecent A&B on Child, Aggravated
  - o Rape of Child, Aggravated
  - o Rape of Child with Force, Aggravated

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> On June 4, 2008 House 4811 was engrossed by a vote of 143 to 3; on July 15, 2008 it was engrossed in the Senate by a vote of 35 to 1; and on July 24, 2008 it was signed by Governor Patrick.

- Broadened the <u>subsequent offender</u> provisions for three crimes:<sup>2</sup>
  - o Indecent A&B on Child, Subsequent
  - o Rape of Child, Subsequent
  - o Rape of Child with Force, Subsequent
- Established six new mandatory sentencing provisions:
  - o Indecent A&B on Child, Aggravated
  - o Rape of Child, Aggravated
  - o Rape of Child with Force, Aggravated
  - o Indecent A&B on Child, Subsequent
  - o Rape of Child, Subsequent
  - o Rape of Child with Force, Subsequent

Table 1 summarizes changes in the penalty structure and offenses that were created under this legislation. In this annual report, the focus was placed on those six offenses representing the new offenses and broadened offense elements. All of those six offenses involve new mandatory minimum penalties ranging from 10 years to 20 years. All of these offenses are in the sole jurisdiction of the Superior Court Department in Massachusetts. Offenders convicted and sentenced under these provisions will be sentenced to the Department of Correction.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Previous requirement was prior conviction of the same offense and current legislation calls for prior conviction of any enumerated sex offense.

Table 1.

Chapter 205 of the Acts of 2008, An Act to Further Protect Children Summary of Legislative Provisions

Chapter 205 of the Acts of 2008		Prev	rious Statutes	Change	Revised Statutory Penalty	BMC / District Court Jurisdiction	
c. 265 s. 13B	Indecent A&B on Child	c. 265 s. 13B	Indecent A&B on Child	No Change	10 year statutory maximum / 2 1/2 year house of correction alternative	yes, from Chapter 218, section 26	
c. 265 s. 13B ½	Indecent A&B on Child, Aggravated			New Crime / 10 year Mandatory	life felony / 10 year state prison mandatory minimum / no house of correction alternative	no	
c. 265 s. 13B ¾	Indecent A&B on Child, Subsequent	c. 265 s. 13B	Indecent A&B on Child, Subsequent	Broader Subsequent / 15 year Mandatory	life felony / 15 year state prison mandatory minimum / no house of correction alternative	no	
c. 265 s. 22A	Rape of Child with Force	c. 265 s. 22A	Rape of Child with Force	No Change	life felony	no	
			Rape of Child with Force, Armed, Firearm	Offense Eliminated			
			Rape of Child with Force, Armed, Firearm, Subsequent	Offense Eliminated			
c. 265 s. 22B	Rape of Child with Force, Aggravated			New Crime / 15 year Mandatory	life felony / 15 year state prison mandatory minimum / no house of correction alternative	no	
c. 265 s. 22C	Rape of Child with Force, Subsequent	c. 265 s. 22A	Rape of Child with Force, Subsequent	Broader Subsequent / 20 year mandatory	life felony / 20 year state prison mandatory minimum / no house of correction alternative	no	
c. 265 s. 23	Rape of Child, Statutory	c. 265 s. 23	Rape of Child, Statutory	No Change	life felony / 2 1/2 year house of correction alternative	no	
c. 265 s. 23A	Rape of Child, Statutory, Aggravated			New Crime / 10 year Mandatory	life felony / 10 year state prison mandatory minimum / no house of correction alternative	no	
c. 265 s. 23B	Rape of Child, Statutory, Subsequent	c. 265 s. 23	Rape of Child, Statutory, Subsequent	Broader Subsequent / 15 year Mandatory	life felony / 15 year state prison mandatory minimum / no house of correction alternative	no	

**Chapter 205 Offense** 

#### **Historical Data on Chapter 205 Related Offenses**

As background to the current analysis, relevant information on offenders convicted of sexual assaults on children is considered. While Chapter 205 impacts only a small proportion of these offenders – those who meet the subsequent or aggravated provisions provided by the legislation – this background information should be useful for providing a context for considering the implementation of these legislative provisions.

The following tables are based on annual statistical reports from the Massachusetts Sentencing Commission and the Department of Correction and show the following information on selected sex offenders:

- The number of offenders sentenced in the Superior Court;
- The number of offenders incarcerated in the Department of Correction; and,
- The number of offenders committed to the Department of Correction.

As shown in Table 2, in FY 2012 149 offenders were sentenced for Indecent Assault and Battery on a Child, Rape of a Child, or Forcible Rape of a Child (including all subsequent or aggravated offense convictions) in the Superior Court Department in Massachusetts. While these statistics are based solely on governing offense this substantially accounts for most sex offenders, as for most convicted sex offenders, the sex offense is their governing offense.<sup>3</sup>

Table 2.

Governing Offense, Selected Sex Offenses,
Superior Court Department, FY 2003 to FY 2011<sup>4</sup>

Governing Offense	FY 2003	FY 2004	FY 2005	FY 2006	FY 2007	FY 2008	FY 2009	FY 2010	FY 2011
Rape of Child, Forcible	31	36	30	29	39	30	36	37	31
Rape of Child	125	112	96	104	97	96	101	86	75
Rape of Child, Aggravated	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	8
Rape of Child, 2nd	3	1	1	0	3	0	1	0	0
A&B Indecent Child	38	34	58	39	36	49	36	28	32
A&B Indecent Child, Aggravated	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
A&B Indecent Child, 2nd	2	0	1	2	2	2	2	3	2
Total	199	183	186	174	177	177	176	155	149

<sup>4</sup> The source of these data is the Massachusetts Sentencing Commission, *Survey of Sentencing Practices*, FY 2003 to FY 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Massachusetts Sentencing Commission estimates that 7.1% of all sex offenders were convicted of an offense other than a sex offense as the governing offense and that 4.8% of sex offenders convicted in the Superior Court Department were convicted of an offense other than a sex offense as the governing offense. (Massachusetts Sentencing Commission, *Survey of Sentencing Practices, FY 2011*).

Table 3 shows the number of offenders currently incarcerated in the Department of Correction for selected sex offenses for selected years from the period 1999 to 2012. As shown in Table 3, as of January 1, 2012 there were 791 offenders incarcerated in Department of Correction facilities for the offenses of Rape of Child, Forcible Rape of Child, and Indecent Assault and Battery on a Child.

Table 3.

Governing Offense, Selected Sex Offenses,
Inmates in Department of Correction Facilities,
January 1, Selected Years, 1999 to 2012<sup>5</sup>

 Selected Sex Offenses	1999	2000	2004	2005	2009	2010	2011	2012
Rape of Child, Forcible	404	396	314	304	302	317	309	295
Rape of Child	548	542	475	453	387	375	389	400
A&B Indecent Child	151	144	107	103	96	96	90	96
Total	1103	1082	896	860	785	788	788	791

Table 4 shows the number of new court commitments to the Department of Correction for the selected years from 1998 to 2011 for selected sex offenses. In 2011 there were a total of 121 offenders committed to the Department of Correction for forcible rape of child, rape of child, or Indecent Assault and Battery on a Child.

Table 4.

Governing Offense, Selected Sex Offenses,
Inmates Committed to the Department of Correction,
Selected Years, 1998 to 2011<sup>6</sup>

Selected Sex Offense	1998	1999	2003	2004	2008	2009	2010	2011
Rape of Child, Forcible	37	29	33	38	29	44	26	27
Rape of Child	82	71	70	61	66	69	57	65
A&B Indecent Child	31	27	15	17	18	17	14	29
Total	150	127	118	116	113	130	97	121

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Massachusetts Department of Correction, *Inmate Statistics, January 1, 1999 to 2009* and responses to information requests dated November 23, 2010, October 26, 2011 and December 5, 2012. This table includes criminally sentenced offenders in the jurisdiction of the Department of Correction and excludes those offenders placed in treatment facilities managed by the Department of Correction such as the Bridgewater State Hospital or the Treatment Center for the Sexually Dangerous.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Massachusetts Department of Correction, *Court Commitments to the Massachusetts Department of Correction*, 1998 to 2008 and responses to information requests dated November 23, 2010, October 26, 2011, and December 5, 2012.

### **Chapter 205 Report Statistical Results**

As indicated in the reporting plan submitted in December 2008, the types of information available in the annual report to the legislature would include the number of individuals charged, the status of the case at the end of the reporting period, the number of defendants sentenced under this legislation, and the length of sentences imposed. The methodology used to implement this reporting system is contained in the Appendix.

As noted earlier, Chapter 205 became effective on October 22, 2008. Those who were charged with any one of the six designated sex offenses on or after that date were subject to the mandatory sentencing provisions of Chapter 205. The following table shows the results of the data collection efforts for those charged with a Chapter 205 offense where the offense occurred between October 22, 2008, and June 30, 2012, the end of FY 2012. This table is limited to those cases where one or more of the charges were one of the six Chapter 205 offenses (e.g. subsequent or aggravated charge with an underlying offense of forcible rape of child, rape of child, or indecent assault and battery of child).

#### Some of the findings shown in Table 5 are:

- There were 274 cases identified where one or more of the charges was potentially subject to the provisions of Chapter 205;
- These 274 cases involve 265 individual defendants;
- Of the 274 cases, 128 are currently pending and 146 have been disposed;
- Of the disposed cases, 108 resulted in a conviction and sentenced and 38 cases had some other disposition (e.g. nolle prosequi, not guilty, dismissed, or no bill);
- Of the 108 convicted cases 33 were disposed by a jury trial, one was disposed by a bench trial, and 74 were disposed by a plea of guilty;
- Of the 38 cases that were disposed of in some other manner, 5 were dismissed, 17 resulted in a not guilty verdict, 13 were nolle prosequi, and 3 were no bill;
- Of the 108 convicted cases, 101 resulted in a period of incarceration including 44 mandatory sentences, 46 other sentences to the Department of Correction, and 11 other sentences to a house of correction. In the seven remaining cases, there was one sentence to probation to be served from and after a sentence to incarceration in the state prison sentence on another case and six other sentences to probation.

Table 5.

Chapter 205 Cases Cases Charged, Current Status, Disposition, and Sentence
by Year In Which Case was Filed

	Year Case was Filed					
Case Status	FY 2009	FY 2010	FY 2011	FY 2012	Total	
Carra Channal	11	<i>5</i> 2	0.1	110	274	
Cases Charged	11	53	91	119	274	
<b>Current Status of Case</b>						
Pending	1	6	32	89	128	
Disposed	10	47	59	30	146	
Total	11	53	91	119	274	
Disposed Cases						
Convicted and Sentenced	8	33	47	20	108	
Other Disposition	2	14	12	10	38	
Total	10	47	59	30	146	
Santan and Carea						
Sentenced Cases	2	10	20	1.1	4.4	
Convicted of Chapter 205 Offense	3	10	20	11	44	
Convicted of Other Offense	5	23	27	9	64	
Total	8	33	47	20	108	
Sentence Information						
20 Year Mandatory	0	0	2	0	2	
15 Year Mandatory	2	1	2	1	6	
10 Year Mandatory	1	9	16	10	36	
Other Sentence to State Prison	5	17	16	8	46	
Other Sentence to House of Correction	0	4	7	0	11	
Other Sentence	0	2	4	1	7	
Total	8	33	47	20	108	

### **Summary**

This report is intended to meet the requirements established by the Legislature under Chapter 205. It is the intention of the Executive Office of the Trial Court to maintain this annual reporting requirement by continued follow-up of pending cases along with reporting new cases that come before the court. The Executive Office of the Trial Court looks forward to continued work with the legislature on the implementation and monitoring of this legislation and welcomes suggestions or comments for further improvement of this effort.

#### **Appendix - Chapter 205 Reporting Methodology**

As noted in the planning report submitted in December 2008, the annual reporting system is required to consider the prosecution and disposition of cases under these provisions. At a minimum the reporting system should include the number of new cases filed, the number of cases resulting in a conviction, and the sentence imposed for those cases. The governing offense and secondary offenses were included. In order to be fiscally responsible, the reporting strategy relied on existing automated systems or statistical reporting systems.

The legislation requires that the annual reports be submitted no later than December 31. As recommended in the planning report submitted in December 2008, the annual reports submitted to the legislature include the most recent state fiscal year as well as a follow-up of cases identified in prior reports. The initial study sample was all defendants arraigned in Superior Court with one or more charges for a sex offense. From this initial broader sample, those cases where the specific provisions of Chapter 205 applied were selected for further data collection and analysis.

Chapter 205 was approved effective July 24, 2008 and became effective on October 22, 2008. All of the cases that were classified as potential Chapter 205 that were charged during the period July 1, 2008 through October 31, 2008 were considered to be charged under the old law. District court arraignment dates were reviewed to determine the status of those cases charged from November 2008 through June 2009 which are currently disposed to ascertain the applicability of the Chapter 205 provisions. For those cases charged in FY 2010 or later, it was assumed that the provisions of Chapter 205 were applicable.

As set forth in the planning report submitted in December 2008, two data sources were available to measure the number of cases charged under the new and revised section of the legislation – the Superior Court Department and the Office of the Commissioner of Probation. The Office of the Commissioner of Probation has information on arraignments and would provide the number of new arraignments for selected offenses over the sampling period. The Superior Court Department has an automated system – Forecourt – that can be used to further report charges and disposition of these cases.

Data was collected from the Court Activity Record Information (CARI) database maintained by the Office of the Commissioner of Probation. A sample of all Superior Court arraignments for FY 2012 was selected from the Office of the Commissioner of Probations Court Activity Record Information (CARI) database (N = 21,117 records).

All of the offenses and descriptive information was reviewed to identify sex offense charges. All cases involving kidnapping or "Attempt to Commit a Crime" were further reviewed to determine if the offense should be considered a sexual offense. Some of the sex offense related cases might have other types of charges associated with them. For example, a case might involve a sex offense and a weapons offense charge. For each case involving at least one sex offense charge, all of the charges were selected,

representing those individuals arraigned in a superior court with one or more charges for a sex offense.

The CARI file docket was converted to a Forecourt docket format to allow secondary data collection effort to ensure that all of the potential Chapter 205 offenses were identified. All charges from the Forecourt database were included even if some were arraigned at a prior period of time. For purposes of this analysis at least one of the charges was arraigned in the current sampling period. The unit of analysis for this report is a case and individual defendants can be in the sample more than once if they have multiple cases.

Further analysis was done of those cases from the initial sample with one or more charges for a sex offense. Based on those charges, defendants in the sample were assigned to one of four groups:

- Chapter 205 sex offenses (one or more charges for an offense impacted by Chapter 205);
- Child sex offenses (one or more charges for an offense not covered by Chapter 205 but involving a child victim);
- Other sex offenses (one or more charges of any other type of sex offense); and,
- Other offenses (one or more charges for attempt of a sex offense or other charges under a separate docket arraigned on the same date as a sex offense case).

Of the 532 cases identified in the CARI data-base as sex offenders in FY 2012, information was not available in the Forecourt database for 6 cases. The CARI database included some cases for whom "no bill" was issued for any of the charges (N=5) and the case was not found in some cases (N=1).

For both FY 2012 cases and previously identified cases, the current status of the case was determined from both the CARI data-base and the Forecourt data base. The status of the case was determined through December 14, 2012. Cases were assigned to one of two statuses: pending (including active and suspended cases), and disposed. All of the offenses that are subject to the provisions of Chapter 205 are under the jurisdiction of the Superior Court Department and are subject to the Criminal Case Management standards adopted by the Trial Court. Cases involving rape are assigned to track "C" and other sex offense cases are assigned to track "B" with presumptive trial dates of 360 days and 270 days respectively. In this annual report, it is expected that many of the cases subject to the provisions of Chapter 205 will be active at the time of the data collection for this report.

For those cases that have been disposed, the type of disposition and sentence was collected using the data available in both the CARI database and the Forecourt database. Data collection on sentence structure was based on the method used by the Massachusetts Sentencing Commission in the on-going survey of sentencing practices. Type of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Commonwealth of Massachusetts The Trial Court, Standing Order No. 2-86 (Amended) http://www.mass.gov/courts/courts/andjudges/courts/superiorcourt/amended-standing-order2-86.pdf.

disposition included the following categories: dismissed, nolle prosequi, not guilty finding, not guilty verdict, guilty plea, guilty finding, and guilty verdict.

Where the offender had multiple charges in the case, the disposition reflects the most serious disposition in the case (e.g. guilty, not guilty, dismissed, nolle prosequi). For purposes of reporting the longest sentence is used to classify the case. In some instances, an offender may be convicted of a less serious offense than the Chapter 205 offense and this is reported.