



Number: **EVAL-100-1-0AA**

Date: **May 2023-FINAL**

# **CITY/TOWN / OTHER AWARDING AUTHORITY CONTRACTOR EVALUATION REPORT DIRECTIVE**

## **Contractor Project Evaluation Reports**

The purpose of this Directive is to implement new **Contractor Project Evaluation** Reports on all projects requiring MassDOT Prequalification associated with City / Town & Other Awarding Authorities, for both General Contractors and Subcontractors. Effective immediately, these reports shall be used for the evaluation of all general contractors and their subcontractors on all current and future State Funded Projects & or any projects requiring MassDOT Prequalification associated with City / Town & Other Awarding Authorities construction contracts. These reports replace any similar reports previously used for this purpose.

Separate reports have been developed specifically for rating general contractors and subcontractors. The categories used to evaluate performance have been expanded from four to nine for general contractors, and there are eight categories in the subcontractor report. This will allow Resident Engineers or Awarding Authority to rate the overall performance levels of general contractors and subcontractors in a broader range of areas associated with performance and contract compliance. To standardize the ratings submitted by Resident Engineers or Awarding Authority, guidelines have been established for assigning ratings for each category and for each type of report.

The new forms also include signature blocks for the general contractor as well as for the subcontractors. This is provided to allow contractors the opportunity to acknowledge that they reviewed the report. If a contractor or subcontractor refuses to sign a form, the Resident Engineers or Awarding Authority should note that in the appropriate signature block.

Completion of these forms is very important because the rating scores will be used as part of a revised process by the Prequalification Committee to review, evaluate, investigate and determine the annual Prequalification Certificate status for each contractor.

After sign-off by the Resident Engineer or Awarding Authority, the evaluation reports shall be submitted to the Prequalification Program via email at 100% (final) completion of all work. This includes reports with either passing or failing ratings. A passing rating is any rating equal or greater than 80%. Email the evaluation reports to the Prequalification Program at [prequal.r109@dot.state.ma.us](mailto:prequal.r109@dot.state.ma.us). In addition, these forms shall **also be used at any interim point in the project to identify performance problems** with either the general contractor or any of the subcontractors.

**PRIME CONTRACTOR- Project Evaluation Report Rating Guidelines**

When rating the overall performance of a contractor, whether it is an interim evaluation or the final evaluation, the Resident Engineer or Awarding Authority shall use the following guidelines in determining the rating in each category. Guidelines have been developed to give overall guidance for ratings of 10, 8 and 4. Other numerical ratings may also be used if the description of the performance falls between the upper and lower ratings (10 and 4). Detailed descriptions of the contractor’s performance shall accurately describe the factual basis of the reasons for the rating and shall not include personal or subjective comments.

**1. WORKMANSHIP:** Refers to the quality of the work product produced as defined by Construction Specifications, Plans and Industry Standards where applicable.

<b>Workmanship</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Full compliance with the contract specifications and plans  Requires minimal oversight by the Resident Engineer/ or Awarding Authority  Work performed does not require rework to correct deficiencies	General conformance with the contract specifications and plans  Requires occasional oversight by the Resident Engineer/ or Awarding Authority  Occasional cosmetic defects	Substantial deviations from the contract plans and specifications  Requires constant oversight by the Resident Engineer/ or Awarding Authority  Repeated, substantive corrective actions required on work performed

**2. SAFETY:** Refers to proper compliance with all federal, state and local regulations, including, but not limited to, MUTCD compliant traffic management plan, OSHA, Department of Occupational Safety regulations and overall project housekeeping guidelines.

<b>Safety</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Full OSHA compliance  Full compliance with TMPs  Active safety program such as: regular toolbox meetings, safety manager on site, excellent housekeeping, full fall protection  Worker injuries rare  Workers fully engaged in safety issues	General OSHA compliance  General compliance with TMPs  Adequate housekeeping  Periodic safety meetings  Periodic site inspections by corporate safety officer  Occasional worker injuries  Workers generally aware of safety issues	Disregard for OSHA requirements  Frequent failure to follow TMPs  Poor housekeeping  Inadequate or no fall protection  Frequent worker injuries  Workers are unable to speak up about safety issues.

**PRIME CONTRACTOR- Project Evaluation Report Rating Guidelines**

**3. SCHEDULE:** Maintains work progress in accordance with approved schedule of operations and all subsequent approved modifications.

<b>Schedule*</b>		
*Schedule impacts outside Contractor's control are not to be considered failure to control the schedule.		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Full use of schedule to manage construction progress	General adherence to work plan	Routine failure to complete work as planned
Prompt re-submittal of schedules as required or requested.	General attention to schedule as an important part of the contract	General lack of urgency in completing work
Full adherence to stated plan for prosecuting work	Reasonable response to schedule submittal requirements/requests	Failure to submit required/requested schedules

**4. HOME OFFICE SUPPORT:** Refers to all aspects of Project Management including, but not limited to support for field operation needed to prosecute work, scheduling, timely submission of shop drawings/plans, erection/demolition procedures, material acquisition schedules and extra work order proposals.

<b>Home Office Support</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Full support from home office	General support from home office	Lack of support from home office
Timely, accurate submissions	Generally, on time and accurate submittals	Late, incomplete submittals
Materials always available when required by field	Materials available when needed	Materials unavailable when needed by field

**5. SUBCONTRACTORS' PERFORMANCE:** Subcontractors used are competent and knowledgeable with sufficient resources to produce high quality work.

<b>Subcontractor's Performance</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Subs exhibit excellent performance as defined for other categories	Subs exhibit average performance as defined for other categories	Subs exhibit poor performance as defined for other categories

**PRIME CONTRACTOR- Project Evaluation Report Rating Guidelines**

- 6. FIELD SUPERVISION/SUPERINTENDENT:** Must demonstrate knowledge of construction and contract documents necessary to complete the work as specified. The superintendent must also cooperate fully with Department personnel and all other interested parties so that work progresses as scheduled. The superintendent must be authorized to make decisions in the field that are binding upon the Contractor. In addition, the superintendent must demonstrate effective supervision and staffing of labor force, effective scheduling of subcontractors and proper prosecution of work.

<b>Field Supervision/Superintendent</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Demonstrates full knowledge of contract requirements	Reasonable knowledge of contract requirements	Does not demonstrate working knowledge of contract requirements
Fully cooperates with all reasonable requests	Generally, cooperates with reasonable requests	Refuses to cooperate with reasonable requests
Effectively manages workforce	Generally capable of managing workforce	Unable to properly manage workforce
Fully authorized and capable of making jobsite decisions	Able to make jobsite decisions	Unable to make jobsite decisions

- 7. CONTRACT COMPLIANCE:** Submittal of all documents required by the contract, but not directly needed for doing construction, such as payroll affidavits, EEO reports, trainees, manpower projections and material certifications.

<b>Contract Compliance</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Fully compliant with Division I contract requirements,	General overall compliance with contract paperwork	Non-compliant with contract paperwork
Material certifications received with material deliveries	EEO, material certifications and certified payrolls generally received as required	Certified payrolls late
Certified payrolls received with estimates		Incomplete, late submissions of material certifications

**PRIME CONTRACTOR- Project Evaluation Report Rating Guidelines**

**8. EQUIPMENT:** Refers to all equipment, machinery and operators used on the project. Equipment must be suitable and readily available, when needed, for all phases of the project. Equipment operators must demonstrate proficiency and skill in the operation of said equipment.

<b>Equipment</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Equipment always available when needed	Equipment usually available when needed	Equipment frequently unavailable
Equipment well maintained	Equipment reasonably well maintained	Equipment poorly maintained
Operators highly skilled and show proficiency in operation of equipment	Operators show proficiency in operation of equipment	Operators lack proficiency in operation of equipment

**9. PAYMENT OF ACCOUNTS:** Refers to the timely payment of undisputed invoices submitted by the subcontractors, material suppliers and police.

<b>Payment of Accounts*</b>		
*Funding/payment issues outside the contractor's control are not to be considered evidence of non-payment or late payment.		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
No evidence of non-payment of subcontractors and suppliers	Occasional evidence of non-payment or late payment; i.e. sub mobilization or material deliveries delayed pending payment. No impact to project schedule. Holding of payment for legitimate contractual reasons is not to be considered "non-payment".	Repeated delays to the work due to deliveries or sub mobilizations delayed for non-payment  Subcontractors lost for non-payment  POs cancelled for non-payment

**SUBCONTRACTOR- Project Evaluation Report Rating Guidelines**

When rating the overall performance of a subcontractor, whether it is an interim evaluation or the final evaluation, the Resident Engineer shall use the following guidelines in determining the rating in each category. Guidelines have been developed to give overall guidance for ratings of 10, 8 and 4. Other numerical ratings may also be used if the description of the performance falls between the upper and lower ratings (10 and 4). Detailed descriptions of the subcontractor’s performance shall accurately describe the factual basis of the reasons for the rating and shall not include personal or subjective comments.

- 1. WORKMANSHIP:** Refers to the quality of the work product produced as defined by Construction Specifications, Plans and Industry Standards where applicable.

<b>Workmanship</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Full compliance with the contract specifications and plans	General conformance with the contract specifications and plans	Substantial deviations from the contract plans and specifications
Requires minimal oversight by the Resident Engineer/ or Awarding Authority	Requires occasional oversight by the Resident Engineer/ or Awarding Authority	Requires constant oversight by the Resident Engineer/ or Awarding Authority
Work performed does not require rework to correct deficiencies	Occasional cosmetic defects	Repeated, substantive corrective actions required

- 2. SAFETY:** Refers to proper compliance with all federal state and local regulations, including, but not limited to, MUTCD compliant traffic management plan, OSHA, Department of Occupational Safety regulations and overall project housekeeping guidelines.

<b>Safety</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Full OSHA compliance	General OSHA compliance	Disregard for OSHA requirements
Full compliance with TMPs	General compliance with TMPs	Frequent failure to follow TMPs
Active safety program such as: regular toolbox meetings, safety manager on site, excellent housekeeping, full fall protection	Adequate housekeeping	Poor housekeeping
Worker injuries rare	Periodic safety meetings	Inadequate or no fall protection
Workers fully engaged in safety issues	Periodic site inspections by corporate safety officer	Frequent worker injuries
	Occasional worker injuries	Workers are unable to speak up about safety issues
	Workers generally aware of safety issues	

**SUBCONTRACTOR- Project Evaluation Report Rating Guidelines**

3. **SCHEDULE:** Maintains work progress in accordance with approved schedule of operations and all subsequent approved modifications.

<b>Schedule*</b>		
*Schedule impacts outside Contractor's control are not to be considered failure to control the schedule.		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Full use of schedule to manage construction progress	General adherence to work plan	Routine failure to complete work as planned
Prompt re-submittal of schedules as required or requested	General attention to schedule as an important part of the contract	General lack of urgency in completing work
Full adherence to stated plan for prosecuting work	Reasonable response to schedule submittal requirements/requests	Failure to submit required/requested schedules

4. **HOME OFFICE SUPPORT:** Refers to all aspects of Project Management including, but not limited to support for field operation needed to prosecute work, scheduling, timely submission of shop drawings/plans, erection/demolition procedures, material acquisition schedules and extra work order proposals.

<b>Home Office Support</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Full support from home office	General support from home office	Lack of support from home office
Timely, accurate submissions	Generally, on time and accurate submittals	Late, incomplete submittals
Materials always available when required by field	Materials available when needed	Materials unavailable when needed by field

**SUBCONTRACTOR- Project Evaluation Report Rating Guidelines**

- 5. FIELD SUPERVISION/SUPERINTENDENT:** Must demonstrate knowledge of construction and contract documents necessary to complete the work as specified. The superintendent must also cooperate fully with Department personnel and all other interested parties so that work progresses as scheduled. The superintendent must be authorized to make decisions in the field that are binding upon the Contractor. In addition, the superintendent must demonstrate effective supervision and staffing of labor force, effective scheduling of subcontractors and proper prosecution of work.

<b>Field Supervision/Superintendent</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Demonstrates full knowledge of contract requirements	Reasonable knowledge of contract requirements	Does not demonstrate working knowledge of contract requirements
Fully cooperates with all reasonable requests	Generally, cooperates with reasonable requests	Refuses to cooperate with reasonable requests
Effectively manages workforce	Generally capable of managing workforce	Unable to properly manage workforce
Fully authorized and capable of making jobsite decisions	Able to make jobsite decisions	Unable to make jobsite decisions

- 6. CONTRACT COMPLIANCE:** Submittal of all documents required by the contract, but not directly needed for doing construction, such as payroll affidavits, EEO reports, trainees, manpower projections and material certifications.

<b>Contract Compliance</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Fully compliant with Division I contract requirements	General overall compliance with contract paperwork	Non-compliant with contract paperwork
Material certifications received with material deliveries	EEO, material certifications and certified payrolls generally received as required	Certified payrolls late
Certified payrolls received with estimates		Incomplete, late submissions of material certifications



**SUBCONTRACTOR- Project Evaluation Report Rating Guidelines**

**7. EQUIPMENT:** Refers to all equipment, machinery and operators used on the project. Equipment must be suitable and readily available, when needed, for all phases of the project. Equipment operators must demonstrate proficiency and skill in the operation of said equipment.

<b>Equipment</b>		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
Equipment always available when needed	Equipment usually available when needed	Equipment frequently unavailable
Equipment well maintained	Equipment reasonably well maintained	Equipment poorly maintained
Operators highly skilled and show proficiency in operation of equipment	Operators show proficiency in operation of equipment	Operators lack proficiency in operation of equipment

**8. PAYMENT OF ACCOUNTS:** Refers to the timely payment of undisputed invoices submitted by the subcontractors, material suppliers and police.

<b>Payment of Accounts*</b>		
*Funding/payment issues outside the contractor’s control are not to be considered evidence of non-payment or late payment.		
<u>10</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>4</u>
No evidence of non-payment of subcontractors and suppliers	Occasional evidence of non-payment or late payment; i.e. sub mobilization or material deliveries delayed pending payment. No impact to project schedule. Holding of payment for legitimate contractual reasons is not to be considered “non-payment”.	Repeated delays to the work due to deliveries or sub mobilizations delayed for non-payment  Subcontractors lost for non-payment  Posted cancelled for non- payment