

GWSA Implementation Advisory Committee (IAC)

June 11, 2020, 2:00PM – 3:30PM

Virtual Meeting Via Windstream

DRAFT Meeting Minutes

Undersecretary David Ismay called the meeting to order at 2:03PM. He laid out guidelines for the virtual meeting and welcomed Judy Chang, EEA's new Undersecretary of Energy.

Jack Clarke motioned to add opportunities for IAC members to address other business and the public to offer comment by adding "Other Business" and "Public Comment" to the agenda prior to "Wrap Up". David agreed with the suggestion and added those items to the agenda.

Hanh Chu pointed out corrections to the attendance list in the draft minutes of the February 26, 2020 IAC meeting; David called for a vote to approve the draft meeting minutes with those corrections. Rebecca Davis moved to approve and Jack Clarke seconded. The meeting minutes were unanimously approved.

State Agency Updates

Christine Kirby, Assistant Commissioner of MassDEP, gave an update on the Transportation and Climate Initiative (TCI). There has been considerable progress to date, with great stakeholder engagement through webinars and comments. In October 2019, a framework for a regional policy proposal was released and, in December 2019, a draft MOU was released. The goal of having a final MOU by the Spring of 2020 has been moved to the Fall of 2020 due to COVID-19. Christine assured the group that the TCI effort continues despite COVID-19, and the IAC can expect to hear back in the Fall, with webinars likely in between. All jurisdictions continue to be involved in program design and stakeholder outreach.

Dan Gatti, new EEA Director of Clean Transportation Policy, announced new transportation policy proposals will be announced and discussed at the upcoming ZEV Commission meeting on Thursday, June 25, from 3pm to 5pm. Dan noted that a number of these policy proposals is aiming to address ground transportation pollution (excludes aviation and marine) that negatively impacts EJ communities. Invitations to attend the ZEV Commission meeting are available for anyone interested.

Galen Nelson, MassCEC Chief Program Officer, gave updates on two of their programs:

1. MassCEC recently launched the Bridging Recovery for Innovators Driving Green Energy Solutions (BRIDGES) investment program with \$1.5 million to support clean energy startups weather the economic disruption from COVID-19. Breakthrough Ventures contributed \$1 million as well. MassCEC intends to give out 10-15 awards by the end of the month.
2. MassCEC's Accelerating Clean Transportation Now (ACTNow) funding program is helping to scale clean transportation solutions. They received 20 applications, and intended to make 9 awards in June that cover a wide variety of technologies. All awards include cost share, and 6 of 9 projects will benefit EJ communities. They plan a second round of ACTNow grants to address specific challenges, including urban freight and DC fast charging.

IAC Work Group Updates

David acknowledged that Dan Gatti is no longer co-chairing the IAC Transportation work group; he invited nomination of a second co-chair if there is interest.

David then explained that EEA convened the IAC work groups at the end of May to provide brief, high level initial results of the Decarbonization Roadmap Study. EEA was unable to share more detailed results with the IAC at that time due to COVID-19 delaying their internal briefing. Additionally, the modeling and technical analysis were also slightly delayed because of COVID but should be wrapping up at the end of June. All work groups indicated they look forward to seeing more results.

The work groups were invited to report on their priorities and areas of focus:

- **Sarah Simon, Transportation Work Group Co-Chair:** The work group supports the vision of clean transportation among all modes of transportation. They are particularly aware of behavioral changes from COVID that can change greenhouse gas emission forecasts dramatically and should be considered for the 2050 Roadmap report. It is also important to focus on changes that can be made during this crisis, such as installing new bike paths. Last mile mobility to get from home to transportation hubs is critical.
- **Cammy Peterson, Buildings Work Group Chair:** Buildings are a critical sector since in cities, 80% of emissions can come from buildings. The work group is looking to dig into modeling assumptions.
- **Caitlin Peale Sloan, Electric Sector Work Group Chair:** The work group has more clarity on the modeling results due to the fact that the electric sector has been the initial focus of decarbonization efforts. They are looking for more inputs from the Climate Justice Work group to influence policy.
- **Steve Long, Nature-Based Solutions and Land Use Work Group Chair:** GWSA goals cannot be reached without nature-based solutions—nature is the only economically feasible carbon sink currently available. The work group is looking forward to the Clean Energy and Climate Plan for 2030 (2030 CECP) and the cost-benefit analysis of the various policies that are available. They are curious about EEA's timeline to develop a carbon sink framework, and request further work be done on how to account for carbon sinks. Steve also wonders how the work groups can best work in concert with each other.
- **Eugenia Gibbons, Climate Justice Work Group Co-Chair:** The work group is continuing to spotlight equity and justice. They have met with other work groups to make better connections between the different sectors. They are making specific recommendations for the IAC Master Policy List and developing a specific lens to review policies on climate justice by July. They are aware of inherent wonkiness of modeling, and are working to recommend ways of creating a more comprehensive stakeholder process that could include the public. For example, EEA could create a shorter report that could be translated. They are interested in how the report can quantify the benefits from the policies beyond strict greenhouse gas reductions, particularly other benefits that achieve equitable outcomes.

Decarbonization Roadmap Study Update

David presented the status of the Decarbonization Roadmap analysis and policy development for the 2030 CECP. The first step in the analysis centers on modeling deep decarbonization pathways of 90% reduction to 2050 and is to be completed by the end of June. Afterwards, the second step is to analyze portfolios of policies for the 2020-2030 timeframe to help inform the set of policies to be included in the 2030 CECP while laying the groundwork for meeting the 2050 target.

David indicated there has been a pivot in the entire process from developing “*the*” Roadmap through 2050, a singular prescriptive approach, to exploring a half dozen possible pathways to 2050. These pathways were informed by the November 2019 public engagement event as well as two in-person public meetings and one virtual webinar in March 2020 (five other in-person meetings had to be cancelled due to COVID-19). EEA is not picking one pathway forward; there will be a lot of optionality included in the 2050 Roadmap as well as the 2030 CECP, all of which should help the Commonwealth meet the GWSA emissions reduction targets. EEA will identify key themes that emerge from analyzing the half dozen pathways. Commonalities across multiple pathways are “no-regret” actions that the Commonwealth can pursue.

David also addressed the public stakeholder plan for the Decarbonization Roadmap and 2030 CECP. EEA has been engaging the IAC to gather input throughout this process. EEA is also eager to get results out and is discussing potential public engagement, but the modeling has to be complete and put into digestible format first. The timeline to get everything done before the end of this calendar year is short. EEA is also discussing another potential option of having a public comment process in December for several months after the 2050 Roadmap is released and before the 2030 CECP is finalized. Either way, public input will continue because the 2030 CECP is the start of a multi-year process of implementation that will include public commenting around any regulation development.

Several IAC members urged EEA to have a public process around the 2050 Roadmap and the 2030 CECP as soon as possible to gather feedback from stakeholders outside of the IAC. One IAC member expressed support for staggering the 2 reports so that the Roadmap can be a tool to bring in more stakeholder and public input and guide the CECP, and another suggest further discussion of staggering the reports at the next IAC meeting.

Other specific suggestions from the IAC include:

1. When seeking stakeholder or the public’s feedback, EEA should have specific questions to create dialogue.
2. EEA should have a multi-session process with a detailed workshop to share followed by a session for debate and feedback.
3. With virtual meetings bringing in greater attendance, EEA should not focus too much on seeking underlying assumptions and data and instead seek big bold approaches.
4. EEA should not exclude up front the pathways that aren’t measurable, and have transparency of what policy considerations are being used in the model.

Other IAC Business

Rebecca David shared that this is the last IAC meeting for Jack Clarke, who is retiring in July. IAC members thanked and congratulated Jack, and David offered his personal thanks and gratitude on behalf of the EEA Secretary for his service to the Commonwealth.

Jack Clarke recommended that, since the IAC acts as a main body for public feedback to EEA, someone from the committee should chair it rather than David.

Public Comment

Written comment from Marc Breslow: "The modeling for the 2050 scenarios and the 2030 CECP needs to be presented to the IAC and the public for feedback well before they are released in final form."

Written comment from Laura Spark: "As a participant observer of meeting today, yes I would also agree with Rebecca [on IAC suggestion #3 above]. That is what people like me, who care about the issues but probably can't parse some of the deep details on assumptions, would be interested in!"

Meeting was adjourned at 3:41 PM.

Documents or exhibits used at the meeting (posted online):

1. Meeting Agenda
2. Meeting minutes of February 26th, 2019 (posted online)
3. Meeting Slides

IAC Member/Designee in attendance

Organization	Name
A Better City (ABC)	Kate Dineen
Boston University	<i>Absent</i>
City of Boston	<i>Absent</i>
Conservation Law Foundation (CLF)	Caitlin Peale Sloan
Dismas House / Commonwealth Green Low Income Housing Coalition	David McMahon
Environmental Entrepreneurs (E2)	Sarah Simon
Environmental League of Massachusetts (ELM)	<i>Absent</i>
Fraunhofer Center for Sustainable Energy Systems (CSE)	<i>Absent</i>
Health Care Without Harm	Eugenia Gibbons
Mass Audubon	Jack Clarke
Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT)	Sebastian Eastham
Massachusetts Municipal Wholesale Electric Company (MMWEC)	Jason Viadero
Metropolitan Area Planning Council (MAPC)	Rebecca Davis
National Grid	Marcy Reed
Northeast Clean Energy Council (NECEC)	Peter Rothstein

The Nature Conservancy (TNC)	Steve Long
Union of Concerned Scientists (UCS)	Paulina Muratore

Others in attendance (Note: this may not capture all attendees)

Organization	Name
Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs (EEA)	David Ismay
EEA	Judy Chang
EEA	Hong-Hanh Chu
EEA	Benjamin Miller
EEA	Claire Miziolek
EEA	Dan Gatti
EEA	Vallery Cardoso
EEA	Andrew Kimball
EEA	Linda Benevides
EEA	Justin Taylor
EEA	Leah Foecke
EEA	Osamu Kumasaka
EEA	Rees Sweeney-Taylor
EEA	Rose Callahan
Massachusetts Clean Energy Center (MassCEC)	Galen Nelson
MassCEC	Peter McPhee
MassCEC	Elizabeth Kennedy Cleveland
MA Division of Capital Asset Management and Maintenance (DCAMM).	Sarah Creighton
MA Department of Environmental Protection (MassDEP)	Christine Kirby
MassDEP	Sharon Weber
MA Department of Energy Resources (DOER)	Maggie McCarey
DOER	Ian Finlayson
DOER	Catie Snyder
DOER	Chelsea Kehne
DOER	Eric Friedman
DOER	Joanne Bissetta
DOER	John Mirandette
DOER	Samantha Meserve
DOER	Joanna Troy
DOER	Marian Swain
DOER	Alexis Washburn
DOER	Arianna Cusick
MA Department of Transportation (MassDOT)	Steve Woelfel
Acadia Center	Deb Donovan
Acadia Center	Jordan Stutt
Cadmus	Liz Hanson
Cadmus	Mike Walsh
City of Boston	Kat Eshel
CLF	Allison Wood
Clean Water Action	Laura Spark

Climate XChange	Marc Breslow
ELM	Nancy Goodman
ELM	Susannah Hatch
EPIC	Kavita Macleod
Green Energy Consumers Alliance	Kai Salem
Ipswich	Carolyn Britt
Mass Audubon	Alexandra Vecchio
MAPC	Cammy Peterson
MA Sierra Club	David Zeek
National Grid	Mackay Miller
Regulatory Assistance Project	Nancy Seidman
Salem	Rob Bonney
Union of Concerned Scientists	Paula Garcia
	Emma Chisholm
	Jim Mulloy
	John Metzger
	Pete Dunbeck
	Rachel Zaff