

Massachusetts Department of Environmental Protection
GUIDANCE FOR THE APPROVAL OF MOLDERING PRIVIES AT
EXISTING HIKE-IN/PADDLE-IN CAMPSITES

Issue Statement

Hiking in New England is a popular activity and there are numerous trails for hikers to use. The people who oversee and utilize these trails are working to improve the human sanitary waste disposal facilities on hike-in/paddle-in trails in an effort to reduce environmental and public health risks. In order to improve sanitary conditions at existing hike-in/paddle-in overnight campsites, the Massachusetts Department of Environmental Protection (MassDEP), along with the Appalachian Mountain Club (AMC) and MassDEP's Title 5/Groundwater Discharge Regulatory Review Stakeholder Group, has developed this Guidance for upgrading nonconforming pit privies and concentrated areas of cat holes at existing sites with nonconforming moldering privies.

The Appalachian Trail Conservancy's (ATC) Backcountry Sanitation Manual [2nd Edition, 2014] states that resolving problems of backcountry sanitation is a continuing challenge: "Improper disposal of wastes at heavily used remote recreation sites causes pollution of soil, groundwater and surface waters..." Human fecal waste at existing backcountry sites without moldering privies is usually deposited in the soil in pit toilets or cat holes or sometimes left uncontained on the ground surface. A moldering privy is an alternative type of backcountry outhouse that reduces the likelihood of human contact with wastes, and promotes aerobic conditions allowing for faster breakdown of wastes and less potential for groundwater contamination. Pit toilets are larger trenches dug in the ground by site managers to collect human wastes. Cat holes are smaller, created by users for one-time use (about 6 inches deep) and are covered with soil after use. Pits dug in areas with seasonal high water tables may be filled with water for a portion of the year. This results in anaerobic conditions which lead to the propagation of pathogens and groundwater contamination.

The anaerobic breakdown of waste in pits is slow and pathogens may remain viable for years. The waste in poorly located pit toilets proximate to surface water resources or high groundwater can leach contaminants into the surrounding area for years after use has ended. Cat holes are often dug by individuals without consideration of proximity to surface water and groundwater. As a result, anaerobic decomposition of wastes is not optimized. Studies have shown that human pathogens can remain viable for up to two years in cat holes (<http://www.jswnonline.org/content/37/6/357.abstract>, Temple, Camper, and Lucas. 1982. Potential health hazards from human waste disposal in wilderness. *Journal of Soil and Water Conservation* 37(6):357-359). Uncontained waste on the ground surface creates an imminent health hazard and the potential for contaminant runoff.

The moldering privy was designed and approved by the U.S. Forest Service and is used on the Green and White Mountain National Forests. The National Park Service has also approved moldering privies on the Appalachian Trail and throughout the National Park System. The basic design of a moldering privy consists of a conventional outhouse on a mesh-enclosed, above-ground box foundation with airflow, also known as a cribbed foundation. The crib for the privy sits above a shallow depression (a few inches deep) that allows liquids to percolate into the biologically active layer of soil directly below the waste pile. Decomposition and treatment of the waste pile occurs through the slow collection of waste. Moldering privies are designed for locations that are remote, do not have plumbed water and are only accessible by hiking or paddling (inaccessible by vehicle). These sites may have tent platforms (a raised open deck for placement of a tent), shelters (a 3-sided structure with a roof), or a rustic cabin (4 walls and a roof). All of these sites are for transient use, with many sites limiting the number of nights a hiker can stay.

Moldering privies are based on a principle of continuous, cold (between 40°F and 100°F) composting. They are suitable for situations when the waste is added too slowly to reach higher temperatures. The majority of liquid that enters the pile is dried out before it reaches the ground through aerobic composting activity. The liquid that does enter the ground below the cribbed foundation enters the organic soil surface, is absorbed, and does not travel beyond the footprint of the outhouse. Organic soil is adequate to absorb the relatively low volumes of liquid deposited in these waterless toilets. A bulking agent is added to the pile with use to improve the porosity of the pile and prevent anaerobic conditions. Some sites use worms to assist with composting. When the waste is fully composted, it is disposed of in an area away from water sources and the campsites.

Moldering privies do not meet the definitions in the current Title 5 regulations at 310 CMR 15.002 for an on-site subsurface sewage disposal system, privy, or humus/composting toilet. Moldering privies are similar to humus/composting toilets, but discharge small amounts of liquid waste to the ground surface. 310 CMR 15.002 defines composting toilets as self-contained systems “consisting of a composter with a separate toilet fixture from which no liquid or solid waste materials are discharged to the surface or subsurface environment and from which a humus/compost like end product is produced.” Due to the fact that moldering privies discharge waste to the surface of the ground in the sequestered cribbing, they do not meet the definition of humus/composting toilets and therefore cannot be authorized under the Composting Toilet General Use Certification established by 310 CMR 15.289.

Maximum Feasible Compliance

Title 5 at 310 CMR 15.404(1) establishes goals for full compliance where feasible. An upgraded system in full compliance with Title 5 as contemplated by 15.404(1)(a) is not feasible for remote backcountry locations for the following reasons:

- The locations are inaccessible by vehicles necessary for the construction and maintenance of a Title 5 septic system;
- These locations do not have plumbed water available which is required for a Title 5 system;
- The locations would likely not accommodate a full Title 5 system; the use of an innovative/alternative system in accordance with 15.404(1)(b) is also not feasible due to the siting, construction, operation, maintenance, inspection and sampling requirements applied to these systems;
- The use of a Recirculating Sand Filter (RSF) system pursuant to 15.404(1)(c) designed for systems in a nitrogen sensitive area (NSA) with flows of 2000 gallons per day or greater will not be required because these sites will not be located in NSAs nor will the sites achieve such flows based on the limited number of visitors per week;
- A shared system could not be used (15.404(1)(d)) for the same reasons that a fully compliant septic system cannot be used and because there is only one “facility” associated with these sites; and
- A sewer system connection (15.404(1)(e)) is not feasible because sewers are not available in these locations.

The provisions of 310 CMR 15.404(2) which allow replacement or repair of a system component are inapplicable because the current cat holes and privies do not have any of the usual system components – e.g., septic tanks, distribution boxes, soil absorption systems, piping, or building sewers.

However, an approval pathway for these systems is available through upgrade approvals pursuant to 310 CMR 15.401 – 310 CMR 15.405.

310 CMR 15.402(1) provides that Local Upgrade Approvals (LUAs) may be granted by Local Approving Authorities (LAAs) without review by the Department for voluntary upgrade of nonconforming systems in accordance with the terms and provisions of 310 CMR 15.402 through 15.405. A nonconforming system is defined as one that is not in full compliance with the standards and requirements of Title 5, and includes, but is not limited to, cesspools and privies. 310 CMR 15.403(1) provides that the owner or operator may upgrade a failed or nonconforming system pursuant to a local upgrade approval in accordance with the standards and requirements of 310 CMR 15.404 and 15.405 without obtaining variances.

310 CMR 15.404(3) provides that a LAA may issue a LUA authorizing upgrade of a system with the goal of maximizing protection of public health, safety, welfare and the environment to the maximum extent feasible when full compliance is not feasible. However, this provision prohibits varying the following requirements in the manner stated within 310 CMR 15.404(3)(a) – (e): septic tank capacity; separation between a soil absorption system (SAS) and the high groundwater elevation; a minimum amount of naturally occurring pervious soil below the SAS

and reserve area; minimum SAS sizing requirements; and minimum setbacks between a SAS and surface water supplies and their tributaries, or private water supply wells. These provisions are all inapplicable to moldering privies which do not utilize a septic tank or SAS.

The remote and inaccessible location of these sites renders the goal of full compliance physically impossible and economically infeasible. In conformance with the third and fourth sentences of 310 CMR 15.405(1), LUAs issued for the upgrade of existing back country pit toilets or cat holes by replacement with moldering privies should include a finding that moldering privies are the best feasible upgrade and have the least effect on public health, safety, welfare and the environment because they will provide increased protection for water resources and improved treatment of sanitary sewage. Requirements for separation between the bottom of the shallow depression below the privy crib and high groundwater elevation, a minimum amount of naturally occurring pervious soil below the shallow depression, and appropriate setbacks from sensitive receptors including drinking water resources should be incorporated.

The Department will presume that LUAs are consistent with the requirements of Title 5 if they include the following:

Guidelines for siting of Moldering Privies:

Existing sites will be evaluated by representatives of the trail's hiking association and land managers to determine if moldering privies are the best feasible upgrade and will have the least effect on public health, safety, welfare and the environment because they will provide increased protection for water resources and improved treatment of sanitary sewage , or whether there is a better option that can be utilized. Each site should meet the following conditions:

Backcountry hike-in/paddle-in only overnight sites – Existing sites that are only accessible via hiking or paddling, where there is no vehicle access and no plumbing is available. Sites may have structures such as tent platforms (a raised open deck for placement of a tent), shelters (a 3-sided structure with a roof), or a rustic cabin (4 walls and a roof).

The moldering privy has been determined to be the best alternative to handle sanitary waste at the site based on its level of use. Per the ATC Backcountry Sanitation Manual, moldering privies are generally used at sites with less than 500 hikers per season but can be used at higher-use sites by constructing additional cribs to accommodate use and storage.

Siting and construction of the moldering privy should be on a dry, level site not vulnerable to flooding and should follow the detailed specifications in Section 8 of the ATC Backcountry Sanitation Manual (<https://appalachiantrail.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/backcountry-sanitation-manual-2-0-august-2014.pdf>).

Notwithstanding the provisions of 15.405(1), the setback distances for a Moldering Privy should comply with the provisions of 15.211(1) for a Soil Absorption System.

There should be four feet of separation between the bottom of the shallow depression below the privy crib and the high groundwater elevation at the site.

Cribs should be sized to provide enough storage to accommodate trail use and composting needs. The goal is to have enough storage capacity to allow a long retention time for the waste in the crib, to ensure the greatest level of pathogen reduction.

Each moldering privy should have a minimum of two storage cribs to provide storage when one bin is full. Additional cribs should be added if the cribs are filling up in three years or less. (See pg. 56 ATC Backcountry Sanitation Manual.)

Composted solids should be disposed of in a manner approved by the LAA. The location of where the composted solids will be disposed of should be determined at the time of approval. If the composted solids are buried, they should be covered with a minimum of six inches of clean compacted earth. Any change in the location or in the manner of disposal should obtain pre-approval by the LAA.

The construction of the moldering privy should be done in accordance with the ATC Backcountry Sanitation Manual specifications (United States Forest Service (USFS) design – see Appendix 1). Representatives of the trail's hiking association should submit written documentation to the LAA detailing and verifying the proper construction of the system. Any variations made during construction should be described, outlining the need for the variance and the solution.

The system should be maintained in accordance with ATC Backcountry Sanitation Manual specifications and a maintenance log should be maintained at the site.

Signage explaining proper use of the moldering privy should be posted on and within the structure.

APPENDIX 1



