# **New England Forward Clean Energy Market**

**PROPOSED MARKET RULES, VERSION 1** 

**PROPOSED BY** Massachusetts Department of Energy Resources

**DEVELOPED WITH SUPPORT FROM** The Brattle Group Sustainable Energy Advantage

PRESENTED AT DOER PUBLIC WEBINAR **FEBRUARY 3, 2023** 



Sustainable Energy dvantaae



Energy Resources

#### **INTRODUCTION**

#### **Clean Energy Market Design Reform**

- In October 2020, the New England States released a Vision Statement for a clean, affordable, and reliable 21<sup>st</sup> century regional electric grid that identified three core segments of our shared energy system that will require significant changes
  - New England's existing wholesale electricity markets must modernize if they are to support achievement of clean energy laws, while maintaining system reliability and fostering more affordable electricity for regional consumers
  - In July 2019, NESCOE requested that ISO-NE and the New England Power Pool initiate a process to analyze and discuss potential future market frameworks that
    contemplate and are compatible with the implementation of state energy and environmental laws
  - In early 2021, the ISO's Board of Directors directed the ISO management team to pursue an assessment of policy and market frameworks that could further advance the
    evolution of the regional power grid
  - Released in April 2022, the Pathways Study provides the region with significant data and analysis to evaluate four approaches that could meet the New England states' ambitious environmental goals
- The Massachusetts 2022 Climate Bill directs Energy and Environmental Affairs, in consultation with the DOER and the Department of Public Utilities, to investigate the advantages and disadvantages of using or participating in regional or multi-state competitive marketbased mechanisms, structures, systems or competitive solicitations in order to facilitate the development of clean energy generation resources
  - Including but not limited to offshore wind energy generation,
  - To meet the Commonwealth's clean energy needs and
  - Comply with the statewide greenhouse gas emission limits and sublimits established pursuant to the GWSA,
  - While providing benefits for the commonwealth

#### Current Clean Energy Markets – Status Quo

- The demand for electricity will grow as Massachusetts electrifies the transportation and heating sectors
- In order to meet emission reduction targets, the increased demand for electricity will require new clean resources to be built in New England and for clean energy generation to be incentivized
- Currently, Massachusetts utilizes portfolio standards, such as the Renewable Energy Portfolio Standard (RPS) and the Clean Energy Standard (CES), to require that the retail energy suppliers annually increase the use of clean energy generation when supplying Massachusetts customers
- Massachusetts also uses the Green Communities Act Clean Energy Procurements (Sections 83C and 83D) to facilitate the financing of clean energy generation facilities





- The result of these procurements are long-term (up to 20 year) contracts between the Massachusetts distribution companies and the selected projects for energy and attributes (e.g. RECs)
- The distribution companies may use the RECs for their own RPS compliance obligation or may sell the RECs for other suppliers to buy
- This increase in REC supply then supports RPS compliance and emission reductions

### Economic Development & Other State Policy Goals

The current model of long-term contracting includes pursuit of other state goals like economic development, environmental justice, and diversity, equity, and inclusion in the contracting process

- For instance, Section 83C offshore wind RFP requires projects to demonstrate these additional benefits
- There are limitations to achieving these important Commonwealth goals in the procurement process
  - Cost of commitments is spread over 20-years contracts and funded by all ratepayers
  - PPAs do not include enforcement mechanisms for these commitments
- Neighboring states are increasingly pursuing clean energy economic development initiatives outside of procurement processes

# Financing new clean energy through an energy market would separate pursuit of these state goals from t other state goals like economic development, environmental justice, and diversity, equity, and inclusion

- State would set targets for procuring clean energy in a dedicated competitive market
- State must pursue economic development, environmental justice, and DEI goals through other processes, which may include:
  - Environmental permitting and reviews
  - Economic development incentive programs
  - Workforce development grants and partnerships
  - Supplier Diversity Office certifications and support to industry
- This may improve transparency and competition on the cost of economic development initiatives, ensure greater compliance and strengthen enforcement mechanisms, improve the equitable allocation of costs, and better target initiatives

## Forward Clean Energy Market (FCEM)

- DOER was interested in investigating clean energy market designs that addressed key goals:
  - (1) support the financing of new clean energy projects with financeable product,
  - (2) support the scale and supply mix of clean energy that will be required to meet the region's and Massachusetts' ambitious clean energy and emission reduction targets while maintaining system reliability
  - (3) be implementable by state and/or federal authorities, integrating effectively with existing regulations.
- To advance regional discussions toward implementation, DOER commissioned consultants at The Brattle Group and Sustainable Energy Advantage to support the development of a detailed design proposal
  - Study process builds on several years of study and design work by New England States Committee on Electricity (NESCOE), New England Power Pool (NEPOOL), Independent System Operator of New England (ISO-NE), and others
  - Engaged in detailed interviews with all New England states and discussions within New England States Committee on Electricity (NESCOE) to inform design proposal
- DOER has issued a detailed proposal for a new "Forward Clean Energy Market" (FCEM) that can attract large-scale investment in clean energy for the region
- DOER seeks stakeholder feedback on the FCEM design proposal, which will be incorporated into the DOER's upcoming report to state legislature and regional engagement



**Brattle** 

See Full Proposal: New England FCEM Design

Massachusetts Departme

of Energy Resources

Advantage

#### **INTRODUCTION**

### Goals of the Proposed FCEM Design

The goal of releasing the FCEM Design Proposal is to contribute to our regional discussions with the New England partners and power sector stakeholders, prompt conversation, and help identify areas for further refinement.

- Enable state policymakers and consumers to reflect and achieve their **decarbonization goals** through a competitive regional marketplace
- Ensure that participation is **voluntary**, costs are assigned to voluntary buyer participants, and that no costs are imposed on nonparticipants in the FCEM
- Align with and augment other contracting and policy instruments that states and consumers have used, and will continue to use, to meet policy goals, while allowing states to replace existing policy and contract mechanisms with a competitive market mechanism if desired
- Achieve economically efficient and affordable clean energy transition through the use of **competitive markets**, and by aligning with complementary competitive wholesale and retail market structures across the region
- Offer robust and commercially reasonable financial terms sufficient to attract the large-scale investments in developing and financing new clean energy infrastructure
- Align with **system reliability** needs and the market and regulatory structures, both present and future, that will be needed to maintain reliability throughout clean energy transition
- Provide a **sound governance framework** that reflects a proper level of state oversight, empowers consumers to reflect their goals, enables innovation in policy and product design, and offers a stable and sustainable foundation for attracting large-scale financial investments

## Massachusetts DOER is Seeking Stakeholder Feedback

#### **Massachusetts Process**

- Public webinar to present FCEM report (today)
  - Introduction
  - Technical Review
  - Question and Answer
- Stakeholder comments requested, due February 17, 2023 (to joanna.k.troy@mass.gov)
- Stakeholder feedback will inform DOER's report to legislature, due by March 1, 2023 (required by Massachusetts' 2022 Climate Act, <u>Section 85</u>)

#### **Regional Engagement**

- Engagement with NEPOOL, ISO-NE and regional stakeholders and processes
- Continued discussion with New England states via NESCOE to revise and refine the FCEM proposal, seeking consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented

<ul> <li>Cherker Chemer</li> <li>Chevener</li> <li>January 4, 2023</li> <li>Dar DER Stakeholder,</li> <li>The Massechusetts Department of Engy Market ("FCEM) design proposal. This design proposal in dia design and governance. Included in the design proposal. This design proposal in this design proposal. This design proposal in the release of the design and governance. Included in the design proposal in the release of the release in the release of the release of the release in the release of the release proposal in the release prelease the release of the release proposal in the release prop</li></ul>	COMMON ENERGY DEPARTME 100 C	WEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF IND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS INT OF ENERGY RESOURCES AMERIDGE ST. 9 <sup>6</sup> FLOOR BOSTON, MA 02114 Telephone: 617-626-7300
<ul> <li>Lowmer</li> <li>Jurger 1: Pailing</li> <li>Jurger 4: 2023</li> <li>Jord DER Stakeholders</li> <li>The Assessments To Papartment of Faring Market ("FCEM") design proposed to design and governance. The Varing and States while supporting the final design proposed in this design proposed to the status while support the design proposed to the sign and design proposed to the design proposed to the sign and design proposed to the sign and design proposed to the sign and design proposed to the design proposed to the design proposed to the design proposed to the sign and design proposed to the design proposed</li></ul>	Charles D. Baker Governor	
Li Governor Li Governor Li Governor January 4, 2023 Dear DOER Stakeholder, The Massachusetts Department of En- Energy Market ("PCEM") design pro- wholesale market design. We hope the the New England partness and partness and partness may analysis evaluating potential market frameworks that may help support the evolu- networks of the Question of the Status, We hope the the New England partness and partness and partness and excerning wholesale market design, We hope the the New England partness and partness and partness and excerning wholesale market design are the status (use our policy approachess active: substantial levels of decarbonization, transitioning from the status (use own used structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals. While the concept of the FCEM has had support, the idea has lacked specificity on key is structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals. While the concept of the FCEM has had support, the idea has lacked specificity on key is structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals. While the renease of the release of the interview and com- proposal. While this proposal is huid of the market. The ZhiYung and Status structure that may nost effectively meet clean energy goals. While the renease of the release of the admini- of the market design and governance. Included in the design proposal today are details regar- tion of the market. The ZhiYung and Status structure of the FCEM and participate will not see a costs associate with the market. The addition to states, the market will be open to voluntary of the we will need to be significant change. Including wholesale electricity for a proposal and solicity written the will need to be significant change. Following a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the develored FOLOW ing a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the develored FOLOW ing a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the develored FOLOW ing a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inf	Karyn E. Polito	July 2019, NESCOE requested that ISO-NE and the New England Power Pool initiate a proc
January 4, 2023 Dear DOER Stakeholder, The Massachusetts Department of Eme Energy Market ("FCEM") design prover grid. This Pathways Study includes the comparison of multiple market structure hive solution of the FCEM, net carbon pricing, and a with both structures. The Pathways Study found that although all four policy approaches swings. DOER is interested in investigating the benefits of a regional FCEM as the mark structure that may nost effectively meet clean energy goals. DOER is interested in investigating the benefits of a regional FCEM as the mark structure that may nost effectively meet clean energy goals. While the soncept of the FCEM has had support, the idea has lacked specificity on key is related to design and governance. Included in the design proposal today are details regar governance, the definition of market products, the composition of buyers, and the admin intends to use the release of this design weekness takkohder review and com- proposal. While this proposal is reps SEA coordinated by DOER we acchor refine, and reach consensus on a design implementation. Conceptual FCEM market designs had conceptual FCEM market designs had support at moder regional electric grin there will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity in the will need to be significant chang	Lt. Governor	to analyze and discuss potential future market frameworks that contemplate and are compatible with the implementation of state energy and environmental laws. ISO-NE began the Future of Initiative Key Project in 2020 which includes the Pathways to the Future Grid ("Pathways
Dear DOER Stakeholder, The Massachusetts Department of En- Energy Market (*FCEM) design prove wholesale market design. We hove the feed of the feed of the feed of the feed on the design proposal. This Pathways Study found that although all four policy approaches the New England partners and power proposal. This design proposal is build of the questions raised in initial discuss statistice the release of this design welcome stakeholder review and down proposal. While this proposal is represented to a structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals. While the concept of the FCEM has had support, the idea has lacked specificity on key is structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals. While the concept of the FCEM has had support, the idea has lacked specificity on key is structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals. While the concept of the FCEM has had support, the idea has lacked specificity on key is structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals. While the source the design proposal today are details regar governance, the definition of market products, the composition of buyers, and the admini- structure that may most effectively voluntary and states that chose not to participation in the FCE a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participation in the STE and the market. Fickbilty is a key design feature of the FCEM and spin represents a seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the is demand bids could be recovered through new rate authorization, allowing states to meed to a buyer will be consensus on a design proposal. Moles are clean energy goals. DOER welcomes feedback from stakeholders on the FCEM design proposal. Moles while support in rowiding opport in moder regional electric girth is stakeholders for the design proposal and solicit written relates through NESCOE is of antifys additional areas of analyses, including a heigen analysis evelutaly come to	January 4, 2023	Study") analysis evaluating potential market frameworks that may help support the evolution
The Massachusetts Department of Em Energy Market (FCEM) design prove wholesale market design. We hop the the New England partners and power proposal. This design proposal is build of the questions mised in initial discus Sustainable Energy Advantage (FEE energy stakeholders to design a marke other states while supporting the fund intends to use the release of this design weccome stakeholder review and com- proposal. While this proposal is repro- SEA coordinated by DOER we achor refine, and reach consensus on a design implementation. Conceptual FCEM market designs has october 2020, the six New England's England states vision for a clean, affor support an odder regional desitte grant for a design for possil is repro- seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the seeking cost-effective through new rate authorization, allowing states to meet or coreat an optimized market with flexibility that creates financing for projects while say states' clean energy goals. DOER welcomes feedback from stakeholders on the FCEM design proposal. Molecult wells and Environmental Affairs' ("EEA") report on the advantages of using roviding opportinities for public sessions about this design with other New England's power andem regional cectric give in this stakeholder for dust, support and design and providing opport of market review solicitations to facilitate the development of clean energy generation resource. March 2023, as required in Massachusetts' 2022 Climate Act. Following this initial feed the FCEM, DOER is eager to discuss and refine	Dear DOER Stakeholder,	achieving clean energy goals, including a version of the FCEM, net carbon pricing, and a hyb
<ul> <li>Energy Market (FEEM) design proposal to device the second of the second s</li></ul>	The Massachusetts Department of Ene	with both structures. The Pathways Study found that although all four policy approaches can achieve substantial levels of decembraization, transitioning from the status are would exactly
<ul> <li>structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals.</li> <li>structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals.</li> <li>structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals.</li> <li>structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals.</li> <li>While the concept of the FCEM has had support, the idea has lacked specificity on key is related to design and governance. Included in the design proposal today are details regare of the market. Flexibility is a key design feature of the FCEM and participate will not see a cost associate with the market. In addition to states, the market will be open to voluntary end states had consensus on a design implementation.</li> <li>Conceptual FCEM market designs have control to be significant chang including wholesale electricity market or a clean, affor support an odern regional electric distribution companies. All these design proposal. All these design proposal. All these design proposal and solicit written comments. Unlike the subscience is a sociated with flexibility that creates financing for projects while suptoriations of next sites 'clean energy goals.</li> <li>DDER welcomest feedback from stakeholders on the FCEM design proposal. ADDER planting in regional electric girth market is stakeholder for deal and subsci written comments. Market solicit written the fCEM DOER is a sequence of the fCEM design proposal and solicit written companies and sociated legal regional or multi-state market-based mechanisms, structures, systems, or opticities of clean energy solues for the FCEM DOER will support the development of Clean energy solues for the fCEM DOER is a sequence in the form the development of clean energy solues for the fCEM DOER is a sequence in the solue sign and socicit written the fCEM DOER will suppor</li></ul>	Energy Market ("FCEM") design prop	savings. DOER is interested in investigating the benefits of a regional FCEM as the market
<ul> <li>Proposal. This design proposal is built of the questions mised in initial discust Sustainable Energy Advantage ("SEA continues supporting the finan intends to use the related to design and governance. Included in the design proposal today are details regare governance, the definition of market products, the compact of the FCEM and participation in the FG abuyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate in the FA continues by DOER we achore support the market. Freckibility is a key design fature of the FCEM and participation in the FG abuyer will be completely voluntary and states, the market will not see a user associate with the market. In addition to states, the market will not see a user support and the activity and bids could be recovered through new rate authorization, allowing states to meet or energy goals cost effective (through nergy supply rather than contracts between develor electric distribution companies. All these design elements work together in the design proposal. DOER plate there will need to be significant denard for the significant design proposal. DOER plate there will need to be significant to participation in regional electric grit there will need to be significant denard for the states (from stakeholder son the FCEM design proposal. DOER plate there will need to be significant power and the states (from stakeholder son the FCEM design proposal. DOER plate to design any portunities for public secsions about this design proposal and solicit written and the force of the FCEM, DOER well and solicit written and the force of the FCEM design any stems, or competitive solicitations to facilitate the development of chean energy section. Wholesale energy market as eager to discuss and refine the FCEM design with other New England states through NESCOE to identify additional areas of analyses, including a legal analysic voludity methods and the fCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements.</li> </ul>	the New England partners and power	structure that may most effectively meet clean energy goals.
<ul> <li>of the questions raised in initial discuss solutions of the concept of the PC EM has had support in the design proposal today are details regar genergy stakeholder rote was narked to design and governance. Included in the design proposal today are details regar governance, the definition of market products, the composition of buyers, and the admini tors states while supporting the automatic to a support and consensus on a design implementation.</li> <li>Conceptual PCEM market designs has consensus on a design implementation.</li> <li>Conceptual PCEM market designs has consensus on a design implementation.</li> <li>Conceptual PCEM market designs has consensus on a design implementation.</li> <li>DOER welcomes takeholder rote and providing opport of the PCEM design proposal. DOER plan the development of New England states vision for a clean, affor a states of real to be significant them gives a description of providing opport minites for public sessions about this design proposal. DOER plan providing opport minites for public sessions about this design proposal. DOER plan providing opport minites for public sessions about this design in providing opport minites for public sessions about this design in providing opporting of the SCOEF ') to inform the development of Clean energy generation resource March 2023, as required in Massachusetts' 2022 Climate Act. Following this initial feed the FCEM design proposal and solicit written and the rote sign frame to consensus on an FCEM design with other New Englan states through NESCOEF ') to inform the development of clean energy stakeholders for working on this initial feed the FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements.</li> </ul>	proposal. This design proposal is built	While the second of the POPPA has had associated the idea has had a society in the instance
<ul> <li>serup stakeholders to design a marke orbit stakeholders or using a marke orbit states while supporting the interds to use the release of this design proposal. While this proposal is represented by DOER we acknow the combined of the market. Flexibility is a key design feature of the release of this design proposal. While this proposal is represented by DOER we acknow the combination of the market. I addition to states, the market will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a cost associate with the market. I addition to states, the market will be optimized will not see a cost associate with the market. I addition to states, the market will be optimized will not see a cost associate with the market. I addition to states, the market will be optimized will not see a cost associate with the market. I addition to states, the market will be optimized will not see a cost associate with the market. I addition to states, the market will be optimized will not see a cost associate with the market. I addition to states, the market will be optimized will not see a cost associate with the market. I addition to states, the market will be optimized will not see a cost associate with the market. I addition to states, the market will be optimized will not see a cost associate with the market will be addition to states, the market will be optimized market provides and provide and provide and provide market will be addited with the market and the set of the cost of the set of the market of the cost of the set of the cost of the set of the</li></ul>	of the questions raised in initial discus Sustainable Energy Advantage ("SEA	related to design and governance. Included in the design proposal today are details regarding
other states while supporting the finan intends to use the release of this design welcome stakeholder review and conv proposal. While this proposal is repertively and convergence of the functional and the second through new rate authorization, allowing states to meet to a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a costs associate with the market. In addition to states, the market will be open to voluntar seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the: energy goals cost effectively through energy supply rather than contracts between develop to create an optimized market with flexibility that creates financing for projects while sup states' clean energy goals. DOER welcomes feedback from stakeholders on the FCEM design proposal. DOER plan there will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity market component of New England's power multiple states. The existing market so of clean energy and associated legar to Following a public process supported Following a public process support Following a public process support to reste through NESCOE' to identify additional areas of analyses, including a legal analysis eventually come to consensus on a FCEM design that can be implemented. Thank you to all our regional prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements.	energy stakeholders to design a marke	governance, the definition of market products, the composition of buyers, and the administra
<ul> <li>a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not participate will not see a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not participate and bid sould be recovered through new retained and baryer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not participates and the participate will be completely voluntary and states that chose not participates and the participate and participates and the participates and th</li></ul>	other states while supporting the finan	of the market. Flexibility is a key design feature of the FCEM and participation in the FCEM
<ul> <li>Proposal. While this proposal is repressed and the proposal of properties of the properti</li></ul>	welcome stakeholder review and conv	a buyer will be completely voluntary and states that chose not to participate will not see any costs associate with the market. In addition to states, the market will be open to voluntary bu
SEA coordinated by DDER we actors implementation. Conceptual FCEM market designs have conceptual FCEM market design and conceptual FCEM design and conceptual for the fCEM design and conceptual FCEM design and and set conceptual FCEM design and and below identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely, Conceptual FCEM design and and below identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely, Conceptual FCEM design and and and for the set conceptual FCEM design and and below identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely, Conceptual FCEM design and and and and and and and and and an	proposal. While this proposal is repre-	seeking cost-effective clean energy products for their customers. Costs for fulfilling the state
implementation. Conceptual FCEM market designs has October 2020, the six New England states England states vision for a clean, affo support a modern regional electric gits mitinized market with flexibility that creates financing for projects while sup states' clean energy goals. DOER welcomes feedback from stakeholders on the FCEM design proposal. DOER plan there will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity market component of New England's support of clean energy and associated legat r Following a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the developm FOLOWING public States inform the developm ("NESCOE") to inform the developm Topic Market with flexibility that creates financing for projects while sup states' clean energy and associated legat r competitive solicitations to facilitate the development of clean energy generation resource ("NESCOE") to inform the developm FOLOWING public States inform the developm ("NESCOE") to inform the developm Topic Market solit with the form the form the development of clean energy generation resource eventually come to consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented. Thank you to all our regional prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely, Wint Wint States Sincerely, Sincerel	refine, and reach consensus on a desig	demand bids could be recovered through new rate authorization, allowing states to meet clear
Conceptual FCEM market designs and October 2020, the six New England's England states vision for a clean, affor states' clean energy goals. DOER welcomes feedback from stakeholders on the FCEM design proposal. DOER plan providing opportunities for public sessions about this design proposal and solicit written including wholesale electricity market of clean energy and associated legal is following a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the development ("NESCOE") to inform the dev	implementation.	energy goals cost effectively through energy supply rather than contracts between developer electric distribution companies. All these design elements work together in the design propo- to create an optimized morter with flowbility that creates financing for projects while support
England states vision for a clear, affor support a modern regional electric grin including wholesale electricity market component of New England's power multiple states. The existing market so clean energy and associated legan I Following a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the developm Following a public process supported ("NES	October 2020, the six New England st	states' clean energy goals.
support a modern regional electric gria three will need to be significant chang including wholesale electricity market component of New England's power multiple states. The existing market of clean energy and associated legal re Following a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the development ("NESCOE") to inform the development to the to the total state through NESCOE") to inform the development of the significant benefits to competent of New England's systems, or competitive solicitations to facilitate the development of clean energy generation resource ("NESCOE") to inform the development to the TCEM, DOER is eager to discuss and refine the TCEM design with other New England states through NESCOE to identify additional areas of analyses, including a legal analysis eventually come to consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented. Thank you to all our regional prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely,	England states vision for a clean, affor	07 0
<ul> <li>Including wholesale electricity market component of New England's power and solution written in provide and and solution written in the existing market so of clean energy and associated legal relations in the existing market so of clean energy and associated legal relations in the existing market solution in the existing market design and achieve significant benefits for the region. We this FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements.</li> </ul>	support a modern regional electric grid there will need to be significant chang	DOER welcomes feedback from stakeholders on the FCEM design proposal. DOER plans o
component of New England's power multiple states. The existing markets of clean energy and associated legal x Following a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the development FCEM, DOER is cager to discuss and refine the FCEM design with other New Engla states through NESCOE to identify additional areas of analyse, including a legal analysis eventually come to consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented. Thank you to all our regional partners and energy stakeholders for the region. W this FCEM, DOER design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely,	including wholesale electricity market	comments. Using this stakeholder feedback DOER will support the Executive Office of End
<ul> <li>participating in regional or multi-state market-based mechanisms, structures, systems, or participating in regional or multi-state market-based mechanisms, structures, systems, or porticipating in regional or multi-state market-based mechanisms, structures, systems, or porticipating in regional or multi-state market-based mechanisms, structures, systems, or more source. March 2023, as required in Massachusetts' 2022 Climate Act. Following this initial feed the FCEM, DOER is cager to discuss and refine the FCEM design with other New Engla test hrough NESCOE to identify additional areas of analyses, including a legal analysis eventually come to consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented.</li> <li>Thank you to all our regional partners and energy stakeholders for working on this import topic. Wholesale energy market design can achieve significant benefits for the region. W this FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements.</li> </ul>	component of New England's power r	and Environmental Affairs' ("EEA") report on the advantages and disadvantages of using or
Following a public process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the developm the development of customers and the the CELM, DOER is cager to discuss and refine the FCEM design with other New Engla states through NESCOE to identify additional areas of analyses, including a legal analysis eventually come to consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented. Thank you to all our regional partners and energy stakeholders for working on this import topic. Wholesale energy market design can achieve significant benefits for the region. W this FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely,	of clean energy and associated legal re	participating in regional or multi-state market-based mechanisms, structures, systems, or
<ul> <li>Pointwing a punce process supported ("NESCOE") to inform the development of the FCEM, DOER is eager to discuss and refine the FCEM design with other New Engla states through NESCOE to identify additional areas of analyses, including a legal analysic eventually come to consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented.</li> <li>Thank you to all our regional partners and energy stakeholders for working on this import topic. Wholesale energy market design can achieve significant benefits for the region. Whis FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements.</li> <li>Sincerely, White the state of the</li></ul>	Tollowing with a second state	March 2023, as required in Massachusetts' 2022 Climate Act. Following this initial feedbac
states through NESCOE to identify additional areas of analyses, including a legal analysi eventually come to consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented. Thank you to all our regional partners and energy stakeholders for working on this import topic. Wholesale energy market design can achieve significant benefits for the region. W this FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely,	("NESCOE") to inform the developm	the FCEM, DOER is eager to discuss and refine the FCEM design with other New England
Thank you to all our regional partners and energy stakeholders for working on this impor topic. Wholesale energy market design can achieve significant benefits for the region. W this FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely,		states through NESCOE to identify additional areas of analyses, including a legal analysis, a eventually come to consensus on an FCEM design that can be implemented.
topic. Wholesale energy market design can achieve significant benefits for the region. V this FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely,		Thank you to all our regional partners and energy stakeholders for working on this important
this FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements. Sincerely,		topic. Wholesale energy market design can achieve significant benefits for the region. We have
Sincerely,		this FCEM design proposal prompts conversation and helps identify areas for further refinements.
He Will		Sincerely,
		All White
Patrick C. Woodcock		Patrick C. Woodcock

# **Technical Review**

#### **TECHNICAL REVIEW**

#### What is the forward clean energy market?

A new component of the New England wholesale electricity marketplace through which Massachusetts and other states can coordinate procurements of large amounts of clean energy at a competitive price



# Who can buy in the FCEM?

FCEM can accept all types of buyers from state agencies, suppliers, utilities, and smaller buyers such as localities, universities, and corporate buyers

#### How it works:

- Buyers place "demand bids" that represent desired amount of clean energy and maximum price they are willing to pay
- Buyers can specify one or more categories of renewable energy certificates (RECs) or other certificates they wish to buy
- Buyers can specify "new-only" demand bids
- FCEM auction will seek to fill as many buy orders as possible, clearing price is always equal or below the buyer's specified price



#### **TECHNICAL REVIEW**

# How do sellers offer into in the FCEM?

FCEM adapts regional energy markets to allow renewable and clean energy to compete and get financed through competitive markets

#### How it works:

- Sellers place "sell offers" that represent the volume of certificates they can deliver, and their offer price
- Resources can offer to sell one or more categories of renewable and clean energy certificates for which they are eligible
- New resources are eligible for 15 (eventually reducing to 7) year commitments

#### FCEM AUCTION SUPPLY OFFERS



Supply (TWh of NE-RECs)

### How does the auction clear and set prices?

FCEM auction clearing seeks to maximize the benefits from trade, matching aggregate buy and sell commitments at a mutually attractive price

#### How it works:

- FCEM-NE conducts auction clearing in an optimized format
- Buy orders and sell offers stacked in price order with matching volumes
- Single clearing price for each certificate product
- Sellers that offer at a high a price may not clear (buyers that offer at a lower price may not clear)



#### FCEM AUCTION CLEARING

Demand (TWh of NE-RECs) brattle.com | 11

### What products can be purchased via the FCEM?

- Products are unbundled clean or renewable energy certificates, minted and tracked by NEPOOL-GIS
- Multiple categories of products can be purchased (no maximum limit)
- State-defined certificates can be listed and defined by state authorities
- Regionally-defined certificates will be defined in the FCEM market rules (4 products proposed in initial launch)

	Product	Description & Purpose	Eligible Resources
state	State-Defined Certificates Units: MWh	<ul> <li>Different in all states</li> <li>Enable states and retail providers to meet current laws and requirements</li> </ul>	Determined by state laws or regulations
icts	New England Renewable Energy Certificate NE-REC Units: MWh	<ul> <li>Renewable product, eligibility consistent with most or all states' current criteria. States may decide to allow such RECs for use in compliance with their Class I RPS.</li> <li>NE-RECs cannot be minted in negative price intervals (i.e., during curtailment events)</li> </ul>	Onshore wind, offshore wind, solar, run-of- river hydro <30 MW, tidal, wave. Distributed resources eligible if qualified and delivering into ISO-NE energy markets
ined Produ	Clean Energy Attribute Certificate NE-CEAC Units: MWh	<ul> <li>Clean energy product, includes nuclear and large hydro to maximize scope of eligible supply (increases competition, reduces system cost)</li> <li>NE-CEACs cannot be minted in negative price intervals (i.e., during curtailment events)</li> </ul>	Onshore wind, offshore wind, solar, hydroelectric, nuclear, tidal, wave. Distributed resources eligible if qualified and delivering into ISO-NE energy markets
egionally-Det	GHG Marginal Abatement Certificate NE-GHG Units: MWh <sub>GHG</sub>	<ul> <li>New product focused on tons of GHG displaced by a resource (rather than MWh produced)</li> <li>Aims to favor clean resources producing energy at the times and locations that displace the most GHG emissions</li> <li>Storage and demand response eligible</li> </ul>	Onshore Wind, offshore wind, solar, nuclear, hydroelectric, storage, and demand response. Storage resources eligible only for net GHG abatement from injecting at a time of higher marginal emissions than when the resource charged
	<b>Clean Capacity</b> <b>Certificate</b> <i>NE-CCC</i> <i>Units: MW-month</i>	<ul> <li>Allow states and customers to procure reliability/capacity needs from zero-carbon emitting resource types</li> <li>Capacity value denominated identically to ISO-NE definitions</li> </ul>	Onshore wind, offshore wind, solar, nuclear, hydroelectric, storage, and demand response. Clean capacity imports are eligible, as long as qualified under ISO- NE capacity qualification rules

# How will FCEM support financing for new clean energy resources?

To achieve design objectives, the FCEM must attract large-scale and stable investment in new clean energy, reducing the overall financing risk to developers and reducing the price risk ratepayers currently assume with long term contracts

#### Several design elements seek to ensure FCEM can attract new resources and necessary financing:

- <u>Price lock-in for new resources</u>, beginning at 15 years at FCEM launch, declining to 7 years as the market gains maturity
- <u>Accessible, predictable, and annually-conducted regional auction</u>, creating robust opportunities to monetize unhedged clean resource value over the long term
- Long-term participation commitments for state buyers and stable, pricelocked commitments, ensuring no state can suddenly cease participation (graduated withdrawal can be achieved over 10 years from public notice)
- <u>Phased entry buy bid option</u> for state entities making large purchases that have flexibility in resource online date

Stakeholder input requested on how to improve access to financing for FCEM resources (while keeping supply-side risks with investors, and buy-side/regulatory risks with customers)

#### **TECHNICAL REVIEW**

# What is the role of FCEM compared to other policies & contracts?

State agencies and customers have flexibility to decide whether and how much they wish to rely on FCEM purchases vs. other policies and contracts



# **Questions and Discussion**

## **Questions for Stakeholders**

- Are there key aspects of the FCEM Design Proposal that have advantages or disadvantages over the status quo?
- Are there design aspects that are key to **financing a portfolio of new clean energy resources** and supporting the Commonwealth meeting emission reduction targets?
- Will there be sufficient **interest** from both buyers and sellers for an FCEM?
- What processes would help achieve **effective implementation** of a clean energy market design?
- Are there other clean energy market reforms that could be considered as alternatives or operate with an FCEM?
- Are there any other **state policy goals** that overlap with the FCEM Design Proposal?
- How should DOER proceed to engage with regional stakeholders to progress clean energy market reforms?

Stakeholder comments requested, due **February 17, 2023** to joanna.k.troy@mass.gov Stakeholder feedback will inform DOER's report to legislature, due by **March 1, 2023** (required by Massachusetts' 2022 Climate Act, <u>Section 85</u>)

## **Contact Information**





Massachusetts Department of Energy Resources



Kathleen Spees

PRINCIPAL | THE BRATTLE GROUP

Kathleen.Spees@brattle.com

412.445.2694

#### Joanna Troy

DIRECTOR, ENERGY POLICY AND PLANNING | MASSACHUSETTS DOER

joanna.k.troy@state.ma.us

**Bob Grace** 

PRESIDENT & MANAGING DIRECTOR | SUSTAINABLE ENERGY ADVANTAGE

bgrace@seadvantage.com

508.665.5855