



EDWARD J. COLLINS, JR. CENTER FOR PUBLIC MANAGEMENT
JOHN W. McCORMACK GRADUATE SCHOOL OF POLICY AND GLOBAL STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS BOSTON

100 Morrissey Boulevard
Boston, MA 02125-3393
P: 617.287.4824
F: 617.287.5566
mccormack.umb.edu/centers/cpm
collins.center@umb.edu

CLASSIFICATION AND COMPENSATION STUDY
PROFESSIONAL EMPLOYEES
TOWN OF MARION, MA

JULY 2019

INTRODUCTION

As a result of receiving a Community Compact grant, the Town of Marion engaged the services of the Collins Center for Public Management (Collins Center) to conduct a classification and compensation study of approximately thirty professional positions. Working with the Town Administrator the project objectives were defined as:

- Evaluating and assigning all positions studied to appropriate classifications to assure internal equity; and
- Developing new descriptions for the positions studied that would include clear definitions of essential functions and requirements.
- Conducting a market survey to determine relative place in market and recommend an equitable compensation structure

POSITION DESCRIPTIONS

To create a viable classification system for the Town, the Collins Center began by evaluating the Town's current system. Copies of existing position descriptions were provided by the Town to facilitate this evaluation.

A comprehensive questionnaire was subsequently given to each incumbent of the positions included within the study. The questionnaire requested information concerning the amount of supervision exercised and received for each position, as well as decision-making authority, budgetary responsibilities, and other characteristics that allowed the Collins Center to evaluate the position's level of difficulty, complexity and importance to the departmental and town organization.

In addition, each incumbent was offered the opportunity for an interview with a Collins Center employee. The interviews were conducted to clarify information contained in the questionnaires. The Collins Center has found that the time spent meeting with employees prior to drafting the descriptions improves the accuracy of the drafts and helps minimize the need for edits.

The draft descriptions were then created and distributed to incumbents and department heads for comments prior to the preparation of the final descriptions. Very few edits to the drafts were requested, and those that were requested resulted in only minor changes to the draft descriptions. The final recommended position descriptions are provided electronically under separate cover.

DISCUSSION

Marion does not have a true classification and compensation system. Individual employees are hired at a rate of pay that is not part of a classification of a position within a structure but has more to do with how the previous incumbent was compensated. At the time of hire, starting pay rates are determined and then across the board or cost of living adjustments are granted.

The Town does not have pay ranges. The Town has not conducted a comprehensive market survey to address the compensation of employees. In individual instances, narrow surveys have been conducted to address individual positions. By undertaking this comprehensive review of the classification and compensation structure, Marion will be able to adopt a fair and equitable system of compensating employees, based on an objective review of the positions and a market analysis.

The Center recommends that the Town consider adopting a personnel by-law which codifies a process for establishing and periodically reviewing and revising a classification and compensation system.

Marion currently utilizes individual employment contracts for many department heads. This practice is not supported in Massachusetts law which identifies a small number of contract eligible positions in public safety and municipal finance. A personnel by-law would supplant the perceived need for individual contracts by creating a uniform system of conditions of employment, compensation and benefits.

RATING OF POSITIONS FOR CLASSIFICATION AND INTERNAL EQUITY

Once descriptions were drafted, the Collins Center used a point factor rating method to objectively evaluate the positions. The application of an objective position evaluation system that is consistently applied to each position is critical in assuring the internal equity of the classification plan. The evaluation system utilized by the Collins Center is one that has been successfully implemented in many public organizations in Massachusetts. Each position was assigned a point factor in a series of categories, including those listed below, and the total points determined the groupings of positions.

Supervision Required	Supervisory Responsibility
Accountability	Judgment
Complexity	Nature and Purpose of Personal Contacts
Confidentiality	Education
Experience	Work Environment

RECOMMENDED CLASSIFICATION STRUCTURE

The Center recommends separate classification systems for non-union and union employees as union employee compensation is subject to collective bargaining.

The recommended classification system for non-union (Pay Plan) employees, not including paid call Firefighters (see below), is comprised of seven (7) grades which groups positions based on similar ratings and is contained in the following Table.

Grade	Title	Department
G	Director of Public Works Finance Director/Town Accountant	Public Works Finance
F	Building Commissioner Facilities Manager Harbor Master Wastewater System Superintendent Health Director	Building Facilities Harbor Master Wastewater Health
E	Associate Assessor Captain Inspector Treasurer/Collector	Finance Fire Finance

	Director of Recreation Executive Director Council on Aging Deputy Harbor Master	Recreation Council on Aging Harbor Master
D	Administrative Assistant BOS Facilities Foreman Public Health Nurse Town Planner Assistant Harbor Master	Selectmen Facilities Health Planning Harbor Master
C	Animal Control Officer Confidential Administrative Assistant Office Manager	Animal Control Police Public Works
B	Assistant Director of Recreation Facilities Laborer Outreach Coordinator Program Coordinator Transportation Coordinator/Reception	Recreation Facilities Council on Aging Council on Aging Council on Aging
A	Custodian Van Driver	Facilities Council on Aging

With respect to call firefighters, finding comparable information for non-union paid call firefighters is challenging. Staffing methodologies vary greatly from 100% volunteer call to 100% full-time career firefighters with every possible combination. The Center recommends the Town maintain a separate classification system for these positions.

A separate three (3) grade classification structure was developed for paid on-call and Per Diem fire department personnel is represented in the following Table.

Grade	Title
F-C	Lieutenant Paramedic
F-B	EMT
F-A	Firefighter

A separate four (4) grade classification structure was developed for DPW employees who are subject to collective bargaining as follows.

Grade	Title	Division
PW-D	Water Division Foreman ¹	Water
PW-C	Assistant Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator DPW Foreman Motor Vehicle Repair Technician	Wastewater DPW DPW
PW-B	Heavy Motor Equipment Operator Motor Equipment Maintenance/Welder Wastewater System Operator Water System Operator	DPW DPW Wastewater Water
PW-A	Laborer	DPW

The Center does not recommend any changes to the classification and compensation structure for the unionized police and clerical positions. The market survey revealed clerical union employees are compensated well above the market, at the rate of \$2.41 to \$3.46 per hour. Similarly, Police Officers minimum pay is approximately \$1.73 per hour higher than the average. Both unions have step systems in place that have been negotiated with the Town. The Town should use the findings of this classification and compensation review in its approach to collective bargaining with both the police and clerical unions.

Finally, the Center recommends that the Town continue to employ the Police and Fire Chiefs, as well as, the Police Lieutenant under individual employment contracts as allowed by law. Total compensation of Police and Fire Chiefs are defined in different ways across municipalities. Some indicate total compensation which may include educational incentive, vehicle allowances and

¹ The Collins Center recommends that this title be changed to Water System Superintendent

clothing allowances. Others are strictly base wages. The Town appears to manage Police Chief and Fire Chief compensation well.

MARKET SURVEY

Once the positions were classified, a salary survey was conducted to determine the ranges within which other towns compensate employees. A summary of the results is attached to this report. Obtaining survey data is one of the most challenging aspects of a classification and compensation study. The towns utilized for the survey were Acushnet, Carver, Fairhaven, Lakeville, Somerset, and Swansea. Minimum and maximum hourly rates were collected from the survey communities. Since Marion does not, in most instances, utilize a pay range, the pay rates were compared with the maximum rates reported by the survey communities. In most cases, Marion's hourly payrates for Pay Plan employees were below the average and median pay rates of the comparable communities.

DEVELOPMENT OF THE SALARY SCHEDULES

When evaluating classification, it is important to remember that each municipality is different and the internal comparability within the organization is just as important, if not more so, than external comparability. In some instances, insufficient data was collected did not provide a valid comparison. In developing the recommended salary schedule, the Collins Center coalesced the position classification with the results of the salary survey to establish salary ranges for each of the grades. The salary ranges were established by evaluating the median and average pay with respect to the existing pay of the positions in each grade.

The Collins Center recommends a non-union (Pay Plan) classification schedule with seven (7) grades with each grade having fifteen (15) steps with 2% increments. The following table represents the recommended compensation schedule for the Pay Plan positions

RECOMMENDED GRADE	RECOMMENDED MINIMUM	RECOMMENDED MAXIMUM
G	\$47.91	\$63.24
F	\$34.22	\$45.16
E	\$29.76	\$39.28
D	\$24.80	\$32.75
C	\$19.84	\$26.17
B	\$16.50	\$21.77
A ²	\$15.00	\$19.79

The Collins Center recommends a Paid On-Call and Per Diem Fire classification schedule with three (3) grades with each grade having fifteen (15) steps with 2% increments. The following table represents the recommended compensation schedule for the paid on-call and per diem Fire department positions.

RECOMMENDED GRADE	RECOMMENDED MINIMUM	RECOMMENDED MAXIMUM
F-C	\$21.00	\$27.69
F-B	\$18.50	\$24.42
F-A	\$17.00	\$22.43

The Collins Center recommends a DPW classification schedule with four (4) grades with each grade having fifteen (15) steps with 2% increments. The following table represents the recommended compensation schedule for Public Works positions.

RECOMMENDED GRADE	RECOMMENDED MINIMUM	RECOMMENDED MAXIMUM
PW-D	\$32.01	\$42.25
PW-C	\$24.62	\$32.47
PW-B	\$22.38	\$29.53

² The Massachusetts Minimum Wage will increase each year until it reached \$15 per hour in 2023

PW-A	\$18.65	\$24.60
------	---------	---------

IMPLEMENTATION

The Collins Center recommends employees be placed on the step of the grade that provides for an increase. In the one instance where the incumbent is currently being paid above the range, it is recommended the pay be continued at the current rate. Each year, the Town should consider implanting step increases based on merit.

CLOSING

Thank you for allowing the Collins Center to work with the Town on this project. We believe the recommended position descriptions and classification plan will serve the Town well for many years to come.

SUMMARY OF CLERICAL SALARY SURVEY

TITLE	DEPARTMENT	MARION MIN HOURLY	MARION MAX HOURLY	AVERAGE MIN HOURLY	MEDIAN MIN HOURLY	Mean v. Marion	Median v. Marion	AVERAGE MAX HOURLY	MEDIAN MAX HOURLY	Max. Median v Marion	Max Median v. Marion
Administrative Assistant*	Police		\$18.58	\$22.17	\$21.78			\$26.95	\$28.61	(\$8.37)	(\$10.03)
Senior Administrative Clerk	Department of Public Works	\$23.18	\$28.61	\$17.95	\$19.12	\$5.23	\$4.06	\$22.55	\$24.77	\$6.06	\$3.84
Senior Administrative Clerk	Finance	\$23.18	\$28.61	\$21.08	\$21.53	\$2.10	\$1.66	\$26.52	\$24.85	\$2.09	\$3.76
Senior Administrative Clerk	Town Clerk / Conservation Commission	\$23.18	\$28.61	\$19.66	\$19.47	\$3.52	\$3.71	\$23.63	\$23.33	\$4.98	\$5.28
Senior Administrative Clerk	Treasurer	\$23.18	\$28.61	\$20.60	\$21.00	\$2.59	\$2.18	\$24.49	\$24.11	\$4.12	\$4.50
Senior Clerk / Bookkeeper	Assessor's Office	\$21.63	\$26.95	\$20.16	\$20.84	\$1.47	\$0.79	\$24.48	\$24.28	\$2.47	\$2.68
Senior Clerk / Bookkeeper	Health	\$21.63	\$26.95	\$19.64	\$19.58	\$1.99	\$2.06	\$23.90	\$23.65	\$3.05	\$3.30
Senior Clerk / Bookkeeper	Building Department		\$25.90	\$20.29	\$20.63			\$24.65	\$24.41	\$1.25	\$1.49
Senior Clerk / Bookkeeper	DPW	\$21.63	\$26.95	\$18.65	\$18.15	\$2.98	\$3.48	\$22.38	\$20.69	\$4.58	\$6.26
Senior Clerk / Bookkeeper	Finance	\$21.63	\$26.95	\$19.27	\$19.03	\$2.36	\$2.60	\$23.89	\$23.20	\$3.06	\$3.75
Senior Clerk / Bookkeeper	Fire Department	\$21.63	\$26.95	\$22.17	\$21.78	(\$0.54)	(\$0.15)	\$28.36	\$28.61	(\$1.41)	(\$1.66)

SUMMARY OF PUBLIC SAFETY SALARY SURVEY

TITLE	DEPARTMENT	MARION MIN HOURLY	MARION MAX HOURLY	AVERAGE MIN HOURLY	MEDIAN MIN HOURLY	Mean v. Marion	Median v. Marion	AVERAGE MAX HOURLY	MEDIAN MAX HOURLY	Max. Mean v Marion	Max Median v. Marion
Lieutenant	Fire		\$20.30					\$29.88	\$31.08	(\$9.58)	(\$10.78)
Firefighter	Fire	\$16.59	\$19.34	\$23.10	\$22.44	(\$6.51)	(\$5.85)	\$26.45	\$26.83	(\$7.11)	(\$7.49)
Sergeant	Police	\$32.51	\$34.44					\$34.25	\$34.62	\$0.20	(\$0.17)
Police Officer	Police	\$24.31	\$29.90	\$22.58	\$22.99	\$1.73	\$1.32	\$29.32	\$29.62	\$0.58	\$0.28

SUMMARY OF PUBLIC WORKS SALARY SURVEY

TITLE	MARION MIN HOURLY	MARION MAX HOURLY	AVERAGE MIN HOURLY	MEDIAN MIN HOURLY	Average v. Marion	Median v. Marion	AVERAGE MAX HOURLY	MEDIAN MAX HOURLY	Max. Average v. Marion	Max Median v. Marion
DPW Foreman	\$27.34	\$29.72	\$23.22	\$22.79	\$4.12	\$4.55	\$28.02	\$27.38	\$1.70	\$2.34
Motor Vehicle Repair Technician	\$23.97	\$27.27	\$20.62	\$21.00	\$3.35	\$2.97	\$24.49	\$24.44	\$2.79	\$2.84
Heavy Motor Equipment Operator	\$23.58	\$26.89	\$20.10	\$20.58	\$3.49	\$3.01	\$24.46	\$24.26	\$2.43	\$2.63
Motor Equipment Maintenance/Welder	\$23.97	\$27.27	\$24.62	\$23.80	(\$0.65)	\$0.17	\$26.32	\$24.44	\$0.95	\$2.84
Laborer	\$18.65	\$22.00	\$18.70	\$19.55	(\$0.05)	(\$0.90)	\$22.11	\$21.87	(\$0.11)	\$0.13

RECOMMENDED PUBLIC WORKS COMPENSATION SCHEDULE

GRADE	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6	Step 7	Step 8	Step 9	Step 10	Step 11	Step 12	Step 13	Step 14	Step 15
PW A	\$18.65	\$19.02	\$19.40	\$19.79	\$20.19	\$20.59	\$21.00	\$21.42	\$21.85	\$22.29	\$22.74	\$23.19	\$23.65	\$24.12	\$24.60
PW B	\$22.38	\$22.83	\$23.29	\$23.76	\$24.24	\$24.72	\$25.21	\$25.71	\$26.22	\$26.74	\$27.27	\$27.82	\$28.38	\$28.95	\$29.53
PW C	\$24.62	\$25.11	\$25.61	\$26.12	\$26.64	\$27.17	\$27.71	\$28.26	\$28.83	\$29.41	\$30.00	\$30.60	\$31.21	\$31.83	\$32.47
PW D	\$32.01	\$32.65	\$33.30	\$33.97	\$34.65	\$35.34	\$36.05	\$36.77	\$37.51	\$38.26	\$39.03	\$39.81	\$40.61	\$41.42	\$42.25

SUMMARY OF NON-UNION SALARY SURVEY

TITLE	DEPARTMENT	MARION MAX HOURLY	AVERAGE MIN HOURLY	MEDIAN MIN HOURLY	AVERAGE MAX HOURLY	MEDIAN MAX HOURLY	Max. Mean v Marion	Max Median v. Marion
Fire Chief**	Fire	\$64.12			\$55.80	\$54.31	\$8.32	\$9.82
Police Chief**	Police	\$69.90			\$59.88	\$59.05	\$10.02	\$10.85
Building Commissioner / Zoning Officer	Building	\$37.36	\$32.80	\$33.38	\$43.73	\$44.48	(\$6.37)	(\$7.12)
Associate Assessor	Assessors	\$35.90	\$27.77	\$26.88	\$37.21	\$37.54	(\$1.31)	(\$1.64)
Executive Director	COA	\$29.42	\$25.80	\$26.74	\$35.65	\$33.49	(\$6.23)	(\$4.07)
Town Planner*	Planning	\$25.38			\$38.45	\$36.15	(\$13.07)	(\$10.77)
Outreach Coordinator	COA	\$15.30			\$18.14	\$18.92	(\$2.84)	(\$3.62)
Program Coordinator	COA	\$15.30	\$18.41	\$19.21	\$23.08	\$22.24	(\$7.78)	(\$6.94)
Transportation Coordinator / Reception	COA	\$15.61	\$15.95	\$15.43	\$19.28	\$18.83	(\$3.67)	(\$3.22)
Facilities Laborer	Facilities	\$18.73	\$18.70	\$19.55	\$22.11	\$21.87	(\$3.38)	(\$3.14)
Custodian	Facilities	\$15.61	\$17.62	\$17.94	\$21.54	\$21.96	(\$5.93)	(\$6.35)
Van Driver	COA	\$15.73	\$13.38	\$13.49	\$14.39	\$14.46	\$1.34	\$1.28

* may want to verify
comparability

** may not represent total compensation

RECOMMENDED NON-UNION COMPENSATION SCHEDULE

Grade	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6	Step 7	Step 8	Step 9	Step 10	Step 11	Step 12	Step 13	Step 14	Step 15
A	\$15.00	\$15.30	\$15.61	\$15.92	\$16.24	\$16.56	\$16.89	\$17.23	\$17.57	\$17.92	\$18.28	\$18.65	\$19.02	\$19.40	\$19.79
B	\$16.50	\$16.83	\$17.17	17.51	\$17.86	\$18.22	\$18.58	\$18.95	\$19.33	\$19.72	\$20.11	\$20.52	\$20.93	\$21.34	\$21.77
C	\$19.84	\$20.24	\$20.64	\$21.05	\$21.47	\$21.90	\$22.34	\$22.79	\$23.25	\$23.72	\$24.19	\$24.67	\$25.16	\$25.66	\$26.17
D	\$24.80	\$25.30	\$25.80	\$26.32	\$26.84	\$27.38	\$27.93	\$28.49	\$29.06	\$29.64	\$30.23	\$30.84	\$31.45	\$32.08	\$32.72
E	\$29.76	\$30.36	\$30.97	\$31.59	\$32.22	\$32.86	\$33.52	\$34.19	\$34.87	\$35.57	\$36.28	\$37.01	\$37.75	\$38.51	\$39.28
F	\$34.22	\$34.90	\$35.60	\$36.31	\$37.04	\$37.78	\$38.54	\$39.31	\$40.10	\$40.90	\$41.72	\$42.55	\$43.40	\$44.27	\$45.16
G	\$47.91	\$48.87	\$49.85	\$50.85	\$51.87	\$52.91	\$53.97	\$55.05	\$56.15	\$57.27	\$58.42	\$59.59	\$60.78	\$62.00	\$63.24

RECOMMENDED CALL FIRE COMPENSATION SCHEDULE

GRADE	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6	Step 7	Step 8	Step 9	Step 10	Step 11	Step 12	Step 13	Step 14	Step 15
F - A	\$17.00	\$17.34	\$17.69	\$18.04	\$18.40	\$18.77	\$19.15	\$19.53	\$19.92	\$20.32	\$20.73	\$21.14	\$21.56	\$21.99	\$22.43
F - B	\$18.50	\$18.87	\$19.25	\$19.64	\$20.03	\$20.43	\$20.84	\$21.26	\$21.69	\$22.12	\$22.56	\$23.01	\$23.47	\$23.94	\$24.42
F - C	\$21.00	\$21.42	\$21.85	\$22.29	\$22.74	\$23.19	\$23.65	\$24.12	\$24.60	\$25.09	\$25.59	\$26.10	\$26.62	\$27.15	\$27.69