Office of Outdoor Advertising Public Meeting

December 13, 2018 11:00 AM

State Transportation Building

10 Park Plaza

2nd Floor

Boston, MA 02116

Present:

John Romano, Executive Director

| 1 | PROCEEDINGS |
|----|--|
| 2 | |
| 3 | JOHN ROMANO: Good morning, everyone. |
| 4 | My name is John Romano and I am the Director of |
| 5 | Outdoor Advertising for MassDOT. We are here for the |
| 6 | December 13, 2018 public hearing. |
| 7 | This meeting is accessible to people |
| 8 | with disabilities and individuals with limited English |
| 9 | proficiency. If you have filed a request with us for |
| 10 | assistive technology, sign language, alternate format |
| 11 | documents, an interpreter, translated documents, or |
| 12 | other such services to be available today, please see |
| 13 | Lydia here if you haven't yet received the assistance |
| 14 | you need. I do not believe we've received any |
| 15 | requests in advance. |
| 16 | If you need any other similar |
| 17 | assistance to participate today, please let Lydia |
| 18 | know, and we will do our best to help you. |
| 19 | Housekeeping stuff there is agendas, |
| 20 | meeting notes from last month's meeting, and a sign-in |
| 21 | sheet on the table to my left. If you didn't sign in |
| 22 | on the way in, please do so on your way out if you |
| 23 | want to be part of the record. |
| 24 | So, November 8 th public hearing meeting |

| Office | of | Outdoor | Advertising | December | 13, | 2018 |
|--------|----|---------|-------------|----------|-----|------|
|--------|----|---------|-------------|----------|-----|------|

| 1 | minutes, any questions, corrections, changes, |
|----|--|
| 2 | omissions? |
| 3 | (No response.) |
| 4 | JOHN ROMANO: Seeing none, we will mark |
| 5 | those approved. |
| 6 | So, this is Clear Channel request 296 |
| 7 | North Beacon Street in Boston, a two-sided sign, |
| 8 | 2018D027 and D028. Notice sent to the mayor's office |
| 9 | and the clerk's office on 11/5 by my office. Mike |
| 10 | Maurello from Clear Channel is here representing the |
| 11 | applicant. |
| 12 | No one is here from the City. No one |
| 13 | is here from there are no abutters present and |
| 14 | there's no one here from the District Office. The |
| 15 | State Traffic Engineer did send a memo stating that no |
| 16 | further traffic study would be required. |
| 17 | Mike, was certified mail notice sent to |
| 18 | abutters at least 30 days prior to submitting your |
| 19 | application to my office? |
| 20 | MIKE MAURELLO: Yes. |
| 21 | JOHN ROMANO: I do have copies of the |
| 22 | post office receipts, so thank you for submitting |
| 23 | those. I also have a copy of the letter that was sent |
| 24 | out. So, those are on record. |

| 1 | Has the applicant received any comments |
|----|--|
| 2 | in support or opposition of this application? |
| 3 | MIKE MAURELLO: None. |
| 4 | JOHN ROMANO: Okay. We did receive an |
| 5 | email late yesterday from a Mr. Anthony D'Isidoro, |
| 6 | president of the Allston Civic Association. |
| 7 | ANTHONY D'ISIDORO: Present. |
| 8 | JOHN ROMANO: Okay. You'll have a |
| 9 | chance at the end if you want to speak. |
| 10 | The request was to have these removed |
| 11 | from the Outdoor Advertising hearing today. We did |
| 12 | not we did take that under advisement, but, |
| 13 | obviously, we're here today. And, as people know, or |
| 14 | may not know, no decisions are made at this hearing |
| 15 | today. Everything is taken under advisement. So |
| 16 | we'll hear any input on all sides. So, I just wanted |
| 17 | to have that on the record. |
| 18 | Okay. And, Mike, a variance was |
| 19 | obtained from the City of Boston. I have a copy of |
| 20 | that. The City did sign off on the application. I |
| 21 | also did hear from Mark McGonagle from the Boston |
| 22 | Planning and Development Agency. It is my |
| 23 | understanding in reading the thing that a license |
| 24 | agreement with BPDA is required. There is a hearing, |

| 1 | a BPDA board meeting tonight in which that will be |
|----|--|
| 2 | brought up there. Again, this is taken under |
| 3 | advisement and no decision will be made until that |
| 4 | thing happens and we see what that says. |
| 5 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: May I just ask for a |
| 6 | quick clarification on the future? |
| 7 | JOHN ROMANO: Yes. |
| 8 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: If events occur after |
| 9 | this hearing, which is a public hearing, are we then |
| 10 | allowed to make additional submissions because there's |
| 11 | only one paragraph in terms of the BPDA board right |
| 12 | now. And that just would give BPDA the authority to |
| 13 | enter into a license agreement. There is no specific |
| 14 | license agreement that is proposed in front of the |
| 15 | BPDA board. |
| 16 | JOHN ROMANO: We won't make a decision |
| 17 | until that happens. |
| 18 | STENOGRAPHER: Could you state your |
| 19 | name for the record? |
| 20 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Oh, yes. My name is |
| 21 | Joanne D'Alcomo. I'm an attorney. And I represent |
| 22 | myself on this issue. |
| 23 | STENOGRAPHER: Could you spell your |
| | |

24

last name?

| 1 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: D-\-A-1-c-o-m-o. And |
|----|--|
| 2 | Joanne is J-o-a-n-n-e, one word. Sorry. |
| 3 | JOHN ROMANO: So, we won't we'll |
| 4 | wait to get that license agreement before we make a |
| 5 | decision. |
| 6 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: And would the public |
| 7 | have additional time to comment based on what that |
| 8 | subsequent event might yield, because right now that's |
| 9 | an unknown? |
| 10 | JOHN ROMANO: You can address that with |
| 11 | BPDA. That's just an agreement between them and us. |
| 12 | We really don't we're really not a party to that. |
| 13 | We just want to get a copy of it so we have it for the |
| 14 | record. |
| 15 | MIKE MAURELLO: Could I just clarify |
| 16 | something? |
| 17 | JOHN ROMANO: Yes, you may. |
| 18 | MIKE MAURELLO: There is a |
| 19 | JOHN ROMANO: Please state your name |
| 20 | again just for |
| 21 | MIKE MAURELLO: Mike Maurello, Clear |
| 22 | Channel Outdoor. |
| 23 | There is an executed license agreement |
| 24 | from Clear Channel to the BPDA. They do have that. |

2 ANTHONY D'ISIDORO: Excuse me. I got

3 clarification --

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

4 JOHN ROMANO: Please state --

5 ANTHONY D'ISIDORO: Anthony D'Isidoro,

6 president of the Allston Civic Association.

I got confirmation from BPDA, Mark McGonagle who is in charge of this area in terms of licensing agreements and everything, and he informed me that no licensing agreement was executed. And the simple reason is BPDA, as we speak, does not have any legal standing, based on where these signs are located, to enter into a licensing agreement with the proponent. So, that is a very important point to This gentleman has misrepresented the situation make. because, legally, it's impossible for them to sign a licensing agreement as it stands right now. As was mentioned, they are going to take it up this afternoon at the BPDA board, as Joanne mentioned. This is not an agenda item that is going to specifically address this particular proposal. It's going to allow the BPDA across the city to enter into licensing agreements with any billboard proposal that gets approved by the Zoning Board of Appeal.

| 1 | JOHN ROMANO: Thank you, sir. |
|----|--|
| 2 | Okay. At this time, I'll ask my |
| 3 | inspector, Chris Chaves, to give his report. |
| 4 | CHRISTOPHER CHAVES: Thank you, John. |
| 5 | As you mentioned, this is a proposed |
| 6 | conversion of a current static permit to an |
| 7 | electronic. The location faces Interstate 90, facing |
| 8 | east and west. There are multiple businesses within |
| 9 | 500 feet. You have Samuels Jaguar and Napa Auto Parts |
| 10 | to fill the requirement. |
| 11 | There are no spacing issues to other |
| 12 | static signs on the same side of the roadway or |
| 13 | electronic signs on either side of the roadway. And |
| 14 | there are no spacing issues in regards to the parks, |
| 15 | recreational areas, reservations, etc. within 300 feet |
| 16 | of this location. |
| 17 | As long as the existing permit is |
| 18 | removed, there's no issues from the field. |
| 19 | JOHN ROMANO: Great. Thank you. |
| 20 | So, Mr. Maurello, as with all |
| 21 | electronic permits, you are required to meet all of |
| 22 | the provisions set forth in 700 CMR 2.17 regarding |
| 23 | brightness, the 10-second static display, video, no |
| 24 | video, no movement, any of that stuff. |

| 1 | I also did notice on the special permit |
|----|--|
| 2 | that no alcohol, tobacco, or marijuana ads. The City |
| 3 | will not require will require that none of those be |
| 4 | shown on these boards. I'm sure you're aware of that. |
| 5 | Also, we have our 15-hour public |
| 6 | service announcement requirement for the state that I |
| 7 | know you're well aware of. That's in addition to any |
| 8 | other commitments that might have been made to the |
| 9 | community or the city. |
| 10 | So, Chris, as you said, no issues from |
| 11 | the field standpoint. |
| 12 | CHRISTOPHER CHAVES: Yes. |
| 13 | JOHN ROMANO: I will note, should these |
| 14 | permits be granted, you will need to surrender the two |
| 15 | static ones. |
| 16 | MIKE MAURELLO: Yes. |
| 17 | JOHN ROMANO: Okay. Is there anybody |
| 18 | from the public who would like to make any comments on |
| 19 | this? Just please state your name for the record. |
| 20 | RICHARD REDMOND: My name is Richard |
| 21 | Redmond. I'm from 46 Vineland Street in Brighton. |
| 22 | STENOGRAPHER: Could you spell your |
| 23 | last name? |
| 24 | RICHARD REDMOND: And I have been |

| 1 | looking |
|----|---|
| 2 | STENOGRAPHER: Could you spell your |
| 3 | last name? |
| 4 | RICHARD REDMOND: R-e-d-m-o-n-d. |
| 5 | STENOGRAPHER: Thank you. |
| 6 | RICHARD REDMOND: My property faces the |
| 7 | sign since 1963. In that time, the owners of this |
| 8 | sign have not been a good neighbor. |
| 9 | The sign that you see in that picture |
| 10 | was built up to the first level. And then, over the |
| 11 | years, because they needed more exposure, it was |
| 12 | raised an additional 25, 30 feet. |
| 13 | As you say, the abutters were all |
| 14 | notified of this. They're all commercial people |
| 15 | around it. It's basically built in an alley. And, |
| 16 | consequently, Clear Channel does whatever they want |
| 17 | with it. |
| 18 | For a couple of years, two or three |
| 19 | years, say five years ago, they sent out crews to cut |
| 20 | trees on state property. It was stopped by the |
| 21 | residents, twice, over two or three weeks, or three |
| 22 | times. |
| 23 | The sign also is supposed to have a |
| 24 | sanction on it that it goes off by 10:00 at night, as |

does the sign on the opposite side. Over the past two years, that hasn't happened either. Maybe the laws have changed on that, too. I am not able to follow the law for how it changes. But I consider that this sign dramatically impacts the people of Brighton.

I know that more money is made from the people on the highway. I watch them stopped in traffic every day from six in the morning till eight at night. The sign directly faces the Faneuil Housing Project. That's 268 units of low- to moderate-income people. It faces the west to residential housing, two-, three-, four-family, all up on the hillside who can see this sign all night long.

I feel it's a major detriment being there. Why it was allowed, the Mass Pike came through the cities and they put that sign there. We already have the one on Vineland Street. In this day and age, I don't know if they'd ever be allowed to be built there. There is no reason to have it there. To put electronics on that only enhances one thing, the bottom line for Clear Channel. It doesn't help the people.

Brighton is going through a major undertaking right now over overdevelopment, housing,

| 1 | you name it. This sign, any change in it, is wrong. |
|----|---|
| 2 | And I will do whatever I can to get it stopped. |
| 3 | Thank you. |
| 4 | JOHN ROMANO: Thank you, sir. |
| 5 | Would anybody else like to speak? |
| 6 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Could I just ask one |
| 7 | informational question of the Clear Channel |
| 8 | representative, and that is what is the height coming |
| 9 | forward with this? |
| 10 | MIKE MAURELLO: I don't actually have |
| 11 | that form with me now, but |
| 12 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Isn't that something |
| 13 | we should know because we know what the proposed new |
| 14 | height is, which is 75 feet. So, I'd like to know |
| 15 | what it's going to be |
| 16 | MIKE MAURELLO: Oh, that's 75 feet. |
| 17 | We're not putting it any higher. |

20 MIKE MAURELLO: And, also, that's a 21 20x60 sign.

Okay.

JOANNE D'ALCOMO: I know. I know.

MIKE MAURELLO: We're reducing the

24 size.

same height.

18

19

JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Okay. So it's the

| 1 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: I do know. |
|----|--|
| 2 | MIKE MAURELLO: Okay. |
| 3 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Thank you. |
| 4 | Again, my name is Joanne D'Alcomo. I'm |
| 5 | an attorney. I'm a longtime Brighton resident and |
| 6 | homeowner, and I also own the house next door to me. |
| 7 | I'm opposing this for the following |
| 8 | reasons. One is the notice is defective. The notice |
| 9 | that is required to be given is certification, that |
| 10 | all property owners within 500 feet will be notified |
| 11 | by certified mail. And I received a copy of the |
| 12 | application when I saw this yesterday. It's a copy of |
| 13 | what purport to be certified mail receipts. And they |
| 14 | do not give the abutters notice. As a matter of fact, |
| 15 | you will see I have a copy of the certified mail. On |
| 16 | its face on its face, it's clear that abutters were |
| 17 | not given notice. For example, the Boston Housing |
| 18 | Authority is not listed. The Boston Housing Authority |
| 19 | owns the Faneuil Gardens Apartment Complex, which is |
| 20 | right next to the site. |
| 21 | Also, you will see the Schubert |
| 22 | organization is there. Trustees of Boston University |
| 23 | are there. Beth Israel is listed. This is a totally |
| 24 | whacky list of certified mail receipts that clearly do |

1 not relate to the abutters.

So, on its face, papers submitted to this authority indicate that notice to the abutters within 500 feet were not given notice. That's the record you have before you. That's what you should act on.

Secondly, the notice itself. Under the -- even if the abutters had been given proper notice, and by the certified mail receipts you see that they were not, the second thing is the substance of the notice. The application that Clear Channel filled out, they're directed in the application to give the height and dimension of the proposed sign and contact information for, among other things, the municipality's chief municipal officer. And that's so that the abutters -- it says right in here -- can submit all comments regarding the proposed sign.

Well, first of all, the height was imprecise. The height information was about 70 feet.

Now, Clear Channel knows what the height of this billboard is and it did not give a specified height. But that's less important than the issue of the substance of the notice. That is, Clear Channel did not identify the chief municipal officer. As a matter

| 1 | of fact, it identified no individual at all, no one. |
|----|--|
| 2 | Instead, what it said was, "Any questions or comments |
| 3 | you may have with respect to the proposed |
| 4 | application," and, as I said, the application only |
| 5 | says approximately 70 feet high, which is ridiculous |
| 6 | if Clear Channel can't be precise, "should be directed |
| 7 | to City of Boston Inspectional Services Department." |
| 8 | Now, anyone who has ever dealt with the City of Boston |
| 9 | Inspectional Services Department knows that's not a |
| 10 | person. That's a department. As a matter of fact, in |
| 11 | a city of this size, the Inspectional Services |
| 12 | Department is loaded with individuals. And this is |
| 13 | such a diffuse direction to abutters that even if they |
| 14 | had received this, this would be insufficient to meet |
| 15 | the very clear directions that Clear Channel was given |
| 16 | in the application. Now, that's with respect to |
| 17 | notice. |
| 18 | I also have specific objections with |
| 19 | respect to the subject of the criteria of the |
| 20 | regulations. The permit cannot be granted if the |
| 21 | director determines that it would not be in harmony or |
| 22 | suitable for the surrounding area or would do |
| 23 | significant damage to the environment. |
| 24 | Well, let's just review, because it's |

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

certainly not in the application what the environment First, I have a photo here that I can provide of what exactly -- excuse me. Pardon my cough. You see the billboard in the sign. Overlooked here, as Mr. Redmond pointed out, the fact that this billboard faces the Faneuil Gardens apartment complex, in addition to many other residences. So, you see that it's facing a residential area. And it's visible from this residential area. And you would never know that looking at the application. You wouldn't have a clue. And I went there yesterday. I took some pictures. This is a 254-apartment complex. Again, that's apart from Mr. Redmond's residence and any other residence. So, as you can see from the area, there's a park within the vicinity, a large park with a kiddie playground and many other residential streets right nearby. Let's go a little bit closer in terms

Let's go a little bit closer in terms of the immediate impact of this sign. Here's a picture again. This is just me standing on the ground taking a picture from Faneuil Gardens. Here's what it looks like from the closest building on the street. You can see, this is just on the ground. Now, this is not even -- these are three-story buildings, Faneuil

1 There are ten buildings. That's what it 2 looks like from the ground. It doesn't matter that 3 it's a slightly smaller sign. It's just that it's significantly different. In fact, it's going to be on 5 24 hours a day. That's the proposal. This is what it looks like a little bit 6 7 stepped back, stepping back a little further. there are three buildings on North Beacon Street alone 8 that face the billboard -- and I'd like to show Mr. 9 10 Romano -- again, all within view, very close view, of the site. 11 12 Now, on that first picture I gave you, you see the first building of the Faneuil Gardens that 13 is close to the sign. If you simply take a left at 14 15 that building, which is what I did, and I walked 16 alongside this building that goes closely -- is near the billboard, this is what you see, and five feet. 17 18 And the sign isn't going to be any lower. 19 that. So, that's what the Clear Channel 20 representative has told us. So, this is what the 21 ground-level people see. That's not -- I didn't go into a third-22 23 floor apartment. The third-floor apartment people see more of the sign and will see more of the sign every 24

| 1 | day, every night, all night long. |
|----|--|
| 2 | This is what you see when you walk |
| 3 | further down alongside the Faneuil Gardens buildings. |
| 4 | And no one has taken that into account. |
| 5 | Once again, this is just walking |
| 6 | further down alongside the Faneuil Gardens buildings. |
| 7 | Again, it's very visible, very intrusive in their |
| 8 | lives, 24 hours a day, seven days a week. |
| 9 | Now, why else is it not suitable? |
| 10 | Again, nobody has pointed out here, in the application |
| 11 | or otherwise, that this sign is directly visible from |
| 12 | one of the areas that is prized by the state. It's |
| 13 | called the Charles River Reservation. And here's a |
| 14 | map of it. And this is managed by the Department of |
| 15 | Conservation and Recreation. And that's the map of |
| 16 | it. And along that Charles River is the Paul Dudley |
| 17 | White people may remember him; he was a |
| 18 | cardiologist at MGH Bike Path. And that runs all |
| 19 | along the Charles River. |
| 20 | Okay. So, if you're trying to enjoy |
| 21 | the Charles River Reservation, either jogging or |
| 22 | walking or biking, this is what you see from and if |
| 23 | I may just come over closer here. I just stood at the |
| 24 | little bend here, right there, on the Charles River |

Reservation, on the Paul Dudley White Bike Path.

That's all I did. I just stood there. And, I turned a couple of directions. In one direction you turn, it's very bucolic. It's very nice. That's what you see. And in the other direction, what you see is Clear Channel's billboard. So, right now it's a static billboard.

But to make it even worse, to make it more prominent, which is exactly what Clear Channel is trying to do, is not make it less intrusive, but to make it more prominent. That's the whole point of a digital billboard is to make it more noticeable to catch your attention or otherwise they wouldn't go to all the trouble. That's what you see.

So, that's why it's also unsuitable for the area because we should value the Charles River Reservation, not degrade it further by having not just a static billboard within view, but to have a digital billboard within view.

Also, within -- right near -- and, again, pardon me. I don't have a cold. I just have a dry throat. Also right within view of this billboard is the Leo Birmingham Parkway. Now, parkways -- if I may, just for a moment. Also right within view of

this billboard is a stretch of road that is called a parkway. Now, the notion of parkways is they're supposed to be less valued in the sense of having trees and being a little bit more attractive than regular roadways. That's why we call them parkways as opposed to just streets. We're calling them highways like I-90. And the Leo Birmingham Parkway is also right at the stretch right near this billboard. Let me show you what the view is. Again, I'm just on foot here. I'm not doing anything fancy. And what you see is from the Leo Birmingham Parkway, yes, the Clear Channel billboard.

So, once again, why would we, as a policy matter, think it was suitable to make this billboard, more noticeable than it is now already? And the answer is it's not suitable to do that. We should not further degrade the area and degrade the view from the parkway, the view from the Charles River Reservation, and certainly the view from where people live 24 hours a day by making this billboard more noticeable. So, I urge rejection of the effort to make this billboard more prominent, more intrusive, and more noticeable. It should stay static and it should not be operating 24 hours a day, seven days a

| 1 | week, bringing its visuals into the homes of the |
|----|--|
| 2 | people who live nearby or people who are trying to |
| 3 | enjoy the reservation, the bike path, and just trying |
| 4 | to enjoy a pleasant ride down Leo Birmingham Parkway |
| 5 | on your way home or after work or to work. |
| 6 | Thank you. |
| 7 | JOHN ROMANO: Thank you for your |
| 8 | comments. |
| 9 | Is there anybody else who would like to |
| 10 | add anything? |
| 11 | ANTHONY D'ISIDORO: I'm here on behalf |
| 12 | of the Allston Civic Association. |
| 13 | The who key words that come to me in |
| 14 | this whole proposal, and it was just clearly displayed |
| 15 | by the attorney for Clear Channel, is credibility and |
| 16 | community. And in this whole transaction, neither one |
| 17 | of those words applies. |
| 18 | I know this is not all in the purview |
| 19 | of the state, but let me just give you a quick, a real |
| 20 | quick history of this proposal. It's been 21 months, |
| 21 | almost 22 months, since this first proposal was |
| 22 | brought before the community. And it was brought |
| 23 | before the community at the Brighton Allston |
| 24 | Improvement Association with an agenda item that just |

| That evening, the district cit councilor, the Mayor's Office of Neighborhood Services, and the leadership of the Brighton Improvement Association sprung on the communi that had been worked out with Clear Channel t this to take place and to put together an agr that involved taking down some additional bil money returned to the community, some other p that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | | |
|---|----|--|
| That evening, the district cit councilor, the Mayor's Office of Neighborhood Services, and the leadership of the Brighton Improvement Association sprung on the communi that had been worked out with Clear Channel t this to take place and to put together an agr that involved taking down some additional bil money returned to the community, some other p that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 1 | talked about converting this billboard to an |
| councilor, the Mayor's Office of Neighborhood Services, and the leadership of the Brighton Improvement Association sprung on the communi that had been worked out with Clear Channel t this to take place and to put together an agr that involved taking down some additional bil money returned to the community, some other p that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 2 | electronic billboard. No other information was given. |
| Services, and the leadership of the Brighton Improvement Association sprung on the communi that had been worked out with Clear Channel t this to take place and to put together an agr that involved taking down some additional bil money returned to the community, some other p that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 3 | That evening, the district city |
| Improvement Association sprung on the communi that had been worked out with Clear Channel t this to take place and to put together an agr that involved taking down some additional bil money returned to the community, some other p that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 4 | councilor, the Mayor's Office of Neighborhood |
| that had been worked out with Clear Channel to this to take place and to put together an agray that involved taking down some additional bil money returned to the community, some other put that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, including myself, because some of those billboards involved billboards in Allston. And as a member, at the of the Allston Civic Association, and speaking the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 5 | Services, and the leadership of the Brighton Allston |
| this to take place and to put together an agr that involved taking down some additional bil money returned to the community, some other p that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 6 | Improvement Association sprung on the community a deal |
| that involved taking down some additional bil money returned to the community, some other p that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 7 | that had been worked out with Clear Channel to allow |
| money returned to the community, some other p that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 8 | this to take place and to put together an agreement |
| that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of was all about. That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 9 | that involved taking down some additional billboards, |
| That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 10 | money returned to the community, some other provisos |
| That proposal was voted upon, the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 11 | that we still haven't gotten a clear sense of what it |
| the objections of a number of people, includi myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 12 | was all about. |
| myself, because some of those billboards invo billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 13 | That proposal was voted upon, despite |
| billboards in Allston. And as a member, at t of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 14 | the objections of a number of people, including |
| of the Allston Civic Association, and speakin behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 15 | myself, because some of those billboards involve |
| behalf of our president, we were never consul during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 16 | billboards in Allston. And as a member, at the time, |
| during the whole course of these negotiations when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 17 | of the Allston Civic Association, and speaking on |
| when we raised objections, we were told that a work in progress and that we would continue | 18 | behalf of our president, we were never consulted |
| 21 a work in progress and that we would continue | 19 | during the whole course of these negotiations. And |
| | 20 | when we raised objections, we were told that this was |
| 22 they'd have to come back to us and we'd have | 21 | a work in progress and that we would continue |
| 22 they a have to come back to us and we a have | 22 | they'd have to come back to us and we'd have to |
| 23 continue to talk about this. | 23 | continue to talk about this. |
| | 24 | Well, guess what? Two weeks later, I'm |

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

sitting in my living room watching the Zoning Board of Appeals, expecting to hear a deferral on this matter because of the fact they needed to do more community review. And, guess what? It came up for consideration. And the most important people, the people who live here, the abutters, and the Housing, and Mr. Redmond, and Joanne were not there. There was a major misrepresentation made at that committee hearing by the Brighton Allston Improvement Association. They were specifically asked by the chair of the Zoning Board of Appeals, "Doesn't this billboard back up to residential property?" And they were told, "Absolutely not." I guess poor people and people who live in subsidized housing don't count. But the Faneuil Hall residents do count. And they would be directly impacted, as Mr. Redmond has powerfully stated to you this morning. So, that was a major, major misrepresentation. And then it was agreed to based on the marijuana, alcohol, and tobacco restriction. person from BPDA was there that day, told the Zoning

person from BPDA was there that day, told the Zoning Board of Appeal that they would have to, as part of Article 11 of the Zoning Code, enter into a licensing agreement between the BPDA and the proponent. So, it

1 was made very strongly subject to those conditions. 2 Now, 21 months later, we pop up and all 3 of a sudden we see it on the agenda of the Outdoor Advertising Board. And thank you for reading the email I sent. Checking into this, we were officially 5 told by the person who is now in charge of the 6 7 billboards that they could not legally enter into a license agreement with Clear Channel based on the fact 8 that these two billboards were "outside of the zone," 9 10 but that an effort was going to be made at the BPDA board hearing on Thursday, today, to rectify that 11 12 situation. So, when the gentleman from Clear 13 14 Channel says they had an executed agreement, this is 15 the credibility issue that we're talking about. That 16 was a complete misrepresentation, a complete lie. that's what we're dealing here with Clear Channel as 17 18 Mr. Redmond and Joanne clearly illustrated to you. 19 There's nothing about credibility here. 20 nothing about community here. 21 And I'm quite -- and this was in the 22 email that I raised with you gentlemen -- I quite 23 don't understand why you're taking up this matter

today even though you're not going to vote. You're

24

just taking it out of consideration. Because you don't have a proponent who has ZBA approval.

Now, if you want everybody to come from the City who just wants to convert a billboard to come and spend and waste your time here before they get ZBA approval, then you have the right to do that. If you've got the staff and the time to do that, that's fine. But based on the legal rendering, these people don't have an agreement. It was made very clear that the ZBA approval was contingent on the alcohol, tobacco, and marijuana, and based on entering into a licensing agreement. They legally can't do that. Right now, they legally cannot enter into that agreement.

And, right now, the fact that, as

Joanne pointed out, we have no idea what this

agreement eventually is going to look like. That's

why Joanne is asking you the question. When this

agreement is reached, if it is reached, and it is made

public, don't we have a chance to come back and at

least provide some additional testimony? I understand

the state -- that's something between the city and the

proponent. The state doesn't really want to get into

that. But that was a clear representation at the BAI

1 and to get that membership to approve this conversion 2 was this agreement that was going to be made and the 3 provisos that were going to be in place today. We have no idea where that agreement stands right now. And the fact that the BAI 5 6 misrepresented the poor people of the Faneuil project 7 by stating to the Zoning Board of Appeal that this would not impact any residential housing was a major 8 9 misrepresentation. 10 Thank you. Thank you for your 11 JOHN ROMANO: 12 comments. Does anybody else want to add anything? 13 14 RICHARD REDMOND: Richard Redmond, 15 Just a couple of other points about the sign. again. 16 I have questions. In 1963, it was It was raised in probably I'd say the '80s to 17 built. 18 the height that it is now, whatever that height really 19 In essence, was the abutter, EMCOR I believe is 20 the new power facility we have there, notified about 21 the sign change, or the sign in general, or the 22 structural integrity of it? When was the last 23 structural integrity done on that sign? With those Ibeams that come up going across at the cross-bracing 24

at the top, when was that done? Nobody seems to know that answer. This was basically built on an alley between Garwin Motors back in those days, it was a truck company, and the corner lot.

So, consequently, what is the sign going to have? If they approve the sign, it's going to affect all the people, 75 feet in the air. The new developments in Brighton are over 60 feet in the air. They're all going to look at their new \$2,000, \$3,000 places, they're going to be looking at this sign on Faneuil Street, North Beacon Street, on the corner of Lincoln Street. They're all going to be looking at this beautiful sign. It's going to have all this information and controls.

The medium is the message. Is that what you're looking for? Give the message through the medium. That sign, a revolving sign, is a travesty. The sign in general that sits there since the '60s is a travesty.

I'd also like to know from those who are involved how long that sign was supposed to stay, that sign as well as the one on Vineland Street as well as the ones that are on Lincoln Street, the ones on the other side on North Beacon Street and

| Office o | ſ | Outdoor | Advertising | December | 13, | 2018 |
|----------|---|---------|-------------|----------|-----|------|
| | | | | | | |

| 1 | Birmingham Boulevard. How long were those signs |
|----|--|
| 2 | supposed to stay there? And it's just a travesty. |
| 3 | Brighton is dying. We're losing |
| 4 | housing. We can't have kids living there because they |
| 5 | can't afford houses. We just want it's fallen upon |
| 6 | the area of advertisements. This is what we're going |
| 7 | to do. |
| 8 | I'm sorry. This is totally wrong. And |
| 9 | is the next step Vineland Street? Oh, we need a sign |
| 10 | there. We've got to enhance that one, which is over a |
| 11 | single-family house up on those pillars. It's |
| 12 | beautiful. You can see it all the way from Newton. |
| 13 | This sign you can see all the way from Union Square in |
| 14 | Allston. That's got to be about a mile-and-a-half |
| 15 | away. You see it all the way up to Newton. It's good |
| 16 | for Clear Channel. What good is it for the people of |
| 17 | Brighton? What good is it at all? |
| 18 | JOHN ROMANO: Thank you for your |
| 19 | comments. |
| 20 | Anything new? |
| 21 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: I just to ask |
| 22 | question of you, Mr. Director. I think we're entitled |
| 23 | to an explanation from Clear Channel as to why in |
| 24 | December 2018 an application is before you for a |

| | Office of Outdoor Advertising December 13, 2018 |
|----|--|
| 1 | billboard that received conditional approval by the |
| 2 | Board of Appeals in Boston in January or February |
| 3 | 2017. Could we have that answer please? |
| 4 | JOHN ROMANO: It's up to them if they |
| 5 | want to answer that. I can't direct them to answer |
| 6 | your questions. |
| 7 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Do they refuse to |
| 8 | answer? |
| 9 | MIKE MAURELLO: I don't have a comment. |
| 10 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: I would also as the |
| 11 | Director if he received the executed license agreement |
| 12 | because that's obviously represented to this board. |
| 13 | There is an executed license agreement which is part |
| 14 | of this record. |
| 15 | JOHN ROMANO: I am under no it's my |
| 16 | understanding that an agreement is not executed. |
| 17 | Clear Channel may have signed their side of it and |
| 18 | presented it to the BPDA. According to Mark |
| 19 | McGonagle, they're bringing it up tonight at the |
| 20 | board. And then, after that, they will sign |
| 21 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Oh, all right. |
| 22 | JOHN ROMANO: the thing, and then |
| 23 | they will get that to me. |

24

JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Because it was stated

| 1 | at this hearing today that it was executed. So, if |
|----|--|
| 2 | only one party executed it, it's not really considered |
| 3 | by the law an executed agreement when one side signs |
| 4 | it. I could sign |
| 5 | JOHN ROMANO: I get it. |
| 6 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Okay. So, is it |
| 7 | correct that only one side has signed it? |
| 8 | JOHN ROMANO: Based on the information |
| 9 | I have. |
| 10 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Okay. |
| 11 | JOHN ROMANO: I don't have a copy of |
| 12 | any of it. |
| 13 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: Okay. |
| 14 | JOHN ROMANO: Mr. McGonagle promised me |
| 15 | that we would get that when that was done. And |
| 16 | they're well aware that no action will be taken on |
| 17 | this till that's reviewed. And if it's not executed, |
| 18 | then no permit will be granted. |
| 19 | JOANNE D'ALCOMO: And the only other |
| 20 | thing I'd like to say is that I was not at the 2017 |
| 21 | hearing at which the Board of Appeal gave its approval |
| | |
| 22 | subject to various conditions which have not been met. |
| 23 | But, to the extent if, indeed, the Brighton Allston |

Board of Appeal that there was no residential property nearby, and Clear Channel did not correct that false representation, they own it. They own it.

JOHN ROMANO: Yes, that's something to bring up with the City.

JOANNE D'ALCOMO: But that is -- in other words, that's -- you don't have that information that there was residential residences right nearby, which is why I'm putting the pictures in front of you because you'd never know if from the application.

JOHN ROMANO: My inspector goes out there and inspects the site. So we have a good idea of what's there. Whatever might have been presented in 2017 to the City, if there's an issue with that, you need to bring that up with them.

JOANNE D'ALCOMO: And one other thing I would say is that the regulations, specifically 700 CMR 3:074 says that you can only issue a permit if it's in harmony or suitable for the surrounding area. And I urge you to consider area as indeed an area, not a parcel, not the adjacent parcel, not the across the street parcel, but the area, because it's not fair to us in Brighton that only a little tiny speck of land be considered. The regulations say area, surrounding

1 area, not parcels. So, I urge you to consider that. 2 Thank you. 3 JOHN ROMANO: Thank you. ANTHONY D'ISIDORO: Mr. Director, just one last question and then I'll sit down. 5 It's just an extension of Mr. Redmond and what Joanne just 6 7 mentioned. And I know you're hearing this a lot, especially from the City of Boston in certain 8 9 neighborhoods. And I know you take this under 10 consideration. 11 Allston Brighton is one of those 12 communities, like South Boston, for example, that is undergoing, as Mr. Redmond said, massive development, 13 14 transformative development. And a lot of the 15 placement of these billboards was in an era that is 16 quickly disappearing. In essence, commercial streets, like in South Boston, a lot of old industrial 17 18 commercial space is now being transformed into mixed-19 use developments. And the placement of these 20 billboards, in many cases now, not only for projects 21 in the pipeline, under construction, those that are 22 coming that we know of, are just obsolete in terms of 23 the quality of life issues that Joanne mentioned. 24 They are simply out of character and they're simply

| | , |
|----|--|
| 1 | not positioned correctly anymore based on what's |
| 2 | happening. |
| 3 | As Mr. Redmond was saying, he talked |
| 4 | about the \$3,000 a month rental units that are being |
| 5 | built. What about the people that are paying |
| 6 | \$700,000, \$800,000, \$900,000, a million dollars for |
| 7 | condominiums that are going to be surprised when these |
| 8 | buildings are built to look outside and see billboards |
| 9 | changing every ten or 15 seconds in their face. |
| 10 | So, I know you've heard this before. |
| 11 | And I hope you take it under consideration. But we |
| 12 | want to emphasize the need that Allston Brighton is |
| 13 | such strong appeal right now from developers and |
| 14 | people who want to live there. It's being reflected |
| 15 | in all the projects that are taking place, and that a |
| 16 | lot of the placement of these billboards are now |
| 17 | obsolete if you follow your guidelines in terms of |
| 18 | abutting residential communities. |
| 19 | Thank you. |
| 20 | JOHN ROMANO: Thank you, all. We will |
| 21 | take this into consideration. Thank you, Mr. |
| 22 | D'Isidoro. |
| 23 | ANTHONY D'ISIDORO: Thank you. |
| 24 | JOHN ROMANO: We'll take this all under |

| 1 | advisement. No decision will be made at this time. |
|----|--|
| 2 | We certainly will wait to see what happens with the |
| 3 | BPDA. |
| 4 | So, thank you all for your comments. |
| 5 | Okay. The next item on the agenda is |
| 6 | 730 Madison Ave. in Wrentham, Application 2018D033 and |
| 7 | 34, also by Clear Channel. |
| 8 | Notice was sent on November 13, 2018 to |
| 9 | the town administrator and the town clerk. |
| 10 | Is the applicant present? |
| 11 | MIKE MAURELLO: Yes, Mike Maurello, |
| 12 | Clear Channel Outdoor. |
| 13 | JOHN ROMANO: Is there anyone here |
| 14 | representing the municipality where the sign is being |
| 15 | proposed? |
| 16 | (No response.) |
| 17 | JOHN ROMANO: Are there any abutters |
| 18 | present? |
| 19 | (No response.) |
| 20 | JOHN ROMANO: None. Is anybody present |
| 21 | from the District Office? |
| 22 | (No response.) |
| 23 | JOHN ROMANO: No. Mike, I forwarded |
| | |

you an email yesterday that I received from Bill

24

| Office o | ſ | Outdoor | Advertising | December | 13, | 2018 |
|----------|---|---------|-------------|----------|-----|------|
| | | | | | | |

| 1 | Travers from District 5 just reminding you that if |
|----|--|
| 2 | there is any tree trimming or tree removal anticipated |
| 3 | that you should contact him directly. A separate |
| 4 | permit for any of that is tied to this permit and |
| 5 | would need to be obtained if needed. He recommends |
| 6 | you get together with him for a site visit. |
| 7 | MIKE MAURELLO: Yes. |
| 8 | JOHN ROMANO: Is anyone here from |
| 9 | Traffic Operations? |
| 10 | (No response.) |
| 11 | JOHN ROMANO: Seeing none. We did |
| 12 | receive a memo from the State Traffic Engineer's |
| 13 | Office stating that no further traffic study would be |
| 14 | required should a permit be issued for these |
| 15 | applications. |
| 16 | Mike, was certified mail notice to |
| 17 | abutters sent out by you at least 30 days prior to |
| 18 | submitting your application us? |
| 19 | MIKE MAURELLO: Yes. |
| 20 | JOHN ROMANO: I do have the post office |
| 21 | receipts. I also have a copy of the letter that was |
| 22 | sent out. |
| 23 | Have you received any written comments |
| 24 | in support or opposition to this? |

| 1 | MIKE MAURELLO: No. |
|----|--|
| 2 | JOHN ROMANO: And we have not. |
| 3 | Okay. The special permit is attached |
| 4 | to your application. The application was signed off |
| 5 | by the City of Boston (sic), is that correct? |
| 6 | MIKE MAURELLO: Yes. The City of |
| 7 | Wrentham. You said Boston. |
| 8 | JOHN ROMANO: Oh, excuse me. Wrentham. |
| 9 | Thank you for that correction. |
| 10 | I'll have Marc Plante give our |
| 11 | inspector's report on this application. |
| 12 | MARC PLANTE: Thank you, John. |
| 13 | This application is a digital |
| 14 | application for a new monopole. It's located north |
| 15 | and south on Route 1 in Wrentham. As you can see on |
| 16 | the screen, there is now an existing static on the |
| 17 | pole on the location, which will be completely |
| 18 | dismantled and the new structure will be entirely new |
| 19 | on the same spot. This is a monopole, two-sided |
| 20 | digital application. |
| 21 | This particular area is of business |
| 22 | character. There's two businesses within 500 feet of |
| 23 | the location. There no parks, playgrounds, or |
| 24 | recreation areas within 300 feet of the proposed sign. |

| Office | of | Outdoor | Advertising | December | 13. | 2018 |
|--------|---------|---------|----------------|-----------|-----|------|
| OTITCC | \circ | Outdoor | 11010010131119 | DCCCIIDCI | , | 2010 |

| 1 | There are no spacing issues with any other signs. So |
|----|--|
| 2 | this site is conforming to the regulations. |
| 3 | JOHN ROMANO: Thank you. |
| 4 | MARC PLANTE: You're welcome. |
| 5 | JOHN ROMANO: Thank you, Marc. So, no |
| 6 | issues from the field. Okay. Great. |
| 7 | Mr. Maurello, again, a reminder, 700 |
| 8 | CMR 3.17, all of the items related to electronic signs |
| 9 | regarding brightness, ten-second static display |
| 10 | changes, no video, no movement, etc., and also the 15- |
| 11 | hour public service announcement requirement with this |
| 12 | office separate from any other agreement you might |
| 13 | have with the community. |
| 14 | MIKE MAURELLO: Yes. |
| 15 | JOHN ROMANO: Anybody from the general |
| 16 | public have any questions, comments on this? |
| 17 | (No response.) |
| 18 | JOHN ROMANO: Do you have anything |
| 19 | you'd like to add to your application at this time? |
| 20 | MIKE MAURELLO: Nothing. |
| 21 | JOHN ROMANO: Okay. We will take |
| 22 | everything under advisement and we'll get back to you |
| 23 | on this. |
| 24 | MIKE MAURELLO: Thank you. |
| | |

| 1 | JOHN ROMANO: Thank you very much. |
|----|---|
| 2 | Next on the agenda is Application for |
| 3 | 2019 renewal of Outdoor Advertising licenses and |
| 4 | permits. There is a list of 38 of them, the licensee |
| 5 | and the associated permits. Are there any questions, |
| 6 | comments on those? |
| 7 | (No response.) |
| 8 | JOHN ROMANO: Okay. Seeing none. Next |
| 9 | is Application for 2018 renewal of unlicensed Outdoor |
| 10 | Advertising permits. There are 26 of those, the |
| 11 | associated companies with their permits. Any |
| 12 | comments, questions, concerns? |
| 13 | (No response.) |
| 14 | JOHN ROMANO: None. Okay. Next is for |
| 15 | the record. Any questions on items listed under for |
| 16 | the record? |
| 17 | (No response.) |
| 18 | JOHN ROMANO: Seeing none. Great. |
| 19 | And, lastly, any other public comment |
| 20 | related to anything related to Outdoor Advertising? I |
| 21 | don't mean anything, Outdoor Advertising. |
| 22 | (No response.) |
| 23 | JOHN ROMANO: Okay. Seeing none, we |
| 24 | are adjourned. Thank you all very much. Merry |

```
Christmas. Happy holidays to everybody. Happy New
 1
 2
          Year. We'll see you in January.
 3
                     (Whereupon, the proceedings were concluded
          on December 13, 2018 at 11:48 a.m.)
 4
 5
          //
          //
 6
 7
          //
 8
          //
 9
          //
          //
10
          //
11
12
          //
          //
13
          //
14
15
          //
16
          //
17
          //
18
          //
19
          //
20
          //
          //
21
22
          //
23
          //
          //
24
```

CERTIFICATE

I, Judith Luciano, do hereby certify that the foregoing record is a true and accurate transcription of the proceedings in the above-captioned matter to the best of my skill and ability.

Judith Luciano

Judith Luciano

**All names not provided were spelled phonetically to the best of my ability.