

**Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held on May 21, 2020**

Call-in Number:
United States (Toll Free): 1 877 568 4106
Access Code: 550-492-469

9:30 a.m.

Pursuant to Governor Charles D. Baker's Executive Order Suspending Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law, G.L. c. 30A, s. 20, dated March 12, 2020, board members and staff appeared by videoconference.

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential*
Tracy Sharkey, *Licensed Real Estate Broker* Arrived at 10:15 a.m.
Thomas Kokoliadis, *Banking Member* Arrived around 11:100 a.m.
William McLaughlin, *Certified General Member*
Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*
Matthew Jenkins, *Member*

Administrative Staff Present:

Shawn T. Murphy, *Executive Director*
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*
Colleen Cavanaugh, *Associate Executive Director*

Call to Order – Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 9:36 a.m.

Vote on Minutes: April 16, 2020- A motion was made by Paula Wolfe and seconded by Timothy McDonough after roll call it was so

Voted: To accept the minutes as amended

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew Jenkins, Michael Giannelli

Abstain: Tracy Sharkey

Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

Executive Director Report: Shawn Murphy informed the Board that the board staff continues to work remotely. Board members received comment and discussed operations.

Next Board Meeting:

The next board meeting is scheduled for Thursday, June 18, 2020

Board Counsel's Report to the Board:

Ms. Read informed the Board that the MBREA felt the Board's remote education policy will not be effective when the State of Emergency ends. Ms. Read states that the Policy would be amended to be in effect for 90 days after the State of Emergency is lifted.

License Application Report

This list contains the applications that have been reviewed since the last board meeting and their standing.

- Russell Stering – Not approved
- Gregory Caputo – Approved

Course Approval Report

This list contains the applications that have been reviewed since the last board meeting and their standing.

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	ResFlag	AQB	Recommendations
Appraisal Institute	Appraisal Institute Annual Conference_ - Day 1	5	S	E	No	Board Member Approved
Appraisal Institute	Appraisal Institute Annual Conference_ - Day 2	5	S	E	No	Board Member Approved
ASFMRA	Appraisal of Water Rights Seminar	8	S	E/NR	No	Board Member Approved
MBREA	MBREA Spring 2020 Conference for Appraisers	7	C	NR	No	Board Member Approved
Hondros Learning LLC	15 Hour National USPAP Equivalency	15	P	USPAP	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Artificial Intelligence, AVMs, and Blockchain: Implications for Valuation - Synchronous	7	S	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Hondros Learning LLC	Covering All of the Bases in Residential Reporting	7	C	R	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Desktop Appraisals (Bifurcated, Hybrid) and Evaluations	7	S	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Measure It Right! – Using the ANSI-Z765-2013 Standard for Residential Properties	4	S	R	Yes	Staff Approved

Hondros Learning LLC	Sales Comparison :A Fresh Approach	7	C	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
----------------------	---------------------------------------	---	---	----	-----	----------------

A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough, seconded by Ms. Wolfe, to accept the Course Approval Report, and after roll call it was so

Voted: To accept the Course Approval Report.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew Jenkins,
Michael Giannelli

Abstain: Tracy Sharkey

Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

Discussion

- **Screening of Applications under CORI Policy**

A MOTION was made by Timothy McDonough seconded by Paula Wolfe, and after roll call it was so

Voted: To allow board staff and board counsel to review and approve applications having only one conviction for minor motor vehicle offenses older than 10 years.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins,
Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey

Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

- **Draft Regulations for Appraisal Management Companies (“AMC”), 264 CMR 13.00**

After discussion, a MOTION was made by Timothy McDonough seconded by William McLaughlin after roll call it was so

Voted: to approve the draft AMC regulations as presented and authorize Board counsel to revise to accommodate potential amendments to the statute regarding fingerprinting and regulation of companies smaller than the definition of AMC.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins,
Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey

Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

- **Review Board’s Existing Regulations 264 CMR 2.00-4.00 & 6.00-12.00**

A MOTION was made by Timothy McDonough seconded by William McLaughlin, and after roll call vote it was so

Voted: to table the review of the regulations. Section 11 will be reviewed at next meeting.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins,
Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey, Thomas Kokoliadis

- **Renewing Trainee License**

License lapsed in 2016, she has not renewed 4 times. Thomas Kokoliadis arrived during this discussion.

A MOTION was made by Timothy McDonough seconded by William McLaughlin after roll call vote it was so

Voted: to allow licensee to reinstate

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins, Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey, Thomas Kokoliadis

Adjourn Public Meeting, Enter Executive Session, and then Enter Investigative Conference (Closed Executive Session under G.L. c. 30A, s.21(a)(1) and Closed Investigative Conference under G.L. c. 112, s. 65C to review cases)

A motion was made by Tracy Sharkey seconded by Paula Wolfe after roll call vote it was so

Voted: to enter into Executive Session, Closed Session under MGL c. 30A, Section 21(a)(1)- Good Moral Character, and thereafter to enter into Investigative Conference, Closed Session under MGL c. 112, s. 65C, and the open meeting of the Board will not resume. The Chair called for a Roll Call vote.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins, Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey, Thomas Kokoliadis

Timothy McDonough has left the meeting.

See separate minutes of Executive Session.

During the closed Investigative Conference, the Board voted to take the following actions:

2019-001017-IT-ENF	Refer to prosecutions
2019-001150-IT-ENF	Refer to prosecutions

Settlements:

2019-000163-IT-ENF	Guidance given to Prosecutor
2019-000547-IT-ENF	Guidance given to Prosecutor

A MOTION was made by Thomas Kokoliadis to adjourn the meeting at 12:01 p.m., seconded by Tracy Sharkey and unanimously agreed to by the Board



Shawn T. Murphy, Executive Director
Board of Real Estate Appraisers

Documents Used in Open Meeting:

Agenda

Draft Minutes of meeting held April 16, 2020

Draft AMC Regulations, 264 CMR 13.00

CORI Policy

Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held on May 21, 2020

Call-in Number:

United States (Toll Free): 1 877 568 4106

Access Code: 550-492-469

9:30 a.m.

Pursuant to Governor Charles D. Baker's Executive Order Suspending Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law, G.L. c. 30A, s. 20, dated March 12, 2020, board members and staff appeared by videoconference.

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*

Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential*

Tracy Sharkey, *Licensed Real Estate Broker* Arrived at 10:15 a.m.

Thomas Kokoliadis, *Banking Member* Arrived around 11:100 a.m.

William McLaughlin, *Certified General Member*

Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*

Matthew Jenkins, *Member*

Administrative Staff Present:

Shawn T. Murphy, *Executive Director*

Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

Colleen Cavanaugh, *Associate Executive Director*

Call to Order – Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 9:36 a.m.

Vote on Minutes: April 16, 2020- A motion was made by Paula Wolfe and seconded by Timothy McDonough after roll call it was so

Voted: To accept the minutes as amended

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew Jenkins, Michael Giannelli

Abstain: Tracy Sharkey

Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

Executive Director Report: Shawn Murphy informed the Board that the board staff continues to work remotely. Board members received comment and discussed operations.

Next Board Meeting:

The next board meeting is scheduled for Thursday, June 18, 2020

Board Counsel's Report to the Board:

Ms. Read informed the Board that the MBREA felt the Board's remote education policy will not be effective when the State of Emergency ends. Ms. Read states that the Policy would be amended to be in effect for 90 days after the State of Emergency is lifted.

Deleted:

Formatted: Indent: First line: 0"

Deleted: ¶

You can also dial in using your phone

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman

Formatted: Font: Not Bold

Formatted: No Spacing, None, Indent: First line: 0"

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: Not Italic

Formatted: Justified

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 0", First line: 0", Tab stops: Not at -2"

Deleted: b

Deleted: during the COVID state of emergency

Deleted: ¶

A MOTION was made by Paula Wolfe and seconded by Timothy McDonough and after roll call it was so ¶

Voted: To accept the minutes of the April 16, 2020 meeting as amended.¶

¶
In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew Jenkins, Michael Giannelli ¶

Abstain: Tracy Sharkey¶

Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

Deleted: ¶

Deleted: b

Deleted: boards

Deleted: item 2 on the list covers this, but she will also

Deleted: it

Deleted: it

Deleted: say it would

Deleted: DRAFT
Deleted: January 16

License Application Report

This list contains the applications that have been reviewed since the last board meeting and their standing.

- Russell Stering – Not approved
- Gregory Caputo – Approved

Deleted: ¶

Course Approval Report

This list contains the applications that have been reviewed since the last board meeting and their standing.

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", No bullets or numbering

Deleted: A MOTION was made by _____ and seconded by _____ to accept the License Application Report, and after roll call it was so ¶
Voted: To accept the License Application Report¶
¶
In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew Jenkins, Michael Giannelli ¶
Abstain: Tracy Sharkey¶
Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis ¶

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	ResFlag	AQB	Recommendations
Appraisal Institute	Appraisal Institute Annual Conference_- Day 1	5	S	E	No	Board Member Approved
Appraisal Institute	Appraisal Institute Annual Conference_- Day 2	5	S	E	No	Board Member Approved
ASFMRA	Appraisal of Water Rights Seminar	8	S	E/NR	No	Board Member Approved
MBREA	MBREA Spring 2020 Conference for Appraisers	7	C	NR	No	Board Member Approved
Hondros Learning LLC	15 Hour National USPAP Equivalency	15	P	USPAP	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Artificial Intelligence, AVMs, and Blockchain: Implications for Valuation - Synchronous	7	S	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Hondros Learning LLC	Covering All of the Bases in Residential Reporting	7	C	R	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Desktop Appraisals (Bifurcated, Hybrid) and Evaluations	7	S	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Measure It Right! – Using the ANSI-Z765-2013 Standard for Residential Properties	4	S	R	Yes	Staff Approved

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Deleted: DRAFT

Deleted: January 16

Hondros Learning LLC	Sales Comparison :A Fresh Approach	7	C	NR	Yes	Staff Annroved
----------------------	---------------------------------------	---	---	----	-----	----------------

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 12 pt

A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough, seconded by Ms. Wolfe, to accept the Course Approval Report, and after roll call it was so

Voted: To accept the Course Approval Report.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew Jenkins, Michael Giannelli

Abstain: Tracy Sharkey

Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

Discussion

- **Screening of Applications under CORI Policy**

A MOTION was made by Timothy McDonough seconded by Paula Wolfe, and after roll call it was so

Voted: To allow board staff and board counsel to review and approve applications having only one conviction for minor motor vehicle offenses older than 10 years.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins, Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey
Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

Formatted: Font: Bold

Deleted: motion

Deleted:

Deleted: with

Deleted: any

Deleted: s

Deleted: and only one offense

- **Draft Regulations for Appraisal Management Companies ("AMC"), 264 CMR 13.00**

After discussion, a MOTION was made by Timothy McDonough seconded by William McLaughlin after roll call it was so

Voted: to approve the draft AMC regulations as presented and authorize Board counsel to revise to accommodate potential amendments to the statute regarding fingerprinting and regulation of companies smaller than the definition of AMC.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins, Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey
Absent: Thomas Kokoliadis

Formatted: Font: Bold

Deleted: motion

Deleted: ,

Deleted: ing

Deleted: C

Deleted: seek approval of either this draft or a draft that would incorporate proposed

Deleted: AMC

Deleted: to remove

Deleted: requirement

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", First line: 0"

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5"

Formatted: Font: Bold

- **Review Board's Existing Regulations 264 CMR 2.00-4.00 & 6.00-12.00**

A MOTION was made by Timothy McDonough seconded by William McLaughlin, and after roll call vote it was so

Voted: to table the review of the regulations. Section 11 will be reviewed at next meeting.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins, Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey, Thomas Kokoliadis

- **Renewing Trainee License**

License lapsed in 2016, she has not renewed 4 times. Thomas Kokoliadis arrived during this discussion.

A **MOTION** was made by Timothy McDonough seconded by William McLaughlin after roll call vote it was so

Voted: to allow licensee to reinstate

In favor: Paula Wolfe, Timothy McDonough, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins, Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey, Thomas Kokoliadis

Deleted: DRAFT

Deleted: January 16

Deleted: t

Deleted: l

Formatted: Font: Bold

Formatted: Font: Bold

Formatted: Font: Bold

Formatted: Tab stops: -2", List tab

Adjourn Public Meeting, Enter Executive Session, and then Enter Investigative Conference (Closed Executive Session under G.L. c. 30A, s.21(a)(1) and Closed Investigative Conference under G.L. c. 112, s. 65C to review cases)

A motion was made by Tracy Sharkey seconded by Paula Wolfe after roll call vote it was so
Voted: to enter into Executive Session, Closed Session under MGL c. 30A, Section 21(a)(1)- Good Moral Character, and thereafter to enter into Investigative Conference, Closed Session under MGL c. 112, s. 65C, and the open meeting of the Board will not resume. The Chair called for a Roll Call vote.

In favor: Paula Wolfe, William McLaughlin, Matthew, Jenkins, Michael Giannelli, Tracy Sharkey, Thomas Kokoliadis

Timothy McDonough has left the meeting.

See separate minutes of Executive Session.

During the closed Investigative Conference, the Board voted to take the following actions:

2019-001017-IT-ENF	Refer to prosecutions
2019-001150-IT-ENF	Refer to prosecutions

Settlements:

<u>2019-000163-IT-ENF</u>	<u>Guidance given to Prosecutor</u>
<u>2019-000547-IT-ENF</u>	<u>Guidance given to Prosecutor</u>

Deleted: ¶

And the open meeting of the Board will not resume, but the Board will meet in closed Executive Session to consider character not competence [closed session pursuant to G.L.c. 112, § 65C], and then would meet in Investigative Conference to make final decisions in cases before the Board. ¶

¶

Formatted: Font: Bold

Formatted: Font: Bold

Formatted: Font: Bold

Deleted: ¶

Deleted: ¶

¶

¶

Formatted: Font: Not Bold

Deleted: h

Formatted: Font: Not Bold

Deleted: ¶

Deleted: ¶

A MOTION was made by Thomas Kokoliadis to adjourn the meeting at 12:01 p.m., seconded by Tracy Sharkey and unanimously agreed to by the Board

Shawn T. Murphy, Executive Director
Board of Real Estate Appraisers

Documents Used in Open Meeting:

Agenda

Draft Minutes of meeting held April 16, 2020

Draft AMC Regulations, 264 CMR 13.00

CORI Policy

Deleted: DRAFT

Deleted: January 16

Deleted: return to Open Session and to

Deleted: ¶
¶

Deleted: Respectfully submitted, ¶
¶
¶

Formatted: Underline

Deleted: ¶

¶
¶
¶
¶
¶
¶

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman, 12 pt

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman