

**Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held April 13, 2023**

Time: 10:30 a.m.

Location: Microsoft Teams

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified*

Residential Appraiser Member

Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking
Member*

Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser
Member*

Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser
Member*

Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*

Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*

Members Not Present:

Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*

William McLaughlin, *Certified General
Appraiser Member*

Administrative Staff Present:

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*

Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

All Board members and staff appeared by videoconference.

- I. Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:35 a.m.
- II. Vote on Minutes of March 9, 2023** – The draft Minutes were not available, no action was taken.
- III. Executive Director’s Report to the Board:** Kristin Mitchell reported to the Board the number of licenses issued since the last meeting and reminded the Board that the Appraisal Subcommittee Auditors will be in Boston in May and attending our May meeting.

Next Board Meeting Date

Full Board Meeting Date: May 11, 2023

- IV. Board Counsel’s Report to the Board** – Board Counsel, Lynn Read, reported to the Board that remote meetings are allowed to continue for the next two years. She also reported that the AMC regulations are moving forward, and they are currently under review with A&F.
- V. License Application -Interview**
 - (a) Shane Raby, Applicant for Certified Residential Appraiser License** – Kristin Mitchell introduced Mr. Raby to the Board then Chair Gianelli explained why they wanted to see him. The Board asked questions as to why he hasn’t logged work experience since 2020 and why he did not complete any appraisals of Multifamily properties. Mr. Raby and his supervisor said he has been working but stopped logging experience hours when he reached the required 1,500 hours of experience and that as a company, they do not work on Multifamily properties. The Board requested an updated log with current appraisals including multifamily properties.

VI. License Application Report: A MOTION was made by Ms. Wolfe to table approvals for license applications. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McDonough and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McDonough – “Yes”.

<u>Applicant</u>	<u>License Type</u>	<u>Last Action Taken</u>
KS	CG	Board Requested More Information
JS	CR	Board Approved
JF	CG	Board Requested More Information
MM	CR	Board Approved
JB	CG	Board Tabled

VII. Education Report: No action taken

<u>Provider Name</u>	<u>Course Name</u>	<u>Hours</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>ResFlag</u>	<u>AQB</u>	<u>Recommendations</u>
The CE Shop	15-Hour National USPAP Course	15	P	USPAP	Yes	Staff Approved
The CE Shop	7 Hour National USPAP Update (Distance Education)	7	C	USPAP	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Basic Appraisal Procedures Synchronous	30	C	R/NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Basic Appraisal Principles	30	P	R/NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Basic Appraisal Procedures	30	P	R/NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Income Approach/Part 1	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Income Approach/Part 2	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15	C	R	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach Synchronous	15	P	R	Yes	Staff Approved
American Society of Appraisers	2023 ASA-IFA Eastern Region Conference	7	C	R/NR/E	No	Board Review
American Society of Appraisers	2023 ASA-IFA Eastern Region Conference - Day 2	7	C	R/NR/E	No	Board Review
ASFMRA	Introduction to Business Valuation for Rural Appraisers	8	S	NR/E	No	Board Review
MBREA	Appraisal Bias – Behind the Headlines	3	S	NR/R	No	Board Review
ASFMRA	Farmer Mac Appraisal Requirements	4	S	NR/E	No	Board Review
ASFMRA	Livestock Ranch Seminar	8	S	NR/E	No	Board Review
ASFMRA	Appraising Ag Facilities: Swine Confinement Seminar	8	S	NR/E	No	Board Review
ASFMRA	Appraising Natural Resources: Oil, Gas and Minerals	8	S	NR/E	No	Board Review
Massachusetts Rhode Island & Maine Chapter of the Appraisal Institute	Maine Real Estate Market & Economic Update 2023	2	C	R/NR	No	Board Review

VIII. Discussion:

- (a) **Supervision Requirements:** Ms. Read advised the Board of the questions that have arisen on applications for higher licenses. The Board discussed supervision requirements briefly and asked the staff to review and place on the May Agenda for further discussion.
- (b) **Practical Applications of Real Estate Appraisal (PAREA) and Board Regulations:** Ms. Read explained to the Board the PAREA reference material presented and the regulations with PAREA amendments as alternative to experience hours. Steve Sousa of MBREA told the Board that PAREA programs may be available this year. He described the development of PAREA programs and that states would accept federal Appraiser Qualifications Board's approval of PAREA programs. There is no prototype to currently view. The Board would like to see concept paper from the AQB. Ms. Read will review the full regulations for effects caused by the addition of PAREA with a new draft for the next meeting.

IX. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated: None.

X. Public Comment: None

XI. Executive Session: None

XII. Quasi-Judicial Session: None

XIII. Complaints and Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C:
At 11:26 p.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Open Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C, and the Board would not go back into Open session except to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McDonough- “Yes”.

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s):
- 2020-001097-IT-ENF – Dismissed with Advisory

Matthew Jenkins left the meeting at 1:00 p.m.

- b. Cases:

Docket	Board Vote
2022-000986-IT-ENF	Dismissed
2022-001064-IT-ENF	Tabled
2022-001065-IT-ENF	Tabled
2022-001173-IT-ENF	Tabled

XIV. Adjourn:

Mr. McDonough made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:39 p.m., seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.
”.

List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:

1. Agenda for meeting of April 13, 2023
2. Application of Shane Raby
3. PAREA Materials:
 - a. AQB Criteria for PAREA
 - b. Draft 264 CMR 5.00 and 6.00

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting held May 11, 2023



Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director
Board of Real Estate Appraisers