

**Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers  
Minutes of the Board Meeting held on July 14, 2022**

**Time: 10:30 a.m.**

**Location: Microsoft Teams**

**Members Present:**

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified Residential Appraiser Member*  
Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking Member*  
William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*  
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*  
Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*

Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*  
Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*

**Administrative Staff Present:**

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*  
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

All Board members and staff appeared by videoconference.

- I. Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:33 a.m.
- II. Vote on Minutes of May 12, 2022** – A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve the minutes of May 12, 2022, as written. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.
- III. Executive Director’s Report to the Board:** Kristin Mitchell reported to the board how many licenses issued since the last meeting.

**Next Board Meeting Date**

Subcommittee Meeting Date: no meeting  
Full Board Meeting Date: September 8, 2022

- IV. Board Counsel’s Report to the Board** – Board Counsel, Lynn Read, reported that there is nothing extra to report other than the agenda items.
- V. Adopt Remote Meeting Procedures** – Ms. Read explained the Attorney General’s requirements for remote meetings when the virtual extension has ended. She requested that the Board accept the Attorney General’s Regulation 940 CMR 29.10. A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept the regulations. The motion was seconded by Ms. Sharkey and unanimously adopted by roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.
- VI. Review Ethics Disclosures** - Ms. Read reviewed with the Board applicable ethics and financial disclosure requirements.

**VII. Executive Order issued June 24, 2022, Protecting Access to Reproductive Health Care Services in the Commonwealth** - Ms. Read explained the executive order and how it pertains to the Board.

**VIII. License Application – Interview of Adnan Salam** - Mr. Salam appeared before the Board with his supervisor for discussion of his hours of experience and whether 50% of his hours were spent on Appraisal Reports for which he prepared at least 75% of the report, as required by the Board’s regulation 264 CMR 5.06(6). A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to have applicant complete and submit 3 more reports completed after July 14, 2022, for review by the board members to accept or reject. The motion was seconded by Ms. Sharkey and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

**IX. License Application Report:** A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept Board Reviewers’ recommendations of approval for license applications. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Sharkey and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

Applicant	License Type	Last Action Taken
MD	CR	Board Approved
JM	CG	Requested More Information
AC	CR	Board Approved
RA	CR	Board Approved
HW	CG	Requested to Invite
MB	CR	Board Approved
HS	CG	Board Approved

**X. Education Report:** A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept Board Reviewers’ recommendations of approval for education report. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Sharkey and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	Res Flag	AQB Appr.	Recommendations
Appraisal Institute	AI Annual Conference, Day 1	5	C	E	N	Board Approved

Appraisal Institute	AI Annual Conference, Day 2	5	C	E	N	Board Approved
Allterra Group LLC	2022 Keynote Vegas	7	C	E	N	Board Approved
Allterra Group LLC	2022 Gold Standard Vegas	7	C	E	N	Board Approved
MBREA	Fair Housing, Bias and Ethics Seminar	3	C	R/NR	N	Board Approved
MA, RI & ME Chapter of Appraisal Institute	Virtual Appraisal Service Vendor Showcase 2022	2	C	R/NR	N	Board Approved
MA, RI & ME Chapter of Appraisal Institute	Maine Real Estate Market & Economic Update – 2022	2	C	R/NR	N	Board Approved
Calypso Continuing Education	Appraising Manufactured Homes in America	7	C	E	N	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Timberland Valuation: A Practical Overview	4	S	E/NR	N	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Square Footage Method for Calculating Single Family Residences	7	S	E/NR	N	Board Approved
McKissock, LP	Live Webinar: Responding to a Reconsideration of Value (ROV)	3	C	E	Y	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuation Modeling Synchronous	15	P	R/NR	Y	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuation Modeling Synchronous	14	C	R/NR/E	Y	Staff Approved

XI. **Discussion:** Nothing to Report

XII. **Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated:** Ms. Read told the board that she drafted guidance for documenting trainee experience. Kristin Mitchell asked the board how to proceed with an application with no Multi-Family on the report log. They stated to request 4, two of each Single Family and Condominium.

**XIII. Public Comment:** Chair Giannelli opened the meeting to public comment. There was nothing to report.

**Complaints and Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C:**

At 11:43 a.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Open Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C, and the Board would not go back into Open session except to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s):
  - 2020-001057-IT-ENF – Gave guidance to Prosecutor
  - 2020-000648-IT-ENF – Gave guidance to Prosecutor
  - 2020-000684-IT-ENF – Gave guidance to Prosecutor

b. Investigative Conference:

<b>Docket</b>	<b>Board Vote</b>
2022-000402-IT-ENF	Dismiss
2022-000451-IT-ENF	Return to Investigations
2022-000510-IT-ENF	Forward to Prosecutions

**Thomas Kokoliadis and William McLaughlin left the meeting at 1:00 p.m.**

**XIV. Adjourn:**

Ms. Sharkey made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:10 p.m., seconded by Mr. McDonough and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

**List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:**

- 1. Agenda for meeting of July 14, 2022
- 2. Draft Minutes of meeting held May 12, 2022

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting held September 8, 2022



---

Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director  
Board of Real Estate Appraisers