

**Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held on May 12, 2022**

Time: 10:30 a.m.

Location: Microsoft Teams

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking Member*
William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*

Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*
Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*

Administrative Staff Present:

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

All Board members and staff appeared by videoconference.

- I. Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:33 a.m.
- II. Vote on Minutes of March 10, 2022** – A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve the minutes of March 10, 2022, as written. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.
- III. Executive Director’s Report to the Board:** Kristin Mitchell reported to the board how many licenses issued since the last meeting.

Next Board Meeting Date

Subcommittee Meeting Date: June 9, 2022

Full Board Meeting Date: July 14, 2022

- IV. Board Counsel’s Report to the Board** – Board Counsel, Lynn Read, reported that remote Open Meetings have been extended until July 15, 2022 to allow time for permanent extension to be enacted.
- V. License Application – Interview of Paul LaPointe** - Mr. LaPointe appeared before the Board with his supervisor Maria Hopkins for discussion of his hours of experience and whether 50% of his hours were spent on Appraisal Reports for which he prepared at least 75% of the report, as required by the Board’s regulation 264 CMR 5.06(6). A MOTION was made by Mr. Kokoliadis to have applicant complete and submit log another 150 hours of work experience to be reviewed again. The motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

Tracey Sharkey Left the meeting at 11:07 A.M.

VI. License Application Report: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept Board Reviewers’ recommendations of approval for license applications. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Sharkey and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

Applicant	License Type	Last Action Taken
SM	CR	Board Approved
SK	CG	Board Approved
JL	CR	Board Approved
TH	CR	Board Approved
MA	LA	Board Approved
AS	CG	Requested to Invite

VII. Education Report: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept Board Reviewers’ recommendations of approval for education report. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Sharkey and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	Res Flag	AQB Appr.	Recommendations
MA, RI & MA Chap. of Appraisal Institute	The 50% FEMA Rule Appraisal	3	C	R/NR	N	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Timberland Valuation for Foresters & Rural Appraisers	8	S	E/NR	N	Board Approved
ASFMRA	AGWare Back to Basics	7	S	E/NR	N	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Valuing Livestock Facilities: Dairy Farms Seminar	8	S	E/NR	N	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Drainage Considerations for Managers & Appraisers	4	S	E/NR	N	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Appraising Ag Facilities: Feedlot Seminar	8	S	E/NR	N	Board Approved

ASFMRA	Barn-Dominium/Shouse/Shome - What Is It and What It's Not	4	S	E/NR	N	Board Approved
MA, RI & ME Chapter of Appraisal Institute	Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent	4	C	NR/R	N	Board Approved
Appraisal Institute	Practical Applications of Fundamental Analysis	7	C	E	Y	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Expand Your Practice: Arbitration Do's and Dont's	7	C	E	Y	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Rapid Response: Market Analysis in Volatile Markets	7	C	E	Y	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	General Appraiser Report Writing & Case Studies	28	C	NR/R	Y	Staff Approved
Appraiser e-learning LLC	2022-2023 7 Hour USPAP Update Course	7	C	USPAP	Y	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Residential Property Measurement and ANSI Z765	4	C	E	Y	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Valuation Overview of Accessory Dwelling Units	7	C	E/R	Y	Staff Approved
ACEI dba Calypso Continuing Education	2022-2023 7 Hour Equivalent USPAP Update Course	7	C	NR/R/E	Y	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Learning From the Mistakes of Others: Appraisal Disciplinary Case Studies	3	C	E	Y	Staff Approved

VIII. Discussion:

- (a) **Can Education from University of South Carolina be Used for Trainee Primary Education:** The Board denied the request based on regulations because the educational program was not approved.
- (b) **Solomon Book of Adjustments:** Ms. Wolfe spoke to the board as to why she asked for this to be on the agenda. No formal action taken.

IX. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated: Mr. Kokoliadis said educators should guide students on typical problems in appraisal reports that are the subjects of complaints to the

Board. Steve Sousa asked the Board for a guidance memo on typical errors with a reminder to consult the regulations. The Board discussed supervisor training.

- X. **Public Comment:** Chair Giannelli opened the meeting to public comment. There was nothing to report.

Complaints and Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C:

At 11:52 a.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Open Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C, and the Board would not go back into Open session except to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s):
2020-001057-IT-ENF – Gave guidance to Prosecutor
- b. Investigative Conference:

Docket	Board Vote
2022-000102-IT-ENF	Forward to Prosecutions
2022-000123-IT-ENF	Dismiss with Advisory
2022-000214-IT-ENF	Forward to Prosecutions
2022-000237-IT-ENF	Forward to Prosecutions

XI. **Adjourn:**

Mr. Kokoliadis made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:13 p.m., seconded by Mr. McDonough and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough- “Yes”.

List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:

1. Agenda for meeting of May 12, 2022
2. Draft Minutes of meeting held March 10, 2022

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting held July 14, 2022



Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director
Board of Real Estate Appraisers