

**Massachusetts Board of Registration of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held November 14, 2024**

Time: 10:00 a.m.

Location: Microsoft Teams

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser Member*
William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*
Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*

Members Not Present:

Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking Member*
Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*

Administrative Staff Present:

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

Board members, staff, and members of the public appeared by video conference.

- I. Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:17 a.m.
- II. Vote on Minutes of October 10, 2024**– After brief discussion, a MOTION was made by Mr. McLaughlin to approve the draft minutes of the open meetings held September 12, 2024, as written. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough- “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”.
- III. DOL Report of Executive Director and Board Counsel:** Kristin Mitchell reported to the Board that there were 23 licenses/permits issued since the last meeting. She informed the Board how the AARO conference went. Also asked the board to confirm the 2025 schedule. Ms. Mitchell also informed the board and public of the agency’s move in March 2025. Lynn Read updated the board on the status of the draft regulations.

Next Board Meeting Dates

Subcommittee - December 12, 2024

Full Meeting – January 9, 2025

- IV. License Application Report:** A MOTION was made by Ms. Wolfe to ratify reviewers’ decisions for License Applications. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough- “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”.

<u>Applicant</u>	<u>License Type</u>	<u>Last Action Taken</u>
DL	CR	Board Approved
JM	CG	Board Tabled

- V. Education Report:** A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to ratify reviewers' decisions for Education applications. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough- “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”.

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	ResFlag	AQB	Online	Recommendations
MBREA	Commercial & Residential Real Estate Trends with Industry Leaders	3	CE	R/NR	No	No	Board Approved
McKissock, LP	Live Webinar: Navigating AI-Transformative Tools for Appraisers	4	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Live Webinar: Unlocking Valuation Conditions - Desktop & Hybrid Appraisals	4	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Performing Divorce Appraisals	3	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Performing Estate Appraisals	3	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Navigating AI-Transformative Tools for Appraisers	4	CE	E	Yes	No	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Unlocking Valuation Conditions - Desktop & Hybrid Appraisals	4	CE	E	Yes	No	Staff Approved
Appraiser eLearning	Appraising Complex Properties with Unique Characteristics	3.5	CE	NR/R/E	No	Yes	Board Approved
McKissock, LP	Expert Witness Testimony Basics for Appraisers	4	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved

VI. Discussion:

- (a) **Draft Regulations 264 CMR 13.00:** Ms. Read presented to the Board the draft regulations for consideration. She explained the changes made to 264 CMR 13.00. After a brief discussion a MOTION was made by Ms. Wolfe to accept the draft regulations 264 CMR 13.00 as amended conditional upon review by Matthew Jenkins- AMC Member. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough- “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”.

- (b) **Training Logs and Federally Related Transactions:** Tabled

- (c) **Draft Announcement on Continuing Education for Reinstatement:** MOTION to table and keep on next agenda made by Mr. McDonough, second by Mr. McLaughlin. The motion was unanimously adopted by a roll call vote:

Giannelli – “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough- “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes;”
McLaughlin – “Yes”.

VII. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated: Nothing to report

VIII. Executive Session (Closed Session) To discuss individuals’ character, rather than competence (M.G.L. c. 30A, § 21(a)(1)) and/or to comply with the public records law pursuant to G.L. c. 66, § 10 and G.L. c. 4, § 7, ¶ 26(c) to protect highly personal information relating to a named individual (M.G.L. c. 30A, § 21(a)(7): A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit the public meeting and enter Closed Executive Session at 10:50 a.m., after which the Board would enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C and would not return to open session. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough- “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes”.

- See separate Minutes of Executive Session

IX. Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Closed Executive Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C at 11:04 a.m. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough- “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes”.

The following actions were taken by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s):
 - i. 2022-001065-IT-ENF – Gave Guidance to Prosecutor
 - ii. 2024-000359-IT-ENF - Gave Guidance to Prosecutor and Staff
- b. Discussion of complaints prior to the issuance of an order to show cause:
 - i. 2024-000677-IT-ENF: Dismiss with Advisory
 - ii. 2024-000599-IT-ENF: Forward to Prosecutions
 - iii. 2024-000598-IT-ENF: Forward to Prosecutions
 - iv. 2024-000479-IT-ENF: Forward to Prosecutions

Mr. McDonough left the meeting at 12:00 PM

- c. Discussion of Potential Complaints from Fannie Mae: Table and Filed materials submitted

X. Adjourn:

Ms. Wolfe made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:10 p.m., seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes”.

The above Minutes were approved at the Open
Meeting held January 9, 2025

A handwritten signature in dark ink, reading "Kristin Mitchell". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style. The first name "Kristin" is written with a large, stylized 'K' and 'M'. The last name "Mitchell" is written in a similar cursive style. The signature is positioned above a horizontal line.

Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director
Board of Registration of Real Estate Appraisers

List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:

1. Agenda for meeting of November 14, 2024
2. Draft Minutes of October 10, 2024
3. License applications for examination of Dominic LaChance and Jake Mucci
4. Draft Regulations 264 CMR 13.00