

**Massachusetts Board of Registration of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held March 14, 2024**

Time: 10:30 a.m.

Location: Microsoft Teams

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking Member*
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*
Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*

William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

Members Not Present:

Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*
Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

Administrative Staff Present:

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

Board members, staff, and members of the public appeared by videoconference.

I. Call to Order – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:35 a.m.

Vote on Minutes of January 11, 2024 – After brief discussion, a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve the minutes of the open meeting held January 11, 2024, as written. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes.”

Matthew Jenkins arrived at 10:39 am.

II. DOL Report of Executive Director and Board Counsel: Kristin Mitchell reported to the Board that there were 34 licenses/permits issued since the last meeting. Lynn Read reported to the Board that the regulations are still being reviewed and updated and will be on the agenda for an upcoming meeting.

Next Board Meeting Date

Subcommittee Meeting Date: April 11, 2024

Full Board Meeting Date: May 9, 2024

III. License Application Report: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept reviewers’ decision for License applications and to change the April 11, 2024, subcommittee meeting to a full board meeting. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes.”

Applicant	License Type	Last Action Taken
MH	CG	Board Approved
SK	CR	Invite to Board Meeting
MP	CR	Board Approved
JN	CR	Board Approved
GN	LA	Board Approved
PM	CR	Invite to Board Meeting
PL	CR	Invite to Board Meeting
ON	CG	Invite to Board Meeting
JD	CG	Invite to Board Meeting

IV. Education Report: A MOTION was made by Mr. Kokoliadis to accept reviewers’ decision for Education applications. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes.”

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	ResFlag	AQB	Online	Recommendations
Appraisal Institute	Online Appraising Residential Property on Tribal Lands in Closed Market Areas	4	CE	R/E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	2024 15-Hour National USPAP Course	15	QE	USPAP	Yes	No	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Appraising Complex and Stigmatized Residential Properties	7	CE	E	Yes	No	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Live Webinar: 2024-2025 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course	7	CE	USPAP	Yes	No	Staff Approved
MBREA	2024-2025 7-Hour USPAP Update Course for Mass Appraisal	7	CE	USPAP	Yes	No	Staff Approved
North Central MA Association of REALTORS	2024-2025 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course	7	CE	USPAP	Yes	No	Staff Approved
American Continuing Education Institute, Ltd	2024-2025 7-Hour USPAP Equivalency Course	7	CE	USPAP	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	2024 15-Hour Equivalent USPAP Course	15	QE	USPAP	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	2024 15-hr National USPAP Course	15	QE	USPAP	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Live Webinar: 2024 15-Hour National USPAP Update Course	15	QE	USPAP	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraiser eLearning	2024 Appraiser Conference and Tradeshow (ACTS) - Day 1	7	CE-S	E	No	No	Board Approved
Appraiser eLearning	2024 Appraiser Conference and Tradeshow (ACTS) - Day 2	7	CE-S	E	No	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	AgWare – ClickForms & DataLog 101.5	4	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Understanding Conservation Easements Valuation	8	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved

ASFMRA	Market Area and Industry Analysis	8	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Appraising Agricultural Land in Transition	8	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Introduction to Native American Real Estate Appraisal	4	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved

V. Discussion:

- (a) **Reinstatement Requirements:** Mr. McLaughlin opened the discussion of requests he has received to “streamline” the reinstatement requirements and process. After a brief discussion Lynn Read will review the Appraiser Qualifications Board (aqb) requirements on reinstatement and will report to the Board at an upcoming meeting.
- (b) **Potential Elimination of “Seminar” Designation for CE Courses:** After a brief discussion A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough for the Executive Director to remove the seminar application from the online portal for new submissions. Any existing Seminar courses approved, or open application will remain classified as Seminars. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes.”

VI. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated: Lynn Read introduced to the Board the new Q&A’s from the Appraiser Qualifications Board regarding personal inspection of property.

VII. Public Comment: Chair opened the floor to the public. Steven Sousa asked the Board to consider removing the Residential Flag, NR/R/E, distinction from approvals of continuing education courses, as no other state has them. Lynn Read will look into it.

VIII. Executive Session: None

IX. Quasi-Judicial Session CLOSED per M.G.L. c. 30A, § 18(d): At 11: 22 a.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Open Session and enter Closed Quasi-Judicial Session under M.G.L. c. 30A, § 18(d). The motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes.”

- i. 2023-000207-IT-ENF: Board decided terms of Final Decision and Order

X. Complaints and Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Closed Quasi-Judicial Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C. The motion was seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes.”

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s)
 - i. 2022-001065-IT-ENF: Gave Guidance to Prosecutor
 - ii. 2023-000276-IT-ENF: Gave Guidance to Prosecutor
 - iii. 2023-000505-IT-ENF: Gave Guidance to Prosecutor
 - iv. 2023-000508-IT-ENF: Gave Guidance to Prosecutor
- b. Discussion of complaints prior to the issuance of an order to show cause
 - i. 2023-000698-IT-ENF: Dismissed
 - ii. 2023-000827-IT-ENF: Dismissed
 - iii. 2023-000855-IT-ENF: Dismissed with advisory

XI. Adjourn:

Mr. McDonough made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 12:58 p.m., seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes.”

List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:

1. Agenda for meeting of March 14, 2024
2. Draft Minutes of January 11, 2024
3. Q&A from Appraiser Qualifications Board

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting held May 9, 2024



Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director
Board of Registration of Real Estate Appraisers