

**Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held April 11, 2024**

Time: 10:30 a.m.

Location: Microsoft Teams

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking Member*
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser Member*
William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*

Members Not Present:

Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*
Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*

Administrative Staff Present:

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

Board members, staff and members of the public appeared by videoconference.

- I. **Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:38 a.m.
- II. **Vote on Minutes of March 14, 2024** – The draft Minutes were not available, no action was taken.
- III. **License Application -Interview**
 - (a) **Shalauddin Khan, Applicant for Certified Residential Appraiser License** –Chair Gianelli explained why the Board wanted to see him. Mr. Kokoliadis stated consistency is needed between what is checked off then what is written. The cloning of reports is causing confusion on the territories he is working. The Board discussed locational competence as well as how to label credentials. After a brief discussion a MOTION was made by Mr. Kokoliadis to approve to move forward with the process. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McDonough and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes;” Dicks- “Yes.”
 - (b) **Paul Michaud, Applicant for Certified Residential Appraiser License** - Chair Gianelli explained why they wanted to see him. Mr. Giannelli asked him how long he was an appraiser and why there were no original photos for comparable properties; they used MLS photos. Mr. Michaud stated that they drive by but do not take the photos based on lenders needs/requests. Mr. Gianelli strongly suggested to take comp photos so the report is not contradictory. He also mentioned they need to review how to list/show credentials on reports. After a brief discussion a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve to move forward with the process. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes;” Dicks- “Yes.”

- (c) **Paul LaPointe, Applicant for Certified Residential Appraiser License** - Chair Gianelli explained why they wanted to see him. Mr. Giannelli stated the discussion of a comparable could insinuate a double adjustment. On the another Report, the value exceeds the market value. Mr. Gianelli asked why he thinks the value was justified and why didn't they use a closer comparable(s) that were available. Mr. LaPoint explained how they concluded the value and that the other comps were inadequate to the upgrades on original property. Mr. Lapointe's supervisor, Maria Hopkins, stated that it may not have been within the neighborhood boundaries. Mr. Giannelli pointed out there are contradictory comments and Mr. LaPointe said he will be more mindful of this. Ms. Wolfe mentioned her concerns on market conditions being labeled on the report and how it is important not to contradict market conditions in reports. Mr. Kokoliadis asked if he is signing the reports and if he is doing them. Mr. LaPointe and Ms. Hopkins explained the lenders want Maria Hopkins' signature as the appraiser for hire. After a brief discussion a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve to move forward with the process. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Dicks and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes;” Dicks- “Yes.”
- (d) **Owen Nally, Applicant for Certified General Appraiser License** – Mr. McLaughlin explained why they wanted to see him and stated the certificate does not identify he completed the work. Mr. McLaughlin asked for one new report that shows the corrections. After a brief discussion a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to table until receipt of a new report. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes;” Dicks- “Yes.”
- (e) **Jason Dono, Applicant for Certified General Appraiser License** – Mr. Dicks explained what their concerns are with the scope of work, the analysis of the property and the comparable properties, and the income approach. Mr. Dicks asked are there any other work he can do other than right of way. Mr. Dono stated he does mainly right of way. The Board asked him to submit the report he mentioned that was originally to be a convenience store but ended up being full retail. After a brief discussion a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to table until receipt of a new log with reports identified for review. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Dicks and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes;” Dicks- “Yes.”

IV. Education Report: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept reviewers' decision for Education applications. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes;” Dicks- “Yes.”

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	ResFlag	AQB	Online	Recommendation
ASFMRA	Principles of Permanent Planting Valuation	8	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	The Appraisers as an Expert Witness	8	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved

ASFMRA	Farm and Ranch Succession, Estate, and Continuity Planning	8	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Rural Sales Analysis and Confirmation	8	CE-S	E/NR	No	No	Board Approved

V. Discussion:

(a) **Continuing Education Requirements for Reinstatement:** Ms. Read reported to the Board that this will need to be tabled until May as she is still looking into the requirements. Mr. Dicks advised that the State of Wisconsin allows proof from other states to reinstate if Ms. Read wants to reach out to them.

VI. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated: None.

VII. Public Comment: None

VIII. Executive Session: None

IX. Quasi-Judicial Session: None

X. Complaints and Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C:
 At 12:30 p.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. Dicks to exit Open Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C, and the Board would not go back into Open session except to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Mr. McDonough and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes;” Dicks- “Yes.”

Timothy McDonough left the meeting at 12:49 p.m.

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s):
 - Nothing to report.
- b. Cases:

Docket	Board Vote
2023-000855-IT-ENF	Dismissed with Advisory
2024-000098-IT-ENF	Tabled

XI. Adjourn:

Mr. Kokoliadis made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:28 p.m., seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” McLaughlin – “Yes;” Dicks- “Yes.”

List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:

1. Agenda for meeting of April 11, 2024
2. Application of Shalauddin Khan
3. Application of Paul Michaud
4. Application of Paul LaPointe
5. Application of Owen Nally
6. Application of Jason Dono
- 7.

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting held May 9, 2024

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Kristin Mitchell". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looping initial "K".

Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director
Board of Real Estate Appraisers