

**Massachusetts Board of Registration of Real Estate Appraisers  
Minutes of the Board Meeting held May 9, 2024**

**Time: 10:30 a.m.**

**Location: Microsoft Teams**

**Members Present:**

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified Residential Appraiser Member*  
Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking Member*  
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*  
Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*  
Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*

Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

**Members Not Present:**

Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*  
William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

**Administrative Staff Present:**

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*  
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

Board members, staff, and members of the public appeared by videoconference.

- I. Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:33 a.m.
- II. Vote on Minutes of March 14, 2024 and April 11, 2024**– After brief discussion, a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve the draft minutes of the open meetings held March 14, 2024, and April 11, 2024, as written. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes.”
- III. DOL Report of Executive Director and Board Counsel:** Kristin Mitchell reported to the Board that there were 34 licenses/permits issued since the last meeting. Lynn Read reported to the Board that she has nothing extra to report that is not already on the agenda.

**Next Board Meeting Date**

Subcommittee Meeting Date: June 13, 2024

Full Board Meeting Date: July 11, 2024

- IV. License Application Report:** After discussion, a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept Joseph Izzo’s License application for examination. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes.”

After discussion, a MOTION was made by Mr. Kokoliadis to table Kathleen Foster’s License application and request a new log in three (3) months with a minimum of 12 Reports for new reports to be chosen for review. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McDonough and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes.”

- V. Education Report:** A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept reviewers' decision for Education applications. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Wolfe and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes.”

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	ResFlag	AQB	Online	Recommendations
ASFMRA	Income Approach for General Appraisers Part II (A330)	30	QE	NR	Yes	No	Staff Approved
ASFMRA	Income Approach for General Appraisers Part II (A330)	27	CE	E	Yes	No	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Live Webinar: Appraising 2-4 Unit Residences	7	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Appraising 2-4 Unit Residences	7	CE	E	Yes	No	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Appraising 2-4 Unit Residences	7	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Live Webinar: Navigating Essential Tools for Real Estate Appraisal	4	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Navigating Essential Tools for Real Estate Appraisal	4	CE	E	Yes	Yes	Staff Approved
ASFMRA	General Appraisal Report Writing and Case Studies (A350)	30	QE	NR	Yes	No	Staff Approved
ASFMRA	General Appraisal Report Writing and Case Studies (A350)	28	CE	NR/E	Yes	No	Staff Approved
ASFMRA	Introduction to Statistical Analysis for Appraisers (A200)	15	QE	R/NR	Yes	No	Staff Approved
ASFMRA	Introduction to Statistical Analysis for Appraisers (A200)	14	CE	NR/E	Yes	No	Staff Approved
MBREA	Commercial Valuation Case Studies & Issues	7	CE	NR/R	No	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Appraising Ag Facilities: Poultry Seminar	8	CE	E	No	No	Board Approved
MA, RI & ME Chapter of Appraisal Institute	the Multifamily Market and the impact of the MBTA Communities Act.	2	CE	NR/R	No	No	Board Approved

**VI. Discussion:**

- (a) **Summer Board Meeting Schedule:** Kristin Mitchell and Lynn Read explained why the schedule may need to be updated and procedures for subcommittee meetings. The Board decided to leave schedule as is.
- (b) **Continuing Education Requirements for Reinstatement:** the Board agreed to Ms. Read's request to table this matter until a future meeting.

**VII. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated:** Lynn Read introduced the article on Fair Housing and Appraisal Bias.

**VIII. Public Comment:** Chair opened the floor to the public. Steven Sousa went into detail on the article on Fair Housing & appraisal bias in the Boston area, as he was quoted in the article. He also asked if courses can be approved by the Subcommittee outside of a full board meeting. Lynn Read stated yes, but the Subcommittee meetings must be posted. Teresa MacNutt asked to confirm how many licenses were issued and which courses were approved, and she thanked Steven Sousa for the article.

**IX. Executive Session:** None

- X. **Quasi-Judicial Session CLOSED per M.G.L. c. 30A, § 18(d)**: At 11:25 a.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Open Session and enter Closed Quasi-Judicial Session under M.G.L. c. 30A, § 18(d). The motion was seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes.”

i. 2023-000507-IT-ENF: Board decided terms of Final Decision and Order

- XI. **Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C**: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Closed Quasi-Judicial Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C. The motion was seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” McDonough – “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes.”

Timothy McDonough left the meeting at 12:45 pm.

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s)  
i. 2023-001047-CP-ENF: Gave Guidance to Executive Director
- b. Discussion of complaints prior to the issuance of an order to show cause  
i. 2024-000072-IT-ENF: Dismissed  
ii. 2024-000098-IT-ENF: Forward to Prosecutions

XII. **Adjourn:**

Mr. Kokoliadis made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:23 p.m., seconded by Mr. Dicks and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes;” Kokoliadis– “Yes;” Wolfe – “Yes;” Jenkins- “Yes;” Dicks – “Yes.”

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting  
held July 11, 2024



Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director  
Board of Registration of Real Estate Appraisers

**List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:**

1. Agenda for meeting of May 9, 2024
2. Draft Minutes of March 14, 2024 and April 11, 2024
3. License application for examination of Joseph Izzo and Kathleen Foster
4. “Why appraisal bias lingers in Black neighborhoods,” Boston Globe, May 5, 2024