

**Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held July 13, 2023**

Time: 10:30 a.m.

Location: Microsoft Teams

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser Member*
Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*
Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*
Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*
William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

Members Not Present:

Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking Member*

Administrative Staff Present:

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

All Board members and staff appeared by videoconference.

- I. Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:34 a.m.
- II. Vote on Minutes of May 11, 2023** – After brief discussion, a MOTION was made by Mr. McLaughlin to approve the minutes of the open meetings held May 11, 2023 as written. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”; McLaughlin – “Yes”.
- III. Executive Director’s Report to the Board:** Kristin Mitchell reported to the Board the number of licenses issued since the last meeting. She also reminded the Board of the upcoming hearing regarding the Woolf matter on August 16 & 17, 2023.

Next Board Meeting Date

Full Board Meeting Date: September 14, 2023

Timothy McDonough arrived at 10:41 am

- IV. Board Counsel’s Report to the Board** – Board Counsel, Lynn Read, reported to the Board that AMC regulations are moving forward, and they are currently under review with the Secretary of Administration and Finance.

Kenneth Dicks arrived at 10:48 am

- V. License Application – Interviews**
 - (a) Scott Saveriano – CG** – Board Counsel, Lynn Read informed the Board that the Applicant has requested to withdraw his application.

VI. Jason Fenlason – CG - Board Chair Michael Giannelli introduced Mr. Fenlason to the Board and Kenneth Dicks explained to the applicant why he was asked to be before the Board. Mr. Dicks asked clarifying questions regarding his reports.

A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to allow applicant to move forward with the process. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

VII. License Application Report: A MOTION was made by Ms. Wolfe to accept reviewers’ decision for license applications. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

<u>Applicant</u>	<u>License Type</u>	<u>Last Action Taken</u>
GS	CG	Board Approved
JB	CG	Board Approved
JF	CR	Board Approved
JM	CR	Board Approved
JB	CR	Board Approved
KS	CG	Board Requested Further Information
RB	CR	Board Approved
SH	LA	Board Approved
SR	CR	Board Approved
YS	CR	Board Approved
HW	CG	Board Approved

VIII. Education Report: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept reviewers’ decision for Education applications. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

<u>Provider Name</u>	<u>Course Name</u>	<u>Hours</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>ResFlag</u>	<u>AQB</u>	<u>Recommendations</u>
McKissock, LP	GSE Appraisal Requirements and Guidelines	7	C	E	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30	P	R	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	15	P	R	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	VA Appraisal Requirements and Guidelines	7	C	E	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30	C	R	Yes	Staff Approved
ASFMRA	Online Basic Appraisal Principles (A101)	30	P	R/NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraiser eLearning LLC	2023 UAD Redesign Vegas	7	C	NR/R/E	No	Board Approved
Storyboard	2023 Market Conditions	7	C	NR/R/E	No	Board Approved

Appraisal Institute	Community Land Trust (CLT) Appraisal Training	4	C	R	No	Board Approved
Green Mountain eLearning	Cultural Competency and Elimination of Bias	3	C	R/NR/E	No	Board Approved
Appraiser eLearning LLC	Non-Lending Appraisals: Expanding Your Appraisal Practice	7	C	R/NR/E	No	Board Approved
Appraiser eLearning LLC	Ultimate Workfile: What, When, Why	4	C	R/NR/E	No	Board Approved
Appraiser eLearning LLC	2023 Appraisal Summit – Day 1	7	C	E	No	Board Approved
Appraiser eLearning LLC	2023 Appraisal Summit – Day 2	7	C	E	No	Board Approved
MBREA	Appraisal Metrics: Adapting to the AVM World	3	C	R/NR	No	Board Approved
OREP	Appraiser Liability and Risk Management	7	C	E	No	Board Approved
Appraiser eLearning LLC	Top 15 Takeaways from Your Colleagues' Legal Misfortunes	3	C	R/NR/E	No	Board Approved

IX. Discussion:

- (a) **CORI Policy:** Ms. Read presented the Board with a Draft Policy for review of CORI (Criminal Offender Record Information). The Board requested to table the discussion for full complement to be present.
- (b) **Review Draft Regulations addressing PAVE Dashboard and PAREA Requirements:** Ms. Read presented draft regulations the incorporate PAREA and the PAVE Dashboard initiative. Ms. Read explained to the Board the PAVE initiative stating the AQB/ASC went through all states regulations and highlighted where requirements were higher than Federal minimum. She said the suggestion is to lower standards to match.

A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to table discussion. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

- X. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated:** Ms. Read informed the Board that we are trying to help an applicant who took Continuing Education courses instead of the mandatory Qualification Education versions. She is working with the provider to see if they will allow her to take the exams to make up the difference. She asked the Board if they would accept this education if the provider allowed it. The members stated they would be open to it. Mr. Dicks will work with Lynn.

- XI. Public Comment:** Chair opened the floor to the public. Scott Dibiasio from the Appraisal Institute informed the Board that the Appraisal Institute will allow applicant to take the exams for the continuing education courses she took with them if it was completed within one year.

Applicant Kevin Sullivan asked the Board about his application. Mr. McLaughlin advised he is reviewing the application and will notify the Executive Director of the decision. Ms. Mitchell advised she will be in touch.

Steven Sousa told the Board that no other state has the classification of NR/R/E and asked if they would consider removing that as a part of the regulation review.

XII. Executive Session: None

XIII. Quasi-Judicial Session CLOSED per M.G.L. c. 30A, § 18(d):

At 11:50 a.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. Giannelli to exit Open Session and enter Closed Quasi-Judicial session under M.G.L. c. 30A, § 18(d) to make a decision in an adjudicatory proceeding, and the Board would then enter Closed Investigative Conference and would not go back into Open session except to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Mr. McDonough and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

2020-001669-IT-ENF – Board decided terms of Final Decision and Order

XIV. Complaints and Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C:

At 12:50 a.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Open Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C. The motion was seconded by Mr. Dicks and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s): **None**
- b. Cases:

Docket	Board Vote
2022-001078-IT-ENF	Tabled
2023-000277-IT-ENF	Referred to Prosecutions
2023-000207-IT-ENF	Referred to Prosecutions

XV. Adjourn:

Mr. Dicks made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:26 p.m., seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes”; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:

- 1. Agenda for meeting of July 13, 2023
- 2. Draft Minutes of May 11, 2023

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting
held September 14, 2023

A handwritten signature in dark ink, reading "Kristin Mitchell". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, stylized "K" and "M".

Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director
Board of Real Estate Appraisers