

**Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers
Minutes of the Board Meeting held January 12, 2023**

Time: 10:30 a.m.

Location: Microsoft Teams

Members Present:

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking Member*
Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser Member*
Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*
Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser Member*
Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*

Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*
William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

Members Not Present:

Administrative Staff Present:

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*
Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

All Board members and staff appeared by videoconference.

- I. Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:33 a.m.
- II. Vote on Minutes of November 10, 2022** – A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve the minutes of September 8, 2022, as written. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McLaughlin – “Yes”, McDonough- “Yes”.
- III. Executive Director’s Report to the Board:** Kristin Mitchell reported to the Board the number of licenses issued since the last meeting and asked board members if any were able to attend upcoming hearings.
 - i. 2020-000526-IT-ENF – March 28-29, 2023: Mr. Giannelli volunteered to attend.

Next Board Meeting Date

Subcommittee Meeting Date: February 9, 2023

Full Board Meeting Date: March 9, 2023

- IV. Board Counsel’s Report to the Board** – Board Counsel, Lynn Read, reported that all legal matter will be covered in discussion of the agenda items.
- V. License Application Report:** A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept Board Reviewers’ recommendations of approval for license applications. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McLaughlin – “Yes”, McDonough- “Yes”.

Applicant	License Type	Last Action Taken
BB	CR	Board Approved
BH	LA	Board Approved
AK	CR	Board Approved

VI. Education Report: A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept Board Reviewers' recommendations of approval for the education report. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McLaughlin – “Yes”, McDonough- “Yes”.

Provider Name	Course Name	Hours	Type	Res Flag	AQB Appr.	Recommendations
McKissock, LP	Live Webinar: Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use	15	P	R	Y	Staff Approved
MBREA	Breakfast with the Experts How to Protect Yourself in a Litigious, Complaint Driven Environment	3	S	NR/R	N	Board Approved
MA, RI & ME Chapter of the Appraisal Institute	Economic Outlook and Real Estate Trends 2023	2	C	NR/R	N	Board Approved
MA, RI & ME Chapter of the Appraisal Institute	Appraising for the Appellate Tax Board – Expand Your Scope of Services	4	C	NR/R	N	Board Approved
American Continuing Education Institute, Ltd	Acquainting Ourselves with the ANSI Standard: Measuring Residential Properties Properly	7	C	E	N	Board Approved

Tracey Sharkey Entered at 10:44 am

VII. Discussion:

(a) **Fair Housing Issues:** Ms. Read discussed upcoming amendment incorporating anti-bias measures into the USPAP Ethics Rule and advised that a potential complaint must be discussed in closed Investigative Conference. A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to table until Investigative Conference. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McLaughlin – “Yes”, McDonough- “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”.

(b) Draft on Extension of 2020-21 USPAP and Requirement to Take 7-Hour USPAP Every Renewal Cycle: Ms. Read presented the draft guidance, Board members reviewed it and requested an amendment. A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve the draft as amended. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McLaughlin – “Yes”, McDonough- “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”.

VIII. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated: None.

IX. Public Comment: Chair Giannelli opened the meeting to public comment. Joseph Comperchio asked if specific courses were approved. Ms. Mitchell said yes. Steve Sousa gave an update on PAREA programs in development. Ms. Read will draft a policy or regulation on PAREA. Allan Cohen asked if the potential fair housing complaint could cause issues for appraisers. Ms. Read said we cannot discuss at this time. Attorney Gail Sullivan asked about an appraiser on probation and what can or cannot do. Ms. Read answered her questions.

Complaints and Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C:
At 11:05 a.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Open Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C, and the Board would not go back into Open session except to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Ms. Sharkey and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McLaughlin – “Yes”, McDonough- “Yes”; Sharkey – “Yes”.

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s):
- 2022-000237-IT-ENF– Dismissed
 - 2018-000743-IT-ENF – Gave Guidance to Staff
 - 2020-000082-IT-ENF – Dismissed with Advisory
 - 2020-000526-IT-ENF – Tabled for subcommittee

Kenneth Dicks left at 12:06 p.m.

Tracey Sharkey left at 12:52 p.m.

Thomas Kokoliadis left at 12:54 p.m.

b. Cases:

Docket	Board Vote
2022-000909-IT-ENF	Tabled for subcommittee
Potential Complaint	Tabled for Subcommittee

X. Adjourn:

Mr. McDonough made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:00 p.m., seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McLaughlin – “Yes”, McDonough- “Yes”.

List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:

1. Agenda for meeting of January 12, 2023
2. Draft Minutes of meeting held November 10, 2022
3. Materials for Courses ## 2022-000013-RA-SMA_NR-R, 2022-000036-RA-CEA_NR-R, 2022-000037-RA-CEA_NR-R, and 2023-000001-RA-CEA_E
4. Draft Guidance on 7-Hour USPAP Update Course

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting held March 9, 2023



Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director
Board of Real Estate Appraisers