

**Massachusetts Board of Real Estate Appraisers  
Minutes of the Board Meeting held May 11, 2023**

**Time: 10:30 a.m.**

**Location: Microsoft Teams**

**Members Present:**

Michael Giannelli, *Chair, Certified*

*Residential Appraiser Member*

Thomas Kokoliadis, *Vice Chair, Banking*

*Member*

Paula Wolfe, *Certified Residential Appraiser*

*Member*

Kenneth Dicks, *Certified General Appraiser*

*Member*

Timothy McDonough, *State Licensed Appraiser/Municipal Assessor*

Tracy Sharkey, *Real Estate Broker Member*

William McLaughlin, *Certified General Appraiser Member*

Matthew Jenkins, *AMC Member*

**Members Not Present:**

**Administrative Staff Present:**

Kristin Mitchell, *Executive Director*

Lynn Read, *Board Counsel*

All Board members and staff appeared by videoconference.

- I. Call to Order** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli opened the meeting at 10:35 a.m.
- II. Introduction of ASC Policy Managers and Compliance Review** – Board Chair Michael Giannelli introduced the ASC Policy Managers in attendance to the other members and the public. The Policy Managers are conducting the biennial audit of the Board’s licensing and enforcement programs.
- III. Vote on Minutes of March 9, 2023 and April 13, 2023** – After brief discussion, a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to approve the minutes of the open meetings held March 9, 2023 and April 13, 2023 as written. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.
- IV. Executive Director’s Report to the Board:** Kristin Mitchell reported to the Board the number of licenses issued since the last meeting.

**Next Board Meeting Date**

Full Board Meeting Date: July 13, 2023

- V. Board Counsel’s Report to the Board** – Board Counsel, Lynn Read, reported to the Board that AMC regulations are moving forward, and they are currently under review with the Secretary of Administration and Finance.
- VI. License Application Report:** A MOTION was made by Mr. Kokoliadis to accept reviewers’ decision for license applications. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McDonough and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks –

“Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

<u>Applicant</u>	<u>License Type</u>	<u>Last Action Taken</u>
TB	CR	Board Approved
SS	CG	Board Requested to Invite In
TD	CR	Board Approved
AP	CR	Board Approved
JB	CG	Board Requested 1 More Report

**VII. Education Report:** A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to accept reviewers’ decision for Education applications. The Motion was seconded by Mr. McLaughlin and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

<b>Provider Name</b>	<b>Course Name</b>	<b>Hours</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>ResFlag</b>	<b>AQB</b>	<b>Recommendations</b>
The CE Shop	15-Hour National USPAP Course	15	P	USPAP	Yes	Staff Approved
The CE Shop	7 Hour National USPAP Update (Distance Education)	7	C	USPAP	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Basic Appraisal Procedures Synchronous	30	C	R/NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Basic Appraisal Principles	30	P	R/NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online Basic Appraisal Procedures	30	P	R/NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Income Approach/Part 1	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Income Approach/Part 2	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15	C	R	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach Synchronous	15	P	R	Yes	Staff Approved
McKissock, LP	Responding to a Reconsideration of Value (ROV)	3	C	E	Yes	Staff Approved
The CE Shop	Appraisal Economics and Value	7	C	E	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
Appraisal Institute	Online General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30	P	NR	Yes	Staff Approved
American Society of Appraisers	2023 ASA-IFA Eastern Region Conference	7	C	R/NR/E	No	Board Approved
American Society of Appraisers	2023 ASA-IFA Eastern Region Conference - Day 2	7	C	R/NR/E	No	Board Approved

ASFMRA	Introduction to Business Valuation for Rural Appraisers	8	S	NR/E	No	Board Approved
MBREA	Appraisal Bias – Behind the Headlines	3	S	NR/R	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Farmer Mac Appraisal Requirements	4	S	NR/E	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Livestock Ranch Seminar	8	S	NR/E	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Appraising Ag Facilities: Swine Confinement Seminar	8	S	NR/E	No	Board Approved
ASFMRA	Appraising Natural Resources: Oil, Gas and Minerals	8	S	NR/E	No	Board Approved
Massachusetts Rhode Island & Maine Chapter of the Appraisal Institute	Maine Real Estate Market & Economic Update 2023	2	C	R/NR	No	Board Approved
MBREA	Non-Lending Appraisal Assignments	7	C	R/NR	No	Board Approved

### VIII. Discussion:

- (a) **Pave Dashboard:** Ms. Read advised the Board that the PAVE Interagency Task Force on Property Appraisal and Valuation Equity “Dashboard” lists areas in which Massachusetts regulations require qualifications to become licensed that go beyond the baseline established by the federal Appraisal Qualifications Board. Ms. Read will review the regulations and suggest potential amendments.
- (b) **Supervision Requirements:** Ms. Read explained to the Board that the regulations regarding experience required for State Licensed candidates to obtain Certified Residential license can be clarified, and draft amendments will include this clarification.
- (c) **Practical Applications of Real Estate Appraisal (PAREA) and Board Regulations:** Ms. Read presented draft regulations authorizing PAREA as a way to meet experience requirements. Reviewing 264 CMR 5.06(c) she amended the language pertaining to Certified General Appraisers. Ms. Read explained the options in moving forward with adoption. Members suggested there be a “layman’s terms” guide for the public after these are adopted. Chair opened floor for public questions. Alan Cohen asked if the draft regulations are open to the public. Ms. Read stated he can submit a public records request and they will be sent. She also explained the amendments in 264 CMR 2.00. The Board asked her to amend the supervising appraiser definition to say the Supervisor must be licensed in Massachusetts including those who have received reciprocity within 3 years.

A MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to adopt draft regulations as amended. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Dicks and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

### IX. Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated: None.

- X. **Public Comment:** Chair opened the floor to the public. Scott Dibiasio thanked the Board for moving forward with PAREA.

**XI. Executive Session:** None

**XII. Quasi-Judicial Session:** None

**XIII. Complaints and Investigative Conference, Closed Session per M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C:**

At 11:53 a.m. a MOTION was made by Mr. McDonough to exit Open Session and enter Closed Investigative Conference under M.G.L. c. 112, s. 65C, and the Board would not go back into Open session except to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Mr. Jenkins and unanimously adopted by the Board by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

After the Investigative Conference the following was reported by the Board:

- a. Discussion of the terms of negotiated settlement of complaint(s):
  - 2022-000451-IT-ENF – Gave guidance to Prosecutor
- b. Cases:

Docket	Board Vote
2022-001064-IT-ENF	Forwarded to Prosecutions
2022-001065-IT-ENF	Forwarded to Prosecutions
2022-001173-IT-ENF	Forwarded to Prosecutions
2023-000174-IT-ENF	Forwarded to Prosecutions

**Matthew Jenkins left at 12:56 p.m.**

**XIV. Adjourn:**

Mr. McDonough made a MOTION to adjourn the meeting at 1:26 p.m., seconded by Mr. Kokoliadis and unanimously adopted by a roll call vote: Giannelli – “Yes”; Dicks – “Yes”; Kokoliadis – “Yes”; Wolfe – “Yes”; Jenkins- “Yes; McDonough – “Yes”, Sharkey – “Yes”, McLaughlin – “Yes”.

**List of Documents Used in Open Meeting:**

1. Agenda for meeting of May 11, 2023
2. Draft Minutes of March 9, 2023 and April 13, 2023
3. PAREA Materials:
  - a. AQB Criteria for PAREA
  - b. Draft 264 CMR 2.00, 5.00 and 6.00

The above Minutes were approved at the Open Meeting held July 13, 2023

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Kristin Mitchell".

---

Kristin Mitchell, Executive Director  
Board of Real Estate Appraisers