COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
100 Cambridge Street, Suite 200
Boston, MA 02114
(617) 979-1900

Tracking Number: I-25-153

Re: Request of Douglas Trude for Investigation regarding Captain promotions in the Quincy Fire Department

RESPONSE TO REQUEST FOR INVESTIGATION

Petitioner's Request and Initial Show Cause Conference

On July 3, 2025, the Petitioner, Douglas Trude, a Fire Lieutenant in the Quincy Fire Department (QFD), filed a request for the Civil Service Commission (Commission) to conduct an investigation into an alleged error by the Human Resources Division (HRD) in establishing the current eligible list for Quincy Fire Captain from the scores of candidates on the 2024 Statewide Fire Captain examination. Specifically, the Petitioner complains about HRD's allegedly erroneous crediting of a candidate ranked higher on that list with certain "outside experience" points on the Experience, Certification, Training and Education (ECT&E) component of the examination that this other candidate purportedly was not eligible to receive.

This request for investigation was consolidated for purposes of initial consideration with an appeal filed by another QFD Fire Lieutenant, Joseph P. Callahan, CSC No. B2-25-154 (Callahan Appeal), which asserted substantially the same complaint.

On July 29, 2025, I held a combined Show Cause Conference in this matter and a Pre-Hearing Conference in the Callahan Appeal. HRD reported that it was in the process of conducting an audit of the ECT&E credits that the Petitioner and Lieutenant Callahan alleged were erroneously granted to the other candidate. The Petitioner and Lieutenant Callahan agreed that the Commission should defer further action in this request for investigation, and in the Callahan Appeal, pending HRD's completion of its audit.

On September 5, 2025, HRD reported that it had completed the audit and issued the following report:

> HRD completed an audit of the [candidate's name redacted] outside supervisor experience claim. As a result of that audit, the claimed experience could not be verified to a level sufficient to HRD's requirements. Accordingly, HRD rescinded the previous award of credit for that claimed experience and issued [the candidate] an updated score notice yesterday, September 4, 2025. I spoke with Petitioner's Counsel yesterday and made him aware. This matter is now resolved from HRD's standpoint and it is HRD's position the

matter should be withdrawn by Petitioner or dismissed by the Commission as the issue brought by the Petitioners is now moot.

Counsel for the Petitioner replied with an email criticizing HRD's handling of the matter generally and raising questions about the other candidate's request for the credit in question to begin with, but did not dispute that the initial issue involving the other candidate was resolved

Commission's Authority to Conduct Investigations

The Commission, established pursuant to G.L. c. 7, § 4I, is an independent, neutral appellate tribunal and investigative entity. Section 2(a) of Chapter 31 grants the Commission broad discretion upon receipt of an alleged violation of the civil service law's provisions to decide whether and to what extent an investigation might be appropriate.

Further, Section 72 of Chapter 31 provides for the Commission to "investigate all or part of the official and labor services, the work, duties and compensation of the persons employed in such services, the number of persons employed in such services and the titles, ratings and methods of promotion in such services."

The Commission exercises its discretion to investigate only "sparingly," typically only when there is clear and convincing evidence of systemic violations of Chapter 31 or an entrenched political or personal bias that can be rectified through the Commission's affirmative remedial intervention.

Commission's Response

Based on HRD's September 5, 2025 report, I find the Petitioner's request for an investigation to now be moot. Accordingly, I recommend that the Commission vote to close this investigation request without further action.

Civil Service Commission

/s/ Paul M Stein
Paul M. Stein
Commissioner

On October 30, 2025, the Commission (Bowman, Chair; Dooley, Markey, McConney and Stein, Commissioners) voted to close the pending request for investigation (I-25-153).

Notice:
John J. McGlone, Esq. (for Petitioner)
Michael J. Owens, Esq. (for HRD)