

**Minutes of the Massachusetts Zero Emission Vehicle Commission Meeting #1
August 31, 2015
100 Cambridge Street, 2nd Floor, Conference Rooms B, C, and D, Boston, MA**

FINAL MINUTES

Members named by title present: Dan Sieger, Chair and Assistant Secretary of EEA, Environment; Ron Gerwatowski, Assistant Secretary of EEA, Energy; Christine Kirby (Designee of Commissioner Suuberg), MassDEP; Rob Garrity, Secretary of Transportation Designee; Judith Judson, Commissioner of Energy Resources; Charles Carroll, Deputy Director of the Division of Standards; Vineet Gupta, Transportation Planning, Mayor of the City of Boston appointee; Andrew Savitz, City of Newton; Massachusetts Municipal Association Appointee.

Members appointed or nominated for appointment present: Jennifer Rushlow, Conservation Law Foundation; Mark LeBel, Acadia Center; Gina Coplion-Newfield, Sierra Club; Jeff Hyman, EMD Serono; Mark Foster, Tufts Health; Jong Wai Tommee, Mass Convention Center Authority; Watson Collins, Eversource Energy; Fouad Dagher, National Grid; Scott Dube, Dube Hyundai; Robert Boch, Expressway Toyota; Kim Boas, Massachusetts Municipal Wholesale Electric Company; Colleen Quinn, ChargePoint; Dan Shanahan, EVSE LLC; Gus Block, Nuvera Fuel Cells, LLC; Kevin Kinnaw, Toyota; Tracy Woodard, Nissan; Alex Keros, General Motors.

Others present: John Bartley, Josh Pudnos, Charlie Myers, Joe Bush, Steve Russell, Michelle Broussard, Kathleen Connors, John Slocum, Colleen McGlynn, Rachel Szakmary, Barry Woods, Peter Brennan, Karsten Barde, Zach Stanley, Tim Kreunriet, Patricia Lynch, Sejal Shah, Susan Kaplan, Jonathan Lee, Peter Fuller, Nicholas Hutchings, Dave Packard, Nicole Appenzeller, and Colin Santulli.

Q	A	D	R	Bold
Question	Answer	Discussion	Request for action/Result	Vote taken

Open Meeting - Chair Sieger called the meeting to order at 10:06 a.m.

Commission Member Introduction and Staff/Participant introductions. No remote participation.

Review of Agenda

Q: - Has Baker administration put out support for ZEV MOU?

A: - Nothing has been decided prior to these proceedings.

1. Adopt a Policy on Remote Participation

D: Members want to attend. No use of proxies from appointed members. Advance notice given to Linda Benevides to arrange for remote participation.

Vote: Tracy Woodard motion, seconded and unanimous **approval to allow remote participation under prescribed situations with advanced notice given to Linda Benevides.**

D: Agreed to use simplified Robert's Rules with ZEV Commission discussion first, open to participants followed by vote of ZEV Commission members as needed.

**Minutes of the Massachusetts Zero Emission Vehicle Commission Meeting #1
August 31, 2015
100 Cambridge Street, 2nd Floor, Conference Rooms B, C, and D, Boston, MA**

The State of the ZEV Market in Massachusetts – PowerPoint Presentation by Colin Santulli, Center for Sustainable Energy

Q: Even though the highest self-reported motivation is environmental impact, there is less than ½ interested in solar. Why?

A: Solar may not work for everyone's residential roof (physically) or work economically for them.

Q: Survey mentioned 35% of drivers said they had access to Workplace Charging similar to CA data (40% had access). Why would driver not use if available?

A: Good for MA. If don't need a charge (within range) so don't need it (personal example). CSE provide accurate CA %.

Q: Any data not presented that should be made available to ZEV Commission?

No response at this time although requests did come up during the meeting including:

- Survey data by model particularly Tesla (by income level) and effect of rebate on purchase/lease decision making
- Look at all models to see if difference in survey question about would you purchase w/o rebate

Q: Seems like MA ahead of other states, how did we get the EV data?

A: RMV provided non-identifiable registered vehicle data; CSE used VIN decoder to get numbers. MassDEP Inspection and Maintenance data is in line with the numbers.

Q: EVSE #s low in presentation.

A: Yes, according to the Alt Fuels database there are more stations than in presentation – frequent additions a good thing. ChargePoint updates their installs frequently in the database. GHG savings in MA is 700,000 pounds from plugging into the ChargePoint network (data submitted by Colleen Quinn after the meeting)

MOR-EV Program Update – PowerPoint Presentation by Colin Santulli, Center for Sustainable Energy

D: When survey changed, consider 1) TOU if lifestyle changes emphasized 2) would you buy another ZEV; does cold weather effect purchase

Q: EV plates – I couldn't get one, why don't dealers have them?

A: Distribution of plates to dealers requires software adjustment that is underway.

Q: How is the federal tax credit applied on a lease – if its applied as a reduction to lease payment, then to buy it at the end, the residual prices is higher than to buy the car used with less miles.

A: Should be treated as additional “down payment” and lower lease – should not affect residual value

Minutes of the Massachusetts Zero Emission Vehicle Commission Meeting #1
August 31, 2015
100 Cambridge Street, 2nd Floor, Conference Rooms B, C, and D, Boston, MA

D: No one comes into a dealership asking for a PHEV or even a hybrid though those are readily available and common. Price of gas is what puts an EV on a consumers list. If we only have fuel savings, no motivation with low gas prices. Must get consumer interest without fuel price. Need additional reasons to purchase. Buyers don't think about lower maintenance costs over time – gas price immediate.

D: Fuel cell vehicles will be similar to ICE fueling (time to fill a tank and driving range). Training dealers in target markets will be key. Later in meeting: Enviro members H2 derived from natural gas (NG) is not beneficial. Electricity is generated from NG. All Hydrogen delivered to MA in the Air Liquide/Toyota will be renewable (electrolyzed water) not NG. By definition ZEVs include FCEV, MA has to accelerate this market too to achieve goals.

Q: Why don't OEMs market or advertise more?

A: OEMs take the long view. Example of vehicle timeline – marketing \$ at launch of vehicle goes to advertising but as it “ages”, \$ go to incentives to reduce price and move cars before new model.

Review of Potential MOR-EV Rebate Program Adjustments

1. MSRP cap – ZEV Commission asked to comment and advise EEA on \$60K cap (over this amount, ineligible for rebate, similar to Connecticut's rebate program).

D:

- Budget may be the key issue – are Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) funds decreasing? RGGI funds for energy efficiency are critical so MOR-EV is competing with other major objectives. Are you trying to stretch \$2M further or can you get consistent funding to reduce the need to consider this?
- Consistency for the market – keep same and keep it predictable- suggestion for 5-year horizon; Reauthorization by Congress on tax rebate continues to make the market uncertain. If you offer it and then take it away, aren't you going to negatively affect sales?
- The International Council on Clean Transportation (ICCT) report clearly says that financial incentive is key factor although a range of different incentives are also important.
- Don't set MSRP cap: 56% of Tesla owners didn't take rebate so it is self-selecting. 8-state MOU commitment #1 goal is ZEVs, ICCT study shows that vehicles on the road expand awareness and there is nothing like a Tesla to get people talking at a grocery store or market parking lot. Same with FCEV....
- Support MSRP cap: MSRP cap could encourage manufacturers to come in under the cap. Sierra Club, CLF, Nuvera support. RGGI funds are critical to EE issues that have greater benefit to lower income households so must preserve. Do not accept making an exception for FCEV.
Suggestion to offer that rebate gets “donated” back into the MOR-EV fund for lower income or pilot to keep it going. Suggestion for sliding scale (income based for higher end cars). Suggestion to have a sliding rebate scale based on MSRP – don't eliminate just make it less at the higher end.

Minutes of the Massachusetts Zero Emission Vehicle Commission Meeting #1
August 31, 2015
100 Cambridge Street, 2nd Floor, Conference Rooms B, C, and D, Boston, MA

R:

- Tesla data in CA/CT by month compared to MA – if rebate changes, are changes reflected in data #s. State can track if MSRP cap instituted and make adjustments if needed.
- MOR-EV rebate importance for Tesla, get data
- No recommendation at this time.

Chair - Review and Discussion of MASS DRIVE CLEAN with Plug In America and Upcoming Events will be discussed during Action Plan elements related to outreach after lunch

Lunch break – Chair calls to order at 12:45 (30 minutes)

2. Pilot – Tiered Income Based Rebate proposal for \$5K rebate, new or used vehicle under EJ income levels administered by a local community action agency or neighborhood Community Development Corp.

D: Note: ZEV credit only when new

- Having a BEV as a primary vehicle may not be ideal. PHEV better? Must be able to charge in MDU this is a role where the utilities can help.
- The plan addresses equity issue (where MSRP doesn't) – pilot to learn is important, dealers will be part of the solution as they will help.
- Use CDCs to find local support.
- Whoever administers it should test drive an EV
- \$275K will exhaust itself quickly. Don't spend time on outreach. Evaluate Charge Ahead California best practices from Colleen – good info on outreach
- Concern that dealers will be out the upfront money- how fast can the check be cut?
- With such a high down payment on a BEV – may be incentive to not really consider downsides of EV as it will over ride normal decision making

Note: Linda asked for a poll to recommend to EEA that it pursue a low –income program. Unanimous yes. ZEV Commission asked for more information on what is being considered.

Review and Recommendations for ZEV Commission Obligations Under Section 205

1. Review and Discuss Draft ZEV Action Plan and H2085 – An Act Promoting Electric Vehicle (EV) Adoption

D: Updates given by DOER/Clean Cities/MassDOT infrastructure grant build-out, workplace charging, standards and testing for charging equipment, potential building codes, MassEVIP fleet grant program, MASS DRIVE CLEAN, National Grid Energy Expo at Gillette Stadium ride and drive, Newton ride and drive, Tufts Health Plan ride and drive that happened in the spring, Fifth annual National Drive Electric Week (9/12-20) – over 100,000 registered and 167 events nationwide. CLF/Sierra/Acadia report on successful ZEV policy initiative will be shared by the end of September. Eversource managed charging pilot described. National Grid submitted several locations for FC as an R&D project. How can we merge Energy Efficiency services with

Minutes of the Massachusetts Zero Emission Vehicle Commission Meeting #1
August 31, 2015
100 Cambridge Street, 2nd Floor, Conference Rooms B, C, and D, Boston, MA

EV awareness? Suggestion to have MOR-EV booth more prominent at the January Auto Show. Hydrogen infrastructure planning and incentives needed to pave the way for FCEV. Grid impact of making hydrogen and energy storage capability.

Identify Future Issues of Interest to ZEV Commission

D: Commission proposed these topics to work on before the next meeting:

- Legislation – EEA should convene small group discussion for ZEV Commission to identify legislative needs or miss an opportunity – do this while finalizing action plan. Suggestion that this should include long term funding and direction for utilities to participate.
- Develop EVSE and Utility roadmap – Critical to get more EVSEs in place to support the Commonwealth goal of ZEVs by 2025 (over \$500M for 50K-150K publicly available EVSEs). Upon review, there is no targeted grid integration for EVSE in Grid Mod plans. This is a gap that should be filled. R&D funds can be directed to EVSE pilot programs - use CA as a model, what collaborations would work to put EVSE into utility programs. Consider a program to off-set owner costs for operating and maintenance of EVSE through large scale utility pilots with guidelines developed by DPU under DPU 13-182. Opportunity to serve MDUs and low income pilot.
- Dealers – They are key and there is no plan to motivate and increase enthusiasm for sales.
- Outreach – Need focus on mainstream events and find ways to reach more people. Include broader, in-depth outreach to higher education and vocational tech schools. Put into curriculum how relates to climate change.
- Rental/car-share focus

R: Linda Benevides will get back to Commission.

Schedule Next Meeting – in two months (October)

Adjourn meeting – Ron Gerwatowski adjourned meeting at 2:00

List of Documents Used by the Commission at the Meeting:

1. Agenda
2. ZEV Commission Member List and Section 205
3. Remote Participation section of Open Meeting Law Guide
4. Potential MOR-EV Rebate Program Adjustments – MSRP cap and Pilot Tiered Rebate
5. Draft MA ZEV Action Plan
6. H.B. 3085 (Representatives Frank Smizik and Jonathan Hecht)
7. MOR-EV Year One Report handout
8. MOR-EV Eligible Vehicle List handout
9. State of the ZEV Market and MOR-EV Program Update (PowerPoint handout)
10. MASS DRIVE CLEAN campaign handout
11. PIA Landscape Assessment – April 2015 Promotion of EVs in the US (limited handouts)
12. DOE Clean Cities Handouts

Approved: _____, 2015