

**COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS  
BOARD OF UNDERWATER ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES  
FINAL MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING – 30 January 2020**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Michael Driscoll (Designee, Director of DCR Division of Waterways)  
Mark McClanan (Dive Community Representative)  
Graham McKay (Marine Archaeologist)  
Jonathan Patton (Designee of Brona Simon, Executive Director of the Massachusetts Historical Commission)  
Dan Sampson (Designee of Lisa Berry Engler, Director of Coastal Zone Management)  
John Warner (State Archivist)  
Nadia Waski (Designee of Brona Simon, State Archaeologist)

David Robinson, Director (Staff for the Board)

**MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Jack Chapin (Designee of the Director of Environmental Law Enforcement)  
Gary Murad (Dive Community Representative)

**PROCEEDINGS:**

The public meeting of the Massachusetts Board of Underwater Archaeological Resources (BUAR) was convened by the Director, David Robinson (Dave R) at 1:31 PM on 30 January 2020 in the Massachusetts Office of Coastal Zone Management (CZM) Conference Room at 251 Causeway Street in Boston.

**1. MINUTES**

**A. Minutes of December 5, 2019**

Dave R asked the Board if there were any comments or corrections to the minutes of the public meeting held on 5 December 2019. There were no comments or corrections to the minutes.

Graham McKay moved to accept the minutes of the 5 December 2019 public meeting. John Warner seconded. Unanimous vote in favor. So voted.

**2. DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

**A. MA Bay Estuary Partnership**

On December 18, 2020, Dave R. was invited to present a case-study on at-risk intertidal archaeological sites and introduced BUAR's SHIPS (Shoreline Heritage Identification Partnerships Strategy) program to the MA Bay Estuary Partnership's Science and Technical Advisory Subcommittee Regional Coordinators. The MA Bay Estuary Partnership is an EPA National Estuary Program dedicated to protecting, restoring, and enhancing the estuarine resources of Ipswich Bay, Massachusetts Bay, and Cape Cod Bay. The MA Bay Estuary Partnership and their regional coordinators work closely with communities to provide technical assistance and to implement program goals and objectives in five coastal subregions: Upper North Shore, Lower North Shore, Metro Boston, South Shore, and Cape Cod. They are involved in active field programs in coastal observation and monitoring. The purpose of BUAR's presentation was to inform them about BUAR, and our mission, responsibilities, and authority within the waters of the Commonwealth, and to request that the coordinators: a) inform BUAR of any archaeological sites or areas with unusual inundated terrestrial deposits (such as peat, tree stumps and roots, etc.) that they encounter in MA's intertidal and shallow waters during the course of their work; and b) to document the location and nature of the finds with GPS, photographs, and by completing and submitting a BUAR

**COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS  
BOARD OF UNDERWATER ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES  
FINAL MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING – 30 January 2020**

SHIPS form to us. The MA Bay Estuary Partnership and its regional coordinators committed to informing us of their finds as they are encountered.

**B. Stellwagen Bank National Marine Sanctuary Maritime Heritage Working Group**

Dave R reported that BUAR was invited to join the Stellwagen Bank National Marine Sanctuary's Maritime Heritage Working Group and to participate in their January 16, 2020 meeting held at MIT Sea Grant, Cambridge. The Maritime Heritage Working Group meets periodically and advises the Sanctuary Advisory Council on issues related to maritime heritage within the Sanctuary. The meeting was convened to discuss upcoming Management Plan Review work and the assessment and identification of gaps, areas of opportunity, and issues, as well as issues related to public access/disclosure to shipwreck locations, fishing impacts on shipwrecks, wreck site monitoring, the 2019 *Portland* expedition, telepresence/public engagement, and a proposed maritime cultural landscape plan. Dr. Calvin Mires (WHOI) presented an interim 3D photogrammetric model of *Portland* with images recorded by ROV during WHOI and the Sanctuary's 2019 field programs. The interim results are extraordinary for the details that are visible and the unique perspective that 3D photogrammetric modeling provides of the wreck's content and condition – details and perspective that are simply unattainable with side-scanning sonar or underwater video. New imagery obtained in 2019 shows fishing-net impacts (large net on portside bow) that have occurred since the last Sanctuary expedition to the wreck in 2009. The Sanctuary and NOAA are considering making all shipwreck locations in their databases public, including historically significant wrecks like *Portland*, based on the negative results of their current non-disclosure policy. The logic is that shipwreck protection will be enhanced by providing commercial fishers with the necessary information to help them avoid contacting and damaging the wrecks with their fishing gear. Concurrent with this consideration, the Sanctuary is also researching different technologies for monitoring vessel activity around shipwreck sites and alerting fishing vessel captains to the presence of wreck sites that are to be avoided (e.g., using a video-buoy or "geo-fencing" that employs VMS data).

**C. Bay State Council of Divers**

Dave R. reported that BUAR will be giving a presentation on underwater archaeology in MA and the important roles recreational divers and diving can and do have in that research at the February 12, 2020 Bay State Council of Divers meeting. BUAR is seeking the Council's feedback prior to taking the presentation public as part of BUAR's outreach programing. BUAR is partnering with the Council to educate the Commonwealth's coastal communities about the State's rich maritime heritage resources and the diving community's (archaeological and recreational) involvement in the study, management, and protection of that common heritage.

**D. MA Ocean Management Plan**

Dave R. reported that BUAR continued its work in December and January with MA CZM on the most recent updating of the MA Ocean Management Plan (OMP). The MA OMP must be updated every 5 years. Dave R is co-lead on the OMP's Cultural Heritage and Recreational Uses Work Group with MA CZM's Prassede Vella (Vic had also served in this role during the OMP's previous updating). On January 7, 2020, the Work Group's sub-committee on Submerged Paleocultural Landscapes and Tribal Use and Access met in the Mashpee Wampanoag Tribal Council Chambers to discuss issues, recommendations, and science priorities related to paleolandscape modeling and mapping of Tribal use and access locations along the MA coast and in the OMP. In January 2020, the Working Group produced a Draft Work Group Report. DRAFT Cultural Heritage recommendations were as follows:

1. SHIPWRECKS:

- Include the newly developed geospatial database of publicly-available shipwreck locations mapping in the OMP and establish shipwrecks as a new SSU (Special, Sensitive, Unique natural resource). Shipwrecks were previously included as part of Hard and Complex Bottom SSU in the 2015 OMP. The separate SSU designation for shipwrecks would acknowledge their significance as a resource in their own right, and

**COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS  
BOARD OF UNDERWATER ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES  
FINAL MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING – 30 January 2020**

the fact that the oldest and perhaps most significant shipwrecks are less likely to constitute areas of Hard and Complex Bottom.

- Work with MA CZM seafloor mapping partner, USGS, to explore the possibility of gathering data during future MA CZM/USGS mapping programs at a resolution allowing for shipwreck identification
- Science and Data Priority: work with diving community to gather shipwreck and related data to include in the new geospatial database.

**2. SUBMERGED PALEOCULTURAL LANDSCAPES:**

- Science and Data Priority: Working from the latest research by BOEM and URI-GSO, compile and synthesize USGS seafloor mapping legacy data to identify the locations of surficial expressions of “Quaternary fluvial estuarine” (“Qfe”) geological deposits within the OMP as potentially archaeologically sensitive and as priority research areas when planning future USGS seafloor mapping and sediment coring locations
- Science and Data Priority: Obtain and synthesize the MHC MACRIS data and develop a coastal archaeological site sensitivity map for pre-contact cultural resources. Integrate this map with MA CZM’s newly updated coastal erosion mapping to identify coastal areas where pre-contact cultural resources are most at risk of being destroyed by erosion or most likely are inundated offshore as a result of sea level rise.

**3. TRIBAL USE AND ACCESS:**

- Science and Data Priority: Work with the MCIA and MA Tribes to develop maps of Traditional Tribal Rights of Way and current activity (i.e., fishing and hunting areas).
- Incorporate Tribal ROWs (as deemed appropriate and acceptable by the Tribes) in the MA Coast Guide with the help of CZM staff.

**11. Fieldwork**

Plymouth Harbor, North Plymouth - Dave R gave a brief slide presentation on the September 27 and November 21 site visits BUAR conducted in North Plymouth where an intact element of a paleocultural landscape is preserved in the intertidal zone of Plymouth Harbor. The area is archaeologically sensitive and at risk of loss through erosion. BUAR has (informally) informed the MHC and the MA Commission on Indian Affairs (MCIA) about the find and is preparing a Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC) site form for the area that it will be submitting to the MHC and MCIA. In response to the expressed concerns of the Mashpee Wampanoag and Wampanoag Tribe of Gay Head (Aquinnah) THPO staff who visited the site with us in November, BUAR is currently researching non- and minimal-disturbance survey methodologies for determining presence/absence of a human burial at the find site, as well as possible sources of funding for that survey.

**3. BOARD MEMBER REPORTS**

There were no Board member reports.

**COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS  
BOARD OF UNDERWATER ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES  
FINAL MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING – 30 January 2020**

**4. PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES**

**A. Society for Historical Archaeology (SHA)/Advisory Council on Underwater Archaeology (ACUA) Annual Conference**

Dave R. reported that on January 8, 2020 he was one of the invited presenters at the ACUA's Underwater Cultural Heritage Workshop held during the 2020 SHA/ACUA annual conference here in Boston. The 5-part workshop introduced participants to: legislation and best practices; underwater survey; underwater archaeology of pre-contact sites; qualifications and reporting; and interpretation, outreach, and avocation efforts. The workshop was well-attended (ca. 30 people) and included an international group of participants consisting of new marine archaeology graduate students and early-career professionals, state and federal government agency representatives, educators, researchers, and non-specialist CRM professionals (from as far away as India).

**B. South Shore Neptunes**

Dave R. reported that on January 21, 2020, BUAR gave an invited presentation to the South Shore Neptunes Dive Club in Quincy. Founded in 1960, the South Shore Neptunes are one of the nation's oldest dive clubs. Dave R.'s talk focused primarily on a recent marine archaeological investigation by Dave R. of RI's largest ship graveyard at the mouth of the Seekonk River, but also provided an overview of the BUAR and a discussion of BUAR's interest in working with MA's recreational diving community on photographing the Commonwealth's shipwrecks to produce 3D photogrammetric models of them for public outreach, resource management, and research purposes. Examples of 3D photogrammetric models made in other parts of the world were shared with the Club. Members of the club expressed interest in working with BUAR on this effort and in participating in BUAR's future NAS training.

**C. Free Public Lecture on the Sinking and Salvage of the US Submarine S-4**

Dave R. reported that on February 19, 2020, at 7 pm BUAR will be giving the free public lecture, "Fearless Devotion: An Accounting of the Sinking and Salvage of the US Submarine S-4." at the East Regiment Beer Company in Salem. The talk will describe the December 17, 1927 loss of the S-4, which sank in 102 feet of water after being accidentally rammed by the U.S. Coast Guard destroyer *Paulding* (CG-17) off of Provincetown and the subsequent efforts to: a) rescue six survivors trapped inside the submarine; and b) to recover and salvage the S-4, including the recovery of the bodies of its 40-person crew. While the attempt to rescue the trapped submariners failed due to winter gales that made diving impossible, the loss of the S-4's 40-man crew did result in dramatic improvements to the safety of U.S. Navy submarine service. Dave R.'s great-great uncle, Thomas Eadie, served as Chief Diver in the effort and was awarded the Congressional Medal of Honor for his heroism in rescuing a fellow navy diver who had become badly entangled during the submarine recovery effort. The talk is free and open to the public, although registration on the East Regiment Beer Company website is required.

**D. School Programs**

Dave R. reported that on January 14, 2020, BUAR conducted an invited school program on underwater archaeology and the Nipmuc Nation's "Project Mishoon" as part of the Vinson-Owen Elementary School's 4<sup>th</sup> grade enrichment programming. The program, which involved several hands-on activities and a powerpoint presentation, reached the school's entire 4<sup>th</sup> grade (80+ students) and was very well-received. BUAR has been invited back to present to next year's 4<sup>th</sup> grade class. The school's 4<sup>th</sup> grade curriculum includes archaeology; BUAR's presentation kicked-off the start of that educational unit. Dave R. was impressed with the students' knowledge – particularly their awareness of the Native word "mishoon," which they had learned during a 3<sup>rd</sup> grade field trip to Plymouth Plantation last year.

BUAR is also continuing to work with the After-School Enrichment Collaborative of the Chenery Middle School in Belmont, MA, on developing the content and schedule for an after-school STEM program on underwater archaeology.

**COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS  
BOARD OF UNDERWATER ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES  
FINAL MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING – 30 January 2020**

**5. OLD BUSINESS**

**A. Bassings Cove Maritime Association**

Dave R. reported that the Bassings Cove Maritime Association's Excavation Permit (91-001) was up for renewal today, but that BUAR had not yet received a renewal application or gotten a response from the permittee to a notification email BUAR had sent them on December 17, 2019. Dave R. recommended the expiration date for the permit be administratively extended until the next BUAR public meeting to provide additional time for the Board to determine whether Bassings Cove Maritime Association wishes to renew their permit and, if so, for them to submit their application for renewal. Bassings Cove Maritime Association representatives were not in attendance to represent their permit application.

Michael Driscoll moved to administratively extend the expiration of Excavation Permit No. 91-001 held by Bassings Cove Maritime Association for their Scituate site with all standard conditions in effect until the next meeting of the Board. John Warner seconded. Unanimous vote in favor. So voted.

**B. James M. Karos**

Dave R. reported that James M. Karos's Reconnaissance Permit (06-001) was up for renewal today, as well. Mr. Karos has requested the Board extend the expiration date for the permits until the Board's March meeting. Mr. Karos was not in attendance to represent his permit application.

Daniel Sampson moved to administratively extend the expiration of Reconnaissance Permit No. 06-001 held by James M. Karos for his Chelsea Creek (Boston, Chelsea, Revere) sites with all standard conditions in effect until the next meeting of the Board. John Warner seconded. Unanimous vote in favor. So voted.

**6. NEW BUSINESS**

None.

**7. DIRECTOR'S REPORT (continued)**

**Meetings Start-Time Change**

Dave R. noted that at the December 5, 2019 meeting there was discussion and interest by the Board in changing the current 1:30 pm start-time of its meetings to 12:30 pm. Dave R. informed the Board that there is no statutory reason for the current 1:30 pm start time, and that when he checked the schedule for the large meeting room at CZM-Boston it was available for the earlier time slot on all of the upcoming scheduled meeting dates.

Michael Driscoll moved to change the Board's meeting start-time to 12:30 pm, effective from the close of the January 30, 2020 meeting. Nadia Waski seconded. Unanimous vote in favor. So voted.

**2020 BUAR Meetings Planned Schedule**

Dave R. informed the Board that its annual meeting schedule requires a formal vote and that the 2020 meeting schedule should have been voted on during the December 5, 2019 meeting. The Board's 2020 planned schedule for meetings is as follows:

**COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS  
BOARD OF UNDERWATER ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES  
FINAL MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING – 30 January 2020**

- March 26
- May 28
- September 24
- December 3

Alternative meeting dates (if needed) are February 27, April 30, June 25, July 30, August 27, and October 29. The Board is in recess during the summer months (June, July, August), unless business requires a public meeting. There is no meeting scheduled in November due to the Thanksgiving holiday falling on the last Thursday of the month.

Mark McClanan moved to approve the Board's meeting schedule for the 2020 calendar year. Michael Driscoll seconded. Unanimous vote in favor. So voted.

Dave R noted that the next scheduled public meeting of the Board will be **12:30** pm at 251 Causeway Street on Thursday, March 26, 2020.

Dave R thanked the Board and members of the public for their attendance and participation in the meeting.

Graham McKay moved to adjourn the meeting at 2:12 PM. Mark McClanan seconded. Unanimous vote in favor. So voted.

Respectfully submitted,

David S. Robinson  
Director